

TECHNICAL BID EVALUATION RESULT

To,

All Bidders

Sub - Request for Proposal for Consultancy Services for Impact Study of NETC Programme and other Management Consultancy Services for IHMCL with Tender No. IHMCL/Consultant/2024/01 published on dated 24.04.2024

Sir,

With reference to your e-bid submission for the subject project, the result of Technical Evaluation is as under: -

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Technical score	Whether the applicant is Technically Qualified or Not
1/2	M/s KPMG Advisory Services Private Limited	97	Technically Qualified
2/2	M/s RINA Consulting S.P.A	65	Technically NOT Qualified

Detailed Scoring provided at Annexure -1

Annexure -1 Detailed Scoring

S. No	Criteria Description	Max Marks	KPMG Advisory Services Private Limited	RINA Consulting S.p.A
1	Bidder Profile (Maximum Marks = 20)		Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained
1.1	Average Annual Turnover Average Annual Sales Turnover generated from consulting services in the last three financial years FY 2020-21, 2021-22 and 2022-23 • More than INR 500 Crore – 10 marks • More than INR 300 Crore up to INR 500 Crore – 8 marks • INR 130 Crore up to INR 300 Crore – 7 marks <u>Supporting Documents</u> • Extracts from the audited Balance sheet and Profit & Loss for the last 3 years as specified; • Certificate from the Statutory Auditor	10	Average Annual Turnover - Rs. 502.91 Cr Refer: document “KPMGProposal PreQualificationCriteria” Page no. 62 and 72 Total Marks obtained – 10 marks	Average Annual Turnover - Rs. 1307.53 Cr Refer: document “COVER4” Page no. 60 and 61 Total Marks obtained – 10 marks
1.2	Relevant Experience of the Firm Experience in Providing Services as Consultancy Firm in Infrastructure sector • More than 15 years of experience – 10 marks • More than 12 years up to 15 years of experience – 8 marks • 10 years up to 12 years of experience – 7 marks <u>Supporting Documents</u> • Copy of Certificate of Incorporation/ Partnership Deed, as applicable	10	• Date of Incorporation – 12.10.1999 • Refer document “KPMGProposal PreQualificationCriteria” Page no. 5 and 8 • Project 1: Preparation of a development plan for Manesar – Bawal investment region in Haryana sub-region of Delhi-Mumbai Industrial Corridor – Client - DMICDC	• Date of Incorporation in India – 26.02.2015 • Date of Incorporation in Italy – 19.02.1996 • Refer document – “COVER4” page 17 to 36 • Project 1: The Intelligent, Innovative, Integrated Bus Systems Client – European Union Start Date – Oct 2012 End Date – March 2015 • Project 2: New Cooperative Business Models and Guidance for Sustainable City Logistics

S. No	Criteria Description	Max Marks	KPMG Advisory Services Private Limited	RINA Consulting S.p.A
	•Project details with supporting evidence.		Start Date – Feb 2009, End Date – Dec 2013 • Project 2: Implementation Consultancy under DFID aided Capacity Building Programme for KMC. Client – Kolkata Municipal Corporation Start Date – Feb 2004, End Date – Jan 2013 • Eight other projects credentials provided Ref to proposal: “KPMGProposal Technical ScoringCriteria.pdf” page no. 18 to 66. • The oldest project credential start date is 2004 • Total Years of Experience – More than 15 years • Total Marks Obtained – 10 marks	Client – European Union Start Date – June 2015 End Date – May 2018 Seven other project credentials were also provided. Ref to proposal: “COVER5” page 30 • The oldest project credential start date is Oct 2012. • Total Years of Experience – 11 years • Total Marks obtained – 7 marks
2	Relevant Past Experience (Maximum Marks = 40)			
2.1	The Bidder must have experience of implementing projects of ‘<i>similar nature</i>’ in India or abroad for Government or International funding agencies in the last 10 years as on bid due date. Impact Studies of Government Policy(ies) / Public Policy / IT System Audit of large or medium scale projects in the fields of ICT or Intelligent Transport system/Smart	40	Project 1: Electronic Toll Collection Impact Assessment under the National Electronic Toll Collection (NETC) Program Client Name – IHMCL Start Date of Work – Feb’ 21 Project Qualifies Criteria -----	Project 1: Project Management Consultant for Implementing the Intelligent Transport System (ITS) in Chandigarh Transport Undertaking Client - Chandigarh Transport Undertaking Start Date of Work – May 2020 Project Qualifies Criteria -----

