

**NATIONAL HIGHWAYS AUTHORITY OF INDIA
MADURAI REGION**

Minutes of Meeting of Tender Evaluation Committee (Tech. Evaluation) dated 05.12.2025 for "Consultancy Services for Supervision Consultants (SC) of Operation & Maintenance of Two Lane with Paved Shoulder of Dindigul to Nattham section from Km 0+000 to Km 38+000 of NH-383 in the State of Tamil Nadu (Ref. No. NHAI/17011/02/37/2025/RO Madurai)".

1. The Tender Evaluation Committee, constituted upon the approval of Regional Officer, Madurai has opened the bids on 22.07.2025 and found that all the bids are responsive based on pre-technical scrutiny. Later, the detailed technical evaluation of bids was taken up and finalized on 24.11.2025, the initial scores assigned to the bidders are tabulated as under;

S. No	Name of the Bidder	Bid ID	Initial score as per NHAI Score
1	M/s Artefact Projects Ltd in JV with Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with Renaissance IOT LLP., Nagpur.	881953	94.29
2	M/s MSPARK Futuristics & Associates., Noida	881960	90.85
3	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in Association with Bloom Infrastructure & Logistics Pvt. Ltd., Haryana	881986	93.40
4	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre, Bhopal	881987	93.74
5	M/s Satra Services and Solutions Private limited, Telangana	882011	94.81
6	M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Stella Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	882019	88.85
7	M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd in Association with Maark Civil Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd., Maharashtra	885172	89.15
8	M/s. Geo Designs & Research (P) Ltd., Gujarat	885452	92.11
9	M/s. Saptagon Asia Private Limited in Association with M/s. CivilMantra Infracon Limited, Haryana	885470	92.14

2. The evaluation sheets with the initial scores were circulated in NHAI INFRACON Portal & e-tender Portal to receive objections from the bidders, if any, within a period of 07 days as per Para 5.3 (ii) of RFP. As the approved Minutes of Meeting along with annexure of Detailed Technical Evaluation sheets were uploaded in NHAI INFRACON Portal & e-tender Portal on 27.11.2025 for objections from the bidders for a period of 7 days i.e. upto 04.12.2025. In this regard, eight nos. of bidders have submitted their objections/remarks towards the scores given against their technical bid.

3. As such, the Tender Evaluation Committee has examined the objections raised by the bidders and accordingly, the scores assigned were reviewed and following are brought out;

 A.N. Baveja   

A) M/s Artefact Projects Ltd in JV with Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with Renaissance IOT LLP., Nagpur vide dated 04.12.2025 has raised certain objections towards the initial evaluation done by NHAI w.r.t Firm Evaluation as well as Key Personnel evaluation. The details are as under:

(i) Regarding Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business (Min 5 Crore) @ S.No.1b of Annexure-A-1, the bidder has represented to consider their cumulative Average Annual Turnover of Lead Partner and JV Partner. The Committee is of opinion that, only the JV Partner Turnover meets the minimum eligibility criteria being checked as per RFP and there is no clause in the RFP describe to take Cumulative Average Annual Turnover of JV, hence, the committee has considered the Avg. Annual Turnover of Lead Partner alone. Hence, the request of the bidder is disallowed by the tender evaluation committee and the initial score remains unchanged i.e. 1.50 marks out of 2 marks @ S.No.1b of Annexure-A-1.

(ii) Regarding Quality of Approach & Methodology and Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan @ S.No.2a, b & c of Annexure-A-2, the Bidder has represented to consider their submission to award full marks i.e. 5 out of 5 under this category in Annexure-A-2. Upon reviewing the same by the tender evaluation committee, it is observed that, the bidder has not visited the site physically and has not explained about "Quality of Approach & Methodology", "Quality Audit Methodology" in line with Activities & schedules, in their submitted bid. Hence, the request of the bidder is disallowed by the tender evaluation committee and the initial score remains unchanged, i.e., cumulative marks scored 2 marks.

