

**MINUTES OF E-ELIGIBILITY BID APPROVAL CWC-I MEETING HELD
ON 31-05-2024 FOR THE CIVIL WORK – SPECIAL REPAIRS TO
FALSE CEILING, WINDOWS, DOORS IN AVNL
CORPORATE OFFICE AT HVF ESTATE.**

CIVIL ENGINEERING OFFICE

The following Officers were present ;

1	Shri. V.R. Rambhad	CGM / HVF	Chairman / CWC-I
2	Shri. M. Sivakumar	GM / HR, F&A, IMS	Member / Finance
3	Shri. R.K. Bal	GM / CO & HR (RKB) / AVNL	Member / User
4	Shri. Sulaiman S. Siddique	GM / CP & ARJUN (Alternate Officer for GM / EO, STORES & GS)	Member / CEO
5	Shri. K. Tulasi Rao	JT. GM / IMS	Member / Secy

- 01 e-Tender Enquiry No. & Date : HVF/TE/13025/CEO/2024-25/01, Dt. 27-04-2024.
E-Procurement Tender ID : 2024_AVNL_194253_1
- 02 Name of the Work : Special Repairs to False Ceiling, Windows, Doors in AVNL
Corporate Office at HVF Estate.
- 03 Type of Tender : Open Tender under Two Bid System (e-Tendering)
- 04 Grant & Code Head : 920 / 34 (Capital Grant) ND 2339
- 05 User Section : HVF / IMS – CE (E) - AVNL
- 06 Estimated cost of Work (Approx) : Rs. 1,40,79,000/= (As per delegation of Financial Powers issued
by AVNL as on 01-10-2021, Point Sl.No. 51. (For Capital Civil
works for other than Production Buildings, including Roads but
excluding residential accommodation and amenity building), Sub
Clause "b" and AVNL Amendment letters Dt. 22-04-2022 and 07-06-
2023, CGM is empowered for Issue of Acceptance of Necessity &
Administrative Approval and placement of contract for Departmental
Works upto Rs. 05 Crores. Hence the subject case falls under the
financial powers of CWC-I).
- 07 Approval & Financial Concurrence : i. CGM Approval vide IMS / Estate Note No.1659/IMS/2023-24/
CAP, Dt. 14-03-2024

ii. F&A Concurrence vide Letter No. 12501/HVF/FIN&ACCT/86/
2024, Dt. 02-04-2024

iii. ADP Approval vide AVNL Letter No. AVNLCO/ENGG/CIVIL/
ADP/ HVF-ND2339/2023-24, Dt. 28-02-2024
- 08 e-Tender published in CPPP e-proc website on : 30-04-2024
- 09 Scheduled Bid submission closing date and Date : Original Bid Submission closing Date : 15-05-2024
of Tender Opening : Original Technical Tender Opening Date : 16-05-2024
- 10 No. of T.O.D Postponements (System Configured : NIL
for Bid Auto Extn Corrigendum)



- 11 e-Tender Technical /Eligibility Bid opened on : 16-05-2024
- 12 No. of Responses received online : 05 Responses / bids were received online.
- 13 Names of Contractors who have responded and their EMD details :

Sl. No.	NAME OF THE CONTRACTOR	EMD VALIDITY	OFFER VALIDITY (90 Days from Actual Technical bid opening date)
01	M/s Sri Lakshmi Industries, Chennai	FDR, Date of Maturity is 14-05-2026	Confirmed . Offer Validity till 14-08-2024
02	M/s Siva Enterprises, Chennai	FDR, Date of Maturity is 10-08-2024	Confirmed . Offer Validity till 14-08-2024
03	M/s Vijayalakshmi Enterprises, Chennai	FDR, Date of Maturity is 11-08-2024	Confirmed . Offer Validity till 14-08-2024
04	M/s MSK Construction, Thiruvannamalai	FDR, Date of Maturity is 06-05-2025	Confirmed . Offer Validity till 14-08-2024
05	M/s Maheshwari Traders, Nagpur	FDR, Date of Maturity is 04-05-2025	Confirmed . Offer Validity till 14-08-2024

- 14 The following Eligibility conditions have been verified and submitted for CWC decision please. All documents are available in the case-file.