S. No	Criteria Description	Max Marks	KPMG Advisory Services Private Limited	RINA Consulting S.p.A
	Mobility/Transit payments/ e-Governance. Project experience of only the Bidding entity shall be considered for evaluation. Ongoing projects may also be considered if the relevant work/deliverable as required in this criterion has been completed as on the bid release date. For such ongoing projects, the certificate from client or self-certificate by the bidder shall clearly mention the work completion as on the bid release date P.S. – Credentials of Proof of Concept and Free of Cost shall not be considered for evaluation. Marks shall be allotted on the basis of number of projects cited by the Bidder, subject to maximum 40 marks. Marks shall be allotted as below – • More than 3 projects – 30 marks • 2 to 3 projects – 20 marks • 1 project – 10 marks • Experience of providing “similar nature” of consultancy services in NHAI/ MoRTH/ NHIDCL/IHMCL – 10 marks <u>Supporting Documents Required</u> • Extracts of Work Order + Completion Certificates from the client; Or • Extracts of Work Order + Self Certificate of Completion (Certified by the Statutory Auditor or the Authorized Signatory holding Power of Attorney for the bid) The extracts of Work Order or the Self-Certificate should clearly demonstrate the relevant area of work/activities as required in the criterion. IHMCL reserves the right to seek further explanation or supporting documents in case any clarification is required		Project 2: Consultancy for Evaluation of Centrally Sponsored Schemes in Package 9- Water Resources and Environment and Forest Sector Client Name – DME0, Niti Ayog Start Date of Work – Oct’ 19 Project Qualifies Criteria ----- Project 3: Consultancy for Evaluation of Centrally Sponsored Schemes in Package 8- Jobs and Skills Sector Client Name – DME0, NITI Ayog Start Date of Work – Sep’ 19 Project Qualifies Criteria ----- Project 4: Consultancy for Evaluation of Centrally Sponsored Schemes in package 10 - Social Inclusion, Law and Order and Justice Delivery Client Name – DME0, NITI Ayog Start Date of Work – Oct’ 19 Project Qualifies Criteria Refer to proposal – “KPMGProposal TechnicalScoring Criteria.pdf” page no. 67 to 143 ----- Two other project credentials also provided Experience of providing similar nature consultancy in NHAI/MoRTH/NHIDCL/IHMCL	Project 2: Project Management Consultant for Implementing the Intelligent Transport System (ITS) in Chandigarh Transport Undertaking Client - Chandigarh Transport Undertaking Start Date of Work –July 2023 Project Qualifies Criteria ----- Refer to proposal: “COVER5” page no. 32 to 40 ----- Project 3: SMILE - Smart mobility & last MILE logistics Client Name – FILSE – Lingurian Region Start Date of Work – April 2014 The bidder has provided the translated document. The object of project is related with research and innovation: integrated with high level of technology, which is a research and innovation project and not the impact Studies of Government Policy(ies) / Public Policy / IT System Audit of large or medium scale projects in the fields of ICT or Intelligent Transport system/Smart Mobility/Transit payments/ e-Governance as per requirement of RFP. Considering, above the project shall be considered for evaluation as per RFP Clause 5.2.3 S. No. 2. ----- Project 4: Design Review of the Preliminary and Detailed Design, Factory Acceptance Test and Site Acceptance Test of the Ticketing

