



Government of Maharashtra

Office of the Executive Engineer National Highway Division, Nashik

Phone No: 0253-2573270

E-mail : eenhnashik@gmail.com

nhnashik.ee@mahapwd

Second Floor Green Building,

P.W.D. Compound Untwadi

Road, Nashik - 422 002.

No. NHNsk/AB-3/ /2024

Date: 22/11/2024

To

5/20

All Bidders,

Subject :- Submission of Evaluation Report of Technical Bids

Name of Work : Rehabilitation and Upgradation to 2L4L with Paved Shoulders from Saputara Gujarat Maharashtra Border to Chausale section of NH 953 in km 104.000 to 121.570 Length 17.570 on EPC Mode in the State of Maharashtra.

Tender Id:- 2024_MoRTH_795785_1

Job No. NH-953-MAH-2023-24-036 dated 22.02.2024.

- Reference:-**
1. Chief Engineer, Government of India, Ministry of Road Transport & Highways (Regional office, Maharashtra and Goa), Mumbai, office letter no. RW / MUM / FINANCILA CONSULTANCY / 2024-25 / 955 Dt. 26/08/2024.
 2. Opening of Technical bids on 18/7/2024.
 3. 1st Minutes of meeting of State level evaluation Committee held on 08.10.2024.
 4. 2nd Minutes of meeting of State level evaluation Committee held on 08.11.2024.
 5. 3rd Minutes of meeting of State level evaluation Committee held on 22.11.2024.

With reference to the above subject work the following (Fifteen) Contractors have submitted their document and Technical Evaluation of Fifteen Contractors is done & total 10 agencies are considered as Responsive & total 5 agencies are considered as Non-Responsive. The Details are as below.

Sr. No.	Name of Contractor	Result of Evaluation
1.	M/s A S Sonje Associates	Non-Responsive
2.	M/s Aakar Constructions	Responsive
3.	M/s Anand Construwel Pvt Ltd	Non-Responsive
4.	M/s B R Goyal Infrastructure Ltd	Responsive

5.	M/s B T Kadlag Construction Company	Responsive
6.	M/s Compact Builders & Developers Pvt Ltd.	Responsive
7.	M/s Forcon Infra Pvt Ltd	Responsive
8.	M/s Indicon Construction Pvt Ltd	Responsive
9.	M/s M T Patil Builders & Contractors Pvt Ltd.	Non-Responsive
10.	M/s Mahesh Infrastructure	Responsive
11.	M/s Sundar Madhav Construction	Non-Responsive
12.	M/s Renuka Construction	Responsive
13.	M/s Sant Satramdas Infrastructure Pvt Ltd.	Responsive
14.	M/s Saraswati Construction Company	Responsive
15.	M/s Shri Dev Narayan Infracon	Non-Responsive

All Bidders kindly note that any clarification for above results should be sent on cenhmumbai.ce@mahapwd.gov.in, cenhmaharashtra@gmail.com & nhpune.se@mahapwd.com, nhpune.se@gmail.com, nhnashik.ee@mahapwd, eenhnashik@gmail.com and the same will be clarified /answered within 7 days. The Financial bid of the above work will be opened on 29.11.2024 At 11.00 Hrs. in the Office of the Chief Engineer (PW), National Highway Department, Konkan Bhavan Navi Mumbai, if possible. Bidders are requested to attend the financial bid Opening.

Encl.- Clarification for Evaluation Report


Executive Engineer,
National Highway Division,
Nashik.

Copy submitted to The Chief Engineer & Regional officer, MoRTH, Konkan Bhavan Navi Mumbai for information please.

Copy submitted to The Chief Engineer, N.H. (P.W.), Konkan Bhavan, Navi Mumbai for information please.

Copy submitted to The Superintending Engineer, NH Circle, Pune for information please.



Government of Maharashtra

Office of the Executive Engineer National Highway Division, Nashik

Phone No: 0253-2573270

E-mail : eenhnashik@gmail.com

nhnashik.ee@mahapwd

Second Floor Green Building,

P.W.D. Compound Untwadi

Road, Nashik - 422 002.

