

| MINUTES OF CWC-I MEETING HELD ON DATED 18/05/2024 FOR PRICE BID EVALUATION                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------|-------------|------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------|
| Name of work                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                           | : Percentage Rate Contract on Chapter/Section 4,5, 14, 19, 21 of MES SSR-2020 Regarding Repair/Rectification of Qtrs. Electrical wiring & power supply with accessories of Type-II, III, IV, V & VI Qtrs. in VFJ Estate sector-I." |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| Demand No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                           | : RD 2314                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| Administrative Approval No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                           | : AON Noting No. 84/RD2314/2023-24/EO(C) dated 16.02.2024                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| Code Head                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                           | : 809/02                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| T.E. No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                           | : RD-2314/VFJ                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| Tender ID No.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                           | : 2024_AVNL_190794_1                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 1.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Nature of work                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : Electrical works                                                                                                                  |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 2.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | a) Basic Cost based on latest SSR 2020 without Market Variation.                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : 50,00,000.00/- Rupees (Fifty Lakhs Only)                                                                                          |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | b) Market Variation (MV)                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : NA                                                                                                                                |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | c) Total Estimated Cost (a+b)                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : 50,00,000.00/- Rupees (Fifty Lakhs Only)                                                                                          |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 3.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Mode of Tender                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : OTE                                                                                                                               |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 4.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Bid Submission Starting Date                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : 15.03.2024                                                                                                                        |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 5.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Bid Submission Closing Date                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : 29.03.2024                                                                                                                        |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 6.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Corrigendum                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : No                                                                                                                                |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 7.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Tender Opening Date                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : 01.04.2024                                                                                                                        |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 8.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) amount                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : Rs. 1,00,000.00/-                                                                                                                 |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 9.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Security Deposit (1.25 times of EMD)                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : Rs. 1,25,000.00/-                                                                                                                 |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 10.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Decision of CWC held on dated DD/MM/YYYY for technical evaluation                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : 03.05.2024                                                                                                                        |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 11.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Completion period                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | : 365 Days                                                                                                                          |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| As per decision of CWC-I dated 03-05-2024, price bid of all eligible 03 bidders were opened on 03-05.2024                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| The detail of bid received is shown below:                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 12.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Sl. No.                                                                                                                   | Name of the Firm                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Amount as per quotation                                                                                                             |                                                     | Offer valid up to                                                          |                              | Status      |                                          |                                                    |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 1                                                                                                                         | M/s S.N.S. Rai, JBP                                                                                                                                                                                                                | (-) 25.01                                                                                                                           |                                                     | 26.06.2024, 90 days from the last date of bid submission (i.e. 29-03-2024) |                              | L-2         |                                          |                                                    |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 2                                                                                                                         | M/s Amit Construction, JBP                                                                                                                                                                                                         | (-) 40.86                                                                                                                           |                                                     |                                                                            |                              | L-1         |                                          |                                                    |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 3                                                                                                                         | M/s Industrial Instruments, JBP                                                                                                                                                                                                    | (-) 41.00                                                                                                                           |                                                     |                                                                            |                              | No Rank     |                                          |                                                    |
| 13.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Freak rate quoted by L-1 bidder (if any) : Not Applicable                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 14.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Details of the correspondence done with the L-1 bidder to obtain clarification of freak rates: Not Applicable             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 15.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Details of Estimated rate with latest market variation and rate quoted by L-1 bidder:                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| 16.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Details of clarification received from the lowest bidder and details revised rates offered by the lowest bidder (if any): |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Item No.                                                                                                                  | Description                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Quantity                                                                                                                            | Total estimated rate based on SSR 2020 + MV (-) 15% |                                                                            | Rate quoted by lowest bidder |             | Percentage above or below estimated rate |                                                    |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     | Unit Price                                          | Total price                                                                | Unit Price                   | Total price |                                          |                                                    |
| It is submitted that, price bid of tender Id 2024_AVNL_190794_1 was opened for three firms on 03.05.2024. After scrutiny in the boq comparative chart, some error has been observed. Details of quoted rate of three firms mentioned in BoQ sheet, BOQ Summary sheet and BoQ Defects sheet are as under: |                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| Sl.No                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Bidder Name                                                                                                               | Estimated Rate                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Quoted Percentage                                                                                                                   | Quoted Rate in Figures and Words (Iteration 0)      |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     | Rate                                                | Amount                                                                     |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     | 1.00                                                | SHYAM NARAYAN SINGH RAI (GSTN-NA)--691413                                  | 5000000.00                   | - 25.01     | 3749500.00                               | Thirty Seven Lakh Forty Nine Thousand Five Hundred |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     | 2.00                                                | AMIT CONSTRUCTION (GSTN-NA)-691426                                         | 5000000.00                   | -40.86      | 2957000.00                               | Twenty Nine Lakh Fifty Seven Thousand              |
| 3.00                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | INDUSTRIAL INSTRUMENTS (GSTN-NA)--691550                                                                                  | 5000000.00                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | -41.00                                                                                                                              |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| Lowest Amount Quoted BY: AMIT CONSTRUCTION (2957000.00)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                     |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |
| <br>Kamlesh Kumar<br>GM/BDU, HR, IMS & PVG<br>Member/ Finance, User & Engg                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | <br>D N Kaushal<br>DGM/IMS<br>Member Secretary |                                                     |                                                                            |                              |             |                                          |                                                    |