S. No	Criteria Description	Max Marks	KPMG Advisory Services Private Limited	RINA Consulting S.p.A
	during evaluation of a Self-certificate submitted by the Bidder.		Project 1: Electronic Toll Collection Impact Assessment under the National Electronic Toll Collection (NETC) Program Client Name – IHMCL Start Date of Work – Feb' 21 Project Qualifies Criteria ----- --- Total Marks Obtained – 40 marks	System for Red Line, Green Line, Purple Line part of “Metropolitan Tel Aviv Mass Transit System” Program including both Light Rail Transit lines and Metro Lines Client Name: NTA Start Date of Project – Feb 2016 The object of project is related with Review of the Preliminary and Detailed design, Factory Acceptance Test and Site Acceptance Test of the Ticketing System of Metro Rail as mentioned in the document submitted by the bidder and not the impact Studies of Government Policy(ies) / Public Policy / IT System Audit of large or medium scale projects in the fields of ICT or Intelligent Transport system/Smart Mobility/Transit payments/ e-Governance as per requirement of RFP. Considering, above the project is not considered for evaluation as per RFP Clause 5.2.3 S. No. 2. ----- Project 5: Intelligent Transport System – Traffic Air Pollution Client Name: Beijing Municipal Start Date of Project – June 2016 The object of project is related with tender document preparation, analysis of bid document, review of design document, supervision, support in calibration and validation system and not the impact Studies of Government Policy(ies) / Public Policy / IT System Audit of large or medium scale

S. No	Criteria Description	Max Marks	KPMG Advisory Services Private Limited	RINA Consulting S.p.A
				projects in the fields of ICT or Intelligent Transport system/Smart Mobility/Transit payments/ e-Governance as per requirement of RFP. Considering, above the project shall be considered for evaluation as per RFP Clause 5.2.3 S. No. 2. ----- Project 6: New Cooperative Business Models and Guidance for Sustainable City Logistics Client: European Commission Start Date of Project: June 2015 There are around 30 consultancy firms involved in the project, and the specific scope of services provided by M/s RINA SPA is not provided. The object of project is related with understanding of freight distribution and service trips by providing guidance for implementing effective and sustainable policies and measure and not the impact Studies of Government Policy(ies) / Public Policy / IT System Audit of large or medium scale projects in the fields of ICT or Intelligent Transport system/Smart Mobility/Transit payments/ e-Governance as per requirement of RFP. Considering, above the project shall be considered for evaluation as per RFP Clause 5.2.3 S. No. 2. ----- Project 7: New Cooperative Business Models and Guidance for Sustainable City Logistics Client: European Commission

S. No	Criteria Description	Max Marks	KPMG Advisory Services Private Limited	RINA Consulting S.p.A
				Start Date of Project: Oct 2012 There are around 30 consultancy firms involved in the project, and the specific scope of services provided by M/s RINA SPA is not provided. The object of project is related with development of Roadmap for European Advanced Bus System, definition of work plan for exploitation of Advanced Bus System, identification, dissemination and transfer of most innovative concept and not the impact Studies of Government Policy(ies) / Public Policy / IT System Audit of large or medium scale projects in the fields of ICT or Intelligent Transport system/Smart Mobility/Transit payments/ e-Governance as per requirement of RFP. Considering, above the project shall be considered for evaluation as per RFP Clause 5.2.3 S. No. 2. Project 8: Consultancy Services for Carrying out Feasibility Study for Development of Personal Rapid Transit (PRT) System in GIFT City, Ahmedabad, Gujarat Client; NHLML Start Date of Project – 12.07.2023 The object of the project is related with feasibility study for PRT System in GIFT City and not the impact Studies of Government Policy(ies) / Public Policy / IT System Audit of large or medium scale projects in the fields of ICT or Intelligent Transport system/Smart

S. No	Criteria Description	Max Marks	KPMG Advisory Services Private Limited	RINA Consulting S.p.A
				Mobility/Transit payments/ e-Governance as per requirement of RFP. Considering, above the project shall be considered for evaluation as per RFP Clause 5.2.3 S. No. 2. Experience of providing similar nature consultancy in NHAI/MoRTH/NHIDCL/ IHMCL No project credential provided Total Qualified Projects: 02 Total Marks Obtained – 20 marks
3. Approach and Methodology				
3.1	Demonstration of understanding of the Project Objective, requirements, challenges likely to be encountered, scope of work, etc.	15	12	8
3.2	Project work break down structure showcasing Overall Timelines, Resource assignments (relevance to the task assigned) and dependencies.	15	15	10
4. Adequacy and Quality of Resources proposed for Deployment (Maximum Marks = 10) (Minimum requisite qualification provided in Resource requirement section)				
4.1	Team Leader - Graduate in Engineering and MBA from a reputed and recognized university or institution. - Minimum 10 years of professional experience and with minimum 07 years of overall experience in managing infrastructure programs/ schemes with Large Scale Firms /PSUs /Government Agencies.	5	Name – Ameya Kulkarni Educational Qualification - BE, Civil – 2000 - 2004 - PGD Advanced Construction Management – 2006- 2008	Name - Kaushal Kishore Mishra Educational Qualification B. Tech, IT – 2005 - PG Diploma in Business Administration (Distance) – 2012

