

Subject: Minutes of the Procurement Evaluation Committee (PEC) held on 13.03.2025 for Awarding of the contract against ONGC Tender No. TC1AC24003 for “Construction of boundary wall and watch tower at gate no. 3 and gate no. 2 at Panchmukh stores, ONGC Tripura Asset, Agartala” after price bid opening.

Estimated cost put to tender: Rs. 5,44,80,734.00/-

Procurement Evaluation Committee (PEC) comprising of following officers met on 13.03.2025 to award the job of “Construction of boundary wall and watch tower at gate no. 3 and gate no. 2 at Panchmukh stores, ONGC Tripura Asset, Agartala” as per guidelines under IMMM Para 10.3.1:

1. Shri Anish Jain , GM (F&A) – Second (2nd) Level Finance
2. Shri N. Pannerselvam, GM (Civil) -L-III level (LM-Works).

PEC is assisted by tender dealing officer – Shri Ashwani Kumar Rajput, SE (Civil)

1. Background: e-Tenders through open tender was invited in two bid system for above mentioned work with details as under-

1.	Tender No.	TC1AC24003
2.	A/A &E/S	Rs 5,61,04,278.00 vide vide Disha File no. AGT/TA/SERVICES/ENGG-SER/WORKS/TECH-CELL/2023/BWALL/1098328
3.	PR NO.	2090060069
4.	Competent Sanctioning Authority	L-II in terms of BDP clause No 7.7 (a)
5.	Technical Sanction Amount	Rs 5,61,04,278.00 /-
6.	TS is accorded by	L-III as per Item no 23.1 of BDP 2015
7.	Estimated cost put to tender	Rs 5,44,80,734.00
8.	CPA	L-II as per Item No. 24.1(a) of BDP-2015
9.	Tender type	Percentage rate tender
10.	Bidding System	Two Bid System- Open Tender

11.	Duration of contract	09 (Nine) Months from the date of NOA / LOI/site handing over, whichever is later
12.	EMD	Rs 10,67,211.00
13.	Date of Publication of NIT	22.10.2024
14.	Opening date of Bid (TBO)	18.11.2024 at 15:30 hrs.
15.	Total Bids received on e-portal	3
16.	Bid Validity up to	17.04.2025
17.	CS Prepared on	26.11.2024
18.	CS Vetted by Finance on	18.12.2024
19.	File Sent for Technical Comment	19.12.2024
20.	Approved Technical Comments received on	23.12.2024
21.	Evaluation of bidders approved by CPA	26.12.2024
22.	1 st round of clarification sought on	26.12.2024
23.	Deficient Documents submission last date	31.12.2024
24.	Approved Technical Comments received on (after 1 st round of clarification)	08.01.2025
25.	Approval to go for 2 nd round of clarification from CPA.	16.01.2025
26.	Approved Technical Comments received on (after 2 nd round of clarification)	03.02.2025
27.	Date of Opening of Price bids	12.02.2025
28.	Vetting of price Bids by Finance	19.02.2025

2.0 Observations and Deliberations:

Three (3) bids were received in the instant tender. Bid of M/s Cyclique Energy LLP (1/3) was rejected due to Technical as well as commercial Non-qualification. After CPA approval on 03.02.2025 for opening of Price bid of 02 no. of TA/CA bidder (M/s Tapan Saha & M/s Samir Lal Saha was opened on 12.02.2025 in the CPPP portal.

Price Bid Comparative statement was prepared and sent to Finance Section for CS vetting on 12.02.2025. Price Bid CS was vetted in Finance Section on 19.02.2025. Price bid CS details is as under:-

Quote:

Sub: Techno-commercial evaluation of offers received from bidder's in respect of Tender no. TC1AC24003

NAME OF WORK: Construction of boundary wall and watch tower at gate no. 3 and gate no. 2 at Panchmukh stores, ONGC Tripura Asset, Agartala.

Estimated Cost put to Tender: Rs. 5,44,80,734.00/-

After obtaining approval of CPA (L-II level officer) to open the price bids of two TA/CA bidders (M/s Tapan Saha & M/s Samir Lal Saha), bidders were informed vide etender.gov.in (CPP portal) notification dated 10.02.2025 about the opening of price bids on 12.02.2025 at 16:30 hours.

Price bids of all two bidders who are TA/CA were opened on 12.02.2025 at 1630 hours (Price bid placed at **Annexure-19 and Annexure-20** and system generated BOQ comparative chart is placed at **Annexure-21**).

