



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways, Government of India)

जी-5 एवं 6, सेक्टर-10, द्वारका, नई दिल्ली - 110 075 • G-5 & 6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110075

दूरभाष/Phone : 91-11-25074100 / 25074200



NHAI/AM/2023-24/IE/Lalitpur-Lakhnadon/TOT-12/e-230155/184

Date: 26.04.2024

To,

All Bidders,

Sub: Independent Engineer Services during Operation & Maintenance period of Lalitpur-Sagar-Lakhnadon (existing Km. 99+005 to Km 415+089) on NH-44 under TOT in the state of Uttar Pradesh and Madhya Pradesh (TOT Bundle-12) - **Result of Technical Evaluation - reg.**

2023_NHAI_176576_1

Sir,

Please refer your submission of Bids for the subject work with bid due date as 04.01.2024. As per Clause 9(viii) of Data Sheet of RFP, the result of Technical Evaluation is enclosed herewith. You are requested to submit your objection, if any, latest by **03.05.2024 upto 1700 hrs.**

2. Communication shall be made with prashantsinha@nhai.org

CC: CGM(F) - for info.

Yours faithfully,

(P. K. Sinha)

DGM (T) - TOT/InvIT

Result of Technical Evaluation

2023_NHAI_176576_1

Date: 26.04.2024

To,

All the Participated Bidders
(As per Table below)

Sub: Independent Engineer Services during Operation & Maintenance period of Lalitpur-Sagar-Lakhnadon (existing Km. 99+005 to Km 415+089) on NH-44 under TOT in the state of Uttar Pradesh and Madhya Pradesh (TOT Bundle-12)
- Result of Technical Evaluation- reg.

Sir,

This has reference to RFP invited for the subject consultancy work. The result of Technical Evaluation of the Bids received are tabulated below:

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Quality of Approach and Methodology		Experience in use of technology for road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Total		Rank of Firm
		Maximum marks	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed
1/5	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	35.00	16.00	5.00	4.00	20.00	17.00	38.00	22.48	93.00	59.48	Non-Responsive
2/5	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Engineer	35.00	21.50	5.00	4.00	20.00	14.00	35.00	27.60	90.00	67.10	Non-Responsive

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Quality of Approach and Methodology		Experience in use of technology for road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Total		Rank of Firm
	Maximum marks	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	
	ing Consultancy Services											
3/5	M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Private Limited in association with M/s Synergy Engineers Group Pvt Ltd	35.00	17.25	5.00	4.00	20.00	20.00	36.82	32.94	91.82	74.19	Non-Responsive
4/5	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s Aicons Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	35.00	16.50	5.00	4.00	20.00	20.00	37.16	32.24	92.16	72.74	Non-Responsive
5/5	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s	35.00	6.00	5.00	4.00	20.00	20.00	36.10	30.50	91.10	60.50	Non-Responsive

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Quality of Approach and Methodology		Experience in use of technology for road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Total		Rank of Firm
	Maximum marks	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	
	Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited											

2. As per the relevant clauses of RFP, result of the technical evaluations are being made available on the website giving opportunity to the bidders to respond within 07 days (i.e., till 03.05.2024 upto 1700 hrs) in case they have any objection. After which, Authority shall not entertain any correspondence with any bidder in relation to acceptance or rejection of any bid.

3. Reasons for non-responsiveness and conditional qualification are attached at Annexure-1.

4. Detailed evaluation sheet is attached at Annexure-2.



1. Reasons for Non-Responsiveness are as below;

- a) M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited

The project with respect to the O&M under DBFOT/OMT/ O & M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length has not been found.

- b) M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Engineering Consultancy Services

The bidder should have prepared DPR/FS cum PPR for at least Two projects of 4/6 laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length., the same has not been found.

- c) M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Private Limited in association with M/s Synergy Engineers Group Pvt Ltd

The bidder should have minimum Experience of Project Supervision/IE at least two construction projects of four/six laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length., the same has not been found.

- d) M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited

i. The bidder should have prepared DPR/FS cum PPR for at least Two projects of 4/6 laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length., the same has not been found.

ii. The bidder should have minimum Experience of Project Supervision/IEAt least two construction projects of four/six laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length and At least one O&M project under DBFOT/OMT/ O & M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length.”., the same has not been found.

- e) M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s Aicons Engineering Pvt. Ltd.

i. The bidder should have minimum Experience of Project Supervision/IE at least two construction projects of four/six laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length., the same has not been found.

ii. No. of key professionals on full time rolls (minimum for last one year): The Consulting Firms has not submitted the Form-26 AS in order to certify their permanent key personnel as per the RFP of the proposed candidates.



