

| Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Lining of Godhra to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBFOT mode under NHDP Phase III |                                                                                             |                                                          |                                    |                                                                                           |                                                                    |          |            |                             |                  |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|------------|-----------------------------|------------------|
| Summary of Marks                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                             |                                                          |                                    |                                                                                           |                                                                    |          |            |                             |                  |
| Final Comparative Technical Evaluation Score.                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Name of Bidder                                                                              | Relevant Experience for the assignment*                  | Proposed work plan and Methodology | Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection | Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment# |          | Total      | Responsive / Non-Responsive | Rank of the Firm |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                             |                                                          |                                    |                                                                                           | Assessed                                                           | Assessed |            |                             |                  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Maximum marks                                                                               | 35                                                       | 5                                  | 20                                                                                        | 40                                                                 | 100      |            |                             |                  |
| 1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kaius Consulting Private Limited | 29.50                                                    | 5.00                               | 20.00                                                                                     | 35.89                                                              | 90.39    | Responsive | 3                           |                  |
| 4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CADD Centre           | 34.50                                                    | 5.00                               | 20.00                                                                                     | 36.77                                                              | 96.27    | Responsive | 2                           |                  |
| 5                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.            | 34.50                                                    | 5.00                               | 20.00                                                                                     | 37.16                                                              | 96.66    | Responsive | 1                           |                  |
| 6                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd      | The bidder did not meet the minimum eligibility criteria |                                    |                                                                                           |                                                                    |          |            |                             | -                |

4/12

| Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Laning of Godhra to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBFOT mode under NHDP Phase III |                                                                                             |                                                    |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------|
| List of Applicants                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                             |                                                    |
| Applicant No                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Name of the Applicant                                                                       | Status of the Applicant<br>Sole/JV/<br>Association |
| 1/4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kaius Consulting Private Limited | Association                                        |
| 2/4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CADD Centre           | Association                                        |
| 3/4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.            | Association                                        |
| 4/4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd      | JV                                                 |

| Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Lining of Godhira to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBEOT mode under NHDP Phase III |                                                                                                                 |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|--|--|--|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                 |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
| Applicant No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                 | Max Marks |  |  |  | 1/4                                                                                          | 2/4                                                                              | 3/4                                                                              | 4/4                                                                                    |
| Name of the Applicant                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                 |           |  |  |  | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Julius Consulting Private Limited | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CAD Centre | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd. | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd |
| Name of Key Personnel                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                 |           |  |  |  | Chandola Vishwakarma                                                                         | T B Siddara                                                                      | Ankush Shankhwar                                                                 | Ashutosh Bharti                                                                        |
| Description                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                 |           |  |  |  | Assessed marks                                                                               | Assessed marks                                                                   | Assessed marks                                                                   | Assessed marks                                                                         |
| 1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | General Qualification                                                                                           | 25        |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
| i)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Graduate in Civil Engineering                                                                                   | 21        |  |  |  | 21                                                                                           | 21                                                                               | 21                                                                               |                                                                                        |
| ii)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Post Graduation in Highway Engineering                                                                          | 4         |  |  |  | 0                                                                                            | 0                                                                                | 0                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Adequacy for the Project                                                                                        | 70        |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
| a)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Professional Experience in Highway Projects:                                                                    |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
| i)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Experience in highway works (inspection /design/ construction/ maintenance)                                     |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | < 7 years -0                                                                                                    |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 7 years -22                                                                                                     |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.        | 30        |  |  |  | 30                                                                                           | 30                                                                               | 30                                                                               |                                                                                        |
| ii)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature                   |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | < 3 year - 0                                                                                                    |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 3 years -12                                                                                                     | 15        |  |  |  | 15                                                                                           | 15                                                                               | 15                                                                               |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Add one marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.                  |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
| iii)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/ Maintenance works of 4/6 Lining/ Expressways |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 1 project -20                                                                                                   | 25        |  |  |  | 25                                                                                           | 25                                                                               | 25                                                                               |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.                                                 |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
| 3                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Employment with the Firm                                                                                        |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | < 1 year -0                                                                                                     |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 1 year -3                                                                                                       | 5         |  |  |  | 0                                                                                            | 0                                                                                | 3                                                                                |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks                                               |           |  |  |  |                                                                                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Total                                                                                                           | 100       |  |  |  | 91                                                                                           | 91                                                                               | 94                                                                               | 0                                                                                      |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Weightage @ 12                                                                                                  | 12        |  |  |  | 10.92                                                                                        | 10.92                                                                            | 11.28                                                                            | 0                                                                                      |

