

MINUTES OF CWC-I MEETING HELD ON DATED 28/01/2025 FOR PRICE BID EVALUATION

Name of work		:	Periodical services of residential Quarters type -I, II, III and VFJ DSC Qtrs. & DSC Line at VFJ Estate.				
Demand No.		:	RD 2312				
Administrative Approval No.		:	Noting No. 84/RD-2312/2023-24/EO(C), Dt. 12.02.2024				
Code Head		:	809/02				
T.E. No.		:	RD -2312/VFJ				
Tender ID No.		:	2024_AVNL_193313_2				
1.	Nature of work		:	Civil works			
2.	a) Basic Cost based on latest SSR 2020 without Market Variation.		:	2,10,63,160.00/- Rupees (Two Crore Ten Lakhs Sixty Three Thousands One Hundred Sixty Only.)			
	b) Market Variation (MV)		:	-15%			
	c) Total Estimated Cost (a+b)		:	1,79,03,686.00/- Rupees (One Crore Seventy Nine Lakhs Three Thousand Six Hundred Eighty Six Only)			
3.	Mode of Tender		:	OTE			
4.	Bid Submission Starting Date & Time		:	04.09.2024			
5.	Bid Submission Closing Date & Time		:	18.09.2024 extended upto 25.09.2024			
6.	Corrigendum		:	Yes, Paint Make of Snowcem Paints is also incorporated in the workfor SI no. 01 and 02 of BOQ			
7.	Tender Opening Date		:	20.09.2024 extended upto 27.09.2024			
8.	Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) amount		:	2,54,050.00			
9.	Security Deposit (1.25 times of EMD)		:	3,17,600.00			
10.	Decision of CWC held on dated DD/MM/YYYY for technical evaluation		:	13.11.2024			
11.	Completion period		:	365 Days			
As per recommendation of CWC-I dated 13-11-2024, price bid of all eligible 05 bidders were opened on 13-11-2024.							
The detail of bid received is shown below:							
12	Sl. No.	Name of the Firm	Amount as per quotation	Offer valid up to		Status	
	1	M/s BrijeshSonker, JBP	91,66,240.00	25.03.2025, vide firm's letter no. NIL dated 16.12.2024		L-1	
	2	M/s Deepesh Electricals, JBP	1,14,37,700.00			L-2	
	3	M/s ParasramMulchandani, JBP	1,24,16,650.00			L-3	
	4	M/s Awadhes Kumar Singh, JBP	1,45,32,150.00			L-4	
	5	M/s Kailash Enterprises, Bhilai	1,60,68,600.00			L-5	
13	Details of Estimated rate with latest market variation and rate quoted by L-1 bidder:						
Item No.	Description	Quantity	Total estimated rate based on SSR 2020+ MV (-)7%		Rate quoted by lowest bidder		Percentage above or below estimated rate
			Unit Price	Total price	Unit Price	Total price	
1	M&L for preparation of old cement painted surface plastered or unplastered by brooming down steel wire brushing on wall & distemping with cement paint white or tinted in two coats as per SSR specification. Colour and quality shall be verified by E-I-C.(make : Berger, Asianpaints, Nerolac, Dulux)	84100.00	66.87	5623514.70	28.80	2422080.00	-55.49
2	M&L for preparation of old cement painted surface plastered or unplastered by brooming down steel wire brushing on ceiling & distemping with cement paint white or tinted in two coats as per SSR specification. Colour and quality shall be verified by E-I-C. (make : Berger, Asianpaints, Nerolac,Dulux)	4500.00	80.45	362002.50	29.80	134100.00	-61.72
 KAMLESH KUMAR GM/BDU, HR, MIS, F&A & PVG (MEMBER USER & TECH)  DEBASHREE CHAKRAVORTY DGM/F&A & BG (MEMBER FINANCE)  D. N. KAUSHAL DGM/ Civil & Central Procurement MEMBER SECRETARY							

3	M&L for preparation of old distemper surface plastered or unplastered on wall by brooming down or steel wire brushing etc. and distempering walls with distemper oil emulsion white or tinted in two coats as per SSR specification. Colour and quality will be verified by EIC (make : Berger, Asianpaints, Nerolac, Dulux)	133600.00	63.43 ✓	8473713.60 ✓	28.80 ✓	3847680.00 ✓	-53.08
4	M&L for preparation of old distemper surface plastered or unplastered on ceiling by brooming down or steel wire brushing etc. and distempering ceiling with distemper oil emulsion white or tinted in two coats as per SSR specification. Colour and quality will be verified by EIC. (make : Berger, Asianpaints, Nerolac, Dulux)	35900.00	77.00 ✓	2764443.60 ✓	29.80 ✓	1069820.00 ✓	-60.01
5	M&L for preparation of old painted wood or wood based surface of any description over 10cm in width or girth not otherwise described and painting one coat of synthetic enamel paint as per SSR specification. Colour and quality will be verified by EIC. (make : Berger, Asianpaints, Nerolac, Dulux)	22750.00	61.66 ✓	1402742.25 ✓	38.80 ✓	882700.00 ✓	-34.98
6	M&L for preparation of old painted steel & iron surface of any description over 10cm in width or girth not otherwise described and painting one coat of synthetic enamel paint as per SSR specification. Colour and quality will be verified by EIC (make : Berger, Asianpaints, Nerolac, Dulux)	6450.00	69.29 ✓	446888.25 ✓	38.80 ✓	250260.00 ✓	-42.13
7	M&L for taking down cement or cement lime plaster any description on brick or stone walls etc. including racking out joint, hacking for key, scrubbing down with water, etc.	1000.00	88.29 ✓	88294.20 ✓	30.00 ✓	30000.00 ✓	-64.89
8	M&L for rendering 15mm thick plaster on fair faces of brick work or concrete surface with CM 1:6 & rendering is to be finished even and smooth (without using extra cement).	1000.00	264.58 ✓	264575.70 ✓	260.00 ✓	260000.00 ✓	1.55
9	Writing letters or figures (Block, Roman, Italic or Indian) not exc. 30 cm height (As per site requirement the height of letter is 10 cm).	3200.00	50.22 ✓	160704.00 ✓	78.00 ✓	249600.00 ✓	60.49
10	M&L for complete removal of small plants and bushes from the wall and roof and making good by CM 1:4 or Cement concrete 1:2:4 (12.5 mm graded aggregate)	250.00	8.00 ✓	2000.00 ✓	80.00 ✓	20000.00 ✓	900.00
Total						91,66,240.00 ✓	

