

BY ROTATION

Minutes of Meeting of Technical Bid Evaluation held on 18th June 2024 under the Chairmanship of Chief Engineer (Highway Zone), PWD Arunachal Pradesh

Name of Work:	"ONE TIME IMPROVEMENT OF BYPASSED SECTION ON JORAM BYPASS OLD ROAD FROM KM 40.200 TO 46.700 KM(LENGTH-6.50KM) OF POTIN-PANGIN PACKAGE-1 OF NH-13 IN THE STATE OF ARUNACHAL PRADESH. [Job No. 713A/Ar.P/2023-24/076]"
Administrative Approval & Technical Sanction	RW/RO/NH(O)/AP23-24/OTI/NH-13 dated 12.03.2024 Sanctioned cost: -Rs.15.49 Crore
Amount put to tender:	Rs. 12.28 Cr (Excl. GST)
Time and Date of Opening of Technical Bids:	At 11:00 Hrs. on 18.03.2024
List of Firms who participated in the online tender:	1) PUNA HINDA 2) M/s D & L Enterprises 3) Vivek Enterprise 4) M/s NABAM TULLON LLP 5) NM Enterprises

1. The Administrative & Financial approval and Technical Sanction for the instant work has been accorded by Ministry for an amount of Rs.15.49 Crore vide letter dated 12.03.2024.

2. The work was bid out in two cover bid system through e-procurement on 02.02.2024 and the technical bids were opened on 18.03.2024.

3. The evaluation committee examined the document placed before the committee. Evaluation sheet is enclosed at Annex-I. Based on the evaluation; the committee observed the following:

3.1. PUNA HINDA: The committee found the bidder as **Technically Responsive** as per Clause 3.1.6 of RFP.

3.2. M/s D & L Enterprises: The Committee observed the following:

- a) The bidder has failed to furnish the details of year wise payment receipt for Eligible projects required to calculate Threshold Technical Capacity in Annex-IV to Appendix IA required as per Clause 2.2.2.7(iii) of the RFP. Further, the bidder has not furnished Annex-V "Statement of Legal Capacity" required under **Clause 3.1.6.1 (a)** of RFP.
- b) Discrepancy between the Annual Turn-over of the firm as in C.A. certificate and the annual-turnover as shown in the Balance sheets and as disclosed by the bidder in Annexure-III. Further, value of civil engineering payments as shown in Annexure-VI for FY 2022-23 and FY 2021-22 is more than Annual turnover as in C.A. certificate ,

which is in-correct. Also, discrepancy between the Net Worth disclosed by the bidder in Annex-III and the Net worth shown in the Net worth certificate. These are mis-representation of facts as per Clause 2.6.2 of the RFP.

- c) One work disclosed under "B" in Annexure-VI namely "C/o Road from Pitapool to kyunglo (pith)(28.00km) under CRIF in lower Subansiri District" has stated the percentage participation of bidder as 30%. However, the same is 100% as per agreement dt. 18.04.2023 between EE,Yazali Division,PWD,Arunachal Pradesh and M/s D&L Enterprises. This is mis-representation of facts as per Clause 2.6.2 of the RFP.

Hence, the committee found the bidder as **Technically Non-Responsive** as per 3.1.6.1 (a) and 2.6.2 of RFP.

3.3. Vivek Enterprise: The Committee observed the following: The bidder has not submitted the "Letter comprising the Technical Bid[Annexure-I] and list of on-going works (B value) Annexure-VI as required as per Cl 3.1.6 Test of Responsiveness. Hence bidder is non-responsive as per Clause 3.1.6.1(a) of the RFP. Hence, the committee found the bidder as **Technically Non-Responsive** as per Clause 3.1.6.1(a) of RFP.

3.4. M/s NABAM TULLON LLP: The committee found the bidder as **Technically Responsive** as per Clause 3.1.6 of RFP.

3.5. NM Enterprises: The committee found the bidder as **Technically Responsive** as per Clause 3.1.6 of RFP.

4. In view of the above, the committee found following 3 (Three) bidders to be technically responsive and recommended for opening their financial proposals for the work "ONE TIME IMPROVEMENT OF BYPASSED SECTION ON JORAM BYPASS OLD ROAD FROM KM 40.200 TO 46.700 KM(LENGTH-6.50KM) OF POTIN-PANGIN PACKAGE-1 OF NH-13 IN THE STATE OF ARUNACHAL PRADESH. [Job No. 713A/Ar.P/2023-24/076]"

- i. PUNA HINDA
- ii. NM Enterprises
- iii. M/s NABAM TULLON LLP


Executive Engineer
Ziro Highway Division,
PWD, Arunachal Pradesh


Superintending Engineer,
Highway Itanagar Circle,
PWD, Arunachal Pradesh


Regional Officer, Itanagar
Ministry of Road Transport & Highways


Sr. Finance & Accounts Officer
Highway Zone,
PWD, Arunachal Pradesh


Chief Engineer
Highway Zone,
PWD, Arunachal Pradesh