Sl. No.	Eligibility Conditions	Sri Lakshmi Industries	Siva Enterprises	Vijayalakshmi Enterprises	MSK Construction	Maheshwari Traders
A	Experience of having successfully completed similar work {Similar work means Civil Works only) in Central / State Govt. Deptt & Undertakings / PSU's (Public Sector Undertakings) during last 7 (seven) years ending last month should be the following : 1) Three Similar works costing not less than 40% of the estimated cost each, OR 2) Two similar works costing not less than 50% of the estimated cost each, OR 3) One similar work costing not less than 80% of the estimated cost. In case the Bidders submit Experience documents of having completed Similar works where the cost of completion of work is lesser than the amount mentioned as per the Eligibility Conditions of the tender, then as per "Manual for Procurement of Works" published by Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance, Government of India, the value of work executed shall be brought to current costing level by enhancing the actual value of work at simple rate of seven percent per annum, calculated from the date of completion to the date of bid opening.	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓



Sl. No	Eligibility Conditions	Sri Lakshmi Industries	Siva Enterprises	Vijayalakshmi Enterprises	MSK Construction	Maheshwari Traders
B	Average Annual Turnover during last 3 Years, shall be at least 30% of the estimated Cost.	√	√	√	√	√
C	Possession of PAN .	√	√	√	√	√
D	GST Registration Certificate	√	√	√	√	√
E	Submission of EMD	√	√	√	√	√
F	Submission of Scanned Copy of NIT documents with enclosures duly signed & sealed by contractor for compliance.	√	√	√	√	√

ANNUAL TURN OVER STATEMENT FOR LAST THREE FINANCIAL YEARS

ESTIMATED COST : 14079000

AVERAGE ANNUAL TURNOVER REQUIRED @ 30% = 4223700

(in Rs/Lakhs)

Year ending 31st March	M/s Sri Lakshmi Industries	M/s Siva Enterprises	M/s Vijayalakshmi Enterprises	M/s MSK Construction	M/s Maheshwari Traders
2021	152.46	162.57	97.91	188.81	146.80
2022	301.61	266.66	166.88	182.18	258.21
2023	212.70	382.11	119.63	421.59	211.76
Average	222.26	270.45	128.14	264.19	205.59
Meeting tender Requirement	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES

- 15 The firms / Contractors have submitted scanned copies of the following Experience Certificates / Reports in the E-tender and the details of the same are reproduced below for perusal of CWC.

ESTIMATED COST OF THE WORK Rs. 1,40,79,000 /=-				
Sl. No	Name of the Firm	Three similar works 40% of the Est. Cost Rs. 56,31,600 /=-	Two similar works 50% of the Est. Cost Rs. 70,39,500 /=-	One similar work 80% of the Est. Cost Rs. 1,12,63,200 /=-
01	M/s Sri Lakshmi Industries			Special Repairs to Roof From Main guard Room (Building No. P-55) to ATC (Building No. P-195) at INS Rajali, Arakkonam vide GE (Maint), Naval Air Station, Arakkonam CA No. CE(NAVY)/VIZ/ARK/05 of 2018-19 at Order Cost of Rs. 349.00 Lakhs. Copy of Work Completion Certificate issued by GE (Maint), Naval Air Station, Arakkonam, submitted.

ESTIMATED COST OF THE WORK Rs. 1,40,79,000 /=-				
Sl. No	Name of the Firm	Three similar works 40% of the Est. Cost Rs. 56,31,600 /=-	Two similar works 50% of the Est. Cost Rs. 70,39,500 /=-	One similar work 80% of the Est. Cost Rs. 1,12,63,200 /=-
02	M/s Siva Enterprises			Periodical Services in Type-I Quarters at HVF Estate vide HVF CA No. HVF/CE/25/2018-19/ Maint, Dt. 09-01-2019 at a order cost of Rs. 137.26 Lakhs. Copy of completion certificate submitted. The Completion Cost of this work is Rs. 124.98 Lakhs
03	M/s Vijayalakshmi Enterprises	1. Addition / Alteration and certain Misc Work at Office of CWE (Navy) Chennai and Provn of Storage Accommodation at Navy Nagar of INS Adyar under AGE (I) Navy, Chennai vide AGE (I) Navy Fort St. George, Chennai CA/VO. No. CWE/NAVY/ CHN/ 05 OF 2021-22 at a Order cost of Rs. 51.52 Lakhs. Copy of Completion Certificate issued by Offg AGE (I) Navy Chennai, Submitted. The Contractor has submitted a consolidated performance letter Dt. 27-09-2023 issued by MES, AE (Civ), AGE (I) Navy, Chennai wherein the completion cost of the work is mentioned as Rs. 49,76,000 /=- The Enhanced Calculated Completion Cost works out to <u>Rs. 57,01,666.67 /=-</u> 2. Provn of UPS Storage Room, Parking Shed, MT Garage, Stainless Steel Concertina Coil and Change in Colour Scheme of Bldg XXXIII under AGE (I) Navy, Chennai vide AGE (I) Navy, Fort St. George, Chennai CA/VO. No CWE/NAVY/ CHN/32 OF 2020-21 at a Order cost of Rs. 47.62 Lakhs. Copy of Completion Certificate issued by Asst. AGE (I) Navy Fort St. George, submitted. The Contractor has submitted a consolidated performance letter Dt. 27-09-2023 issued by MES, AE (Civ), AGE (I) Navy, Chennai wherein the completion cost of the work is mentioned as Rs. 50,52,200 /=- The Enhanced Calculated Completion Cost works out to <u>Rs. 61,13,162.00 /=-</u>		
	Contd/...			

