



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय - गांधीनगर (गुजरात)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India)

Regional Office - Gandhinagar (Gujarat)

दूरभाष / Phone : 079-29650607, 29650608 ई-मेल / e-mail : rogujarat@nhai.org

पहली मंजिल, बी.एस.एन.एल. टेलीफोन एक्सचेंज बिल्डिंग, "च" रोड, सेक्टर-11, गांधीनगर-382011 (गुजरात)

1st Floor, BSNL Telephone Exchange Building, "CH" Road, Sector-11, Gandhinagar-382011(Gujarat)



NHAI/RO-GNR/DKD/IE/OM/2024/D-2558

Date: 01.08.2024

To,
All Bidders

Sub: Independent Engineer (IE) services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four laning of Dwarka (Kuranga-Khambhaliya-Devariya section from New Chainage km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadinar Junction) (Design length 76.27 km) on NH 151-A in the state of Gujarat on Hybrid Annuity Mode [Tender ID - 2024_NHAI_191367_1] - Evaluation of Technical Bids - Reg.

Ref: Bids submitted on 29.04.2024 for the above-mentioned work.

Dear Sir,

This is with reference to your bid dated 29.04.2024 submitted for the subject tender. In this regard the results of Evaluation of Technical Bids as approved by Competent Authority is summarized as below:

(i) M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited., the other/JV partner of the bidder M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd has failed to meet the minimum eligibility criteria as required in cl. 12(A) of Section-I of RFP - "The firm should have prepared DPR/FS cum PPR for at least two projects of 4/6 laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length". It may be noted that subsequent clause 12(B) requires "Lead partner and the JV partner both shall have experience of at least one project of eligible category as in para 12 (A) above". Accordingly, the bid of M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd has been declared Non-Responsive.

(ii) The bidder M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd. has not submitted any experience certificates for the minimum eligibility criteria "The firm should have experience of project Supervision/IE of at least one O&M project under DBFOT / OMT / O&M of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length" as required in cl. 12(A) of Section-I of RFP. Therefore, the bidder has failed to meet this criterion.

Further, the JV member M/s Mspark Futuristics & Associates has not submitted proofs for weightage of experience in past consultancy assignments. As per note below clause 12(B) of Section-1 of RFP, such projects have not been considered for evaluation. As a result, the JV member has also failed to meet the other two eligibility criteria of clause 12(A) of Section-1 viz. (i) experience in DPR/Feasibility Study cum PPR and (ii) experience Project Supervision/IE of construction projects.

Accordingly, the bid of M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd. has been declared Non-Responsive.

दिनेश

(iii) The remaining 3 (three) bidders have been found to be technically responsive and were further evaluated based on the detailed evaluation criteria as elaborated in Annexure-A of RFP. A summary of evaluation of Technical Bids is as below:

Sr.No.	Name of the Bidder	Marks Obtained	Rank (Technical)
1/5	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd	Non-Responsive as other member of JV failed to meet eligibility criteria as per cl. 12 of Section-I of RFP	-
2/5	M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.	Non-Responsive as failed to meet eligibility criteria as per cl. 12 of Section-I of RFP	-
3/5	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre	97.34	1
4/5	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	96.12	2
5/5	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	93.63	3

2. Detailed evaluation sheet is annexed herewith. As per clause 5.3(ii) of Section-II of RFP, bidders are hereby given opportunity to respond within 7 (seven) days of issue of this letter, i.e. up to 08.08.2024 in case of any objections.

