



# भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय - गांधीनगर (गुजरात)

## National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India)

Regional Office - Gandhinagar (Gujarat)

दूरभाष / Phone : 079-29650607, 29650608 ई-मेल / e-mail : rogujarat@nhai.org

पहली मंजिल, बी.एस.एन.एल. टेलीफोन एक्सचेंज बिल्डिंग, "च" रोड, सेक्टर-11, गांधीनगर-382011 (गुजरात)

1<sup>st</sup> Floor, BSNL Telephone Exchange Building, "CH" Road, Sector-11, Gandhinagar-382011(Gujarat)



NHAI/ROGNER/Godhra-GujBrdr/NH-47/IE/OM/2024/D-676

21.02.2025

To

All Bidders (As per list enclosed)

**Sub:** Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Laning of Godhra to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBFOT mode under NHDP Phase III [Tender ID: 2024\_NHAI\_211630\_1]- Evaluation of Representations - Reg.

**Ref:** (i) NHAI letter No. 258 dt 22.01.2025 regarding evaluation of Technical Bids.

Dear Sir,

Kindly refer NHAI letter dated 22.01.2025 vide which result of technical evaluation was intimated to the bidders and bidders were given opportunity to respond within seven days, in case of any objection.

2. The representations were received from below-mentioned bidders:

- (i) M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kaius Consulting Private Limited
- (ii) M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CADD Centre
- (iii) M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd.

3. The bid of ~~M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd~~ was declared as Non-Responsive, as the lead member of the bidder was failing to meet the minimum eligibility criteria - *"The firm should have experience of Project Supervision/IE of at least two construction projects of four/six laning\*\* of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length"* - required as per clause 12(A) of Section-I of RFP.

Further, the JV partner M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd was failing to meet the minimum eligibility criteria - *"The firm should have prepared DPR/FS cum PPR for at least Two projects of 4/6 laning\*\* of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length."* - required as per clause 12(A) of Section-I of RFP.

3.1 The representation of the bidder with respect to the JV partner M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd was examined and based on the supporting documents provided by the bidder, in support to the certificates present in the original bid, the JV member is found to be meeting the eligibility criteria for experience in DPR/FS cum PPR as per RFP.

3.2 With respect to the Lead Member, the bidder's representation has been examined. However, based on the documents submitted in the bid and in the bidder's representation, no eligible experience meeting the criteria have been found.

In view of above, the bid of ~~M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd~~ remains Non-Responsive.

*Amit*

1 of 2

4. The representations as received have been examined and replies to the representation as approved by Competent Authority is enclosed at **Annexure- I**.

5. It has been found that after reviewing the bids based on representations of the bidders, there are no changes in the technical evaluation of the bids. A summary of final marks is as below:

| Applicant No. | Name of Applicant                                                                           | Technical Score | Technical Rank |
|---------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|----------------|
| 1/4           | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kaius Consulting Private Limited | 90.39           | 3              |
| 2/4           | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CADD Centre           | 96.27           | 2              |
| 3/4           | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.            | 96.66           | 1              |
| 4/4           | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd      | Non-Responsive  | -              |

6 As per clause 5.3 and 5.4 of Section 2 of RFP, the financial proposals of the above mentioned three technically responsive bidders will be opened on **24.02.2025 at 1600 Hrs** at RO Gandhinagar, NHAI. Accordingly, the bidders may depute their representatives with authorization letter for attending the opening of financial bids.

*यह सक्षम प्राधिकारी के अनुमोदन से प्रस्तुत है।*

भवदीय



(Amrit Meena)

**Dy. General Manager (Tech)  
for Regional Officer, Gandhinagar**

**ANNEXURE-I**

(to letter no. 676 dated 21.02.2025)

**Sub:** Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Laning of Godhra to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBFOT mode under NHDP Phase III [Tender ID - 2024\_NHAI\_211630\_1]

