

**NATIONAL HIGHWAYS AUTHORITY OF INDIA
MADURAI REGION**

Minutes of Meeting of Tender Evaluation Committee (Technical Evaluation) dated 06.09.2024 for the work of "Operation and Maintenance including Incident Management for One Year from Km 0/000 to Km 16/276 of Nagercoil to Kavalkinaru section of NH-944 (Old NH-47B) in the State of Tamil Nadu on item rate basis" (Tender Ref. No. NHAI/17011/01/89/2024/RO Madurai).

1. Regional Office, NHAI, Madurai invited bids vide Tender ID: 2024_NHAI_199347_1 for the works of "Operation and Maintenance including Incident Management for One Year from Km 0/000 to Km 16/276 of Nagercoil to Kavalkinaru section of NH-944 (Old NH-47B) in the State of Tamil Nadu on item rate basis" (Tender Ref. No. NHAI/17011/01/89/2024/RO Madurai) with an estimated cost of Rs.207.04 Lakh (excluding GST).

2. A committee has been constituted with the following members to carry out tender evaluation;

- i. Shri M Chandrasekhar, DGM (T), RO-Madurai - Convener
- ii. Shri T Velraj, DGM(T) & PD, PIU-Nagercoil - Member
- iii. Shri MK Akhilesh, Manager (T), PIU-Tuticorin - Member
- iv. Shri Vijith Vijayan, Manager (T), RO-Madurai - Member
- v. Shri Prabhat Chandra Nirmohi, Dy. Manager (F), RO-Madurai - Member

3. As per RFP, last date of submission of e-bids and date of technical bid opening was scheduled on 25.07.2024 up to 12.00 PM and 26.07.2024 @ 12.00 PM, respectively.

4. Accordingly, the Committee opened the e-bids received through online (on 26.07.2024) and decrypted. Totally 06 Nos. of Bids were received through online. Accordingly, the details of EMD/Bid Security submitted by the 06 Nos. of bidders were furnished to Accounts Division. In response, Accounts Division has confirmed the receipts of Tender Fee & EMD/Bid Security submitted by the respective bidders.

5. Subsequently, the Committee has admitted & evaluated the 06 Nos. of bids based on available scanned copies. The summary of the detailed technical evaluation is submitted hereunder;

S. No	Bid ID	Name of Bidder	Recommendation
1	722815	M/s RR Associates, Guntur	Non-responsive
2	723494	M/s Virumandy Construction, Madurai	Responsive
3	723685	M/s Fairways Toll and Security Services Private Limited, Hyderabad	Non-responsive
4	723984	M/s K L Enterprises, Bengaluru	Non-responsive
5	723988	M/s V Meenal and Co., Devakottai	Responsive
6	724050	M/s Aishwarya Infrastructures, Tirunelveli	Non-responsive

T. Velraj

[Signature]

[Signature]

[Signature]

[Signature]

6. As above, the Committee recommends to accept the Bids received from (i) M/s Virumandy Construction, Madurai and (ii) M/s V Meenal and Co., Devakottai based on the details furnished by the bidder in compliance with the instructions set forth in the RFP to qualify in the Technical Evaluation.

7. With reference to the bid received from M/s RR Associates, Guntur, it is observed that, the submitted copies of RC Book have been verified with the help of the QR Code Scanner and found most of the RC Books are tampered/forged/fabricated/alterd with the intention to make his bid as Technically Responsive [Age Barred machineries viz., (i) Patrol Vehicle with VTS (28.04.2022), (ii) Crane of 20 Tonne Capacity with VTS (18.01.2022) and (iii) Mechanical Broom with VTS (30.07.2019) have been altered with less than 2 years validity]. For requirement of Generator (250 KVA), bidder has furnished Lease Agreement & invoice with expired age limit for Generator with 200 KVA capacity only. Lease Agreement with invoice furnished for Tractor Trolley with expired age limit (13.10.2017). CVs of Key Personnel has not signed in all pages by the Key Personnel and date of the CV not mentioned. Bidder has submitted the necessary undertaking of Bid Validity for 120 days only. Considering the above, as per Clause 4.4 B (a) (iii), 4.4B (d) & 4.7 (iii) of Section-II ITB of RFP, the Tender Evaluation Committee recommends to consider the bid as "Non-responsive". Also, the committee recommends to issue a Show-cause Notice to the bidder to seek clarification for such unacceptable activity with an intention to make the bid as responsive.

8. Further, the bidder, M/s Fairways Toll and Security Services Private Limited, Hyderabad has not submitted the requisite details w.r.t. Total value of work done & Date of work completion certified by the Authority to qualify in similar work criteria as per RFP. For Mechanical Broomer with VTS, the bidder has furnished RC Copy for Tractor only, however, Documentary evidence either owned/leased/rented for Broomer has not been furnished. For Water Tanker (6000 Litres Capacity), the bidder has furnished RC Copy for Tractor only, however, Documentary evidence either owned/leased/rented for Tanker has not been furnished. Also, the bidder has furnished Lease Agreement & invoice for Tipper (10 Ton Capacity) with expired age limit (13.06.2018). For Mobile Road Repair and Patching Machine, Purchase Order only furnished, Invoice has not been furnished. CV of Project Manager does not having minimum experience as Project Manager. Also, CVs of Key Personnel have not been furnished in the prescribed format as per RFP. Considering the above, as per Clause 4.4 A (b) & 4.4B (d) of Section-II ITB of RFP, the Tender Evaluation Committee recommends to consider the bid as "Non-responsive".