The bidder did not meet the minimum eligibility criteria

| Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Laning of Godhra to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBEOT mode under NHDP Phase III |                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|-----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| Bridge / Structural Engineer                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
| Applicant No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                       |  | Max Marks | 1/4                                                                                          |     | 2/4                                                                             |      | 3/4                                                                              |     | 4/4                                                                                    |  |
| Name of the Applicant                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |           | M/s Dhiruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kalus Consulting Private Limited |     | M/s L N Mahiya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CAD Centre |      | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd. |     | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd |  |
| Name of Key Personnel                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |           | Assessed marks                                                                               |     | Assessed marks                                                                  |      | Assessed marks                                                                   |     | Assessed marks                                                                         |  |
| 1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | General Qualification                                                                                                                                                                 |  |           | 25                                                                                           |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
| i)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Graduate in Civil Engineering                                                                                                                                                         |  |           | 21                                                                                           | 21  |                                                                                 | 21   |                                                                                  | 21  |                                                                                        |  |
| ii)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | III) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering                                                                                                                                        |  |           | 4                                                                                            | 0   |                                                                                 | 0    |                                                                                  | 0   |                                                                                        |  |
| 2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Adequacy for the Project                                                                                                                                                              |  |           | 70                                                                                           |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
| a)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Adequacy for the Project                                                                                                                                                              |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
| i)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Total Professional Experience                                                                                                                                                         |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | < 7 years -0                                                                                                                                                                          |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 7 years -22                                                                                                                                                                           |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks                                                                               |  |           | 30                                                                                           | 26  |                                                                                 | 30   |                                                                                  | 30  |                                                                                        |  |
| ii)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Experience in similar capacity in Design/Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Hyover/Interchanges/any other such structures including rehabilitation                  |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | < 3 years -0                                                                                                                                                                          |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 3 years - 16                                                                                                                                                                          |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.                                                                            |  |           | 20                                                                                           | 17  |                                                                                 | 20   |                                                                                  | 20  |                                                                                        |  |
| iii)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation of 4/6 lane highway/Expressway or similar |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 1 Project -16                                                                                                                                                                         |  |           | 20                                                                                           | 16  |                                                                                 | 18   |                                                                                  | 19  |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional Project subject to maximum 4(Four) marks                                                                                                   |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
| 3                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Employment with the Firm                                                                                                                                                              |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | < 1 year -0                                                                                                                                                                           |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 1 year -3                                                                                                                                                                             |  |           | 5                                                                                            | 5   |                                                                                 | 5    |                                                                                  | 0   |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks                                                                                                                     |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  |     |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Total                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |           | 100                                                                                          | 85  |                                                                                 | 94   |                                                                                  | 90  |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Weightage @ 4                                                                                                                                                                         |  |           | 4                                                                                            | 3.4 |                                                                                 | 3.76 |                                                                                  | 3.6 |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  | 0   |                                                                                        |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |           |                                                                                              |     |                                                                                 |      |                                                                                  | 0   |                                                                                        |  |

| Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Lining of Godhra to Gujarat/Madhy Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.300 in the State of Gujarat on DBEOT mode under NHDP Phase III |                                                                                                                  |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------|
| Road Safety Expert                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                  |  |  |  | 1/4                                                                                         | 2/4                                                                              | 3/4                                                                              | 4/4                                                                                    |                                                          |
| Applicant No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                  |  |  |  | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kalus Consulting Private Limited | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CAD Centre | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd. | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd |                                                          |
| Name of the Applicant                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                  |  |  |  | Assessed marks                                                                              | Assessed marks                                                                   | Assessed marks                                                                   | Assessed marks                                                                         |                                                          |
| Name of Key Personnel                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                  |  |  |  | Assessed marks                                                                              | Assessed marks                                                                   | Assessed marks                                                                   | Assessed marks                                                                         |                                                          |
| Description                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                  |  |  |  | Assessed marks                                                                              | Assessed marks                                                                   | Assessed marks                                                                   | Assessed marks                                                                         |                                                          |
| 1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | General Qualification                                                                                            |  |  |  | 25                                                                                          |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
| i)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Graduate in Civil Engineering                                                                                    |  |  |  | 21                                                                                          | 21                                                                               | 21                                                                               |                                                                                        |                                                          |
| ii)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | II) Post Graduation in Traffic/Transportation/Safety Engineering                                                 |  |  |  | 4                                                                                           | 0                                                                                | 0                                                                                | 0                                                                                      |                                                          |
| 2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Adequacy for the Project                                                                                         |  |  |  | 70                                                                                          |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
| a)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Professional Experience                                                                                          |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
| i)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Total Professional Experience                                                                                    |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | < 7 years -0                                                                                                     |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 7 years -22                                                                                                      |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.         |  |  |  | 30                                                                                          | 30                                                                               | 30                                                                               | 30                                                                                     |                                                          |
| ii)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety works on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (4/6 laning) |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        | The bidder did not meet the minimum eligibility criteria |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | < 3 years - 0                                                                                                    |  |  |  | 20                                                                                          | 20                                                                               | 20                                                                               | 20                                                                                     |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 3 years - 17                                                                                                     |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.                     |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
| iii)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audits of 4/6-laning Highway/Expressway projects                   |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 1 Project- 12 Marks                                                                                              |  |  |  | 15                                                                                          | 14                                                                               | 15                                                                               | 15                                                                                     |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.                     |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
| iv)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Experience in similar capacity in preparation of Road Safety Management Plan for Inter Urban Highways.           |  |  |  | 5                                                                                           | 5                                                                                | 5                                                                                | 5                                                                                      |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 1 project- 3                                                                                                     |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | More than 1 project - 5                                                                                          |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
| 3                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Employment with the Firm                                                                                         |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | < 1 year -0                                                                                                      |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 1 year -3                                                                                                        |  |  |  | 5                                                                                           | 5                                                                                | 5                                                                                | 5                                                                                      |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks                                                |  |  |  |                                                                                             |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |                                                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Total                                                                                                            |  |  |  | 100                                                                                         | 95                                                                               | 96                                                                               | 96                                                                                     | 0                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Weightage @ 5                                                                                                    |  |  |  | 5                                                                                           | 4.75                                                                             | 4.8                                                                              | 4.8                                                                                    | 0                                                        |

| Sr.No. | Name of the Bidder                                                                     | Relevant experience for the assignment (35)                                                | Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology (5) | Experience in use of technology for road inspection (20) | Key Staff for the assignment (40) | Total Marks (100) |
|--------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------|
| 2/4    | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CADD Centre      | 34.50                                                                                      | 5.00                                                  | 20.00                                                    | 36.77                             | 96.27             |
| 3/4    | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.       | 34.50                                                                                      | 5.00                                                  | 20.00                                                    | 37.16                             | 96.66             |
| 4/4    | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd | The bidder failed to meet minimum evaluation criteria as per clause 15 of Section-I of RFP |                                                       |                                                          |                                   |                   |

2. The detailed evaluation sheet for the responsive Bidders is enclosed herewith (Annexure of 12 pages). Bidders are given opportunity to respond within 7 days of issue of this letter, in case of any objection and to submit the requisite details/documents within this period.

