



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways, Government of India)

जी-5 एवं 6, सेक्टर-10, द्वारका, नई दिल्ली - 110 075 • G-5 & 6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110075

दूरभाष/Phone : 91-11-25074100 / 25074200



NHAI/AM/2023-24/IE/Lalitpur-Lakhnadon/TOT-12/e-230155/209

Date: 13.06.2024

To,

All Bidders,

Sub: Independent Engineer Services during Operation & Maintenance period of Lalitpur-Sagar-Lakhnadon (existing Km. 99+005 to Km 415+089) on NH-44 under TOT in the state of Uttar Pradesh and Madhya Pradesh (TOT Bundle-12) - **Final Result for Evaluation of Technical Proposal - reg.**

2023_NHAI_176576_1

Ref.: (i) NHAI/AM/2023-24/IE/Lalitpur-Lakhnadon/TOT-12/e-230155/184 dated 26.04.2024

Sirs,

Please refer your submission of Bids for the subject work with bid due date as 04.01.2024. Also, refer your representations over result published on 26.04.2024 cited under ref. 1.

2. In this regard, please find attached final result of technical evaluation of subject project at **Annexure-1**.

3. This issues with the approval of Competent Authority.

Yours faithfully,

(P.K. Sinha)

DGM (T) - TOT/InvIT

Result of Technical Evaluation

2023_NHAI_176576_1

Date: 13.06.2024

To,

All the Participated Bidders
(As per Table below)

Sub: Independent Engineer Services during Operation & Maintenance period of Lalitpur-Sagar-Lakhnadon (existing Km. 99+005 to Km 415+089) on NH-44 under TOT in the state of Uttar Pradesh and Madhya Pradesh (TOT Bundle-12)
- **Final Result for Evaluation of Technical Proposal - reg.**

Sirs,

This has reference to RFP invited for the subject consultancy work. The final result of Technical Evaluation of the Bids received are tabulated below:

Bid No.	Name of the Bidder (M/s)	Status	Earlier Marks	Revised Marks	Rank of the bidder
1/5	Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	Non-Responsive			
2/5	LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with Engineering Consultancy Services	Responsive	67.10	89.04	1
3/5	LION Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with Synergy Engineers Group Pvt. Ltd.	Responsive	74.19	88.14	2
4/5	MSV International Inc in association with Aicons Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	Non-Responsive			
5/5	Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. in association with Ishita info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	Non-Responsive			



Independent Engineer Services during Operation & Maintenance period of Lalitpur-Sagar-Lakhnadon (existing Km. 99+005 to Km 415+089) on NH-44 under TOT in the state of Uttar Pradesh and Madhya Pradesh															
Final Comparative Technical Evaluation Score															
S. No.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Quality of Approach and Methodology		Experience in use of technology for road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Total		Rank of the Firm	whether the Technical Responsive Applicant/Bidder Eligible for opening of Financial proposal*		
		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed				
1/5	Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	Maximum marks		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	5	Non-Responsive		
2/5	LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with Engineering Consultancy Services			35.00	28.00	5.00	4.00	20.00	20.00	37.06	37.04	92.06	89.04	1	Responsive
3/5	LIION Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with Synergy Engineers Group Pvt. Ltd.			35.00	27.00	5.00	4.00	20.00	20.00	37.26	37.14	92.26	88.14	2	Responsive
4/5	MSV International Inc in association with Alcons Engineering Pvt. Ltd.			35.00	21.50	5.00	4.00	20.00	20.00	37.20	35.88	92.20	81.38	3	Non-Responsive
5/5	Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.			35.00	16.50	5.00	4.00	20.00	20.00	35.98	35.84	90.98	76.34	4	Non-Responsive