9. Also, with reference to the bid received from M/s KL Enterprises, Bengaluru, it is observed that, the bidder has not furnished the documentary evidence of owned/leased/rented Mobile Road Repair and Patching Machine. Also, the CV of Project Manager does not having minimum experience as Project Manager. Considering the above, as per Clause 4.4B (d) of Section-II ITB of RFP, the Tender Evaluation Committee recommends to consider the bid as "Non-responsive".

10. With reference to the bid received from M/s Aishwarya Infrastructures, Tirunelveli, it is observed that, the bidder has not submitted the similar work experience as mentioned in Clause 4.4 A (b) of Section-II ITB of RFP. Also, w.r.t. the genuinity of Experience Certificate submitted by the bidder, the Divisional Engineer, Highways, C&M, Dharapuram vide email dated 30.08.2024

has reported that the Experience Certificate submitted by the bidder, M/s Aishwarya Infrastructures, Tirunelveli for the work of "Widening and Improvements, Improvements Rebuild works including construction of Retaining walls and Reconstruction of Minor bridge in lieu of piped cause way works on Government roads in Udumalpet (H) C&M Sub-Division PACKAGE NO.43 (SCHEME CRIDP 2017-18)" was fake and the same was executed by another Contractor. This activity has been seriously reviewed by the tender evaluation committee, hence, the committee recommends to consider the bid as "Non-responsive". Also, the committee recommends to issue a Show-cause Notice to the bidder to seek clarification for such unacceptable activity with an intention to make the bid as responsive.

Committee further decided to meet at a convenient date to open & evaluate financial bids of the technically qualified bidders at the earliest, upon approval of Competent Authority.


(Prabhat Chandra Nirmohi)
Member


(Vijith Vijayan)
Member


(MK Akhilesh)
Member


(T Velraj)
Member


(M Chandrasekhar)
Convener

Name of Work: Operation and Maintenance including Incident Management for One Year from Km 0/000 to Km 16/276 of Nagercoil to Kavalkinaru section of NH-944 (Old NH-47B) in the State of Tamil Nadu on item rate basis (Tender Ref. No. NHAI/17011/01/89/2024/RO Madurai)

