

**NATIONAL HIGHWAYS AUTHORITY OF INDIA
MADURAI REGION**

Minutes of Meeting of Tender Evaluation Committee (Technical Evaluation) dated 18.12.2023 for the work of "Appointment of Safety Consultants at Construction Stage for 3 projects;

- i) Four laning of Vadipatti - Thamaraipatti section (Madurai Ring Road) from Km 0+000 to Km 29+960 of NH-744A in the State of Tamil Nadu under Bharatmala Pariyojana Phase-I on EPC mode
- ii) Four laning of Melur - Karaikudi section from Km 0+000 to Km 45+855 of NH-36, 338 & 383 in the State of Tamil Nadu under Bharatmala Pariyojana on EPC mode and
- iii) Four Laning of Thirumangalam - Vadugapatti section from Km 0+000 to Km 36+000 of NH-744 in the State of Tamil Nadu under Bharatmala Pariyojana Scheme on EPC Mode"

1. As per extant policy for NHAI vide no. NHAI/RSC/2012/Empanelment dated 30.05.2013 and 12.02.2015, ROs are assigned to carry out timely procurement of Safety Consultant keeping in view the status of each project.

2. Regional Office, NHAI, Madurai invited bids vide Tender ID: 2023_NHAI_170453_1 for the works of "Appointment of Safety Consultants at Construction Stage for 3 projects; (i) Vadipatti - Thamaraipatti section (Madurai Ring Road) of NH-744A, (ii) Melur - Karaikudi section of NH-36, 338 & 383 and (iii) Thirumangalam - Vadugapatti section of NH-744 in the State of Tamil Nadu.

3. In this context, the following Tender Committee was constituted for evaluation of Bids;
- i. Shri A Harikumar, DGM(Tech), RO-Madurai - Convener
 - ii. Shri V Nagaraj, DGM(Tech) & PD-Madurai - Member
 - iii. Shri Sumit Dewda, Dy.Manager(Tech), PIU-Madurai - Member
 - iv. Shri Prabhat Chandra Nirmohi, Head, F&A Unit, RO-Madurai - Member

4. As per RFP, last date of submission of e-bids was scheduled on 25th October, 2023 up to 04.00 PM and date of technical bid opening was scheduled on 26th October, 2023 @ 04.00 PM.

5. As per MoRTH Circular No. RW/NH-37010/4/2010-EAP (Printing) Vol.IV Dated 30.04.2020, evaluation of bids can be carried out with the available scanned copy of documents as per RFP requirement.

6. Accordingly, the Committee opened the e-bid submitted through online and decrypted. 8 Nos. of bids were received through online and the same is tabulated as under;

S. No	Bid ID	Name of the Bidder
1	622037	M/s GMD Consultants, Navi Mumbai
2	623710	M/s FP India Project Management Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai
3	623987	M/s Sri Infotech, Hyderabad
4	624899	M/s Infotrans Engineers Pvt. Ltd., Hyderabad
5	625525	M/s CMEC Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd., Odisha
6	625526	M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd., Vadodara.
7	625537	M/s Monarch Surveyors and Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd., Pune
8	625585	M/s M A Solutions Pvt. Ltd., Delhi

Sumit Dewda
18/12/2023

Dewda

Prabhat Chandra Nirmohi

Prabhat Chandra Nirmohi

7. Further, the details of bid received and Financial Instruments submitted therewith was furnished to Accounts Division. Accounts Division confirmed the receipts of bid document cost & EMD receipts submitted by the bidders except (i) M/s Sri Infotech, Hyderabad (Bid ID: 623987) & (ii) M/s Infotrans Engineers Pvt. Ltd., Hyderabad (Bid ID: 624899), as the said 2 bidders has not submitted the receipts of EMD/Bid Security in their bid documents. Accordingly, those 2 bids are not admitted for detailed technical evaluation.

8. Consequently, the Committee has admitted & evaluated the 6 Nos. of bids based on available scanned copies. The detailed technical evaluation as furnished vide Annexure-A. Summary of the same is submitted hereunder;

S. No	Bid ID	Name of Bidder	Recommendation
1	622037	M/s GMD Consultants, Navi Mumbai	Qualified
2	623710	M/s FP India Project Management Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai	Qualified
3	625525	M/s CMEC Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd., Odisha	Disqualified
4	625526	M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd., Vadodara.	Qualified
5	625537	M/s Monarch Surveyors and Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd., Pune	Qualified
6	625585	M/s M A Solutions Pvt. Ltd., Delhi	Qualified

9. Upon examining the bid document submitted by M/s CMEC Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd., Odisha, it is observed that, the bidder has not submitted the necessary documents i.e. (i) No conflict of interest Certificate & (ii) Integrity Pact as prescribed in Section-2 Instructions to Applicants of RFP. Hence, the tender evaluation committee recommends to consider the bid as "Non-responsive".

