EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL BIDS (1st call)
TENDER NOTICE No. 2 / HDO / NH / 2024-25 Dated. 21.10.2024.
DATE OF MEETING 18.12.2024.

Minutes of the State Level Tender Evaluation Committee (SLEC) meeting for the Evaluation of Technical Bid for the work of **"Maintenance and Repair work from Km 0.000 to 11.950, Km 12.100 to 13.700, Km 16.700 to 20.400 of NH-32 (17.25 Km) (Thoothukudi- Tiruchendur- Kanyakumari Road) in the state of Tamil Nadu under Performance Based Maintenance Contract (PBMC)". (Job No. NH - 32 – TN – 2024 – 25-PBMC-004).**

Estimate Amount : Rs. 2904.29 Lakhs
Value Put to Tender: Rs. 2236.10 Lakhs

Members Present

1. **Thiru.M.Panneerselvam, Chief Engineer, National Highways, Chennai – Chairman**
2. **Tmt T.Santhi, Superintending Engineer, (NH), Tirunelveli – Member**
3. **Thiru.M.S.Rajesh, Deputy Secretary to Government, Highways and Minor Ports Department, Secretariat, Chennai – Member**
4. **Thiru.Dhanapalan.K. EE, MORT&H, Chennai – Member**
5. **Thiru.S.Shanmuganathan, Divisional Engineer (NH), Tirunelveli – Member Secretary**

1. The Chairman welcomed the Committee members and requested Member Secretary to deliberate on the Technical Bids for consideration/decision of the Committee. Accordingly, the Member Secretary explained the Technical points in respect of RFP for the Bid which has been minuted in the following points.

2. The subject work has been sanctioned by GOI, MoRT&H (Project South Zone-II) F.No.RO/ Chennai/ MoRTH/ 23012/ 03/ PBMC/ 2024-25 (E-242866) -Dated: 11.11.2024 for an amount of Rs.2904.29 Lakhs. The 1st call tender for the work has been invited by the Superintending Engineer (NH) Tirunelveli online on 21.10.2024 by fixing the last date for receipt of tender as 25.11.2024 up to 15.00 Hrs and the date of opening as 26.11.2024 @ 15.00 Hrs. The Technical bids received through online were opened by the Evaluation Committee on 26.11.2024 through video conference.

18/12/24
D.E, NH, Tirunelveli

18/12/2024
S.E(N.H) Tirunelveli

3. The following bidders had Participated through online in CPP and BIMS portal 1) Thiru.N.Ravichandran, 2) Thiru.K.Rajamohamed, 3)M/s.S.Muthiah & Co, 4) M/s.MS CONSTRUCTION and 5) Thiru.M.Muthukrishnan.

4. The bidder M/s.P.JEFFERSON SAMUELRAJ and SONS has uploaded bid only in BIMS portal and hence not considered for further evaluation. Further the bidders Thiru.K.Rajamohamed and M/s.MS CONSTRUCTION have not submitted the documents physically before the bid due date as per NIT and RFP Cl.12.2. Hence, their bids are rejected.

5. The committee verified both the CPPP and BIMS Portal and found that the remaining three bidders 1) Thiru.N.Ravichandran, 2) M/s.S.Muthiah & Co and 3) Thiru.M.Muthukrishnan have uploaded the Bid Security for Rs. 22.40 Lakhs as per NIT and Section 2 ITB Cl.16.1 stipulations. Also, the bidders have uploaded the cost of tender document (bharatkosh.gov.in receipt), Online GST remittance receipt in favour of DE (NH) Tirunelveli, POA for signing the Bid and also submitted the documents physically as per RFP Cl.12.2.

6. After discussions, the committee decided to technically evaluate the bids of three bidders viz 1) Thiru.N.Ravichandran, 2) M/s.S.Muthiah & Co and 3) Thiru. M. Muthukrishnan to ascertain the eligibility of the bidders with regards to the criteria prescribed in RFP document. The Superintending Engineer (NH), Tirunelveli informed the Evaluation committee that the Confirmation for the BG's submitted by the three bidders has been obtained from concerned banks.