Value put to tender - Rs.2,07,04,248/-

S. No	Name of the Contractor Qualifying Criteria	Requirement as per Bid Document	Reference	M/s. RR Associates, Guntur (Bid ID: 722815) (1 of 6)	M/s Virumandy Construction, Madurai (Bid ID: 723494) (2 of 6)	M/s Fairways Toll and Security Services Private Limited, Hyderabad (Bid ID: 723685) (3 of 6)											
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)											
1	Cost of tender document	Rs.25,000/-	NIT (Pg 4)	Ref No:N202243160879692 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 20.07.2024 for an amount of Rs.25,000/- (Pg 4)	RTGS Fund Transfer dated 23.07.2024 for an amount of Rs.25,000/- (Pg 2)	UTR No: UBINJ24206530080 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 24.07.2024 for an amount of Rs.25,000/- (Pg 2)											
2	Bid Security	Bid Security for an amount of Rs.4,14,000/-	NIT (Pg 4)	DD No. 033188 from HDFC Bank for an amount of Rs.4,14,000/- dated 19.07.2024 (Pg 3)	DD No.573561 from State Bank Of India for Rs.4,14,000/- dated 23.07.2024 (Pg 1)	BG.No.590401GL0002124 from Union Bank of India for an amount of Rs.4,14,000/- dated 24.07.2024 (Pg 3-6) & Bid Security Deceleration not furnished											
3	Average Annual Turn over during Last 3 years	Rs.62.11 Lakhs	NIT (Pg 4) & Section-II, Clause 4.4 A (a) (Pg 10) & Section-III, Clause 1.3 (Pg 30)	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)		
				2021-22	292.37	1.33	388.85	2021-22	623.54	1.33	829.31	2021-22	509.60	1.33	677.77		
				2022-23	814.05	1.21	985.00	2022-23	1061.10	1.21	1283.93	2022-23	532.93	1.21	644.85		
				2023-24	568.88	1.10	625.77	2023-24	0.00	1.10	0.00	2023-24	633.25	1.10	696.58		
				Total			1999.62	Total			2113.24	Total			2019.18		
				Average Turnover (Pg 5, 41)			667.00	Average Turnover (Pg 48)			704.00	Average Turnover (Pg 95)			673.00		
4	Similar nature of work completed during the last 7 years (The similar work constitutes experience in Operation and Maintenance/Construction/ Periodic Renewal/Overlay of 4/6 lane Expressways/ National Highways/ State Highways)	One Similar completed work costing not less than amount equals to Rs.165.63 Lakhs or Two Similar completed works costing not less than amount equal to each of Rs.103.52 Lakhs or Three Similar completed works costing not less than amount equal to each of Rs.82.82 Lakhs	Section-II, Clause 4.2 (c) & 4.4 A (b) (Pg 11)	Routine Maintenance & Incidental works of Six Lining of Chilakalurpet to Nellore Section of NH-16 from Km 1182.802 to Km 1366.547 (Length 183.62 Km) in the State of Andhra Pradesh. Value of Work Done - Rs.184.70 Lakh. Work duration from 01.04.2010 to 30.03.2020. Work Experience Certificate issued by PD, NHAI, PIU-Nellore (Pg 132)	Package-77 Widening, Strengthening & Improvements Government Roads in Thirumangalam (Highways) C&M Sub Division including construction of Side Drain, Breast Wall, Retaining Wall and including upkeep for a period of 60 months. Value of work done is Rs.423.45 Lakh. Work duration from 14.01.2020 to 24.03.2020. Work experience certificate issued by the Divisional Engineer (H), C&M, Madurai dated 18.11.2020 (Pg 55)	The Bidder has not submitted the requisite details w.r.t. Total value of work done & Date of work completion certified by the Authority to qualify in similar work criteria as per RFP.											
5	Registration	Organisation Registered with Central, State Government, P&T/CPWD, Railways / State PWD and other Govt. organisations	Section-II, Clause 4.2 (a) (Pg 9) & Section-III, Clause 1 (Pg 30)	Government of Andhra Pradesh Registration No. 34 of 2008 dated 03.03.2008 (Pg 10)	Registration No. 218/2007-08 1st class Contractor Code: 01-MU-A-0041-S renewed vide letter No. 1012/2023-2026(3 Years) JDO-3/dated 10.04.2023 (Pg 5)	Registration No. CIN-UB3000TG2016PTC109241 dated 27.04.2016 (Pg 17)											
(a)	Year of Constitution	03.03.2008 (Pg 10)		29.01.2008 (Pg 10)	2016 (Pg 17)												