S. No	Criteria Description	Max Marks	KPMG Advisory Services Private Limited	RINA Consulting S.p.A
	- Should have experience in managing various aspects of highway development processes including pre-construction, construction and operation and maintenance phases Marks shall be provided as below: - More than 15 years' experience – 5 marks - From 13 years – up to 15 years' experience – 4 marks - From 10 years – up to 12 years' experience – 3 marks <u>Supporting Documents Required</u> CV to be submitted in prescribed format counter-signed by authorized signatory		- Total years of experience – 17 years - Project Experience in Highways – Client - State Bank of India Project Finance SBU & Union Bank of India Industrial Finance Branch Project Name – Panvel Indapur Tollways Pvt Ltd. (4 Laning, 84 km, PPP – DBFOT Toll) Bareilly Highway Projects Ltd. (4 Laning, 157 km, PPP – DBFOT Toll) SEW Krishnanagar Behrampore Highways (4 Laning, 78 km, PPP – DBFOT Annuity) Chhapra Hajipur Expressways Ltd. (2/4 Laning, 66 km, PPP – DBFOT Annuity) Baleshwar Kharagpur Expressways Ltd. (4 Laning, 56 km) Ref to proposal – “KPMGProposal TechnicalScoring Criteria.pdf” Total Marks Obtained – 5 marks	- Total years of experience – 17 years of experience (after removal of 2 years of PGD) - Project Experience in Highways Client – NHAI Project Name – Khed - Sinnar section of NH-50. Four Lanning of Chenani to Nashri section of NH-1. Sikar - Bikaner Section of NH-11. Hazaribagh Ranchi Road Project Moradabad - Bareilly road Project DND Flyway Pune Solapur Road Project Ref to proposal – “COVER6” page no. 36 to 43 Total Marks Obtained – 5 marks

S. No	Criteria Description	Max Marks	KPMG Advisory Services Private Limited	RINA Consulting S.p.A
4.2	Subject Matter Specialist (Impact Assessment) - Graduate in Engineering/ Economics/ Statistics and MBA from a reputed and recognized university or institution. - Should have 10 years of experience in the fields of advanced data analysis and statistical data modelling etc. and at least 5 years of consultancy experience in carrying out Socio-Economic benefits of large-scale ICT/E-Governance/digital transformation projects with Government/PSUs - Should have carried out at least 2 impact assessment project of large-scale Government programme in India or abroad. Marks shall be provided as below: - More than 15 years' experience – 5 marks - From 13 years – up to 15 years' experience – 4 marks - From 10 years – up to 12 years' experience – 3 marks <u>Supporting Documents Required</u> CV to be submitted in prescribed format counter-signed by authorized signatory	5	Name - Sandeep Chittora Educational Qualification – - BE, Mechanical Engineering – 2003 - Master's in technology -2005 - Post Graduate Diploma in Business Management (Distance) – 2011 Total years of Experience – 17 years (removing 2 years of PGDBM) Ref to proposal - Ref to proposal – “KPMGProposal TechnicalScoring Criteria.pdf” page 145 to 168 Total Marks Obtained – 5 marks	Name – Abhay Kumar Mishra Educational Qualification – - B.Sc, Engg – 2006 - MBA IT (Distance) – 2020 Total years of Experience – 16 years (removing 2 years of Distance MBA IT) Ref to proposal: “COVER6” page 44 to 52 Total Marks Obtained – 5 mark
Total Marks Obtained			97	65