2. Reasons for conditional qualification for few bidders are as below;

a) M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Engineering Consultancy Services

- i. Letter of Association has not been found in the bid submitted by the bidder.
- ii. Power of Attorney for the Powers of Associate Partners has not been found.

b) M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Private Limited in association with M/s Synergy Engineers Group Pvt Ltd

- i. Board Resolution of Associate Partner has not been found in the bid submitted by the bidder.
- ii. Self-evaluation as per Appendix B10 duly filled in based on the Detailed Evaluation criteria mentioned therein at Appendix-B10 is not readable.

c) M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s Aicons Engineering Pvt. Ltd.

- i. Board resolution of Lead Member has not been found in the bid submitted by the bidder.
- ii. Both Undertakings of point (iii) of format of Appendix-B-12 is not as per format prescribed in the RFP.



Independent Engineer Services during Operation & Maintenance period of Lalitpur-Sagar-Lakhnadon (existing Km. 99+005 to Km 415+089) on NH-44 under TOT in the state of Uttar Pradesh and Madhya Pradesh

Final Comparative Technical Evaluation Score

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Quality of Approach and Methodology		Experience in use of technology for road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Total		whether the Technical Responsive Applicant/Bidder Eligible for opening of Financial proposal*
		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	
1/5	Maximum marks Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	35.00	16.00	5.00	4.00	20.00	17.00	38.00	22.48	93.00	59.48	Non-Responsive
2/5	LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with Engineering Consultancy Services	35.00	21.50	5.00	4.00	20.00	14.00	35.00	27.60	90.00	67.10	Non-Responsive
3/5	LION Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with Synergy Engineers Group Pvt. Ltd.	35.00	17.25	5.00	4.00	20.00	20.00	36.82	32.94	91.82	74.19	Non-Responsive
4/5	MSV International Inc in association with Aicons Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	35.00	16.50	5.00	4.00	20.00	20.00	37.16	32.24	92.16	72.74	Non-Responsive
5/5	Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	35.00	6.00	5.00	4.00	20.00	20.00	36.10	30.50	91.10	60.50	Non-Responsive

Note: *Subject to the fulfillment of required documents as mentioned in the respective evaluation sheet.

FIRMS RELEVANT EXPERIENCE FOR THE ASSIGNMENT

S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/5		2/5		3/5		4/5		5/5	
			Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.		LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with Engineering Consultancy Services		LION Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd. In association with Synergy Engineers Group Pvt. Ltd.		MSV International Inc in association with Alcons Engineering Pvt. Ltd.		Thieme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. In association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	
1	Year of Establishment of the Firm (In case of JV year of establishment of LM shall be considered) (Min 5 Years)	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
		1.5	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
		2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
		2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
		0.5	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
		1										
		1.5										
		2										
		2										
		2										
3	Nos. of Highway Professionals with the firm	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
3.1	<4	0										
3.2	4 to 12 - Linearly varying from 0.25 to 2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
3.3	> 12 personnel - 2 marks	2										
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years	5	5	4	5	0	5	4.25	5	4.5	5	0
4.1	2 project 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4 marks Or 1 project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length	4	5	4	5	0	5	4.25	5	4.5	5	0
4.2	Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks.	1										
5	In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects	10	10	0	10	5	10	0	10	0	10	0
4.1	For DPR project length > the length of project for which RFP invited - 5 Marks	5										
4.2	For DPR project length > two times the length of project for which RFP invited - 7.5 Marks	7.5	10	0	10	5	10	0	10	0	10	0
4.3	For project length > three times the length of project for which RFP invited - 10 Marks	10										
6	Experience as Independent Engineer/Authority Engineer/ Supervision Consultant two construction projects of four/six laning ** of 30% of project length each or one projects of four/six laning ** of 50% project length in last 7 years.	6	6	6	6	4	6	0	6	0	6	0
6.1	2 construction projects 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4marks Or 1 construction project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length	4	6	6	6	4	6	0	6	0	6	0
6.2	Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 2 (two) mark.	2										
7	Experience as Independent Engineer/Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFO/OMT/O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years	8	8	0	8	6.5	8	7	8	6	8	0
7.1	1 project - 6 marks	6										
7.2	Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	2	8	0	8	6.5	8	7	8	6	8	0
		35	35.00	16.00	35.00	21.50	35.00	17.25	35.00	16.50	35.00	6.00