(b)	Legal status of Bidder (Proprietorship/Partnership or Pvt. Ltd. firm)	Partnership (Pg 11)		Partnership (Pg 12-17)	Pvt Ltd Company (Pg 18-48)												
(c)	Place of Registration	Guntur		Madurai (Pg 3)	Telangana (Pg 18)												
(d)	Principal Place of Business	Guntur		Madurai	Telangana												
6	Power of Attorney to sign the bid document	Furnished / Not Furnished		Furnished (Shri Ramayanam Venkata Ramana) (Pg 38)	Furnished (Mr. V.Virumandy (Pg 18-19)	Furnished (Shri. Anantha Sridhar Reddy) (Pg 7-8)											
7	Bid Capacity = (A x N x 2.5 – B) (Cl.4.6) in Lakhs. N = 1 year	Rs.207.04 Lakhs	Section-II, Clause 4.6 (Pg 12) & Section-III, Clause 1.4 (b) (Pg 32-33)	Bid Capacity = (814.05 x 1.21 x 1 x 2.5 - 132) = 2330.50 lakh (Pg 152)	Bid Capacity = (1061.10 x 1.21 x 1 x 2.5 - 0) = 3209.82 lakhs (Pg 60)	Bid Capacity = (633.25 x 1.10 x 1 x 2.5 - 0) = 1741.44 lakhs (Pg 58)											
8	Evidence of availability of lay equipments (either owned, lease or rented)	Requirement as per Bid Document	Nos	Max. Age In Years as on 25.07.2024	Appendix to ITB (Pg 24) & Section-II, Clause 4.4. B (b)(i) (Pg 11)	Owned	Leased	Total Nos.	Remarks	Owned	Leased	Total Nos.	Remarks	Owned	Leased/Rented	Total Nos.	Remarks
		Patrol Vehicle along with list of equipment as per IRC-84-2019 fitted with VTS of AS 140 standards	1	2		0	0	0	Owned RC Furnished with expired age limit (28.04.2022) as per QR Code verification (Pg 154)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & invoice Furnished (Pg 77-79)	1	0	1	Owned Vehicle RC furnished (Pg 60)
		Crane – 20 Ton Capacity fitted with VTS of AS 140 standards	1	2		0	0	0	Lease Agreement with invoice Furnished with expired age limit (18.01.2022) as per as per QR Code verification (Pg 165-167)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished (Pg 80-82)	1	0	1	Owned Vehicle RC furnished (Pg 62)
		Mechanical Broomer with VTS	1	2		0	0	0	Lease Agreement with Invoice Furnished with expired age limit (30.07.2019) as per QR Code verification (Pg 1678-180)	1	0	1	Owned invoice Furnished (Pg 87)	0	0	0	RC Copy furnished for Tractor only, however, Documentary evidence either owned/leased/rented for Broomer has not been furnished (Pg 63)
		Generator (250 KVA)	1	5		0	0	0	Lease Agreement with invoice Furnished with expired age limit for 200 KVA Capacity only (Pg 161-164)	1	0	1	Owned Invoice Furnished (Pg 83)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & invoice not Furnished (Pg 64-65)
		Water Tanker (6000 Litres Capacity)	1	5		1	0	1	Owned RC Copy Furnished (Pg 165)	1	0	1	Owned Invoice Furnished (Pg 76)	0	0	0	RC Copy furnished for Tractor only (Pg 66). Documents of Water Tanker not furnished.
		Tractor with Trolley	1	5		0	0	0	Lease Agreement with invoice Furnished with expired age limit (13.10.2017) (Pg 166-168)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & invoice Furnished (Pg 84-86)	1	0	1	Owned Vehicle RC furnished (Pg 67)
		Tipper (10 Ton Capacity)	1	5		0	1	1	Lease Agreement with invoice Furnished (Pg 169-171)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & invoice Furnished (Pg 73-75)	0	0	1	Lease Agreement & invoice furnished with expired age limit (13.06.2018) (Pg 68-69)
		Static Roller	1	5		0	1	1	Lease Agreement with invoice Furnished (Pg 172-174)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & invoice Furnished (Pg 68-71)	1	0	1	Owned invoice furnished (Pg 70)
		Front End Loader (0.6 cum bucket capacity)	1	5		0	1	1	Lease Agreement with invoice Furnished (Pg 175-177)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & invoice Furnished (Pg 88-90)	1	0	1	Owned invoice furnished (Pg 71)
		Mobile Road Repair and Patching Machine	1	5		0	1	1	Lease Agreement with invoice Furnished (Pg 178-180)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & invoice Furnished (Pg 68-72)	0	0	0	Purchase Order only furnished (Pg 72-73)

