

MINUTES OF CWC-I MEETING HELD ON DATED 18/07/2024 FOR PRICE BID EVALUATION

Name of work	:	Repair of RCC Roof Leakage of residential quarters and VF' DSC quarters at VFJ Estate.
Demand No.	:	ND2306
Administrative Approval No.	:	Noting No. 84/ND-2306/2023-24/EO(C), Dt. 16.02.2024
Code Head	:	920/34
T.E. No.	:	ND -2306/VFJ
Tender ID No.	:	2024_AVNL_187954_1
1. Nature of work	:	Civil works
2. a) Basic Cost based on latest SSR 2020 without Market Variation.	:	1,03,14,934.90 Rupees (One Crore Three Lakhs Fourteen Thousand Nine Hundred Thirty Four Point Nine Zero Only)
b) Market Variation (MV)	:	(-15)% on all items
c) Total Estimated Cost (a+b)	:	87,67,694.67 Rupees (Eighty Seven Lakhs Sixty Seven Thousand Six Hundred Ninety Four Point Six Seven Only)
3. Mode of Tender	:	OTE
4. Bid Submission Starting Date	:	18.03.2024
5. Bid Submission Closing Date	:	01.04.2024
6. Corrigendum	:	No
7. Tender Opening Date	:	03.04.2024
8. Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) amount	:	1,56,550.00
9. Security Deposit (1.25 times of EMD)	:	1,95,700.00
10. Decision of CWC held on dated DD/MM/YYYY for technical evaluation	:	21.05.2024
11. Completion period	:	240 Days
12. As per recommendation of CWC-I dated 21-05-2024, price bid of eligible 05 bidders were opened on 22-05-2024.	:	

The detail of bid received is shown below:

Sl No	Name of the Firm	Amount as per quotation	Offer valid up to	Status
1	M/s DobariaBuildcon, JBP	66,68,435.00	30.08.2024, vide letter no. DBC/461/2024-25 dated 03.07.2024	L-1
2	M/s Deepesh Electricals, JBP	68,34,800.00		L-2
3	M/s Tiki Water Proofing Company, JBP	76,02,130.00		L-3
4	M/s Kailash Enterprises, Bhilai	78,45,850.00		L-4
5	M/s BrijeshSonker, JBP	88,21,240.00		L-5

13. Details of Estimated rate with latest market variation and rate quoted by L-1 bidder:							
Item No	Description	Quantity	Total estimated rate based on SSR 2020 + MV (-) 13%		Rate quoted by lowest bidder		Percentage above or below estimated rate
			Unit Price	Total price	Unit Price	Total price	
1	M & L for Cutting grooves in brick wall, 75 mm wide and 65mm deep and shaping horizontal face of groove with cement mortar 1:3.	300.00	54.83	16448.22	60.00	18000.00	9.43
2	Labour for Taking down cement or cement lime plaster, any description on brick or stone walls, etc. including raking out joints, hacking for key, scrubbing down with water, etc.	5500.00	82.60	454287.90	15.00	82500.00	-81.84
3	M & L for Rendering Cement Plaster 15mm thick in CM 1:6 on fair faces of brick work or concrete surfaces to be finished even and smooth (without using extra lime or cement (Make for Cement :- UltraTech, ACC, Ambuja, J.K. Cement, Birla cement)	8000.00	247.51	1980050.40	160.00	1280000.00	-35.36
4	Supply of Liquid water proofing compound (add in plaster and concrete as per the manufacturer specification), (make : Dr. Fixit, Asian Paints, Berger, Fosroc)	138.00	227.51	31395.69	50.00	6900.00	-78.02
5	M & L for Preparation of roof surface plastered or unplastered at all levels by removal of old surface treatment, roughening by hacking, chiseling, scrapping, rubbing removal of all loose particles and making it ready to receive new roof treatment and Complete removal of existing treatment as directed by EIC.	15750.00	15.14	238423.50	15.00	236250.00	-0.91
6	M & L for Bitumen primer for used in waterproofing and damp-proofing treatments in polyester reinforced bituminous membrane laid on with bituminous primer applied @ 0.40 liter /sqm as per SSR Part-I (clause no.11.44.2.1). (Make: Asian Paints, Shalimar Tar Product, Sika, Tikitar, Tikidan)	6300.00	50.55	318446.10	50.00	315000.00	-1.08