Analysis of L-1 Bidder:

a)	Offer of L-1 (Lowest) bidder	M/s Brijesh Sonker, JBP (Rs. 91,66,240.00)
b)	Offer of L-1 bidder above / below the estimated cost in Percentage. (Based on SSR 2020 + MV%, MV% (-) 15 % considered at the time of estimation) (Estimated cost: Rs. 1,79,03,986.00)	(-) 48.80 % below ✓
c)	Offer of L-1 bidder above / below the estimated cost in Percentage. (Based on SSR 2020 + MV (-10% for quarter ending Jun 2024), at the time of analysis of the offer) (Estimated cost based on SSR 2020 + MV (-10%): Rs. 1,89,57,044.00)	(-) 51.65 % below ✓
d)	Offer of L-1 bidder above / below the estimated cost in Percentage. (Based on SSR 2020 + MV (-07% for quarter ending Sep 2024), at the time of analysis of the offer) (Estimated cost based on SSR 2020 + MV (-07%): Rs. 1,95,88,878.80)	(-) 53.21 % below ✓

KAMLESH KUMAR
GM/BDU, HR, IMS, F&A & PVG
(MEMBER USER & TECH)

DEBASHREE CHAKRAVORTY
DGM/F&A & BG
(MEMBER FINANCE)

D. N. KAUSHAL
DGM/ Civil & Central Procurement
MEMBER SECRETARY

13	It is submitted that, at the time of estimate preparation, market variation (-) 15 % was taken and as per SSR 2020 total estimated cost of this work is Rs. 1,79,03,986.00. Now as per quarterly return for forecast of percentages over SSR 2020 for the succeeding quarter (quarter ending Sep 2024 received on 16.12.24) the latest market variation is (-) 7% for work in restricted area. Hence, considering latest market variation issued by MES over SSR 2020 (except in item no. 10), the price offered by L-1 firm i.e. M/s Brijesh Sonker, JBPRs. 91,66,240.00 is (-) 53.21 % below the estimated cost i.e. Rs. 1,95,88,878.80 (considering latest MV issued by MES). Latest market variation has not been considered for item number 10 as the SSR rate of these items are not available. It is also submitted that as per clause no. 10.5.3 of SOP for civil works, AVNL 2021 "After evaluation and recommendation of CWC, price bid of the technically acceptable offer will be opened immediately. EO shall prepare CST and scrutinize the offers. If there is any freak rate*, the items having higher freak rates shall not be executed more than 5% of the estimated quantity. The items having lower freak rates shall not be executed less than 5% of the estimated quantity. *Freak Rate: Rates which are higher/lower than 50 % of the estimated cost of the item. It is submitted that firm's quoted rates for Item No. 01, 02, 03, 04 & 07 are freak on lower side and rates for Item No. 09 and 10 are freak on higher side. Since total quoted rate was (-) 51.65 % below the estimated cost considering MV issued by MES during succeeding quarter (quarter ending Jun 2024). Subsequently, CWC done under circulation decided that "Firm to be called for meeting for discussion of freak item and to clarify planning of execution of work" accordingly meeting was called on 13.01.2025 with the firm, where decision on freak item and planning of execution of work was done. Subsequently letter was issued to firm for freak rate and for clarification / compliance of following points: 1. Quality of work. 2. All the input material will be recorded in register. 3. Application / consumption of material / square meter to be ensured as per standard. 4. Before starting the work approval of color scheme will be taken by you. Firm vide letter no. BS/VFJ/1501/01 dated 15.01.2025 has intimated that "item no. 1, 2, 3, 4 & 7 are freak on lower side. I assure that work done will be as per CA conditions. Item No. 9 & 10 are freak on higher side. Our rates quoted for item no. 9 and 10 are as per market. Our firm is agreed to work as per the previous meeting which is held on 13.01.2025 " In view of the above case is put up for deliberation and decision please.
14	Deliberation/ discussion:
	1. The price offered by L-1 firm i.e. M/s Brijesh Sonker, JBP Rs. 91,66,240.00 is (-) 53.21 % below the estimated cost i.e. Rs. 1,95,88,878.80 (considering latest MV issued by MES) is found reasonable. 2. GST will be applicable as per appropriate rate at the time of bill raised by firm.
15	Decision:
	1. To place order upon L-1 firm i.e. M/s Brijesh Sonker, JBP Rs. 91,66,240.00 (Rupees Ninty One Lakhs Sixty Six Thousand Two Hundred Forty Point Zero zero) inclusive of all taxes and duties.

KAMLESH KUMAR
GM/BDU, HR, MS, F&A & PVG
(MEMBER USER & TECH)

DEBASHREE CHAKRAVORTY
DGM/F&A & BG
(MEMBER FINANCE)

D. N. KAUSHAL
DGM/ Civil & Central Procurement
MEMBER SECRETARY

S. K. BHOLA
CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER
(CHAIRMAN)