S. No	Name of the Contractor Qualifying Criteria	Requirement as per Bid Document		Reference	M/s. RR Associates, Gunlur (Bid ID: 722816) (1 of 6)		M/s Virumandy Construction, Madurai (Bid ID: 723494) (2 of 6)		M/s Fairways Toll and Security Services Private Limited, Hyderabad (Bid ID: 723686) (3 of 6)	
(1)	(2)	(3)		(4)	(5)		(6)		(7)	
9	i) Project Manager	Minimum Qualification Graduation in Civil Engineering + 5 years Experience as Project Manager on NH/SH, Bridge Construction/ Maintenance Works	1	Appendix to ITB (Pg 24) Section-II, Clause 4.4. B (b)(i) (Pg 12)	Shri S V Nagarjuna Babu B Tech in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2012 Experience 20 Years	CV furnished without date & each page of CV has not been signed by the Key Personnel (Pg 182-190), Provisional Certificate furnished (Pg 191-193)	Shri V. Ganesan B E in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 1998 Experience : 24 Years	CV furnished (Pg 91-92), Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 94)	Shri Lalit Kumar Saini B.E in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2016 Experience: No Experience as a Project Manager	CV has not been furnished in the Prescribed format as per RFP (Pg 76-78), Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 79)
	ii) Site Engineer cum Surveyor Engineer	Minimum Qualification Diploma (or) Graduation in Civil Engineering with 5 years Experience on Highway Construction/ Maintenance Works	1		Shri S. Bharu Sudheer Diploma in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2004 Experience 15 Years	CV furnished (Pg 203-204), Diploma Certificate Furnished (Pg 205)	Shri Thiukumar S Diploma in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2013 Experience 11 Years	CV furnished (Pg 95-96), Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 98)	Shri Raghavendra Singh B Tech in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2020 Experience 4 years Shri M Selva Kumar Diploma in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2014 Experience 8 years	CV has not been furnished in the Prescribed format as per RFP (Pg 85-88), (Pg 90-92), Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 89), (Pg 93)
	iv) Incident Cum Road property Manager Cum Route Operation Manager	Minimum Qualification Graduate from a recognized university + 5 years experience	1		Shri Sapan Kumar Das Degree in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2012 Experience 8 Years	CV furnished (Pg 217-218), Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 219)	Shri Mathavan A BE in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2016 Experience 8 Years	CV furnished (Pg 98-100), Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 102)	Shri K Narasimha Rao MSc. B.ED. BSc Year of completion : 2007 Experience : 14 years	CV has not been furnished in the Prescribed format as per RFP (Pg 80-82), Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 83-85)
10	Information on litigation history in which the Bidder is involved	Furnished / Not Furnished		Section-II, Clause 4.2 (j) (Pg 10) Section-III, Clause 1.7 (Pg 35)	Furnished (Pg 220)		Furnished (Pg 66)		Furnished (Pg 94)	
11	Affidavit on Stamp paper that information furnished in bid document is correct in all respects.	Furnished / Not Furnished		Section-II, Clause 4.4 B (a) (i) (Pg 11) Section-III (Pg 36)	Furnished (Pg 221)		Furnished (Pg 47)		Furnished (Pg 10-11)	
12	Undertaking (Minimum cash upto 25%)	Furnished / Not Furnished		Section-III, Clause 2(ii) (Pg 35 & 37)	Furnished (Pg 222)		Furnished (Pg 64)		Furnished (Pg 14)	
13	Undertaking (For Bid Validity of 165 days)	Furnished / Not Furnished		Section-III, Clause 2(iii) (Pg 35 & 38)	Undertaking Furnished for 120 days only (Pg.223)		Furnished (Pg 63)		Furnished (Pg 12)	
14	Undertaking Refer Cl. 4.4 (B) (b) (i)	Furnished / Not Furnished		Section-II, Cl. 4.4 (B) (b) (i) (Pg 12) Section-III (Pg 39)	Furnished (Pg 224)		Furnished (Pg 65)		Furnished (Pg 13)	
15	Letter of Application as per format in Section-IV	Furnished / Not Furnished		Section-III, Clause 2(iv) (Pg 35 & 45)	Furnished (Pg 2)		Furnished (Pg 67)		Furnished (Pg 15)	
Recommendations of Committee		Responsive / Non-responsive			1. The submitted copies of RC Book has been verified with the original with the help of the QR Code Scanner and found most of the RC Books are tampered and Age Barred as detailed above. 2. Lease Agreement & Invoice furnished with expired age limit(15.06.2018) for Generator with 200 KVA capacity only. 3. Lease Agreement with Invoice furnished for Tractor Trolley with expired age limit (13.10.2017) 4. CVs of Key Personnel has not signed in all pages by the Key Personnel and date of the CV not mentioned. 5. Bidder has submitted the necessary undertaking of Bid Validity for 120 days only. Considering the above, as per Clause 4.4 B (a) (ii), 4.4B (d) & 4.7 (iii) of Section-II ITB of RFP, the Tender Evaluation Committee recommends to consider the bid as "Non-responsive".		Tender Evaluation Committee recommends to consider the bid as "Responsive"		1. The Bidder has not submitted the requisite details w.r.t. Total value of work done & Date of work completion certified by the Authority to qualify in similar work criteria as per RFP. 2. For Mechanical Broomer with VTS, the bidder has furnished RC Copy for Tractor only, however, Documentary evidence either owned/leased/rented for Broomer has not been furnished. 3. For Water Tanker (8000 Litres Capacity), the bidder has furnished RC Copy for Tractor only, however, Documentary evidence either owned/leased/rented for Tanker has not been furnished. 4. Also, the bidder has furnished Lease Agreement & Invoice for Tipper (10 Ton Capacity) with expired age limit (13.06.2018) 5. For Mobile Road Repair and Patching Machine, Purchase Order only furnished, Invoice has not been furnished. 6. CV of Project Manager does not having minimum experience as Project Manager. Also, CVs of Key Personnel have not been furnished in the Prescribed format as per RFP.	
					Non-responsive					