(iii) Considering the above, the Committee has confirmed the Final Scores of the firm, M/s Artefact Projects Ltd in JV with Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with Renaissance IOT LLP., Nagpur., remains unchanged and the same as under:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self - Evaluation	Initial Evaluation by NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	34.50	34.50
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	2.75	2.75
3	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37.04	37.04	37.04
	Total	100	97.04	94.29	94.29

B) M/s MSPARK Futuristics & Associates., Noida vide Letter dated 03.12.2025, has raised certain objections towards the initial evaluation done by NHAI w.r.t Firm Evaluation. The details are as under:

(i) Regarding the Experience as IE/SC in at least one O&M project, the bidder represented to consider the Project no.02 of their bid. The Committee of opinion that, the said work (which is 20.25 Km length

A. N. Phavane

i.e., 23.885 Km x 84.80% share, Pg.326) qualifies as per RFP criteria and accepted to take-up the work in the evaluation.

(ii) Regarding Site Appreciation, Quality of Approach & Methodology and Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan @ S.No.2a, b & c of Annexure-A-2, the Bidder has represented to consider their submission as “Very Good” Category in all aspects to award full marks i.e. 5 out of 5 under this category in Annexure-A-2. Upon reviewing the same by the tender evaluation committee, it is observed that, the bidder has not visited the site physically and has not explained about “Quality Audit Methodology” in their bid submitted in online. Hence, the request of the bidder is disallowed by the tender evaluation committee and the initial score remains unchanged, i.e., cumulative marks scored 2 marks.

(ii) Considering the above, the Committee has revised the Final Scores of the firm, M/s MSPARK Futuristics & Associates., Noida is as under:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self - Evaluation	Initial Evaluation by NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	32	32	32.5
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	2	2
3	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	36.85	36.85	36.85
	Total	100	93.85	90.85	91.35

C) M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre, Bhopal vide dated 02.12.2025 has raised certain objections towards the initial evaluation done by NHAI w.r.t Firm Evaluation as well as Key Personnel evaluation. The details are as under:

(i) Regarding Quality of Approach & Methodology and Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan @ S.No.2b & 2c of Annexure-A-2, the Bidder has represented to consider their submission to award full marks under this category in Annexure-A-2. Upon reviewing the same by the tender evaluation committee, it is observed that, the bidder has not visited the site physically and has not explained about “Quality of Approach & Methodology”, “Quality Audit Methodology” in line with Activities & schedules, in their submitted bid. Hence, the request of the bidder is disallowed by the tender evaluation committee and the initial score remains unchanged, i.e., cumulative marks scored 2 marks.

(iii) Considering the above, the Committee has confirmed the Final Scores of the firm, M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre, Bhopal, remains unchanged and the same as under:

 A-N Praveen   

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self - Evaluation	Initial Evaluation by NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	35	35
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	2	2
3	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37.29	36.74	36.74
	Total	100	97.29	93.74	93.74

D) M/s Satra Services and Solutions Private limited, Telegana vide Letter dated 03.12.2025 has raised certain objections towards the initial evaluation done by NHAI w.r.t Firm Evaluation. The details are as under:

(i) Regarding Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR Preparation of 4/6 laning Highway Projects during last 7 years @ S.No.1d of Annexure-A1, the Bidder has represented to consider Sl no. 3, 4, & 6 of Projects of their online bid document to award full marks i.e.5 marks instead of 4.75 marks. Upon reviewing the same by the tender evaluation committee, it is observed that, the project Sl.no.04 Pg. No.114 was involved Preparation of Feasibility Study & DPR of Two lane project having length of 100 Km, which met the minimum requirement of one project having 50% of project length i.e. 19 Km. Hence, the request of the bidder is accepted by the tender evaluation committee and the final score given as 5 marks.

(ii) Regarding, Quality of Approach & Methodology and Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan @ S.No.2b & 2c of Annexure-A-2, the Bidder has represented to consider their submission as “Very Good” Category in all aspects to award full marks i.e. 5 out of 5. Upon reviewing the same by the tender evaluation committee, it is observed that, the bidder has not explained in detail about “Quality of Approach” Methodology and “Quality Audit Methodology” in line with Activities & schedules. Hence, the request of the bidder is disallowed by the tender evaluation committee and the initial score remains unchanged, i.e., cumulative marks scored 2.5 marks.

(iii) Regarding, Qualification of Key Personnel (4b. Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer), the M.Tech pursued by the key expert is now accepted and marks have given accordingly, for this criteria. i.e., 9.9/10.