यह सक्षम प्राधिकारी के अनुमोदन से प्रस्तुत है।

दिनेश शेरावत

(दिनेश कुमार शेरावत)
प्रबंधक (तकनीकी)
कृते, क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय-गांधीनगर(गुजरात)

Independent Engineer (IE) services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four laning of Dwarka (Kurunga-Khambhaliya-Devariya section from New Chainage km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadinar Junction) (Design length 76.27 km) on NH 151-A in the state of Gujarat on Hybrid Annuity Mode

List of Applicants

Applicant No	Name of the Applicant	Status of the Applicant Sole/JV/ Association
1/5	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd	JV
2/5	M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.	JV
3/5	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre	Association
4/5	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	Association
5/5	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	Association

Independent Engineer (IE) services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four laning of Dwarka (Kuranga-Khambhaliya-Devariya section from New Chainage km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadinar Junction) (Design length 76.27 km) on NH 151-A in the state of Gujarat on Hybrid Annuity Mode														
Average annual turnover from consultancy services after following enhancement factor														
S.No.	Name of Consultancy Firm/Entity (Sole Bidder/Bidder in JV)		Average annual turnover from consultancy services after following enhancement factor										After Factor Annual Average Turnover in Last 5 years	Turnover as per required
			2022-23		2021-22		2020-21		2019-20		2018-19			
			1.1		1.21		1.33		1.46		1.61			
			Actual	Updated	Actual	Updated	Actual	Updated	Actual	Updated	Actual	Updated		
1/5	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd	Lead Partner	74.20	81.62	62.79	75.98	50.63	67.34	51.31	74.91	50.87	81.90	76.35	Yes
		JV Partner	42.72	46.99	28.09	33.99	20.58	27.37	16.11	23.52	14.10	22.70	30.91	Yes
		Total	116.92	128.61	90.88	109.96	71.21	94.71	67.42	98.43	64.97	104.60	107.26	Yes
2/5	M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamal Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.	Lead Partner	12.02	13.22	11.55	13.98	9.94	13.22	7.06	10.31	8.44	13.59	12.86	Yes
		JV Partner	14.00	15.40	14.76	17.86	10.60	14.10	8.03	11.72	8.72	14.04	14.62	Yes
		Total	26.02	28.62	26.31	31.84	20.54	27.32	15.09	22.03	17.16	27.63	27.49	Yes
3/5	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre	Association	235.63	259.19	211.22	255.58	195.78	260.39	130.79	190.95	98.08	157.91	224.80	Yes
4/5	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	Association	149.39	164.33	140.27	169.73	123.23	163.90	114.39	167.01	91.26	146.93	162.38	Yes
5/5	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	Association	171.50	188.65	171.60	207.64	163.53	217.49	140.55	205.20	119.27	192.02	202.20	Yes

Independent Engineer (IE) services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four laning of Dwarka (Kuranga-Khambhaliya-Devariya section from New Chainage km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadinar Junction) (Design length 76.27 km) on NH 151-A in the state of Gujarat on Hybrid Annuity Mode							
MINIMUM ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA							
S.No.	Name of the Applicants		Preparation of DPR (NH/SH/Equivalent)	Project Supervision/IC (NH/SH/Equivalent)		Annual Turnover	Whether the Applicant meets the Minimum Eligibility Criteria or not
			The firm should have prepared DPR/FS cum PPR for at least two projects of 4/6 laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length.	The firm should have experience of project Supervision/IE of a. At least two construction projects of 4/6 laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6laning of 50% of project length	At least one O&M project under DBFOT / OMT /O&M of 4/6 laning** of 50%of project length	Annual turnover (updated average of last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) of the firm from consultancy business should be equal to or more thanRs.5 Crores	
1/5	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd	Lead Member	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
		Other Member	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	
2/5	M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.	Lead Member	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No
		Other Member	No	No	No	Yes	
3/5	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre	Association	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4/5	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	Association	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5/5	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	Association	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Independent Engineer (IE) services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four laning of Dwarka (Kurunga-Khambhaliya-Devariya section from New Chainage km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadinar Junction) (Design length 76.27 km) on NH 151-A in the state of Gujarat on Hybrid Annuity Mode

Summary of Marks

Final Comparativ e Technical Evaluation Score.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*	Proposed work plan and Methodology	Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment#	Total	Responsive / Non- Responsive	Rank of the Firm
		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed		
	Maximum marks	35	5	20	40	100		
1	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd	Other Member of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)					Non-Responsive	-
2	M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.	Both Members of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)					Non-Responsive	-
3	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre	35.00	5.00	20.00	37.34	97.34	Responsive	1
4	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	34.75	5.00	20.00	36.37	96.12	Responsive	2
5	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	34.25	5.00	20.00	34.38	93.63	Responsive	3