यह सक्षम प्राधिकारी के अनुमोदन से प्रस्तुत है।

भवदीय

  
(Amrit Meena)

**Dy. General Manager (Tech)  
for Regional Officer, Gandhinagar**

| Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Lining of Godhra to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBFOT mode under NHDP Phase III |                                   |             |                                                                                             |       |                |                                                                                   |       |                |                                                                                  |       |                |                                                                                        |       |                |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|----------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|----------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|----------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|----------------|
| Summary Sheet of CV's                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                   |             |                                                                                             |       |                |                                                                                   |       |                |                                                                                  |       |                |                                                                                        |       |                |
| S. No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Details                           | Total Marks | 1/4                                                                                         |       |                | 2/4                                                                               |       |                | 3/4                                                                              |       |                | 4/4                                                                                    |       |                |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                   |             | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kaius Consulting Private Limited |       |                | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CADD Centre |       |                | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd. |       |                | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd |       |                |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                   |             | Name                                                                                        | Score | Weighted score | Name                                                                              | Score | Weighted score | Name                                                                             | Score | Weighted score | Name                                                                                   | Score | Weighted score |
| 1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Team Leader cum Highway Engineer  | 19          | Shri Ram Singh                                                                              | 88.5  | 16.82          | Bharat Kumar                                                                      | 91    | 17.29          | Verma Ramsingh                                                                   | 92    | 17.48          | Dinesh Kumar Agarwal                                                                   |       |                |
| 2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Maintenance cum Resident Engineer | 12          | Chandulal Vishwakarma                                                                       | 91    | 10.92          | T B Siddaraj                                                                      | 91    | 10.92          | Ankush Shankdhar                                                                 | 94    | 11.28          | Ashutosh Bhatt                                                                         |       |                |
| 3                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Bridge / Structural Engineer      | 4           | Rohit Ramesh Bandichode                                                                     | 85    | 3.40           | Ankur Singh Rana                                                                  | 94    | 3.76           | Ajeet Pandey                                                                     | 90    | 3.60           | Arun Verma                                                                             |       |                |
| 4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Road Safety Expert                | 5           | Madhavi Shivraj Pawar                                                                       | 95    | 4.75           | Sapna Verma                                                                       | 96    | 4.80           | Soni Pragnesh                                                                    | 96    | 4.80           | Ravi Kumar Singhal                                                                     |       |                |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                   | 40          |                                                                                             |       | 35.89          |                                                                                   |       | 36.77          |                                                                                  |       | 37.16          |                                                                                        |       | 0.00           |

| Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Lining of Godhra to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBFOT mode under NHDP Phase III |               |                                                                                             |                                                                                   |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology                                                                                                                                                                                                          |               |                                                                                             |                                                                                   |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
| Description                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Maximum Marks | 1/4                                                                                         | 2/4                                                                               | 3/4                                                                              | 4/4                                                                                    |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |               | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kalus Consulting Private Limited | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CADD Centre | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd. | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |               | Marks assessed                                                                              | Marks assessed                                                                    | Marks assessed                                                                   | Marks assessed                                                                         |
| <b>Site Appreciation</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |               |                                                                                             |                                                                                   |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
| (i) Average 0.50<br>(ii) Good 0.75<br>(iii) Very Good 1.00                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 1             | 1                                                                                           | 1                                                                                 | 1                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| <b>Quality of Approach and Methodology</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |               |                                                                                             |                                                                                   |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
| (Review of scope of work and design review, construction supervision methodology, contract management approach, safety review/audit and O&M stage, initial view on project plan including key challenges envisaged and potential solutions to be judged).  | 2             | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                 | 2                                                                                | The bidder did not meet the minimum eligibility criteria                               |
| (i) Average 0.75<br>(ii) Good 1.50<br>(iii) Very Good 2.00                                                                                                                                                                                                 |               |                                                                                             |                                                                                   |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
| <b>Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                |               |                                                                                             |                                                                                   |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
| (i) Average 0.75<br>(ii) Good 1.50<br>(iii) Very Good 2.00                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 2             | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                 | 2                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| <b>Total Marks</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 5             | 5                                                                                           | 5                                                                                 | 5                                                                                | 0                                                                                      |

| Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Lining of Godhira to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBFOT mode under NHDP Phase III |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |             |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------|-----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--|
| FIRMS RELEVANT EXPERIENCE FOR THE ASSIGNMENT                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |             |           |                                                                                             | ANNEXURE-A1                                                                          |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
| S. No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Applicant No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Description | Max Marks | 1/4                                                                                         | 2/4                                                                                  | 3/4                                                                              | 4/4                                                                                    |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |             |           | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services United in association with Status Consulting Private Limited | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CAD/CAM Centre | M/s MGV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd. | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |             |           | Assessed                                                                                    | Assessed                                                                             | Assessed                                                                         | Assessed                                                                               |  |  |
| 1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Year of Establishment of the Firm (In case of JV year of establishment of Lead Member shall be considered)(Min 5 years)                                                                                                            |             | 2         | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                    | 2                                                                                |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | For 5 years                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 1.5 marks   |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | More than 5 years                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | 2 Marks     |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
| 2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business                                                                                                                             |             | 2         | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                    | 2                                                                                |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | For 5-10 Crores                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 0.5 mark    |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | For 10-20 Crores                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 1 mark      |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 20-50 Crores                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | 1.5 marks   |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | For >50 Crores                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | 2 marks     |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
| 3                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Nos. of Key Professionals with the firm *                                                                                                                                                                                          |             | 2         | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                    | 2                                                                                |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | <4 personnel                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | 0 marks     |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 4 to 12 - Linearly varying from 0.25 to 2                                                                                                                                                                                          |             |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | >12 personnel                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | 2 marks     |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
| 4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 lining of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 lining of 50% of project length in last 7 years                                               |             | 5         | 4                                                                                           | 4.5                                                                                  | 4.5                                                                              |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Two projects of 4/6 lining of 30% of project length each or One project of 4/6 lining of 50% of project length                                                                                                                     | 4 marks     |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks.                                                                                                                                 |             |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
| 5                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | In hand DPRs of NHAI Projects ( presently under progress)                                                                                                                                                                          |             | 10        | 7.5                                                                                         | 10                                                                                   | 10                                                                               |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | More than Project Length                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 5 marks     |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | More than 2 times of Project Length                                                                                                                                                                                                | 7.5 marks   |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | More than 3 times of Project Length                                                                                                                                                                                                | 10 marks    |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
| 6                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Experience as Independent Engineer/ Authority Engineer/Supervision Consultant two construction projects of four/six lining of 30% of project length each or one projects of four/six lining of 50% project length in last 7 years. |             | 6         | 6                                                                                           | 6                                                                                    | 6                                                                                |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 2 construction projects 4/6 lining of 30% of project length each                                                                                                                                                                   |             |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Or 1 construction project of 4/6 lining of 50% of project length                                                                                                                                                                   | 4 marks     |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to max. 2 marks                                       |             |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
| 7                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Experience as Independent Engineer/ Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFOT/ OMT/ O&M of four/six lining** of 50% of project length in last 7 years                                                                    |             | 8         | 6                                                                                           | 8                                                                                    | 8                                                                                |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 1 project                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 6 marks     |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks                                                                                                                                       |             |           |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |  |  |
| Total                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |             | 35        | 29.50                                                                                       | 34.50                                                                                | 34.50                                                                            | 0.00                                                                                   |  |  |