(iii) Considering the above, the Committee has revised the Final Scores of the firm, M/s Satra Services and Solutions Private limited, Telegana is as under:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self - Evaluation	Initial Evaluation by NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	34.75	35
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	2.5	2.5

[Signature]

A.N. Praveen Kumar

[Signature]

[Signature]

[Signature]

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self - Evaluation	Initial Evaluation by NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
3	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37.91	37.56	37.96
	Total	100	97.91	94.81	95.46

E) M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Stella Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd., vide Letter dated 02.12.2025 has raised certain objections towards the initial evaluation done by NHAI w.r.t Firm Evaluation. The details are as under:

(i) Regarding the Experience in Hand DPR of NHAI Projects, the bidder represented to consider the 3 nos. Projects by submitting the share details. The Committee of opinion that, the share of JV details submitted now, shall not be considered, which violets the Cl.13B of ITC/RFP and therefore the same has not been acceded. Hence there is no change in the Final scores.

(ii) Further, regarding Site Appreciation, Quality of Approach & Methodology and Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan @ S.No.2a, b & 2c of Annexure-A-2, it is observed that, the bidder has not explained in detail about "Quality of Approach" Methodology and "Quality Audit Methodology" in line with Activities & schedules. Hence, the request of the bidder is disallowed by the tender evaluation committee and the initial score remains unchanged, i.e., cumulative marks scored 2.75 marks

(ii) Considering the above, the Committee the Final Scores of the firm, M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Stella Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd., remains unchanged and the same as under:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self - Evaluation	Initial Evaluation by NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	29.5	29.5
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	2.75	2.75
3	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	36.60	36.60	36.60
	Total	100	96.60	88.85	88.85

F) M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd in Association with Maark Civil Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd., Maharashtra vide Letter dated 01.12.2025 has raised certain objections towards the initial evaluation done by NHAI w.r.t Firm Evaluation. The details are as under:

(i) Regarding the Experience in use of Technology for Road Inspection-Annexure A-3, the bidder represented to consider the MoU for NSV, Owned invoice for MBIU & ATCC, of their originally submitted

A-N-Praveen Kumar

bid. After, reviewing the bid, the Committee confirmed that, MoU dated 29.04.2022 with TTK Construction and Invoice dated 18.04.2022 was found (in Pg.721-722) in the name of TTK Construction. Also, Invoice dated 31.06.2016 & 22.02.2016 were found in the Pg. no 820 & 874 of the bid in the name of the firm. Hence, the request of the bidder is accepted by the tender evaluation committee and the final score given as 20 marks for Annexure A-3 Category.

(ii) Considering the above, the Committee has revised the Final Scores of the firm, M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd in Association with Maark Civil Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd., is as under:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self - Evaluation	Initial Evaluation by NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	35	35
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	2.5	2.5
3	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	20	20	14	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37.89	37.65	37.65
	Total	100	97.89	89.15	95.15

G) M/s. Geo Designs & Research (P) Ltd., Gujarat vide Letter dated 04.12.2025, has raised certain objections towards the initial evaluation done by NHAI w.r.t Firm Evaluation. The details are as under:

(i) Regarding the Experience as IE/SC in at least one O&M project, the bidder represented to consider the Projects under O&M of their bid. Initially the bidder listed, all the works as under Construction (other than sl.no.01, which is O&M works). Now, after reviewing the same, the eligible works for maintenance, submitted in the bids are considered (Pg.116, 120, 123 & 134), which also qualifies the minimum 50% of Project lengths and the Committee accepted. Hence, score has given to 8 for the Category.

(ii) Regarding Site Appreciation, Quality of Approach & Methodology and Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan @ S.No.2a, b & c of Annexure-A-2, the Bidder has represented to consider their submission as "Very Good" Category in all aspects to award full marks i.e. 5 out of 5 under this category in Annexure-A-2. Upon reviewing the same by the tender evaluation committee, it is observed that, the bidder has not visited the site physically and has not explained about "Quality of Approach & Methodology", "Quality Audit Methodology" in line with Activities & schedules, in their submitted bid. Hence, the request of the bidder is disallowed by the tender evaluation committee and the initial score remains unchanged, i.e., cumulative marks scored 2 marks.