Independent Engineer (IC) services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four Laning of Dwarka (Kuranga-Khambhanya-Devarya section from New Chainage Km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadmal Junction) (Design length 76.27 km) on NH 151-A in the state of Gujarat on Hybrid Annuity Mode										
FIRMS RELEVANT EXPERIENCE FOR THE ASSIGNMENT				ANNEXURE-A1						
S. No	Applicant No.		Max Marks	1/5	2/5	3/5	4/5	5/5		
	Description			M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants	M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.		
				Assesed	Assesed	Assesed	Assesed	Assesed		
1	Year of Establishment of the Firm (In case of JV year of establishment of Lead Member shall be considered)(Min 5 years)		2	Other Member of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)	Both Members of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)	2	2	2		
	For 5 years								1.5 marks	
	More than 5 years								2 Marks	
2	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business		2			2	2	2		
	For 5-10 Crores								0.5 mark	
	For 10-20 Crores								1 mark	
	20-50 Crores					1.5 marks				
For >50 Crores		2 marks								
3	Nos. of Key Professionals with the firm *		2			2	2	2	2	
	< 4 personnel									0 marks
	4 to 12 - Linearly varying from 0.25 to 2									
> 12 personnel		2 marks								
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years		5	Other Member of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)	Both Members of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)	5	4.75	4.25		
	Two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or One project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length								4 marks	
	Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks.									
5	In hand DPRs of NHAI Projects (presently under progress)		10			10	10	10		
	More than Project Length								5 marks	
	More than 2 times of Project Length								7.5 marks	
More than 3 times of Project Length		10 marks								
6	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Authority Engineer/Supervision Consultant two construction projects of four/six laning ** of 30% of project length each or one projects of four/six laning ** of 50% project length in last 7 years.		6			6	6	6		
	2 construction projects 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4marks Or 1 construction project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length								4 marks	
	Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 2 mark.									
7	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFOT/ OMT/ O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years		8			8	8	8		
	1 project								6 marks	
	Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks									
Total			35	0.00	0.00	35.00	34.75	34.25		

Independent Engineer (IE) services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four laning of Dwarka (Kuranga-Khambhaliya-Devariya section from New Chainage km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadinar Junction) (Design length 76.27 km) on NH 151-A in the state of Gujarat on Hybrid Annuity Mode							
Evaluation sheet for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection			1/5	2/5	3/5	4/5	5/5
S.No.	Description	Maximum Point	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd	M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.
			Marks Assessed	Marks Assessed	Marks Assessed	Marks Assessed	Marks Assessed
1	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection	5	Other Member of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)	Both Members of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)	5	5	5
1.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2			2	2	2
1.2	(a) Experience of 1 -2 projects - 1 (b) Experience of 3-5 projects - 2 (c) Experience of > 5 projects - 3	3			3	3	3
2	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement	4			4	4	4
2.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2			2	2	2
2.2	(a) Experience of 1 -3 projects - 1 (b) Experience >3 projects - 2	2			2	2	2
3	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit or better technology for Bridges inspection	4			4	4	4
3.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2			2	2	2
3.2	(a) Experience of 1 -3 projects - 1 (b) Experience >3 projects - 2	2			2	2	2
4	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology	4			4	4	4
4.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2			2	2	2
4.2	(a) Experience of 1 -3 projects - 1 (b) Experience >3 projects - 2	2			2	2	2
5	Experience in Automatic Traffic Counter cum Classifier (ATCC)	3			3	3	3
5.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2			2	2	2
5.2	(a) Experience of 1 -3 projects - 0.5 (b) Experience >3 projects - 1	1			1	1	1
	Total	20	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	20	20	20