(Prabhat Chandra Nirmohi)
Member


(Vijith Vijayan)
Member


(MK Akhilesh)
Member


(T Velraj)
Member


(M Chandrasekhar)
Convener

Name of Work: Operation and Maintenance including Incident Management for One Year from Km 0/000 to Km 16/276 of Nagercoil to Kavalkinaru section of NH-944 (Old NH-47B) in the State of Tamil Nadu on item rate basis (Tender Ref. No. NHA/17011/01/89/2024/RO Madurai)

Value put to tender - Rs.2,07,04,248/-

S. No	Name of the Contractor Qualifying Criteria	Requirement as per Bid Document	Reference	M/s. KL Enterprises, Bengaluru (Bid ID: 723984) (4 of 6)	M/s V Meenal and Co., Devakottal (Bid ID: 723988) (5 of 6)	M/s Aishwarya Infrastructures, Tirunelveli (Bid ID: 724050) (5 of 6)																																																																								
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)																																																																								
1	Cost of tender document	Rs.25,000/-	NIT (Pg 4)	UTR No. N206243167287203 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 24.07.2024 for an amount of Rs.25,000/- (Pg 1)	Ref No: 795710607 Fund Transfer dated 25.07.2024 for an amount of Rs.25,000/- (Pg 1)	UTR No: BARBQ24206256035 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 24.07.2024 for an amount of Rs.25,000/- (Pg 10)																																																																								
2	Bid Security along with Bid Security Declaration	Bid Security for an amount of Rs. 4,14,000/-	NIT (Pg 4)	BG No.2645T02242040006 from HDFC Bank Ltd for an amount of Rs.4,14,000/- dated 22.07.2024 (Pg 2) & Bid Security Declaration furnished (Pg.4-5)	BG No.39620100000051 from Axis Bank Ltd for an amount of Rs.4,14,000/- dated 23.07.2024 (Pg 2) & Bid Security Declaration furnished (pg.No.3)	BG No. 368228 from Federal Bank Ltd for Rs.4,14,000/- dated 24.07.2024 (Pg 5)																																																																								
3	Average Annual Turn over during Last 3 years	Rs.52.11 Lakhs	NIT (Pg 4) & Section-II, Clause 4.4 A (a) (Pg 10) & Section-III, Clause 1.3 (Pg 30)	<table><thead><tr><th>Year</th><th>Turnover (Lakh)</th><th>Multiplying factor</th><th>Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)</th></tr></thead><tbody><tr><td>2021-22</td><td>0.00</td><td>1.33</td><td>0.00</td></tr><tr><td>2022-23</td><td>1185.80</td><td>1.21</td><td>1434.82</td></tr><tr><td>2023-24</td><td>0.00</td><td>1.10</td><td>0.00</td></tr><tr><td colspan="3">Total</td><td>1434.82</td></tr><tr><td colspan="3">Average Turnover (Pg 102)</td><td>478.00</td></tr></tbody></table>	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)	2021-22	0.00	1.33	0.00	2022-23	1185.80	1.21	1434.82	2023-24	0.00	1.10	0.00	Total			1434.82	Average Turnover (Pg 102)			478.00	<table><thead><tr><th>Year</th><th>Turnover (Lakh)</th><th>Multiplying factor</th><th>Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)</th></tr></thead><tbody><tr><td>2021-22</td><td>407.36</td><td>1.33</td><td>5414.85</td></tr><tr><td>2022-23</td><td>14800.69</td><td>1.21</td><td>17808.83</td></tr><tr><td>2023-24</td><td>0.00</td><td>1.10</td><td>0.00</td></tr><tr><td colspan="3">Total</td><td>23323.78</td></tr><tr><td colspan="3">Average Turnover (Pg 35)</td><td>7775.00</td></tr></tbody></table>	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)	2021-22	407.36	1.33	5414.85	2022-23	14800.69	1.21	17808.83	2023-24	0.00	1.10	0.00	Total			23323.78	Average Turnover (Pg 35)			7775.00	<table><thead><tr><th>Year</th><th>Turnover (Lakh)</th><th>Multiplying factor</th><th>Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)</th></tr></thead><tbody><tr><td>2021-22</td><td>1316.04</td><td>1.33</td><td>1750.33</td></tr><tr><td>2022-23</td><td>1808.87</td><td>1.21</td><td>2188.73</td></tr><tr><td>2023-24</td><td>0.00</td><td>1.10</td><td>0.00</td></tr><tr><td colspan="3">Total</td><td>3939.07</td></tr><tr><td colspan="3">Average Turnover (Pg 25)</td><td>1313.00</td></tr></tbody></table>	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)	2021-22	1316.04	1.33	1750.33	2022-23	1808.87	1.21	2188.73	2023-24	0.00	1.10	0.00	Total			3939.07	Average Turnover (Pg 25)			1313.00
Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)																																																																											
2021-22	0.00	1.33	0.00																																																																											
2022-23	1185.80	1.21	1434.82																																																																											
2023-24	0.00	1.10	0.00																																																																											
Total			1434.82																																																																											
Average Turnover (Pg 102)			478.00																																																																											
Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)																																																																											
2021-22	407.36	1.33	5414.85																																																																											
2022-23	14800.69	1.21	17808.83																																																																											
2023-24	0.00	1.10	0.00																																																																											
Total			23323.78																																																																											
Average Turnover (Pg 35)			7775.00																																																																											
Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)																																																																											
2021-22	1316.04	1.33	1750.33																																																																											
2022-23	1808.87	1.21	2188.73																																																																											
2023-24	0.00	1.10	0.00																																																																											
Total			3939.07																																																																											
Average Turnover (Pg 25)			1313.00																																																																											