Price Bid comparative Statement (CS) is prepared and is as under:

Sl. No.	Bid No	Name of Bidder	Price Quoted (in %)	Offered Price (In Rs.)	Remarks (Ranking)
1	765269	M/s Tapan Saha	3.00 % above	Rs.5,61,15,156.00	L-II
2	765296	M/s Samir Lal Saha	1.15 % Below	Rs. 5,38,54,206.00	L-I

Submitted for following:

- 1) Vetting of the Price Bid CS by Finance (E-4 & above level officer) as per the IMMM clause no. 13.3.8.
- 2) HES and Head Finance is requested to may kindly nominate L-III level officer from Tender processing group and 2nd level Finance officer respectively for Procurement Evaluation As per IMMM clause no. 10.3.1.

Unquote

Bids of above 02 bidders have been qualified technically & commercially. Lowest L-1 rate is ₹ 5,38,54,206.00/- (incl. of GST) offered by M/s Samir Lal Saha among above 02 price bids.

3.0 Reasonability of Rates:

Tender Committee perused IMMM provision regarding reasonability of rates which reads as under:

Quote:

14.1 Reasonability of rates

14.1.1 Rate reasonability will be applicable in cost only or L-1 selection/evaluation methodology. Tender Committee shall be required to establish and certify the reasonability of rates of L-1 bidder received in a tender. Rate reasonability can be established in comparison to cost estimates and / or last purchase rate (if available) and / or price trends prevailing in the market (if the same can be determined depending on either the type of items being purchased or if there is any published documents / data reflecting the price trends or if there is relationship between raw material being used in manufacture of items like steel is used for manufacture of tubular goods). When purchase does not fall under purview of tender committee, dealing officer of MM in consultation with Indentor and Finance shall ascertain the rate reasonability and put up the proposals for approval of CPA. For cases dealt by departments other than MM but MM support is required as per BDP, rate reasonability shall be ascertained by dealing officer in consultation with finance and MM. In such cases minimum E-2 level of executives shall be consulted. While ascertaining the reasonability of rates, comparison should be first done with Cost Estimates/LPR (wherever available) without applying any escalation factor. Thereafter, suitable escalation factor, if any, needs to be considered for ascertaining the reasonability of rates. Accordingly, the case shall be processed for finalization, if the rates of L-1 bidder are considered to be reasonable on the basis of above analysis. Wherever the rates of L-1 bidder are substantially high as compared to cost estimates / or LPR or not in line with the price trend prevailing in the market, a decision shall be taken as to whether price negotiation need to be conducted.

Unquote:

PEC deliberated that in view of the provisions of MM Manual, Rate reasonability can be established in comparison to cost estimates.

PEC deliberated the issue related to reasonability of rates in terms of Para no. 14.1.1 of IMMM & opined as under:

(i). Offered price of M/s Samir Lal Saha is 1.15 % below w,r,t estimated cost put to tender.

(ii). Circular No. 9/2015 (No. MAT/PMC/13(60) 2015 dated 20.2.15) issued by PMC on the subject "Workability of rates" stipulates as hereunder- EPC, in its meeting (04/2015) held on 30/31.1.2015 has directed that provisions on establishing workability of rates need not be followed, till further orders.

However, provisions of Integrated MM Manual for establishing the reasonability of rates shall be continued to be followed."

Now, as per the above guidelines, the workability of rates need not be ascertained vide Circular No. 9/2015 (No. MAT/PMC/13(60) 2015 dated 20.02.2015) issued by PMC.

In order to establish rate reasonability, it is imperative to state that a number of tenders in the Civil Engineering Department have been awarded at quoted rates which are above/At PAR/below the estimated cost put to tender in the recent times.

(iii). PEC was apprised that the cost estimate of ₹ 5,44,80,734.00/- is prepared based on TPWD SOR 2023 & DSR 2023 and the rates quoted by the L-1 bidder is 1.15 % below the estimated cost. Technical member apprised PEC that, recently, similar tender ‘Construction and repair of boundary wall, patrolling track and concertina coil at production installations of Tripura Asset, ONGC’ was got awarded at AT PAR rate to the estimate cost. Additionally, it is in the very interest of the organization to accept the tender at cost which is lower than the estimated cost put to tender.

In view of aforesaid, the PEC opined that the rates quoted by L-1 bidder which is 1.15 (%) below the estimated cost may be considered as reasonable as per PMC Circular No. 09/2015 dated 20.02.2015.

4.0 Comparison of L-1 offered rate with Cost estimates

PEC opined that the estimated cost put to tender for complete scope of work for the job of “Construction of boundary wall and watch tower at gate no. 3 and gate no. 2 at Panchmukh stores, ONGC Tripura Asset, Agartala” is ₹ 5,44,80,734.00/- (inclusive of GST). Compared to cost estimate, the rate quoted by the L-1 bidder M/s Samir Lal Saha is 1.15 % lower than tender estimated cost as deliberated above.