No. NHNsk/AB-3/ /2024

Date: 22/11/2024

To

5/20

All Bidders,

Subject :- Submission of Evaluation Report of Technical Bids

Name of

Work :

Rehabilitation and Upgradation to 2L4L with Paved Shoulders from Saputara Gujarat Maharashtra Border to Chausale section of NH 953 in km 104.000 to 121.570 Length 17.570 on EPC Mode in the State of Maharashtra.

Tender Id:- 2024_MoRTH_795785_1

Job No. NH-953-MAH-2023-24-036 dated 22.02.2024.

Reference:-

1. Chief Engineer, Government of India, Ministry of Road Transport & Highways (Regional office, Maharashtra and Goa), Mumbai, office letter no. RW / MUM / FINANCILA CONSULTANCY / 2024-25 / 955 Dt. 26/08/2024.
2. Opening of Technical bids on 18/7/2024.
3. 1st Minutes of meeting of State level evaluation Committee held on 08.10.2024.
4. 2nd Minutes of meeting of State level evaluation Committee held on 08.11.2024.
5. 3rd Minutes of meeting of State level evaluation Committee held on 22.11.2024.

With reference to the above subject work the following 15 (Fifteen) Contractors have submitted their document and Technical Evaluation of Fifteen Contractors is done & total 10 agencies are considered as Responsive & total 5 agencies are considered as Non-Responsive. The Details are as below.

Sr. No.	Name of Contractor	Result of Evaluation
1.	M/s A S Sonje Associates	Non-Responsive
2.	M/s Aakar Constructions	Responsive
3.	M/s Anand Construwel Pvt Ltd	Non-Responsive
4.	M/s B R Goyal Infrastructure Ltd	Responsive

5.	M/s B T Kadlag Construction Company	Responsive
6.	M/s Compact Builders & Developers Pvt Ltd.	Responsive
7.	M/s Forcon Infra Pvt Ltd	Responsive
8.	M/s Indicon Construction Pvt Ltd	Responsive
9.	M/s M T Patil Builders & Contractors Pvt Ltd.	Non-Responsive
10.	M/s Mahesh Infrastructure	Responsive
11.	M/s Sundar Madhav Construction	Non-Responsive
12.	M/s Renuka Construction	Responsive
13.	M/s Sant Satramdas Infrastructure Pvt Ltd.	Responsive
14.	M/s Saraswati Construction Company	Responsive
15.	M/s Shri Dev Narayan Infracon	Non-Responsive

All Bidders kindly note that any clarification for above results should be sent on cenhmumbai.ce@mahapwd.gov.in, cenhmaharashtra@gmail.com & nhpune.se@mahapwd.com, nhpune.se@gmail.com, nhnashik.ee@mahapwd, eenhnashik@gmail.com and the same will be clarified /answered within 7 days. The Financial bid of the above work will be opened on 29.11.2024 At 11.00 Hrs. in the Office of the Chief Engineer (PW), National Highway Department, Konkan Bhavan Navi Mumbai, if possible. Bidders are requested to attend the financial bid Opening.

Encl.- Clarification for Evaluation Report


Executive Engineer,
National Highway Division,
Nashik.

Copy submitted to The Chief Engineer & Regional officer, MoRTH, Konkan Bhavan Navi Mumbai for information please.

Copy submitted to The Chief Engineer, N.H. (P.W.), Konkan Bhavan, Navi Mumbai for information please.

Copy submitted to The Superintending Engineer, NH Circle, Pune for information please.



To,
Executive Engineer,
National Highway Division (P.W.D)
Compound Untwadi Road,
Nashik-422002

18.11.2024

Project: Rehabilitation and Upgradation to 2L/4L with Paved Shoulders from Saputara (Gujarat-Maharashtra Border) to Chausale section of NH 953 in km 104/000 to 121/570 (Length = 17.570) on EPC Mode in the State of Maharashtra.

Subject: Evaluation Report on RFP Bids received in response to RFP for the Project

Sir,

We, M/s Raj Har Gopal & Co., have been appointed as Financial Consultant for the above mentioned project to carry out the evaluation of the bids received for the subject project.

Regarding the captioned matter, we are submitting herewith the Final Evaluation report for the project based on the bids received and replies received from bidders and discussions held with Authority. We have evaluated the Bids regarding the provisions of RFP and Bids submitted by the Bidder.