The bidder did not meet the minimum eligibility criteria

List of Bidders

| Sr.No. | Name of the Bidder                                                                          |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1/4    | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kaius Consulting Private Limited |
| 2/4    | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CADD Centre           |
| 3/4    | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.            |
| 4/4    | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd      |

| Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Lining of Godhra to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBFOT mode under NHDP Phase III |                                                                                             |              |                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                     |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|
| MINIMUM ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                             |              |                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                     |
| S.No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Name of the Applicants                                                                      |              | Preparation of DPR (NH/SH/Equivalent)                                                                                                                              | Project Supervision/IC (NH/SH/Equivalent)                                                                                                                                 | Annual Turnover                                                                                                                                                               | Whether the Applicant meets the Minimum Eligibility Criteria or not |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                             |              | The firm should have prepared DPR/FS for at least two projects of 4/6 laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length | The firm should have experience of project Supervision/IE of projects of 4/6 laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length | Annual turnover (updated average of last 5 years or 50% of each of the preceding two years) of the firm from consultancy business should be equal to or more than Rs.5 Crores |                                                                     |
| 1/4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kaius Consulting Private Limited | Association  | Yes                                                                                                                                                                | Yes                                                                                                                                                                       | Yes                                                                                                                                                                           | Yes                                                                 |
| 2/4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CADD Centre           | Association  | Yes                                                                                                                                                                | Yes                                                                                                                                                                       | Yes                                                                                                                                                                           | Yes                                                                 |
| 3/4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.            | Association  | Yes                                                                                                                                                                | Yes                                                                                                                                                                       | Yes                                                                                                                                                                           | Yes                                                                 |
| 4/4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd      | Lead Member  | Yes                                                                                                                                                                | No                                                                                                                                                                        | Yes                                                                                                                                                                           | No                                                                  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                             | Other Member | No                                                                                                                                                                 | Yes                                                                                                                                                                       | Yes                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                     |

| Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Laning of Godhara to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBFOT mode under NHDP Phase III |                                                                                                                |               |                                                                                             |                                                                                   |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Evaluation sheet for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                |               |                                                                                             |                                                                                   |                                                                                  |                                                                                        |
| S.No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Description                                                                                                    | Maximum Point | 1/A                                                                                         | 2/A                                                                               | 3/A                                                                              | 4/A                                                                                    |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                |               | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kalus Consulting Private Limited | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CADD Centre | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd. | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                |               | Marks Assesed                                                                               | Marks Assesed                                                                     | Marks Assesed                                                                    | Marks Assesed                                                                          |
| 1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection                        | 5             | 5                                                                                           | 5                                                                                 | 5                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 1.1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis                                              | 2             | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                 | 2                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 1.2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | (a) Experience of 1-2 projects - 1<br>(b) Experience of 3-5 projects - 2<br>(c) Experience of > 5 projects - 3 | 3             | 3                                                                                           | 3                                                                                 | 3                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement        | 4             | 4                                                                                           | 4                                                                                 | 4                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 2.1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis                                              | 2             | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                 | 2                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 2.2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | (a) Experience of 1-3 projects - 1<br>(b) Experience >3 projects - 2                                           | 2             | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                 | 2                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 3                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit or better technology for Bridge inspection                         | 4             | 4                                                                                           | 4                                                                                 | 4                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 3.1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis                                              | 2             | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                 | 2                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 3.2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | (a) Experience of 1-3 projects - 1<br>(b) Experience >3 projects - 2                                           | 2             | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                 | 2                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Experience in Retro reflectometer technology                                                                   | 4             | 4                                                                                           | 4                                                                                 | 4                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 4.1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis                                              | 2             | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                 | 2                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 4.2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | (a) Experience of 1-3 projects - 1<br>(b) Experience >3 projects - 2                                           | 2             | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                 | 2                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 5                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Experience in Automatic Traffic Counter cum Classifier (ATCC)                                                  | 3             | 3                                                                                           | 3                                                                                 | 3                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 5.1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis                                              | 2             | 2                                                                                           | 2                                                                                 | 2                                                                                |                                                                                        |
| 5.2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | (a) Experience of 1-3 projects - 0.5<br>(b) Experience >3 projects - 1                                         | 1             | 1                                                                                           | 1                                                                                 | 1                                                                                |                                                                                        |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | <b>Total</b>                                                                                                   | <b>20</b>     | <b>20</b>                                                                                   | <b>20</b>                                                                         | <b>20</b>                                                                        | <b>#REF!</b>                                                                           |

