

Minutes of the Meeting of the Evaluation Committee held on 16.12.2024 through VC mode for the work of Consultancy services of Independent Engineer for "Upgradation of Mehsana-Visnagar-Vadnagar-Kheralu-Idar section from km 0/00 to km 81/300 of NH 168G (Mehsana to Idar) in the State of Gujarat (Total length 81.300 km) on Hybrid Annuity Mode (HAM).

Meeting of Evaluation Committee was held through hybrid mode on 16.12.2024 at 16:00 hrs. in the Chamber of Regional Officer MoRTH, Gujarat & UT of Dadra & Nagar Haveli and Daman & Diu, 4th floor, Block No 14, New Sachivalaya Gandhinagar for evaluation of bids received from the bidders. The Following Committee members were present:

1	Shri Vinay Kumar Bansal, Superintending Engineer, Regional Officer, MoRTH, Gandhinagar.	Chairman
2	Shri Sudhir Kumar Jaiswal, Advisor (Cost), Finance Wing, MoRTH	Member
3	Shri N G Shilu, Chief Engineer (NH) R&B Dept Govt. of Gujarat.	Member
4	Shri Saurav Shivhare, Executive Engineer, Regional Office, MoRTH, Gandhinagar.	Member
5	Shri D R Mistry, Executive Engineer, NH, R&B, Ahmedabad.	Member

2. At the outset, Regional Officer MoRTH, Gujarat welcomed all the participants. The Committee was apprised that in Evaluation Committee Meeting held on 13.11.2024 & 06.12.2024, following 5 (Five) technically responsive bidders are shortlisted by Evaluation Committee for opening of financial bid by following due procedure as per RFP. The details of technically qualified bidders are as under:

Sr.No.	Name of Bidders
1	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint Venture with M/s Geo Designs & Research Pvt. Ltd.
2	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited
3	M/s LN Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.
4	M/s Yongma Engineering Co., Ltd in association with Sterling indo tech consultants Pvt Ltd
5	M/s TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd. In association with MAV associates LLP

3. Accordingly, online financial bids of above 5 (Five) bidders were opened on 10.12.2024 at Regional Office MoRTH Gandhinagar. The following are the bid prices offered by the bidders: -

Sr. No.	Bidder Name	Financial Quote in (Rs.) (incl. GST)
1	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint Venture with M/s Geo Designs & Research Pvt. Ltd.	4,63,09,867
2	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited	6,79,68,000
3	M/s LN Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	5,64,65,076.80
4	M/s Yongma Engineering Co., Ltd in association with Sterling indo tech consultants Pvt Ltd	4,44,86,000
5	M/s TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd. In association with MAV associates LLP	5,59,89,820

13

Saurav

Qasim

✓

4. Committee observed that as per Clause 5.7 of RFP, the lowest financial proposal (F_M) will be given a financial score (S_F) of 100 points. The financial scores of other proposals will be computed as:

$$S_F = 100 \times F_M / F \text{ (F= amount of financial proposal)}$$

4.1 Thereafter, as per Clause 5.8 of RFP, evaluation Committee evaluated proposals for ranking based on the combined score as per RFP:

$$S = S_T \times T_w + S_F \times F_w$$

Where S_T is the technical scores and S_F is the Financial Score out of 100, S is the combined score and T_w & F_w are weightage for Technical Proposal and Financial Proposal that shall be 0.8 and 0.2 respectively.

4.2 The details of combined score obtained by the bidders are as under:

Sr. No.	Name of the Firm / Entity	Technical Score (S_T)	Financial Amount (Rs.)	Amount of Lowest Bid (F_M)	Financial Score ($S_F=100 \times F_M/F$)	Combined Score ($S = (S_T \times T_w + S_F \times F_w)$)
1	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint Venture with M/s Geo Designs & Research Pvt. Ltd.	97.08	4,63,09,867	4,44,86,000	96.06	96.88
2	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited	96.82	6,79,68,000		65.45	90.55
3	M/s LN Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	96.22	5,64,65,076.80		78.78	92.73
4	M/s Yongma Engineering Co., Ltd in association with Sterling indo tech consultants Pvt Ltd	95.53	4,44,86,000		100.00	96.42
5	M/s TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd. In association with MAV associates LLP	95.52	5,59,89,820		79.45	92.31

5. Rankings of the bidders are:

S. No.	Name of the bidder	Final combined Score	Rank
1	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint Venture with M/s Geo Designs & Research Pvt. Ltd.	96.88	H1 bidder
2	M/s Yongma Engineering Co., Ltd in association with Sterling indo tech consultants Pvt Ltd	96.42	H2 bidder

Saurav

Adarsh

3	M/s LN Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	92.73	H3 bidder
4	M/s TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd. In association with MAV associates LLP	92.31	H4 bidder
5	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited	90.55	H5 bidder

6. In view of the above as per clause 5.8 of RFP, the most preferred bidder (H1, highest combined score) along with their financial quote is as under:

Most Preferred bidder	Financial Quote (Rs.) (incl. GST)
M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint Venture with M/s Geo Designs & Research Pvt. Ltd.	4,63,09,867/-

7. In view of the above, the Evaluation Committee recommended for award of the instant work to the bidder M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint Venture with M/s Geo Designs & Research Pvt. Ltd. for a quote of Rs. 4,63,09,867/- (incl. GST) mentioned in Para 6 above subject to approval of the Competent Authority.

8. The meeting ended with a Vote of Thanks to the Chair.

(D R Mistry)
Executive
Engineer, NH
Division
Ahmedabad

(Saurav Shivhare)
Executive Engineer
RO Gandhinagar

(N G Shilu)
Chief
Engineer
(NH) R&B
Dept Govt.
of Gujarat

(Sudhir Kumar
Jaiswal), Advisor
(Cost), Finance
Wing MoRTH

(Vinay Kumar
Bansal)
Superintending
Engineer
R.O. (MoRTH)
Gandhinagar.