KAMLESH KUMAR
GM/BDU, HR, IMS, F&A & PVG
MEMBER/FINANCE, USER & ENGG

D.N. RAUSHAL
DGM/ Civil & Central Procurement
MEMBER SECRETARY

7	M&L for APP based polymeric membrane minimum weighting 3 kg/sqm and minimum 3mm thick reinforced with polyester non wove fabric (wt. not less than 150 gms/sqm) Laid on primed surface by forced application complete all as specified and directed by EIC.(Make: Asian Paints, Shalimar Tar Product, Sika, Tikitar, Tikidan)	15750.00	351.18	5531014.13	265.00	4173750.00	-24.54
8	M&L for Applying bituminous silver paint 2 coats over the polyester membrane as directed by EIC. (Make :- for Silver Paint:- Shalimar, Asian Paints, Burger, Nerolac, Indigo).	15750.00	15.00	236250.00	30.00	472500.00	100.00
9	M&L for Removing building material to a distance of 500m beyond the lead included in the rates, including loading and staking at the destination as directed.	35.00	142.68	4993.80	150.00	5250.00	5.13
10	M&L for dismantling of PVC water storage tanks for purpose of roof treatment and refixing them in position after treatment including proper sealing of joints and restoring water connection, including fittings damaged during the work, complete, capacity of tank 500 liters.	237.00	810.14	192004.13	305.00	72285.00	-62.35
11	M&L for complete removal of small plants and bushes from the wall and roof and making good by CM 1:4 or Cement concrete 1:2:4 (12.5mm graded aggregate).	200.00	8.00	1600.00	30.00	6000.00	275.00
Total						66,68,435.00	
Analysis of L-1 Bidder:							
a)	Offer of L-1 (Lowest) bidder			M/s Dobaria Buildcon, JBP(Rs. 66,68,435.00)			
b)	Offer of L-1 bidder above / below the estimated cost in Percentage. (Based on SSR 2020 + MV%, MV% 15% considered at the time of estimation) (Estimated cost: Rs. 87,67,694.67)			(-) 23.94% below			
c)	Offer of L-1 bidder above / below the estimated cost in Percentage. (Based on SSR 2020 + MV (-13%), at the time of analysis of the offer) (Estimated cost based on SSR 2020+MV (-13%):Rs. 90,04,913.86) (except item no. 08&11)			(-) 25.95 % below			
It is submitted that, at the time of estimate preparation, market variation (MV) was taken on all items at (-) 15 % and as per SSR 2020 total estimated cost of this work was Rs. 87,67,694.67.							
Now as per quarterly return for forecast of percentages over SSR 2020 for the succeeding quarter (quarter ending Dec 2023) the latest market variation is (-) 13 % for work in restricted area. Hence, considering latest market variation issued by MES over SSR 2020 (except item no. 08 and 11), the price offered by L-1 firm i.e. M/s Dobaria Buildcon, JBP Rs. 66,68,435.00 is (-) 25.95% below the estimated cost i.e. Rs.90,04,913.86 (considering latest MV issued by MES).							
Latest market variation has not been considered for item number 08 and 11 as the SSR rate of this item is not available. It is also submitted that as per clause no. 10.5.3 of SOP for civil works, AVNL 2021							
After evaluation and recommendation of CWC, price bid of the technically acceptable offer will be opened immediately. EO shall prepare CST and scrutinize the offers. If there is any freak rate*, the items having higher freak rates shall not be executed more than 5% of the estimated quantity. The items having lower freak rates shall not be executed less than 5% of the estimated quantity.							
*Freak Rate: Rates which are higher/lower than 50 % of the estimated cost of the item. Vide letter no. 208/1/EOC/ND 2306/2024-25 dated 25.05.2024, firm was asked for clarification for freak on lower side items no. 02, 04 and 10 and revision of rate for items no. 08 & 11. In reply, firm vide letter no. DBC/447/2024-25 dated 28.05.2024 has intimated that, "we will not compromise on quality on the rates quoted by us i.e. item no. 02, 04 & 10". Further for freakishly high item firm has intimated that "it is impossible to negotiate on the rates quoted by us i.e. item no. 08 & 11. Since as per the market availability and rates, we do not want to compromise on quality and since the location of site, we cannot execute the order in lesser amount as the current scenario of market is highly market and the cost of labour and transportation is very high and continuously increasing with time. In the same letter, firm has requested to take into consideration the fact and the other problems during execution of work. it is intimated that Work will be executed for 139 quarters as per list attached as annexure B.							
Analysis of L-1 bidder: The offer of L1 firm Rs 66,68,435.00 is (-) 25.95 % below the estimated cost i.e. Rs..90,04,913.86(considering latest MV issued by MES i.e. (-) 13 % for work in restricted area).							
Deliberation/ discussion:							
1. At present i.e. the time of analysis of the offer, latest market variation is (-) 13 % over SSR 2020 for work in restricted area. 2. The price offered by L-1 firm i.e. M/s Dobaria Buildcon, JBP Rs. 66,68,435.00 is (-) 25.95 % below the estimated cost of Rs. .90,04,913.86. considering latest MV issued by MES i.e.(-) 13 % (quarter ending Dec 2023) for work in restricted area is found reasonable. Work will be executed for 139 quarters as per list attached as annexure B. 3. GST will be applicable as per appropriate rate at the time of bill raised by firm.							
Decision:							
1. To place order upon M/s Dobaria Buildcon, JBP at Rs. 66,68,435.00 (Sixty Six Lakhs Sixty Eight Thousand Four Hundred Thirty Five point zero zero only, inclusive of all taxes and duties. Work will be executed for 139 quarters as per list attached as annexure B.							

KAMLESH KUMAR
GM/ BDU, HR, IMS, F&A & PVG
MEMBER/FINANCE, USER & ENGG

S.K. BNOLA
CHIEF GENERAL MANAGER
CHAIRMAN

D.N.K. BHATIA
DGM/ Civil & Central Procurement
MEMBER SECRETARY