(iii) Considering the above, the Committee has revised the Final Scores of the firm, M/s. Geo Designs & Research (P) Ltd., Gujarat is as under:

 A.N. Phavani   

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self - Evaluation	Initial Evaluation by NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	33	35
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	2	2
3	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	39.47	37.11	37.11
	Total	100	99.47	92.11	94.11

H) M/s. Saptagon Asia Private Limited in Association with M/s. CivilMantra Infracon Limited, Haryana vide Letter dated 28.11.2025, has raised certain objections towards the initial evaluation done by NHAI w.r.t Firm Evaluation. The details are as under:

(i) Regarding the Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business (Min 5 Crore) @ S.No.1b of Annexure-A-1, the bidder has represented that the firm having more than Rs.50 Cr of Turnover and requested to award full marks in this category. Upon examining the submitted bid, the bidder has submitted CA Certificate describes the Turnover only for last three years. Accordingly, the Committee has evaluated the Average Annual Turnover and awarded 1.5 marks. Hence, the request of the bidder is disallowed by the tender evaluation committee and the initial score remains unchanged.

(ii) Regarding the Experience as IE/SC in at least one O&M project, the bidder represented that the firm having more than 5 no. of projects and requested to award full marks in this category. Upon examining the submitted bid, the bidder has submitted only 3 works and the same has already been considered. Hence, the request of the bidder is disallowed by the tender evaluation committee and the initial score remains unchanged.

(iii) Considering the above, the Committee has revised the Final Scores of the firm, M/s. Saptagon Asia Private Limited in Association with M/s. CivilMantra Infracon Limited, Haryana is as under:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self - Evaluation	Initial Evaluation by NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	33.5	33.5
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	2	2
3	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	36.10	36.64	36.64
	Total	100	96.10	92.14	92.14

A-N. Praveen

5. The remaining one bidder, **M/s Bloom Companies LLC in Association with Bloom Infrastructure & Logistics Pvt. Ltd., Haryana** has not raised any observations w.r.t Initial evaluation by NHAI. Therefore, the same shall be kept as final score.

6. In view of the re-evaluation conducted by the Tender Evaluation Committee based on the requests of 8 nos. of bidders, Final scores of the bidders are tabulated hereunder;

S. No	Name of the Bidder	Bid ID	Self-Evaluation	Initial scores evaluated by NHAI	Final scores evaluated by NHAI	Rank
1	M/s Artefact Projects Ltd in JV with Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with Renaissance IOT LLP., Nagpur.	881953	97.04	94.29	94.29	H-3
2	M/s MSPARK Futuristics & Associates., Noida	881960	93.85	90.85	91.35	H-8
3	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in Association with Bloom Infrastructure & Logistics Pvt. Ltd., Haryana	881986	97.16	93.40	93.40	H-6
4	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre, Bhopal	881987	97.29	93.74	93.74	H-5
5	M/s Satra Services and Solutions Private limited, Telegana	882011	97.91	94.81	95.46	H-1
6	M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Stella Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	882019	96.60	88.85	88.85	H-9
7	M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd in Association with Maark Civil Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd., Maharashtra	885172	97.89	89.15	95.15	H-2
8	M/s. Geo Designs & Research (P) Ltd., Gujarat	885452	99.47	92.11	94.11	H-4
9	M/s. Saptagon Asia Private Limited in Association with M/s. CivilMantra Infracon Limited, Haryana	885470	96.10	92.14	92.14	H-7

7) As per Clause 8 of Section-I ITC of RFP, top 5 ranking firms shall only be considered for further evaluation provided further evaluation provided none of them is in conflict of interest with the Contractor. Accordingly, the descending order of Top 5 rank of the firm who are qualified in Technical Evaluation is tabulated as below;

    

S. No	Name of the Bidder	Bid ID	Self-Evaluation	Initial scores evaluated by NHAI	Final scores evaluated by NHAI	Rank
1	M/s Satra Services and Solutions Private limited, Telegana	882011	97.91	94.81	95.46	H-1
2	M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd in Association with Maark Civil Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd., Maharashtra	885172	97.89	89.15	95.15	H-2
3	M/s Artefact Projects Ltd in JV with Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with Renaissance IOT LLP., Nagpur.	881953	97.04	94.29	94.29	H-3
4	M/s. Geo Designs & Research (P) Ltd., Gujarat	885452	99.47	92.11	94.11	H-4
5	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre, Bhopal	881987	97.29	93.74	93.74	H-5

In view of the above, the Tender Evaluation Committee further decided to meet at a convenient date & time for opening of Financial Bids of the technically qualified bidders upon receiving concurrence of the Competent Authority.


(Manas Chakrabarty)
Member


(S Ajithkumar)
Member


(Sumit Dewda)
Member


(A N Praveen Kumar)
Member


(R Murugaprakash)
Convener