The bid due date for the subject project was 16.07.2024 and the technical bids for the subject project were opened on 18.07.2024. A total of 15 (fifteen) number of bids were received

Following bids were received for the subject project:

S.NO	Name of the Bidder
1.	M/s A S Sonje Associates
2.	M/s Aakar Constructions
3.	M/s Anand Construwell Pvt Ltd
4.	M/s B R Goyal Infrastructure Ltd
5.	M/s B T Kadlag Construction Company
6.	M/s Compact Builders & Developers Pvt Ltd
7.	M/s Forcon Infra Pvt Ltd
8.	M/s Indicon Construction Pvt Ltd
9.	M/s M T Patil Builders & Contractors Pvt Ltd
10.	M/s Mahesh Infrastructure



11.	M/s Sundar Madhav Construction
12.	M/s Renuka Construction
13.	M/s Sant Satramdas Infrastructure Pvt Ltd
14.	M/s Saraswati Construction Company
15.	M/s Shri Dev Narayan Infracon

Brief Description About the Project

Estimated Project Cost	Rs. 81.27 Crore
Bid due date	16.07.2024
Threshold Technical capability for all the projects under category- 1,2,3 & 4	Rs. 60.95 Crore
Single eligible Project of minimum value from Category 1 & 3	Rs. 16.26 Crore
Threshold Financial Capacity (Net worth)	Rs. 4.06 Crore
Threshold Financial Capacity (Turnover)	Rs. 12.19 Crore
Threshold Bid Capacity	Rs. 81.27 Crore
For a project to qualify as a Eligible Project under Category 3&4, the receipt / payments of the project should be more than (as per clause 2.2.2.6 (ii))	Rs. 4.06 Crore
No. of Application Received by us	15 (Fifteen)

The evaluation has been carried out for 15 (Fifteen) bids. The evaluation of proposals has been carried out in the following manner:

- Tests of Responsiveness as per RFP
- Computation of Threshold Technical Capability
- Computation of Financial Capability and
- Assessment of Bid Capacity

The RFP evaluation has been broadly guided by the RFP document issued for this project and few assumptions which are attached herewith as Annexure A. The same was discussed with Authority.

It was found during the evaluation that some of the data/information provided by the Bidders were not adhering to clauses given in the RFP. So, to facilitate the evaluation process clarifications were sought from the Bidders, details of which are attached herewith as Annexure B.



Based on the bids received and replies received from the bidders, the assessed technical threshold capability, financial capability and Assessed Available Bid capacity of the following 15 Bidders, the eligibility criteria are mentioned below for your kind perusal:

S. No.	Name of the Bidder	Technical Capacity		Financial Capacity		Assessed Available Bid Capacity is greater than Required i.e. Rs. 81.27 Cr)
		Experience Score Assessed (Required = Rs. 60.95 Cr)	Is bidder qualifying One similar completed project having cost = Rs. 16.26 Cr	Net Worth Assessed (Required Rs. 4.06 Cr)	Average Annual Turnover (Required Rs. 12.19 Cr)	
1.	M/s A S Sonje Associates	0.00	No such project	5.62	31.24	Yes
2.	M/s Aakar Constructions	101.26	Project code "a" (Rs. 50.32 Cr.)	21.56	51.64	Yes
3.	M/s Anand Construwell Pvt Ltd	92.68	No such project	57.27	112.03	Yes
4.	M/s B R Goyal Infrastructure Ltd	585.41	Project code "b" (Rs. 114.16 Cr.)	125.46	286.75	Yes
5.	M/s B T Kadlag Construction Company	130.04	Project code "a" (Rs. 50.33 Cr.)	40.90	80.10	Yes
6.	M/s Compact Builders & Developers Pvt Ltd	68.52	Project code "a" (Rs. 37.32 Cr.)	9.94	16.27	Yes
7.	M/s Forcon Infra Pvt Ltd	120.77	Project code "b" (Rs. 50.33 Cr.)	61.16	143.97	Yes
8.	M/s Indicon Construction Pvt Ltd	64.87	Project code "c" (Rs. 21.01 Cr.)	19.84	44.89	Yes
9.	M/s M T Patil Builders & Contractors Pvt Ltd	49.76	Project code "c" (Rs. 42.79 Cr.)	50.44	65.62	Yes
10.	M/s Mahesh Infrastructure	62.66	Project code "g" (Rs. 35.77 Cr.)	9.64	23.32	Yes
11.	M/s Sundar Madhav Construction	0	No such project	8.88	44.28	Yes
12.	M/s Renuka Construction	70.54	Project code "b" (Rs. 60.25 Cr.)	5.91	22.79	Yes