BOQ Summary sheet is as under:

| Sheet Name | Sl.No | Bidder Name             | Amount     | Bid Rank |
|------------|-------|-------------------------|------------|----------|
| BoQ1       | 1     | AMIT CONSTRUCTION       | 2957000.00 | L1       |
|            | 2     | SHYAM NARAYAN SINGH RAI | 3749500.00 | L2       |
|            | 3     | INDUSTRIAL INSTRUMENTS  |            | No Rank  |

BoQ Defects sheet details are as under:

| Sl.No | Bidder Name            | BoQ Defects          |
|-------|------------------------|----------------------|
| 1     | INDUSTRIAL INSTRUMENTS | BoQ1-Error-Cell-BA15 |

In view of the above, VFJ letter no. 208/01/EO (civil)/RD 2314 dated 06.05.2024 was sent through mail (support-eproc@gov.in) for further clarification. In reply through email date 06.05.2024 it has been intimated by CPPP that :-

**"The error in summary sheet and calculation seems to have appeared because of copy paste of values in the M column, the same is indicated under the BoQ defect sheet in the comparative chart also.**

**Dept may generate the comparative chart manually for this case considering the bidder M/s Industrial Instrument's quotation and upload the manual comparative chart in the financial bid opening/evaluation summary on portal."**

Accordingly Comparison of all firms has been prepared manually as under:

| Sl. No. | Name of the Firm                 | Quoted Percentage w.r.t. SSR- 2020 | Status |
|---------|----------------------------------|------------------------------------|--------|
| 1       | M/s Shyam Narayan Singh Rai, JBP | (-) 25.01                          | L-3    |
| 2       | M/s Amit Construction, JBP       | (-) 40.86                          | L-2    |
| 3       | M/s Industrial Instruments, JBP  | (-) 41.00                          | L-1    |

It is submitted that, as per quarterly return for forecast of percentages over SSR 2020 for the succeeding quarter (quarter ending Sep 2023) the latest market variation is (-) 15% for work in restricted area.

Hence, considering latest market variation issued by MES over SSR 2020, the price offered by L-1 firm i.e. M/s Industrial Instruments, JBP i.e. (-) 41.00 % below SSR 2020 is reasonable.

Analysis of L-1 bidder: The offer of L1 firm i.e. (-) 41.00 % below SSR 2020 is reasonable w.r.t SSR 2020 with latest market variation issued by MES.

17 Deliberation/ discussion:

1. At present i.e. the time of analysis of the offer, latest market variation is (-) 15% over SSR 2020 for work in restricted area.
2. The price offered by L-1 firm i.e. M/s Industrial Instruments, JBP at offer (-) **41.00 %** (Minus Forty One Point Zero Zero percent) w.r.t. SSR- 2020 with latest market variation is found reasonable.
3. GST will be applicable as per appropriate rate at the time of bill raised by firm.

18 Decision:

1. To place order on M/s Industrial Instruments, JBP at offer 41.00 % (Minus Forty One Point Zero Zero percent) w.r.t. SSR-2020 Rates, inclusive of all taxes and duties.

Kamlesh Kumar  
GM/BDU, HR, MIS & PVG  
Member/ Finance, User & Engg

D N Kaushal  
DGM/MIS  
Member Secretary

S.K. BHOLA  
CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER  
CHAIRMAN