FIRMS RELEVANT EXPERIENCE FOR THE ASSIGNMENT

S.No.	Applicant No.	Description	Max Marks	1/5		2/5		3/5		4/5		5/5	
				Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed
1		Year of Establishment of the Firm (In case of JV year of establishment of LM shall be considered) (Min 5 Years)	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
1.1		For 5 years - 1.5 marks	1.5	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
1.2		More than 5 years - 2 marks	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
2		Average Annual Turnover (last three years) from consultancy business	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
2.1		5-10	0.5	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
2.2		10-20	1										
2.3		20-50	1.5										
2.4		>50	2										
3		Nos. of Highway Professionals with the firm	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
3.1		<4	0	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
3.2		4 to 12 - Linearly varying from 0.25 to 2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
3.3		>12 personnel - 2 marks	2										
4		Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years	5	5	4	5	4	5	4.5	5	4.5	5	0
4.1		2 project 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4 marks Or 1 project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length	4	5	4	5	4	5	4.5	5	4.5	5	0
4.2		Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks.	1										
5		In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects	10	10	0	10	7.5	10	5	10	5	10	0
4.1		For DPR project length > the length of project for which RFP invited -5 Marks	5										
4.2		For DPR project length > two times the length of project for which RFP invited -7.5 Marks	7.5	10	0	10	7.5	10	5	10	5	10	0
4.3		For project length > three times the length of project for which RFP invited - 10 Marks	10										
6		Experience as Independent Engineer/Authority Engineer/ Supervision Consultant two construction projects of four/six laning ** of 30% of project length each or one projects of four/six laning ** of 50% project length in last 7 years.	6	6	6	6	4	6	4	6	0	6	4.5
6.1		2 construction projects 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each -4marks Or 1 construction project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length	4	6	6	6	4	6	4	6	0	6	4.5
6.2		Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 2 (two) mark.	2										
7		Experience as Independent Engineer/Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFO/OMT/O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years	8	8	0	8	6.5	8	7.5	8	6	8	6
7.1		1 project - 6 marks	6										
7.2		Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	2	8	0	8	6.5	8	7.5	8	6	8	6
			35	35.00	16.00	35.00	28.00	35.00	27.00	35.00	21.50	35.00	16.50

No.	Description	Applicant No. Max Marks	1/5		2/5		3/5		4/5		5/5	
			Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed
	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection	6	6	3	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6
1	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	3		0		3		3		3		3
	(i) Experience of 1-2 projects	4				3		3		3		3
2	(ii) Experience of 3-5 projects	5										
	(iii) Experience of >5 projects	6										
	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
1	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2		2		2		2		2		2
	(i) Experience of 1-3 projects	2.5		1		1		1		1		1
2	(ii) Experience of > 3 projects	3										
	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit (MBIU) or better technology for bridges inspection	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
1	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2		2		2		2		2		2
	(i) Experience of 1-2 projects	3		2		2		2		2		2
2	(ii) Experience of >3 projects	4										
	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
1	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2		2		2		2		2		2
	(i) Experience of 1-3 projects	3		2		2		2		2		2
2	(ii) Experience of >3 projects	4										
	Experience in ATCC	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	1		1		1		1		1		1
	(i) Experience of 1-3 projects	2										
	(ii) Experience of >3 projects	3		2		2		2		2		2
	Total	20.00	20.00	17.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00

Summary Sheet of CV's*

S. No.	Details	Total Marks	1/5			2/5			3/5			4/5			5/5				
			Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.			LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. In association with Engineering Consultancy Services			LUON Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd. In association with Synergy Engineers Group Pvt. Ltd.			MSV International Inc. In association with Aicoms Engineering Pvt. Ltd.			Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. In association with Istita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.				
			Name	Assessed Score	Claimed	Assessed	Name	Assessed Score	Claimed	Assessed	Name	Assessed Score	Claimed	Assessed	Name	Assessed Score	Claimed	Assessed	
1	Team Leader- cum Senior Highway Engineer	14.00	Hemant Kumar Mishra	7.84	95	56	Manoj Kumar	12.74	91	91	Manoj Kumar	13.30	95	91	Ashutosh Mishra	13.30	95	91	90
2	Highway Maintenance Cum Resident Engineer	4.00	Sarvesh Kumar	3.84	96	96	Ranbir Kumar Mandal	3.68	92.5	92	Durgesh Kumar Tripathi	3.64	91	91	Hasan Ahmar	3.64	91	91	91
3	Highway Maintenance Cum Resident Engineer-2	4.00	Ajay Kumar Singh	0.00	91	0*	Deepak Kumar	3.64	91.00	91	Harish Chandra Mishra	3.64	91	91	Dipak Kumar	3.64	91	91	91
4	Road Safety Expert	6.00	P Sreenivasulu	5.16	95	86	Rajesh Bhagollwal	5.76	96.00	96	Raj Kumar Verma	5.70	95	95	Abhishek Singh	4.38	95	73	88
5	Bridge / Structural Engineer	6.00	Subas Khuntia	5.64	96	94	Sanjay Kumar	5.46	91	91	Rajesh Kumar Tiwari	5.46	91	91	Babbar Prasad Singh	5.46	91	91	89
6	ATMS/TMS Expert	6.00	Gururaja K. Rao	0.00	96	0*	Shivaji	5.76	96	96	Neelesh Kushwaha	5.40	92	90	Gunjesh gunjan	5.46	91	91	89
		40		22.48	38.00			37.04	37.06			37.14	37.26			35.88	37.20		
					1				2				3				4		5
Notes: *The above Marks are subject to submission of Degree in case the Bidder has submitted only marksheet																			

Note: *The above Marks are subject to submission of Degree in case the Bidder has submitted only marksheet

*Key Personnel already engaged as informed by the Authority hence zero marks has been assigned