**Replies to Bidders' Representations**

| S. No.  | Firm's Representation                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Reply                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|---------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| A.      | <b>M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kaius Consulting Private Limited</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| A (i)   | <p><b>Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years</b></p> <p>Two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or One project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length</p> <p>Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks.</p> <p>Present Marks – 4/5</p> <p>Please refer Completed DPR projects submitted for consideration. It is requested to award 4.25 marks for the said criteria.</p>                                                | <p>Based on the representation, the projects under this criteria "Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years" has been reviewed and only 1(one) eligible project experience has been found to meet the mentioned criterion.</p> <p>Accordingly, the marks for this criterion shall remain unchanged.</p> |
| A (ii)  | <p><b>In hand DPRs of NHAI Projects ( presently under progress)</b></p> <p>For DPR project length &gt; the length of project for which RFP invited -<b>5 Marks</b></p> <p>For DPR project length &gt; two times the length of project for which RFP invited -<b>7.5 Marks</b></p> <p>For project length &gt; three times the length of project for which RFP invited - <b>10 Marks.</b></p> <p>Present Marks – 7.5/10</p> <p>Please refer ongoing DPR projects of NHAI submitted for consideration. Total length of in hand DPRs of NHAI is 291.49 Km. Therefore, it is requested to award full marks for the said criteria. i.e 10 Marks..</p> | <p>Based on the documents submitted in the bid and in representation, the projects under this criteria "In-Hand DPRs of NHAI Project" has been reviewed and more than twice the project length of eligible in-hand DPRs of NHAI have been found.</p> <p>Accordingly, the marks for this criterion shall remain unchanged.</p>                                                                                                                      |
| A (iii) | <p><b>Experience as Independent Engineer/ Supervision Consultants one O&amp;M project under DBFOT/ OMT/O&amp;M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years</b></p> <p>1 project - 6 marks</p> <p>Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | <p>Based on the representation, the projects under this criteria "Experience as IE / Supervision Consultants one O&amp;M project under DBFOT/ OMT/O&amp;M of four/ six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years" has been reviewed. Projects wherein less than 90% of original duration of</p>                                                                                                                                            |

| S. No.       | Firm's Representation                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Reply                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|--------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|              | <p>Present Marks – 6/8</p> <p>Please refer to the mentioned projects submitted for consideration It is requested to award 7 marks for the said criteria.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | <p>work as per contract is completed have not been considered. Accordingly, only 1 (one) eligible projects has been found to meet the mentioned criterion.</p> <p>Accordingly, the marks for this criterion remain unchanged.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| A (iv)       | <p><b>Bridge/Structural Engineer: Mr. Rohit Ramesh Bandichode</b></p> <p><b>Experience in similar capacity in Construction/ Construction Supervision of Bridge/ Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation of 4/6 lane highway/ expressway or similar project.</b></p> <p><b>1 Project -16</b><br/> <b>Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) mark</b></p> <p><b>Present marks – 16/20</b></p> <p><b>Infracon Project No: 1,3,5; Score – 18/20</b></p> | <p>The said CV has been reviewed in view of representation submitted by the bidder.</p> <p>As required in the criteria, only those projects have been considered wherein experience is in similar capacity in Construction / construction supervision of structure including rehabilitation of structures that are part of 4/6 lane highway/ expressway.</p> <p>Accordingly, as per the INFRACON CV submitted by the bidder, only one project has been found eligible, which corresponds to 16 marks.</p> <p>Accordingly, marks for this sub-criterion shall remain unchanged.</p> |
| A (v)        | <p><b>Road Safety Expert: Mrs. Madhavi Shivraj Pawar</b></p> <p><b>Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audit of 4/6 Lane highway/ Expressway projects.</b><br/> <b>1 no. -12 Marks</b><br/> <b>Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 3(three) marks.</b></p> <p><b>Present marks – 14/15</b></p> <p><b>Infracon Project No: 2,3,5,6,12; Score – 15/15</b></p>                                                                                                       | <p>The said CV has been reviewed in view of representation submitted by the bidder.</p> <p>As required in the criteria, only those projects have been considered wherein experience is in similar capacity in Road Safety Audit is for 4/6 lane highway/ expressway.</p> <p>Accordingly, as per the INFRACON CV submitted by the bidder, only three projects have been found eligible, which corresponds to 14 marks.</p> <p>Accordingly, marks for this sub-criterion shall remain unchanged.</p>                                                                                 |
| <b>B.</b>    | <b>M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Highway Engineering Consultant</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| <b>B (i)</b> | <p>1. Category "Relevant experience of the firm for the assignment".</p> <p>(a) We have awarded lesser marks have been awarded to our firm under the category "Relevant experience for the assignment" Sub-category " The firm should have prepared DPR/FS cum PPR for at least two projects of</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                           | <p>Based on the representation, the projects under this criteria "Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project t</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |

| S. No.       | Firm's Representation                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Reply                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|--------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|              | <p><b>4/6 Lanning**of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 Lanning of 50% of project length "</b>.<br/>We awarded only 04.50 marks out of maximum 05.00 marks in the evaluation.</p> <p>In pursuance of above provision of the RFP document we have submitted the projects along with documents in our technical proposal for the captioned project.</p> <p>As per the above details we request your good self to consider the above mention projects in the technical evaluation under the sub- category "Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 2/4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project t of 2/4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years".</p> <p>Thus we are request to kindly award full <b>5.00 marks</b> out of maximum <b>5.00 marks</b> in place of <b>4.50 marks</b> awarded to our firm under the sub category "Experience in DPR/feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 2/4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 2/4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years".</p> <p>Thus on the basis of above details we are eligible for award of 35.00 marks out of maximum 35.00 marks in place of 34.50 marks awarded to our firm under the category "Relevant experience of the firm for the assignment" in the technical evaluation.</p> | <p>of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years" has been reviewed. The projects whose experience is older than 7 years from the bid due date have not been considered. Accordingly, only 3 (three) eligible projects have been found to meet the mentioned criterion.</p> <p>Accordingly, the marks for this criterion remain unchanged.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| <b>C.</b>    | <b>M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| <b>C (i)</b> | <p>With reference to above subject and letter under reference, our company has been declared non responsive for the above work. The detailed reply of observation on our proposal are elaborated as under.</p> <p>1. Clause 12.1(A) : DPR Eligibility<br/><b>"The firm should have prepared DPR/FS cum PPR for at least two projects of 4/6 Lanning**of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 Lanning of 50% of project length."</b></p> <p>As per attached Annexure "I" our JV partner has One DPR Project experience whose length 66.15 Kms. is greater than 50% of Project length i.e.43.55 kms. So JV partner fulfils the above eligibility criteria for DPR Project of 4/6 Lanning.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | <p>Based on the representation, the experience of JV/ other member for this criteria has been reviewed based on documents submitted in the bid, and supporting document provided in the representation. The Other/JV partner is found to be having experience in 1 (one) eligible project in this criteria.</p> <p>Accordingly, the other/JV partner is meeting the eligibility criteria - "Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project t of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years".</p> |

| S. No. | Firm's Representation                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Reply                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|--------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| C (ii) | <p>"The firm should have experience of project Supervision/IE of a. at least two construction projects of 4/6 Lanning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6Lanning of 50% of project length."</p> <p>As per attached Annexure "2" Lead Partner has two Supervision Projects experience (one Independent Engineer (IE) Project 105.06 Kms and one Authority Engineer (AE) Project 45.054 Kms.) whose length is greater than 50% of Project Length i.e. 43.55 Kms. So lead partner fulfils the above eligibility criteria for Project supervision of 416 Lanning.</p> <p>Therefore, you are kindly requested to consider our technical proposal responsive as per above clarification and re-evaluate it for further stages.</p> | <p>Based on the representation of the bidder, the experience of Lead Member for this criteria has been reviewed based on documents submitted in the bid, and supporting documents provided in the representation.</p> <p>However, as per the provided documents, no eligible experience meeting the criteria have been found.</p> <p>Accordingly, the bid of M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd remains Non-Responsive</p> |

List of Bidders

| Sr.No. | Name of the Bidder                                                                          |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1/4    | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kaius Consulting Private Limited |
| 2/4    | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CADD Centre           |
| 3/4    | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.            |
| 4/4    | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd      |

**Signature Not Verified**

Digitally signed by SAURABH GAUTAM  
Date: 2025.02.25 11:49:18 IST  
Location: eProcurement System for  
Central PSUs