7. Based on the uploaded documents, the evaluation committee evaluated the technical bids of **1) Thiru.N.Ravichandran, 2) M/s.S.Muthiah & Co and 3) Thiru.M.Muthukrishnan** and brief of findings is tabulated below:

18/12/2020
D.E., NH, Tirunelveli

18/12/2020
S.E.(N.H)

Name of Bidder	Mimimum Requirement	Thiru. N.Ravichandran	M/s.S. Muthiah& Co	Thiru.M. Muthukrishnan
Bid Capacity	Rs. 2236.10 Lakhs	Rs.88671.00 Lakhs	Rs.42239.13 Lakhs	Rs.17036.25 Lakhs
Threshold Technical Capacity	Rs. 2236.10 Lakhs	Rs. 6065.09 Lakhs	Rs.4182.90 Lakhs	Rs.2497.68 Lakhs
Average Annual Turn Over	Rs.335.42 Lakhs	Rs.4476.16 Lakhs	Rs.2592.73 Lakhs	Rs.1067.32 Lakhs
Net Worth	Rs.111.81 Lakhs	Rs. 5049.00 Lakhs Certificate specifying the Methodology adopted for calculating net worth is as per Cl.4.10(ii) of RFP document not furnished	Rs.1046.12 Lakhs Certificate specifying the Methodology adopted for calculating net worth is as per Cl.4.10(ii) of RFP document not furnished	Rs.482.17 Lakhs Certificate specifying the Methodology adopted for calculating net worth is as per Cl.4.10(ii) of RFP document not furnished
Similar Nature single value of work completed	Rs. 447.22 Lakhs	Rs.930.63 Lakhs	Rs.849.59 Lakhs	Rs.862.78 Lakhs
Construction and maintenance equipment's Section –2 Appendix to ITB		Not -satisfying RFP Section –2 Appendix to ITB	Not-satisfying RFP Section –2 Appendix to ITB	Not-satisfying RFP Section –2 Appendix to ITB
Details of the Technical Personnel in the Appendix to ITB		Not-satisfying RFP Section –2 Appendix to ITB	Satisfying RFP Section –2 Appendix to ITB	Satisfying RFP Section –2 Appendix to ITB
Remarks		Non- Responsive	Non- Responsive	Non- Responsive

18/12/24
D.E., NH, Tirunelveli

18/12/2024
S.E(N.H) Tirunelveli.

The reasons for declaring the bidder **Thiru N.Ravichandran** as **non-responsive**:

i) Certificate specifying that the Methodology adopted for calculating net worth is as per Cl.4.10 (ii) of RFP document not furnished.
ii) Documentary evidence for Mobile Maintenance unit not furnished.
iii) Air compressor 1 No shortage.
iv) Water Tanker and Mini hot mix plant (6/10 T/Hr capacity) with indirect heating arrangements not satisfying RFP stipulation (RC also not enclosed for water tanker).
v) Registration validity expired for Tipper / dumper truck.
vi) Incident cum Road Property Manager cum Route Operation Manager and Road Safety Auditor (Key Personnel) have not satisfied requirements as per RFP Section-2 Appendix to ITB.

The reasons for declaring the bidder **M/s S. Muthiah & Co** as **non-responsive:**

i) Certificate specifying that the Methodology adopted for calculating Net worth is as per Cl.4.10 (ii) of RFP document not furnished.
ii) Mobile Maintenance Unit is not satisfying the minimum capacity (6 tonne).
iii) Vibratory Roller, Static Roller not furnished.
iv) Small Roller/ Compactor has been purchased in 2001 and certificate to ensure working condition not furnished.
v) Water tanker not satisfying RFP conditions (RC not enclosed).
vi) Registration validity expired for Tippers.
vii) String line set not furnished.

The reasons for declaring the bidder **Thiru.M.Muthukrishnan** as **non-responsive**:

i) Certificate specifying that the Methodology adopted for calculating net worth is as per Cl.4.10 (ii) of ITB document not furnished.
ii) Mobile Maintenance Unit is not satisfying the minimum capacity (6 tonne).
iii) Water Tanker not satisfying RFP conditions (RC not enclosed).
iv) Dewatering pumps not furnished.
v) Registration validity expired for Tippers.

8. In view of reasons stated in Para'7', the committee decided that the bids of all three bidders **1) Thiru.N.Ravichandran, 2) M/s.S.Muthiah & Co and**

18/12/24 18/12/2024
ADE, NH, S.E(N.H)

3) **Thiru.M.Muthukrishnan** will be considered as technically Non-Responsive. The Evaluation Committee after discussions decided that the instant tender (1st call) shall be annulled and fresh bid may be invited by giving 4 week time period for submission of bids.

The meeting ended with the vote of Thanks to the Chair. Detailed Evaluation sheets are annexed.

DE (NH) Tirunelveli	SE (NH) Tirunelveli	DS, H&MP Dept., Chennai	EE, MoRTH, Chennai	Chief Engineer (NH) & Chairman
18/12/24	19/12/2024			