Independent Engineer (IE) services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four laning of Dwarka (Kuranga-Khambhaliya-Devariya section from New Chainage km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadinar Junction) (Design length 76.27 km) on NH 151-A in the state of Gujarat on Hybrid Annuity Mode						
Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology						
Description	.	1/5	2/5	3/5	4/5	5/5
		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd	M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.
	Maximum Marks	Marks assessed	Marks assessed	Marks assessed	Marks assessed	Marks assessed
Site Appreciation	1	Other Member of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)	Both Members of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)	1	1	1
(i) Average 0.50 (ii) Good 0.75 (iii) Very Good 1.00						
Quality of Approach and Methodology	2			2	2	2
(Review of scope ofwork and design review, construction supervision methodology, contract management approach, safety review/audit and O&M stage, initial view on project plan including key challenges envisaged and potential solutions to be judged). (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00						
Quality Audit Methodology andQuality Assurance Plan	2			2	2	2
(i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00						
Total Marks	5	0	0	5	5	5

ration & Maintenance Period of Four laning of Dwarka (Kuranga-Khambhaliya-Devariya section from New Chainage km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadinar Junction) (Design length 76.27 km) on NH 151-A

Summary Sheet of CV's																	
S. No.	Details	Total Marks	1/5			2/5			3/5			4/5			5/5		
			M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd			M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.			M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre			M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.			M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.		
			Name	Score	Weighted score	Name	Score	Weighted score	Name	Score	Weighted score	Name	Score	Weighted score	Name	Score	Weighted score
1	Team Leader cum Highway Engineer	19	Nagendra Singh	Other Member of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)		Avadhesh Kumar	Both Members of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)		Keshav Prasad Vaishya	96	18.24	Suresh K	91	17.29	Vishnu Shankar Dubey	90	17.10
2	Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer	12	Durgesh Kumar Tripathi			Anil Kumar			Binod Kumar Yadav	88.5	10.62	Manpreet Singh Matharu	88.33	10.60	Satish Raj	91	10.92
3	Bridge / Structural Engineer	4	Ravi Ranjan			Atul Nanakrao Ramteke			Ankur Singh Rana	92	3.68	Suresh Chand	87	3.48	Mukesh Kumar Mukharjee	89	3.56
4	Road Safety Expert	5	Avnish Kumar			Vinod Sharma			Sapna Verma	96	4.80	Soni Pragnesh	100	5.00	Krishan Kumar Vyas	56	2.80
		40			0.00			0.00			37.34			36.37			34.38

Independent Engineer (IE) services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four laning of Dwarka (Kuranga-Khambhaliya-Devariya section from New Chainage km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadinar Junction)							
Team Leader cum Highway Engineer							
	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/5	2/5	3/5	4/5	5/5
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd	M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.
	Name of Key Personnel		Nagendra Singh	Avadhesh Kumar	Keshav Prasad Vaishya	Suresh K	Vishnu Shankar Dubey
	Description		Assessed marks	Assessed marks	Assessed marks	Assessed marks	Assessed marks
1	General Qualification	25	Other Member of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)	Both Members of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)			
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21			21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering	4			0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70					
a)	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:						
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	30			30	30	30
	< 10 years -0						
	10 years -22						
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.						
ii)	Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M of completed 4/6 lane highway sections	35			35	35	35
	< 3 years - 0						
	3 years - 30						
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.						
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in Highway Development Projects taken up under PPP	5			5	5	4
	1 Project- 4 Marks						
	add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks						
3	Employment with the Firm	5			5	0	0
	< 1 year -0						
	1 year -3						
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks						
	Total	100	0	0	96	91	90
	Weightage @ 19	19	0	0	18.24	17.29	17.1