2/5

Independent Engineer Services during Operation & Maintenance period of Lalitpur-Sagar-Lakhnathon (Kilometre 99.005 to Km 415+089) on NH-44 under TOT in the Final Comparative Technical Evaluation Score				
S. No.	Name of Bidder		Quality of Approach and Methodology	
	Maximum marks	Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	Claimed	Assessed
1/5	Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.		5.00	4.00
2/5	LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in association with Engineering Consultancy Services LION Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with Synergy Engineers Group Pvt. Ltd.		5.00	4.00
3/5	MSV International Inc in association with Alcons Engineering Pvt. Ltd.		5.00	4.00
4/5	Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. in association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.		5.00	4.00
5/5			5.00	4.00

4

3/5

Name of the Project
Independent Engineer Services during Operation & Maintenance period of Lalitpur-Sagar-Lakhnadon (existing Km. 99+005 to Km 415+089) on NH-44 under TOT in the state of
Uttar Pradesh and Madhya Pradesh

Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection

S.No.	Description	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/5		2/5		3/5		4/5		5/5	
				Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed
1	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection		6	6	3	6	3	6	6	6	6	6	6
1.1	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	3			0		0		3		3		3
	(i) Experience of 1-2 projects	4											
	(ii) Experience of 3-5 projects	5			3		3		3		3		3
	(iii) Experience of >5 projects	6											
1.2	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
2	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2			2		2		2		2		2
2.1	(i) Experience of 1-3 projects	2.5			1		1		1		1		1
2.2	(ii) Experience of > 3 projects	3											
3	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit (MBIU) or better technology for bridges inspection	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
3.1	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2			2		2		2		2		2
3.2	(i) Experience of 1-2 projects	3			2		2		2		2		2
	(ii) Experience of >3 projects	4											
4	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
4.1	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2			2		2		2		2		2
	(i) Experience of 1-3 projects	3			2		2		2		2		2
4.2	(ii) Experience of >3 projects	4											
5	Experience in ATCC	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
5.1	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	1			1		1		1		1		1
	(i) Experience of 1-3 projects	2			2		2		2		2		2
5.2	(ii) Experience of >3 projects	3											
Total		20.00	20.00	20.00	17.00	20.00	14.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00

4/5

Summary Sheet of CV's*

S. No.	Details	Total Marks	1/5			2/5			3/5			4/5			5/5		
			Anvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.			LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. In association with Engineering Consultancy Services			LION Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd. In association with Synergy Engineers Group Pvt. Ltd.			MSV International Inc. In association with Alcons Engineering Pvt. Ltd.			Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. In association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.		
			Name	Assessed Score	Claimed	Assessed	Name	Assessed Score	Claimed	Assessed	Name	Assessed Score	Claimed	Assessed	Name	Assessed Score	Claimed
1	Team Leader- cum Senior Highway Engineer	14.00	Hemant Kumar Mishra	7.84	95	56	Manoj Kumar	12.74	91	91	Manoj Kumar	12.74	91	91	Vishnu shankar Dubey	12.60	91
2	Highway Maintenance Cum Resident Engineer	4.00	Sarvesh Kumar	3.84	96	96	Ranbir Kumar Mandal	0.00	86	0*	Durgesh Kumar Tripathi	3.64	91	91	Pramod Singh Yadav	3.64	91
3	Highway Maintenance Cum Resident Engineer-2	4.00	Aljay Kumar Singh	0.00	91	0*	Deepak Kumar	3.64	91.00	91	Harish Chandra Mishra	0.00	91	0*	Ajit Kumar	3.64	91
4	Road Safety Expert	6.00	P Sreenivasulu	5.16	95	86	Rajesh Bhagodiwal	0.00	96.00	0	Raj Kumar Verma	5.70	95	95	Krishna Kumar Vyas	5.28	88
5	Bridge / Structural Engineer	6.00	Subas Khuntia	5.64	96	94	Sanjay Kumar	5.46	91	91	Rajesh Kumar Tiwari	5.46	91	91	Nawab Khan	5.34	89
6	ATMS/TWS Expert	6.00	Gururaja K. Rao	0.00	96	0*	Shivaji	5.76	96	96	Neelish Kushwaha	5.40	94	90	Mirza Tahir Beg	0.00	91
		40		22.48	38.00			27.60	36.80			32.94	36.82			30.50	36.10
Note: *The above Marks are subject to submission of Degree in case the Bidder has submitted only marksheet																	
**Key Personnel already engaged as informed by the Authority hence zero marks has been assigned																	

5/5