

Minutes of the Meeting of the Evaluation Committee held on 02.01.2025 at 12:00 Hrs. through VC mode for the work of DPR Consultancy services for Four Lanning from (1) 265/200 to 287/905 in Dahod District and (2) from KM 356/905 to 421/400 (Ferkuva to Bodeli section) of NH-56 in Chhota udepur District in the state of Gujarat.

Meeting of Evaluation Committee was held through hybrid mode on 02.01.2025 at 12:00 hrs. in the Chamber of Regional Officer MoRTH, Gujarat & UT of Dadra & Nagar Haveli and Daman & Diu, 4th floor, Block No 14, New Sachivalaya Gandhinagar for financial evaluation of bids received from the bidders. The Following Committee members were present:

1	Shri Vinay Kumar Bansal, Superintending Engineer, Regional Officer, MoRTH, Gandhinagar.	Chairman
2	Shri Sanjay Kumar, AFA, Finance Wing, MoRTH	Member
3	Shri Saurav Shivhare, Executive Engineer, Regional Office, MoRTH, Gandhinagar.	Member
4	Shri Shirish Singh, Superintending Engineer (I/C) NH, R&B, Vadodara.	Member

2. At the outset, Regional Officer MoRTH, Gujarat welcomed the participants. The Committee was apprised that in Evaluation Committee Meeting held on 16.12.2024, following 5 (Five) technically responsive bidders are shortlisted by Evaluation Committee for opening of financial bid by following due procedure as per RFP. The details of technically qualified bidders are as under:

S.No.	Name of Bidder
1	M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd Jv with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd
2	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd. Association with M/s Aartav Engineering Pvt. Ltd.
3	M/s MSV International Inc, in Association with Civilarcc Engineering and Project Consultant Pvt. Ltd.
4	M/s Indian Technocrat Ltd. In JV with M/s Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Saadhya Infra Solutions LLP
5	Ms Engineering Consultancy Services Associate Member Saksham Survey Solutions

3. Evaluation Committee in the meeting held on 16.12.2024 recommended opening of financial bids of following 5 (Five) technically responsive bidders after uploading the outcome of technical evaluation online, giving opportunity to the bidders to respond within 7 days in case they have any objection. This office has not received any comments within the said period. Accordingly, online financial bids of above 5 (Five) bidders were opened on 30.12.2024 at Regional Office MoRTH Gandhinagar. The following are the bid prices offered by the bidders: -

S.No.	Name of Bidder	Amount (Rs.)
1	M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd Jv with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd	2,15,06,090
2	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd. Association with M/s Aartav Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	1,63,98,698.36
3	M/s MSV International Inc, in Association with Civilarcc Engineering and Project Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	84,66,500
4	M/s Indian Technocrat Ltd. In JV with M/s Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s	1,37,05,759

S. Singh

Saurav

R-S-S

✓

	Saadhya Infra Solutions LLP	
5	Ms Engineering Consultancy Services Associate Member Saksham Survey Solutions	1,32,02,030

4. Committee observed that as per RFP, the lowest financial proposal (F_M) will be given a financial score (S_F) of 100 points. The financial scores of other proposals will be computed as:

$$S_F = 100 \times F_M / F \text{ (F= amount of financial proposal)}$$

4.1 Thereafter, as per RFP, evaluation Committee evaluated proposals for ranking based on the combined score as per following formula given in RFP:

$$S = S_T \times T_w + S_F \times F_w$$

Where S_T is the technical scores and S_F is the Financial Score out of 100, S is the combined score and T_w & F_w are weightage for Technical Proposal and Financial Proposal that shall be 0.8 and 0.2 respectively.

4.2 The details of combined score obtained by the bidders are as under:

S.No.	Bidder	Technical Score (ST)	Financial Amount (F) (Rs.)	Amount of Lowest Bid (FM)	Financial Score (SF=100 x FM/F)	Combined Score(S) (ST x 0.8 + SF x 0.2)	Bidder Rank
1	M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd Jv with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd	97.34	21506090	8466500	39.37	85.75	H3
2	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd. Association with M/s Aartav Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	95.72	16398698		51.63	86.90	H2
3	M/s MSV International Inc, in Association with Civilarcc Engineering and Project Consultant Pvt.	94.6	8466500		100.00	95.68	H1
4	M/s Indian Technocrat Ltd. In JV with M/s Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Saadhya Infra Solutions LLP	89.62	13705759		61.77	84.05	H4
5	Ms Engineering Consultancy Services Associate Member Saksham Survey Solutions	84.65	13202030		64.13	80.55	H5

5. Rankings of the bidders are as under:

S. No.	Name of the bidder	Final combined	Rank
--------	--------------------	----------------	------

S. Singh

Saurav

R - 2

✓

		Score	
1	M/s MSV International Inc, in Association with Civilarcc Engineering and Project Consultant Pvt Ltd	95.68	H1 bidder
2	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd. Association with M/s Aartav Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	86.90	H2 bidder
3	M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd in Jv with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd	85.75	H3 bidder
4	M/s Indian Technocrat Ltd. In JV with M/s Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Saadhya Infra Solutions LLP	84.05	H4 bidder
5	M/s Engineering Consultancy Services Associate Member Saksham Survey Solutions	80.55	H5 bidder

6. It has been apprised to the committee that the bid quoted by Most preferred bidder (H-1) seems extremely low. As per Ministry's circular dated 12.03.2019, the normative cost for preparation of DPR for 4 laning or more comes out as 3.5 lakh per km. The bid quoted by the Most preferred bidder (H-1) is 0.82 lakh per km (Excl. GST), which is much lower as compare to the normative cost.

7. Further, as per the detailed breakup of cost given in BOQ of Most preferred bidder (H-1), it is found that the rate quoted for the professional staff is on quite lower side, which is even lower than the Minimum wages as per the Ministry of labour & Employment circular dated 25.09.2024.

8. After detailed deliberation in meeting, the committee decided to seek written clarification regarding low quote from the most preferred bidder (H-1) before taking further action on the bid received.

9. The meeting ended with a Vote of Thanks to the Chair.

S. Singh

(Shirish Singh)
Superintending
Engineer (I/C),
NH, R&B,
Vadodara

Saurav

(Saurav Shivhare)
Executive
Engineer
RO Gandhinagar

R. S.

(Sanjay Kumar), AFA,
Finance Wing MoRTH

Vinay

(Vinay Kumar Bansal)
Superintending
Engineer
R.O. (MoRTH)
Gandhinagar.

Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by VINAY KUMAR
BANSAL
Date: 2025.01.07 15:13:44 IST
Location: eProcure-EPROC