Comparison of offered price by L-1 bidder with estimated cost is tabulated as below:

Sl. No.	Job Description	Prices as per Estimated cost (in INR) (incl. of GST)	Price quoted by L-1 bidder (in INR) (incl. of GST)
1	Construction of boundary wall and watch tower at gate no. 3 and gate no. 2 at Panchmukh stores, ONGC Tripura Asset, Agartala	₹ 5,44,80,734.00/-	₹ 5,38,54,206.00
Percentage difference of L-1 quoted price (in INR) w.r.t. Total estimated cost put to tender (in INR)			(-) 1.15 %

From the above table PEC noted that the L-1 quoted rate is 1.15 % lower than the cost estimates.

5.0 Financial Implication

Based on the offer submitted by the L-1 bidder M/s Samir Lal Saha, Tender Committee observed that the 'Financial Implication' would work out to as follows:

S. No.	Job Description	Offered Price of L-1 bidder (in INR) (incl. of GST)
1	Construction of boundary wall and watch tower at gate no. 3 and gate no. 2 at Panchmukh stores, ONGC Tripura Asset, Agartala	₹ 5,38,54,206.00

6.0 Expenditure Sanction

Tender Committee noted that, Vide PR No. 2090060069, total estimated cost put to tender exists for an amount of ₹ 5,44,80,734.00/- (incl. of GST). The total financial implication as mentioned above (i.e., at para 5.0) works out to ₹ 5,38,54,206.00 (incl. of GST) and therefore total financial implication are within the estimated cost put to tender.

7.0 PEC Recommendations

In view of above deliberations, PEC recommends as following and approval sought:

- (i) To award the contract to lowest price bidder i.e. L1 bidder M/s Samir Lal Saha (3/3) at a total cost of ₹ 5,38,54,206.00 (incl. of 18 % GST), as per details drawn at para 5.0 above, for Construction of boundary wall and watch tower at gate no. 3 and gate no. 2 at Panchmukh stores, ONGC Tripura Asset, Agartala. under IMMM 15.1.1
- (ii) EMD may be refunded to unsuccessful bidder M/S Tapan Saha (2/3)

Recommendations at para 7.0 (i) & (ii) requires approval of CPA.

CPA may approve for PEC Recommendations at Para 7.0

Type of Tender	:	Open e-tender bidding with two bid system
Expenditure Sanction	:	₹ Rs. 5,61,04,278.00 /- as per PR No. 2090060069
Tender Value	:	₹ 5,44,80,734.00/-
L-1 offered rate	:	₹ 5,38,54,206.00 /- (incl. of GST)
CPA of the case	:	L-II in terms of para 24.1 (a) of BDP
Validity of offer	:	17.04.2025

Submitted for approval please.

N PANNEER SELVAM
(General Manager (Civil))

Recommended & Electronically Signed by:
N PANNEER SELVAM - 77563 (General
Manager (Civil))
TRIPURA ENGG SER WORKS - AGAR
On : 19/03/2025(18:11:45)

ANISH JAIN
(General Manager (F & A))

**Recommended & Electronically Signed
by:**
ANISH JAIN - 68776 (General Manager (F
& A))
TRIPURA FINANCE - AGAR
On : 20/03/2025(10:30:10)

Case is submitted to CPA for approval of TC recommendations.

Electronically Signed & Submitted by:
ASHWANI KUMAR RAJPUT - 122384 (Suptdg.Engr.(Civil))
TRIPURA ENGG SER WORKS CIVIL MAINTENANCE - AGAR
On: 20/03/2025(13:53:51)

PEC recommendations are approved.

Electronically Signed & Submitted by :
ALOK VASHISTHA - 78398 (Ch.General Manager (Mech))
TRIPURA ENGINEERING SERVICES - AGAR
On:20/03/2025(14:55:33)

kindly approve in Disha (system requirement) as the same needs to be used in CPPP portal.

Electronically Signed & Submitted by :
ASHWANI KUMAR RAJPUT - 122384 (Suptdg.Engr.(Civil))
TRIPURA ENGG SER WORKS CIVIL MAINTENANCE - AGAR
On:20/03/2025(15:03:59)

Approved & Electronically Signed by:
ALOK VASHISTHA - 78398 (Ch.General Manager (Mech))
TRIPURA ENGINEERING SERVICES - AGAR
On: 20/03/2025(15:50:03)

Electronically Signed & Submitted by :
GURI APPALANAIDU - 123763 (Suptdg.Engr.(Civil))
TRIPURA ENGG SER WORKS CIVIL - AGAR
On:07/04/2025(16:15:43)