ESTIMATED COST OF THE WORK Rs. 1,40,79,000 /=-				
Sl. No	Name of the Firm	Three similar works 40% of the Est. Cost Rs. 56,31,600 /=-	Two similar works 50% of the Est. Cost Rs. 70,39,500 /=-	One similar work 80% of the Est. Cost Rs. 1,12,63,200 /=-
	M/s Vijayalakshmi Enterprises	3. Special Repairs to Watch Towers at Avadi, Special Repairs to Barbed Wire and Concertina Coil on Perimeter boundary wall and special repairs to basket ball and volley ball court at Avadi, Chennai vide MES, AGE (I), Navy, Fort Saint George, Chennai CA No. CWE/NAVY/CHN/50 of 2019-20 at a Order cost of Rs. 42.14 Lakhs. Copy of Completion Certificate issued by Asst. AGE (I) Navy Fort St. George, submitted. The Contractor has submitted a consolidated performance letter Dt. 27-09-2023 issued by MES, AE (Civ), AGE (I) Navy, Chennai wherein the completion cost of the work is mentioned as Rs. 46,37,400 /=-. The Enhanced Calculated Completion Cost works out to Rs. 58,27,666.00 /=-		

CALCULATION OF ENHANCED VALUE AS PER CL.NO. 38 "INSTRUCTION TO TENDERERS" AND CL.No. "ii" OF ELIGIBILITY CONDITIONS OF NIT DOCUMENT OF THE TENDER.

Name of the Work	Addition / Alteration and certain Misc Work at Office of CWE (Navy) Chennai and Provn of Storage Accommodation at Navy Nagar of INS Adyar	Provn of UPS Storage Room, Parking Shed, MT Garage, Stainless Steel Concertina Coil and Change in Colour Scheme of Bldg XXXIII under AGE (I) Navy, Chennai	Special Repairs to Watch Towers at Avadi, Special Repairs to Barbed Wire and Concertina Coil on Perimeter boundary wall & special repairs to basket ball & volley ball court at Avadi
Completion cost	Rs. 49,76,000.00 /=-	Rs. 50,52,200.00 /=-	Rs. 46,37,400.00 /=-
Date of Completion	10-04-2022	20-04-2021	08-09-2020
Date of e-eligibility bid opening	16-05-2024	16-05-2024	16-05-2024
Escalation Time (Rounded off to Completed Years and Months)	2 years and 01 Month	3 years	3 years 08 Months
Calculation of Enhanced Value @ 7 % Per annum at Simple Interest	Rs. 7,25,666.67	Rs. 10,60,962.00	Rs. 11,90,266.00
Total enhanced value of the Work	Rs. 57,01,666.67 /=-	Rs. 61,13,162 /=-	Rs. 58,27,666 /=-
Qualification Category	Can be considered under the eligibility clause of "Three similar works costing not less than 40% of the estimated cost each".	Can be considered under the eligibility clause of "Three similar works costing not less than 40% of the estimated cost each".	Can be considered under the eligibility clause of "Three similar works costing not less than 40% of the estimated cost each".