Independent Engineer (IE) services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four laning of Dwarka (Kuranga-Khambhaliya-Devariya section from New Chainage km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadinar Junction) (Design length 76.27 km) on NH 151-A in the state of Gujarat on Hybrid Annuity Mode							
Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer							
	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/5	2/5	3/5	4/5	5/5
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd	M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.
	Name of Key Personnel		Durgesh Kumar Tripathi	Anil Kumar	Binod Kumar Yadav	Manpreet Singh Matharu	Satish Raj
	Description		Assessed	Assessed			
1	General Qualification	25	Other Member of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)	Both Members of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)			
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21			21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Highway Engineering	4			0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70					
a)	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:						
i)	Experience in highway works (inspection /design/ construction/ maintenance)	30			30	30	30
	< 7 years -0						
	7 years -22						
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.						
ii)	Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature	15			15	14	15
	< 3 year - 0						
	3 years -12						
	Add one marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.						
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/ Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/ Expressways	25			22.5	23.33	25
	1 project -20						
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.						
3	Employment with the Firm	5			0	0	0
	< 1 year -0						
	1 year -3						
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks						
	Total	100	0	0	88.5	88.33	91
	Weightage @ 12	12	0	0	10.62	10.5996	10.92

Independent Engineer (IE) services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four laning of Dwarka (Kuranga-Khambhaliya-Devariya section from New Chainage km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadinar Junction) (Design length 76.27 km) on NH 151-A in the state of Gujarat on Hybrid Annuity Mode							
Bridge / Structural Engineer							
	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/5	2/5	3/5	4/5	5/5
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd	M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.
	Name of Key Personnel		Ravi Ranjan	Atul Nanakrao Ramteke	Ankur Singh Rana	Suresh Chand	Mukesh Kumar Mukharjee
	Description		Assessed	Assessed			
1	General Qualification	25	Other Member of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)	Both Members of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)			
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21			21	21	21
ii)	II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4			0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70					
a)	Adequacy for the Project						
i)	Total Professional Experience	30					
	< 7 years -0				28	30	30
	7 years -22						
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks						
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Design/Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Flyover/Interchanges/any other such structures including rehabilitation	20					
	< 3years -0				20	20	20
	3 years - 16						
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.						
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation of 4/6 lane highway/Expressway or similar	20					
	1 Project -16				18	16	18
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional Project subject to maximum 4(Four) marks						
3	Employment with the Firm	5					
	< 1 year -0				5	0	0
	1 year -3						
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks						
	Total	100	0	0	92	87	89
	Weightage @ 4	4	0	0	3.68	3.48	3.56

Independent Engineer (IE) services during Operation & Maintenance Period of Four laning of Dwarka (Kuranga-Khambhaliya-Devariya section from New Chainage km 0.000(Kurunga) to Km 76.270(Vadinar Junction) (Design length 76.27 km) on NH 151-A in the state of Gujarat on Hybrid Annuity Mode							
Road Safety Expert							
	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/5	2/5	3/5	4/5	5/5
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd in JV with G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in Association with JS Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd	M/s Armenge Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Mspark Futuristics & Associates and in association with Shree Mahamai Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd.	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in association with Innovative Cadd Centre	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.
	Name of Key Personnel		Avnish Kumar	Vinod Sharma	Sapna Verma	Soni Pragnesh	Krishan Kumar Vyas
	Description		Assessed marks	Assessed marks	Assessed marks	Assessed marks	Assessed marks
1	General Qualification	25	Other Member of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)	Both Members of JV failed to meet minimum eligibility criteria (clause 12 of Section-1 of RFP)			
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21			21	21	21
ii)	II) Post Graduation in Traffic/Transportation/Safety Engineering	4			0	4	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70					
a)	Professional Experience						
i)	Total Professional Experience	30					
	< 7 years -0				30	30	30
	7 years -22						
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.						
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety works on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (4/6 laning**)	20			20	20	0
	< 3 years - 0						
	3 years - 17						
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.						
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audits of 4/6-laning** Highway/Expressway projects	15			15	15	0
	1 Project- 12 Marks Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.						
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in preparation of Road Safety Management Plan for Inter Urban Highways.	5			5	5	5
	1 project- 3						
	More than 1 project - 5						
3	Employment with the Firm	5			5	5	0
	< 1 year -0						
	1 year -3						
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks						
	Total	100			0	0	96
	Weightage @ 5	5	0	0	4.8	5	2.8

Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by AJAY KUMAR SWAMI
Date: 2024.08.02 11:11:19 IST
Location: eProcurement System for Central PSUs