10. Further, with reference to the bids submitted by the Consultants, (i) M/s GMD Consultants, Navi Mumbai, (ii) M/s FP India Project Management Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai, (iii) M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd., Vadodara, (iv) M/s Monarch Surveyors and Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd., Pune & (v) M/s M A Solutions Pvt. Ltd., Delhi, the details furnished by the bidders are complying with the instructions set forth in RFP to qualify in the Technical Evaluation, hence, the Committee is unanimously recommends to consider the bids as "Responsive".

Committee further decided to meet at a convenient date to open & evaluate financial bids of the technically qualified bidders upon approval of Competent Authority.


(Prabhat Chandra Nirmohi)
Member


(Sumit Dewda)
Member


(V Nagaraj)
Member


(A Harikumar)
Convener

Appointment of Road Safety Consultant for Three Projects;

- (1) Four laning of Vadipatti - Thamarapatti section (Madurai Ring Road) from Km 0+000 to Km 29+960 of NH-744A in the State of Tamil Nadu under Bharatmala Pariyojana Phase-I on EPC mode
 (2) Four laning of Melur - Karaikudi section from Km 0+000 to Km 45+855 of NH-36, 338 & 383 in the State of Tamil Nadu under Bharatmala Pariyojana on EPC mode and
 (3) Four Laning of Thirumangalam - Vadugapatti section from Km 0+000 to Km 36+000 of NH-744 in the State of Tamil Nadu under Bharatmala Pariyojana Scheme on EPC Mode