13.0	M/s Sant Satramdas Infrastructure Pvt Ltd	360.50	Project code "a" (Rs. 147.66 Cr.)	105.29	81.78	Yes
14.	M/s Saraswati Construction Company	284.80	Project code "b" (Rs. 128.27 Cr.)	33.97	125.92	Yes
15.	M/s Shri Dev Narayan Infracon	0	No such project	0	0	No

Note: Detailed evaluation sheets are attached as Annexure.

Summary of Evaluation

S.NO	Name of the Bidder	Qualification Status
1.	M/s A S Sonje Associates	Non-Responsive
2.	M/s Aakar Constructions	Responsive
3.	M/s Anand Construwel Pvt Ltd	Non-Responsive
4.	M/s B R Goyal Infrastructure Ltd	Responsive
5.	M/s B T Kadlag Construction Company	Responsive
6.	M/s Compact Builders & Developers Pvt Ltd.	Responsive
7.	M/s Forcon Infra Pvt Ltd	Responsive
8.	M/s Indicon Construction Pvt Ltd	Responsive
9.	M/s M T Patil Builders & Contractors Pvt Ltd.	Non-Responsive
10.	M/s Mahesh Infrastructure	Responsive
11.	M/s Sundar Madhav Construction	Non-Responsive
12.	M/s Renuka Construction	Responsive
13.	M/s Sant Satramdas Infrastructure Pvt Ltd.	Responsive
14.	M/s Saraswati Construction Company	Responsive
15.	M/s Shri Dev Narayan Infracon	Non-Responsive

Non-Responsive Bidders

I. M/s A S Sonje Associates

Bidder is considered as Non- Responsive due to following reasons:

- As per RFP, bidder is required to provide the experience details as per format prescribed in Annex IV of RFP along with supporting documents. However, Annex IV w.r.t. to project code B to H are not found in the submitted bid. Further, Statutory auditor certificates



submitted for all projects, UDIN is not mentioned which is required as per ICAI guidelines. Therefore, the said projects may not be considered for evaluation purpose.

- As per clause 2.2.2.2 (ii) of RFP, Provided that at least one similar work of 20% of Estimated Project Cost Rs. 16.26 crore (Rs. Sixteen Crore Twenty-Six Lakhs Only) shall have been completed from the Eligible Projects in Category 1 and/or Category 3 specified in Clause 2.2.2.5. (project completed or 90% completed as on 31.03.2024). Based on the information available, no such project qualifies the said criteria.
- Statutory auditor certificate submitted for Details of value of B (ongoing commitments) for the purpose of calculation of bid capacity, UDIN is not mentioned which is required as per ICAI guidelines
- Other issues are mentioned in the Annexure B of this report.
- Clarifications were sought from the bidder for above, however, no reply has been received from the bidder.

II. M/s Anand Construwell Private Limited

Bidder is considered as Non- Responsive due to following reasons:

- As per clause 2.2.2.2 (ii) of RFP, Provided that at least one similar work of 20% of Estimated Project Cost Rs. 16.26 crore (Rs. Sixteen Crore Twenty-Six Lakhs Only) shall have been completed from the Eligible Projects in Category 1 and/or Category 3 specified in Clause 2.2.2.5. (project completed or 90% completed as on 31.03.2024). Based on the information available, no such project qualifies the said criteria.
- Appendix II, Bank Guarantee submitted by the bidder is not as per the required format of RFP.
- Annex I, submitted by the bidder does not provide complete information.
- Other issues are mentioned in the Annexure B of this report.
- Clarifications were sought from the bidder for above, however, no reply has been received from the bidder.