The bidder did not meet the minimum eligibility criteria



# भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय - गांधीनगर (गुजरात)

## National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India)

Regional Office - Gandhinagar (Gujarat)

दूरभाष / Phone : 079-29650607, 29650608 ई-मेल / e-mail : rogujarat@nhai.org

पहली मंजिल, बी.एस.एन.एल. टेलीफोन एक्सचेंज बिल्डिंग, "च" रोड, सेक्टर-11, गांधीनगर-382011 (गुजरात)

1<sup>st</sup> Floor, BSNL Telephone Exchange Building, "CH" Road, Sector-11, Gandhinagar-382011(Gujarat)



NHAI/ROGNER/Godhra-GujBrdr/NH-47/IE/OM/2024/D-258

22.01.2025

To

All Bidders (As per list enclosed)

**Sub:** Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Laning of Godhra to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBFOT mode under NHDP Phase III.- Evaluation of Technical Bids - Reg.

**Ref:** (i) Your Bids submitted on 19.11.2024 for the above mentioned work [Tender ID: 2024\_NHAI\_211630\_1].

Dear Sir,

This is with reference to the bids submitted on 19.11.2024 for the subject proposal. The results with respect to Technical Evaluation as approved by the Competent Authority is as under:

(i) It has been found that M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd, the lead member of the bidder M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd has failed to meet the minimum eligibility criteria - "The firm should have experience of Project Supervision/IE of at least two construction projects of four/six laning\*\* of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length" - required as per clause 12(A) of Section-I of RFP.

Further, the JV partner M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd has failed to meet the minimum eligibility criteria - "The firm should have prepared DPR/FS cum PPR for at least Two projects of 4/6 laning\*\* of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length." - required as per clause 12(A) of Section-I of RFP.

The Clause 12 (B) of Section-I of RFP states "Lead partner and the JV partner both shall have experience of at least one project of eligible category as in para 12 (A) above".

Accordingly, the bid of M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd has been declared as Non-Responsive.

(ii) A summary of evaluation of Technical Bids is as below:

| Sr.No. | Name of the Bidder                                                                          | Relevant experience for the assignment (35) | Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology (5) | Experience in use of technology for road inspection (20) | Key Staff for the assignment (40) | Total Marks (100) |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------|
| 1/4    | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kaius Consulting Private Limited | 29.50                                       | 5.00                                                  | 20.00                                                    | 35.89                             | 90.39             |

1 of 2

| Independent Engineer (IE) Services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Lining of Godhra to Gujarat/Madhya Pradesh Border Section of NH-47 (Old NH-59) from Km. 129.300 to Km. 215.900 in the State of Gujarat on DBFOT mode under NHDP Phase III |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |         |                 |         |                 |         |                 |         |                 |         |                                                      |                          |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|-----------------|---------|-----------------|---------|-----------------|---------|-----------------|---------|------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| Average annual turnover from consultancy services after following enhancement factor                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                             |                                                                                      |         |                 |         |                 |         |                 |         |                 |         |                                                      |                          |
| S.No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Name of Consultancy Firm/Entity (Sole Bidder/Bidder in JV)                                  | Average annual turnover from consultancy services after following enhancement factor |         |                 |         |                 |         |                 |         |                 |         | After Factor Annual Average Turnover in Last 5 years | Turnover as per required |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                             | 2023-24<br>1.1                                                                       |         | 2022-23<br>1.21 |         | 2021-22<br>1.33 |         | 2020-21<br>1.46 |         | 2019-20<br>1.61 |         |                                                      |                          |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                             | Actual                                                                               | Updated | Actual          | Updated | Actual          | Updated | Actual          | Updated | Actual          | Updated |                                                      |                          |
| 1/4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with Kaius Consulting Private Limited | 81.50                                                                                | 89.65   | 81.18           | 98.23   | 75.06           | 99.83   | 63.39           | 92.55   | 48.73           | 78.46   | 91.74                                                | Yes                      |
| 2/4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative CADD Centre           | 0.00                                                                                 | 0.00    | 235.63          | 285.11  | 211.22          | 280.92  | 195.78          | 285.84  | 130.79          | 210.57  | 212.49                                               | Yes                      |
| 3/4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.            | 0.00                                                                                 | 0.00    | 151.84          | 183.73  | 140.27          | 186.56  | 123.23          | 179.92  | 114.39          | 184.17  | 146.87                                               | Yes                      |
| 4/4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd in JV with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants P Ltd      | 17.15                                                                                | 18.87   | 15.25           | 18.45   | 13.40           | 17.82   | 10.81           | 15.78   | 9.24            | 14.88   | 17.16                                                | Yes                      |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                             | 24.69                                                                                | 27.16   | 26.47           | 32.03   | 27.88           | 37.08   | 28.43           | 41.51   | 23.65           | 38.08   | 35.17                                                | Yes                      |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                             | 41.84                                                                                | 46.02   | 41.72           | 50.48   | 41.28           | 54.90   | 39.24           | 57.29   | 32.89           | 52.95   | 52.33                                                | Yes                      |