ESTIMATED COST OF THE WORK Rs. 1,40,79,000 /=-				
Sl. No	Name of the Firm	Three similar works 40% of the Est. Cost Rs. 56,31,600 /=-	Two similar works 50% of the Est. Cost Rs. 70,39,500 /=-	One similar work 80% of the Est. Cost Rs. 1,12,63,200 /=-
04	M/s MSK Construction		1. Improvement of Lighthouse Complex and Special Repairs & Civil Maintenance at Pondicherry Lighthouse Cum DGPS Station vide Directorate of Lighthouses & Lightships, Chennai, CA No. 09/2021-22 and Work Order File No. DW-CHE-01001(06)/1/2020-Civil Maintenance, Dt. 04-10-2021 at a Order cost of Rs. 83.99 Lakhs. The value of Work done as per Performance certificate is Rs. 88.11 Lakhs. Copy of CA/WO and Performance Certificate issued by Directorate of Lighthouses & Lightships, Chennai, Submitted. 2. Development Works for Promotion of Tourism at Manappad Point Lighthouse vide Directorate of Lighthouses & Lightships, Chennai, CA No. 12/2023-24 and Work Order File No. DW-CHE-02001(06)/1/2021-Civil Maintenance, Dt. 24-05-2023 at a Order cost of Rs. 102.00 Lakhs. The value of Work done as per Completion Certificate Dt. 06-03-2024 is Rs. 76.52 Lakhs (Upto 6th & Pre-Final Bill, Final Bill yet to be settled). Copy of CA/WO and Completion Certificate issued by Directorate of Lighthouses & Lightships, Chennai, Submitted.	
05	M/s Maheshwari Traders		1. Periodical Services to Sector 7, Type-II Qtrs, (67 Blocks), Jr. Club, Primary School in Sector 9, Block No. 8/2 & 7, SS in Sec. 5 & 8 & Type-V, VI Qtrs with Servant Qtrs, DSC Line, ST Plant with Fencing, OFTI Premises, Sr. Club with Perimeter Wall, IB with Perimeter Wall, SS No. 9 in Sector 10, Compound Wall etc at OFAJ vide OFAJ CA No. GM(OFAJ) 15/RD2009/PS/EO/CC/C-01 of 2021-22 at a Order cost of Rs. 91.78 Lakhs. Copy of Completion Certificate issued by OFAJ submitted wherein Completion cost is mentioned as Rs. 76.79 Lakhs. 2. Rendering Normal Periodical Services to 972 Nos of Type-II (Phase-II and Phase-III) Quarters at OFMK Estate vide OFMK CA No. GM/OFMK/ EO(C)/32 of 2020-21 Dt. 15-04-2021 at a Order Cost of Rs. 87.87 Lakhs. Copy of Completion Certificate issued by OFMK submitted wherein Completion cost is mentioned as Rs. 71.01 Lakhs.	



- 16 Any other observation relevant to the case : It is submitted that all five participating contractors have submitted the documents as per eligibility condition of the tender and their offers are technically acceptable.

17 OBSERVATIONS OF CWC-I HELD ON 31-05-2024 :

CWC-I deliberated the case and observed that all Five participating Contractors have fulfilled the eligibility conditions of the tender.

18 DECISION OF CWC-I HELD ON 31-05-2024

CWC-I deliberated the case and observed that all Five participating contractors have fulfilled the eligibility Conditions of the tender and the offers of all Five participating contractors are technically acceptable. Hence, CWC-I approved opening of e-price bids of all Five eligible contractors viz.,

1. M/s Sri Lakshmi Industries, Chennai
2. M/s Siva Enterprises, Chennai
3. M/s Vijayalakshmi Enterprises, Chennai
4. M/s MSK Construction, Thiruvannamalai
5. M/s Maheshwari Traders, Nagpur

2079201

(R.K. BAL)
GM / CO & HR (RKB) / AVNL
MEMBER USER

[Signature]
(SULAIMAN S. SIDDIQUE)
GM / CP & ARJUN
(Alternate Officer for GM / EO, STORES & GS)
MEMBER / CEO

[Signature]
(K. TULASI RAO)
JT.GM / IMS
MEMBER SECRETARY

[Signature]
(M. SIVAKUMAR)
GM / HR, F&A, IMS
MEMBER / FINANCE

V.R. Rambhad

(V.R. RAMBHAD)
CGM / HVF
CHAIRMAN / CWC-I