4	Similar nature of work completed during the last 7 years (The similar work constitutes experience in Operation and Maintenance/Construction/ Periodic Renewal/Overlay of 4/Lane Expressways/ National Highways/ State Highways)	One Similar completed work costing not less than amount equals to Rs.165.63 Lakhs or Two Similar completed works costing not less than amount equal to each of Rs.103.62 Lakhs or Three Similar completed works costing not less than amount equal to each of Rs.82.82 Lakhs	Section-II, Clause 4.2 (c) & 4.4 A (b) (Pg 11)	Operation and Maintenance including Incident Management of 4 Lane of NH-31, NH-31C & NH-54. Value of work Rs.978.80 Lakh. Work duration from 01.04.2021 to 28.11.2023. Work Experience Certificate issued by PD, NHAI, PIU-Guwahati (Pg 6)	Widening from ML to Four Lane with Paved Shoulder using Paver Block and Strengthening at Km 325/6 - 3330 of Chennai - Trichy - Dindigul road including Reconstruction of Box Culverts, Widening of Culverts, Construction of Retaining Walls, Construction of Drain and Construction of Centre Median. Value of work completed Rs.5704.24 Lakhs. Work duration from 02.05.2022 to 31.12.2023. Work Experience Certificate issued by Divisional Engineer (H), C&M, Trichy-20 (Pg 85).	The bidder has not submitted similar work experiences per RFP.																																																																								
5	Registration	Organisation Registered with Central, State Government, P&T/CPWD, Railways / State PWD and other Govt. organisations	Section-II, Clause 4.2 (a) (Pg 9) & Section-III, Clause 1 (Pg 30)	Udyam Registration No. KR-02-0002119 dated 22.09.2020 (Pg 86-88)	Registration No. 13/2020-2021 1st class Contractor Code: 03-MU-A-0344-S renewed vide letter No. 709/2023-2024/EVA-2 dated 18.04.2023 (Pg 9-10)	Registration No. 12/2020-21 1st class Contractor Code: 03-MU-A-0343-S renewed vide letter No. 2103/2023-24/DO2/ dated 14.09.2023 (Pg 17)																																																																								
(a)	Year of Constitution			27.05.2015 (Pg 96)	2020 (Pg 8)	22.09.2015 (Pg 16)																																																																								
(b)	Legal status of Bidder (Proprietorship/Partnership or Pvt. Ltd. firm)			Proprietorship (Pg 83)	Partnership (Pg 12-19)	Partnership (Pg 23)																																																																								
(c)	Place of Registration			Karnataka & Assam (Pg 95)	Madurai (Pg 9)	Madurai (Pg 24)																																																																								
(d)	Principal Place of Business			Karnataka & Assam	Sivaganga	Tirunelveli (Pg 23)																																																																								
6	Power of Attorney to sign the bid document	Furnished / Not Furnished		Furnished (Shri Punit Agarwal) (Pg 80)	Furnished (Mr V Sudhakar) (Pg 189-200)	Furnished (Smt S. Marishwan) (Pg 12)																																																																								
7	Bid Capacity = (A x N x 2.5 - B) (Cl 4.6) in Lakhs. N = 1 year	Rs.207.04 Lakhs	Section-II, Clause 4.6 (Pg 12) & Section-III, Clause 1.4 (b) (Pg 32-33)	Bid Capacity = (1185.5 x 1.21 x 1 x 2.5 - 759) = 2827.14 lakh (Pg 35)	Bid Capacity = (14800.69 x 1.21 x 1 x 2.5 - 3734) = 41038.09 lakhs (Pg 38)	Bid Capacity = (1808.85 x 1.21 x 1 x 2.5 - 0) = 5477.80 lakhs (Pg 47)																																																																								
8	Evidence of availability of lay equipments (either owned, lease or rented)	Requirement as per Bid Document	Nos	Max. Age in Years as on 25.07.2024	Appendix to ITB (Pg 24) & Section-II, Clause 4.4. B (b)(i) (Pg 11)	Owned	Leased	Total Nos.	Remarks	Owned	Leased	Total Nos.	Remarks	Owned	Leased	Total Nos.	Remarks																																																													
		Patrol Vehicle along with list of equipment as per IRC-84-2018 fitted with VTS of AS 140 standards	1	2		1	0	1	Owned RC copy furnished (Pg 54-55)	1	0	1	Owned Invoice copy furnished (Pg 160)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished (Pg 78-80)																																																													
		Crane - 20 Ton Capacity fitted with VTS of AS 140 standards	1	2		1	0	1	Owned RC copy furnished (Pg 56-57)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement (Pg 161-162) & RC copy Furnished (Pg 163)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished (Pg 81-84)																																																													
		Mechanical Broomer with VTS	1	2		1	0	1	Owned invoice furnished (Pg 58)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement (Pg 164) & Invoice Furnished (Pg 165)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished (Pg 85-87)																																																													
		Generator (250 KVA)	1	5		1	0	1	Owned invoice furnished (Pg 59)	1	0	1	Owned Invoice copy furnished (Pg 166)	1	0	1	Owned Invoice furnished (Pg 60)																																																													
		Water Tanker (6000 Litres Capacity)	1	5		0	1	1	Lease Agreement without RC copy Furnished (Pg 50-53)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement (Pg 167-168) & Invoice Furnished (Pg 169-171)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement (Pg 85-86) & Invoice Furnished (Pg 88)																																																													
		Tractor with Trolley	1	6		0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC copy Furnished (Pg 64-66)	1	0	1	Owned RC copy furnished (Pg 172)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement (Pg 91-93) & RC copy Furnished																																																													
		Tipper (10 Ton Capacity)	1	5		0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC copy Furnished (Pg 67-70)	1	0	1	Owned RC copy furnished (Pg 173-174)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished (Pg 94-95)																																																													
		Static Roller	1	5		0	1	1	Lease Agreement with Invoice Furnished (Pg 71-75)	1	0	1	Owned Invoice copy furnished (Pg 175)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished (Pg 97-99)																																																													
		Front End Loader (0.6 cum bucket capacity)	1	5		0	1	1	Lease Agreement with Invoice Furnished (Pg 76-78)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement (Pg 176) & Invoice Furnished (Pg 177)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & RC Copy Furnished (100)																																																													
		Motor Road Repair and Patching Machine	1	5		0	0	0	Not furnished	0	1	1	Lease Agreement (Pg 178-179) & Invoice Furnished (Pg 180)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement (Pg 85-86) & Invoice Furnished (Pg 89)																																																													