III. M/s M. T. Patil Builders & Contractors Pvt. Ltd.

Bidder is considered as Non- Responsive due to following reasons:

- Appendix II, Bank Guarantee submitted is not as per the required format of RFP. 4th line of Para 14 is mentioned as “-----thereunder claimed, the said branch shall accept such invocation **later** and make payment of-----” instead of “-----there under claimed, the said branch shall accept such invocation **letter** and make payment of-----”.
- Annex I submitted is not as per the required format of RFP.
- As per Annual Reports submitted for the FY 2022-23, the net worth of the bidder works out to be Rs. 50.44 lakhs. However, bidder has claimed the net worth amounting to Rs. 50.44 cr. Bidder was required to clarify said discrepancy duly certified from its statutory auditor. However, no reply received in this regard.
- Bidder is not meeting the criteria of Threshold Technical Capacity.



As per clause 2.1.13 of RFP, i.e. *Notwithstanding anything to the contrary contained herein, in the event that the Bid Due Date falls within three months of the closing of the latest financial year of a Bidder, it shall ignore such financial year for the purposes of its Bid and furnish all its information and certification with reference to the 5 (five) years or 1 (one) year, as the case may be, preceding its latest financial year. For the avoidance of doubt, financial year shall, for the purposes of a Bid hereunder, mean the accounting year followed by the Bidder in the course of its normal business.*

Based on the above, receipts for last five years shall include 2019-20 to 2023-24, hence, receipts for the FY 2018-19 w.r.t. project code 'a' are not considered for evaluation.

Further, bidder has stated that project code B, C, D are upgradation works and are covered under Municipal Corporation Limits.

It is to bring to your kind notice that project code 'd' i.e. 'Proposed Resurfacing of roads'; Resurfacing is not acceptable as per clause 2.2.2.5 (iii) (II) of RFP. Hence, project code 'd' may not be considered.

Based on above facts, Threshold Technical Capacity of the bidder works out to be Rs. 49.76 cr. only against the requirement of Rs. 60.95 cr.

IV. M/s Sundar Madhav Construction

Bidder is considered as Non- Responsive due to following reasons:

- Annex IV submitted by the bidder, supporting statutory auditor certificate/ client certificate as per format given in RFP is not found in the submitted bid. Therefore, the said projects may not be considered for evaluation purpose.
- As per clause 2.2.2.2 (ii) of RFP, Provided that at least one similar work of 20% of Estimated Project Cost Rs. 16.26 crore (Rs. Sixteen Crore Twenty-Six Lakhs Only) shall have been completed from the Eligible Projects in Category 1 and/or Category 3 specified in Clause 2.2.2.5. (project completed or 90% completed as on 31.03.2024). Based on the information available, no such project qualifies the said criteria.
- Following documents are not found in the submitted bid:
 - Compliance w.r.t. GFR (clause 2.2.1 (d)).
 - Local Content Certificate (Self Certification and Certification from Statutory Auditor/ Cost Auditor along with UDIN).
 - Undertaking by statutory auditor along with UDIN for unaudited Annual Account for FY 2023-24 as on bid due date of the project.
- Other issues are mentioned in the Annexure B of this report.
- Clarifications were sought from the bidder for above, however, no reply has been received from the bidder.

V. M/s Shri Dev Narayan Infracon

Technical Bid uploaded by the bidder, Appendix I along with Annexure, Appendix II, Appendix III and other documents required to be submitted as per RFP, are not found in the submitted bid. Therefore, Bidder was considered as non-responsive pursuant to clause 3.1.6.1 of RFP.



Summary of Evaluation

SL. NO	PARTICULARS	NUMBER OF BIDDERS
1.	Bids received by Authority	15
2.	Responsive Bidders	10
3.	Non- Responsive Bidder	05

Note: As per clause 3.2 of RFP, Authority shall inform the venue and time of online opening of the Financial Bid through e-procurement portal and e-mail and also ask from them to submit, the details for any change in their bid capacity status, due to award/declared to be the lowest bidder in any other project as on the day before the date of opening of financial bid of the said project as per clause 2.2.2.1 of RFP. Also, the Authority is required to confirm the shareholding pattern of the Lowest Bidder as per requirement under Clause 2.1.12 of RFP.

This is for your information and necessary perusal.

Thanking You,

Yours Sincerely,

For Raj Har Gopal & Co

(Chartered Accountants)

CA G.K. Gupta

Senior Partner

Enclosures

Annexure A – Assumptions w.r.t. Evaluation

Annexure B – Clarifications sought, Reply Received & our remarks

Annexure C – Evaluation Sheets w.r.t. Technical Threshold Capability, Financial Capability and summary of Available Bid Capacity