| Team Leader cum Highway Engineer |                                                                                                                                                               |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
|----------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|---|
| Applicant No.                    |                                                                                                                                                               | Max Marks                        |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
| Name of the Applicant            |                                                                                                                                                               | 1/4                              | 2/4                            | 3/4                                   | 4/4                                    |   |
| Name of Key Personnel            |                                                                                                                                                               | Shri Ram Singh<br>Assessed marks | Bharat Kumar<br>Assessed marks | Veneta Ramesh Singh<br>Assessed marks | Dinesh Kumar Agarwal<br>Assessed marks |   |
| Description                      |                                                                                                                                                               |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
| 1                                | General Qualification                                                                                                                                         | 25                               |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
| 0                                | Graduate in Civil Engineering                                                                                                                                 | 21                               | 21                             | 21                                    |                                        |   |
| ii)                              | Post Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering | 4                                | 0                              | 0                                     | 0                                      |   |
| 2                                | Adequacy for the Project                                                                                                                                      | 70                               |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
| a)                               | Professional Experience in Highway Projects:                                                                                                                  |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
| ii)                              | Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects                                                                                                    |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
|                                  | < 10 years -0                                                                                                                                                 |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
|                                  | 10 years -22                                                                                                                                                  |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
|                                  | Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.                                                      | 30                               | 30                             | 30                                    | 30                                     |   |
| ii)                              | Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M of completed 4/5 lane highway sections                                               | 35                               | 32.5                           | 35                                    | 32.5                                   |   |
|                                  | < 3 years - 0                                                                                                                                                 |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
|                                  | 3 years - 30                                                                                                                                                  |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
|                                  | Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.                                                                 |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
| iii)                             | Experience in similar capacity* in Highway Development Projects taken up under EPC                                                                            | 5                                | 5                              | 5                                     | 4                                      |   |
|                                  | 1 Project- 4 Marks                                                                                                                                            |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
|                                  | add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks                                                                                     |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
| 3                                | Employment with the Firm                                                                                                                                      | 5                                | 0                              | 0                                     | 4.5                                    |   |
|                                  | < 1 year -0                                                                                                                                                   |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
|                                  | 1 year -3                                                                                                                                                     |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
|                                  | Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks                                                                                             |                                  |                                |                                       |                                        |   |
|                                  | Total                                                                                                                                                         | 100                              | 88.5                           | 91                                    | 92                                     | 0 |
|                                  | Weightage @ 19                                                                                                                                                | 19                               | 16.815                         | 17.29                                 | 17.48                                  | 0 |

Digitally signed by SAURABH GAUTAM  
Date: 2025.01.22 15:50:14 IST  
Location: eProcurement System for  
Central PSUs