S. No	Name of the Contractor Qualifying Criteria	Requirement as per Bid Document		Reference	M/s. KL Enterprises, Bengaluru (Bid ID: 723984) (4 of 6)		M/s V Meenal and Co., Devakottai (Bid ID: 723988) (5 of 6)		M/s Aishwarya Infrastructures, Tirunelveli (Bid ID: 724050) (6 of 6)	
(1)	(2)	(3)		(4)	(5)		(6)		(7)	
9	i) Project Manager	<u>Minimum Qualification</u> Graduation in Civil Engineering + 5 years Experience as Project Manager on NH/SH, Bridge Construction/ Maintenance Works	1	Appendix to ITB (Pg 24) Section-II, Clause 4.4 B (b)(i) (Pg 12)	Shri Harjit Singh B Tech in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2016 Experience No Experience as Project Manager	Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 22)	Shri JP. Gowtham B.E in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2010 Experience: 8 Years	CV is furnished (Pg 182-183) Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 184)	Shri K. Shanmugam B.E in Civil Engineering Year of Completion : 2010 Experience 10 Years	CV is furnished (Pg 104-107). Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 108)
	ii) Site Engineer cum Surveyor Engineer	<u>Minimum Qualification</u> Diploma (or) Graduation in Civil Engineering with 5 years Experience on Highway Construction/ Maintenance Works	1		Shri Rajan S B.E in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2018 Experience 5 Years	Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 25-27)	Shri G. Vijayakumar B.E in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2017 Experience 6 Years	CV is furnished (Pg 185-187). Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 188)	Shri M. Permkumar Diploma in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2012 Experience 10 years	CV is furnished (Pg 110-113). Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 114)
	iii) Incident Cum Road property Manager Cum Route Operation Manager	<u>Minimum Qualification</u> Graduate from a recognized university + 5 years experience	1		Shri Deepak Kumar B.Com Year of completion : 2014 Experience 5 Years	Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 30)	Shri Sasikumar K B.E in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2016 Experience 7 Years	CV is furnished (Pg 190-191). Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 192)	Shri V Suresh Kumar B.E in Civil Engineering Year of completion : 2010 Experience 12 years	CV is furnished (Pg 116-119). Degree Certificate Furnished (Pg 120)
10	Information on litigation history in which the Bidder is involved	Furnished / Not Furnished		Section-II, Clause 4.2 (i) (Pg 10) Section-III, Clause 1.7 (Pg 26)	Furnished (Pg 39)		Furnished (Pg 202)		Furnished (Pg 122)	
11	Affidavit on Stamp paper that information furnished in bid document is correct in all respects.	Furnished / Not Furnished		Section-II, Clause 4.4 B (a) (i) (Pg 11) Section-III (Pg 36)	Furnished (Pg 81-82)		Furnished (Pg 195)		Furnished (Pg 126)	
12	Undertaking (Minimum cash upto 25%)	Furnished / Not Furnished		Section-III, Clause 2(ii) (Pg 35 & 37)	Furnished (Pg 42)		Furnished (Pg 187)		Furnished (Pg 124)	
13	Undertaking (For Bid Validity of 165 days)	Furnished / Not Furnished		Section-III, Clause 2(iii) (Pg 35 & 38)	Furnished (Pg 43)		Furnished (Pg 198)		Furnished (Pg 123)	
14	Undertaking Refer Cl. 4.4 (B) (b) (i)	Furnished / Not Furnished		Section-II, Cl. 4.4 (B) (b) (i) (Pg 12) Section-III (Pg 39)	Furnished (Pg 44)		Furnished (Pg 201)		Furnished (Pg 125)	
15	Letter of Application as per format in Section-IV	Furnished / Not Furnished		Section-III, Clause 2(iv) (Pg 35 & 45)	Furnished (Pg 45)		Furnished (Pg 7)		Furnished (Pg 2)	
Recommendations of Committee		Responsive / Non-responsive		1. The Bidder has not furnished the documentary evidence of owned/leased/rented Mobile Road Repair and Patching Machine. 2. Also, the CV of Project Manager does not having minimum experience as Project Manager. Considering the above, as per Clause 4.4B (d) of Section-II ITB of RFP, the Tender Evaluation Committee recommends to consider the bid as "Non-responsive".		Tender Evaluation Committee recommends to consider the bid as "Responsive"		The Bidder has not submitted the similar work experience as mentioned in Clause 4.4 A (b) of Section-II ITB of RFP, hence, the Tender Evaluation Committee recommends to consider the bid as "Non-responsive"		Non-responsive


(Prabhat Chandra Nirmohi)
Member


(Viji Vin Vijayan)
Member


(MK Akhilesh)
Member


(T Velraj)
Member


(M Chandrasekhar)
Convener