Technical Evaluation							
S. No	Criteria for Pre-qualification	M/s GMD Consultants, Navi Mumbai (Bid ID: 622037) (1 of 6)	M/s FP India Project Management Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai (Bid ID: 623710) (2 of 6)	M/s CMEC Consulting Engineers Private Limited, Odisha (Bid ID: 625525) (3 of 6)	M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd., Vadodara (Bid ID: 625526) (4 of 6)	M/s Monarch Surveyors and Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd., Pune (Bid ID: 625537) (5 of 6)	M/s M A Solutions Private Limited, Delhi (Bid ID: 625585) (6 of 6)
1	Bid Document fee of Rs.5000/-	Furnished. Ref No: 1343832044 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 17.10.2023 for an amount of Rs.5,000/- (Pg 156)	Furnished. Ref No: 034113764471 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 23.10.2023 for an amount of Rs.5,000/- (Pg 6)	Furnished. Ref No: IDIBH23298167081 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 25.10.2023 for an amount of Rs.5,000/- (Pg 10)	Furnished. Ref No: IOBAN23294186344 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 21.10.2023 for an amount of Rs.5,000/- (Pg 7)	Furnished. Ref No: UBINJ23284595185 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 11.10.2023 for an amount of Rs.5,000/- (Pg 4)	Furnished. Ref No: N298232703199119 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 25.10.2023 for an amount of Rs.5,000/- (Pg 113)
2	Bid Security for an amount of Rs.25,000/-	Furnished. Ref No: 1350389794 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 23.10.2023 for an amount of Rs.25,000/- (Pg 156)	Furnished. Ref No: 034113764431 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 23.10.2023 for an amount of Rs.25,000/- (Pg 8)	Furnished. Ref No: IDIBH23298166580 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 25.10.2023 for an amount of Rs.25,000/- (Pg 291)	Furnished. Ref No: N296232701562996 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 23.10.2023 for an amount of Rs.25,000/- (Pg 8)	Furnished. Ref No: UBINJ23296894077 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 23.10.2023 for an amount of Rs.25,000/- (Pg 6)	Furnished. Ref No: N298232703191136 NEFT Fund Transfer dated 25.10.2023 for an amount of Rs.25,000/- (Pg 114)
3	Whether Empanelled consultant (As per NHAI Policy Circular)	Yes (Sl. No.6 in NHAI Policy Circular dated 24.08.2021)	Yes (Sl. No.10 in NHAI Policy Circular dated 24.08.2021)	Yes (Sl. No.3 in NHAI Policy Circular dated 05.01.2023)	Yes (Sl. No.7 in NHAI Policy Circular dated 05.01.2023)	Yes (Sl. No.12 in NHAI Policy Circular dated 21.04.2023)	Yes (Sl. No.15 in NHAI Policy Circular dated 05.01.2023)
4	Details of Safety Consultancy Projects In hand of the proposed Key Personnel (maximum 6)	Sh. Shailendra Mohan (RSA cum TL) : 5 Projects Sh.Rajesh Harish Gajjar (Traffic Planner) : 5 Projects (Pg 146)	Dr. Santosh Jalihal (RSA cum TL): 3 Projects Ms. Priyanka Sareen (Traffic Planner): 3 Projects (Pg 148)	Sh. Komal Prasad (RSA cum TL): 1 Project Sh. Prem Kumar (Traffic Planner): 1 Project (Pg 289)	Sh. Jignesh Trivedi (RSA cum TL): 0 Project Sh.Anil Mehta (Traffic Planner): 0 Project (Pg 217)	Sh. Shankar Dattatray Kulkarni (RSA cum TL): 2 Projects Sh.Sujeet Kumar Modi (Traffic Planner): 2 Projects (Pg 123)	Sh. Md. Mashkur Ahmad (RSA cum TL): 0 Project Sh. Upendra Kumar (Traffic Planner): 0 Project (Pg 84)
5	Name of Key Personnel & Age <= 70 years	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
a	Sr. Road Safety Auditor cum Team Leader	Sh. Shailendra Mohan (Pg 77) 01.01.1968 (55 years) INFRACON ID: mohan_shailendra@rediffmail.com	Dr. Santosh Jalihal (Pg 52) 22.07.1965 (58 Years) INFRACON ID: sjalihal@gmail.com	Sh. Komal Prasad (Pg 44) 05.03.1958 (65 Years) INFRACON ID:komalprasad608@gmail.com	Sh. Jignesh Trivedi (Pg 94) 29.07.1969 (54 Years) INFRACON ID: jigneshtrivedi1993@gmail.com	Sh. Shankar Dattatray Kulkarni (Pg 80) 25.02.1960 (63 Years) INFRACON ID:shankardkulkarni@gmail.com	Sh. Md. Mashkur Ahmad (Pg 16) 15.10.1974 (49 Years) INFRACON ID: mashkur.ahmad@gmail.com
b	Traffic Planner	Sh. Rajesh Harish Gajjar (Pg 102) 28.10.1967 (56 years) INFRACON ID: rhgajjar@gmdconsultants.in	Sh. Priyanka Sareen (Pg 119) 02.10.1981 (42 Years) INFRACON ID:priyankasareen@gmail.com	Sh. Prem Kumar (Pg 219) 26.08.1986 (37 Years) INFRACON ID: premkumar2686@yahoo.com	Sh. Anil Mehta (Pg 177) 18.07.1960 (63 Years) INFRACON ID: anilmehta1871960@gmail.com	Sh. Sujeet Kumar Modi (Pg 102) 11.01.1985 (38 Years) INFRACON ID: sujeetmodi@gmail.com	Sh. Upendra Kumar (Pg 55) 20.01.1972 (51 Years) INFRACON ID: upen.civil@gmail.com
c	CV of the Key Personnel (Furnished/ Not furnished)	Furnished (Pg 77)	Furnished (Pg 52)	Furnished (Pg 46)	Furnished (Pg 94)	Furnished (Pg 80)	Furnished (Pg 16)
6	Forwarding letter (Furnished/ Not furnished)	Furnished (Pg 3)	Furnished (Pg 4)	Furnished (Pg 11)	Furnished (Pg 16)	Furnished (Pg 55)	Furnished (Pg 6)
7	Details of Firm (Furnished/ Not furnished)	503-504, Mayuresh Chambers, Plot No. 60, Sector - 11, CBD Belapur, Navi Mumbai - 400 614, Maharashtra. Phone: +91-22-2756 4586 / 2756 5313. INFRACON ID: info@gmdconsultants.in (Pg 4)	Head Office, 315, Balgovind Wadi, New Prabhadevi Road, Prabhadevi, Mumbai - 400 025. Contact: 022-66603901 INFRACON ID: NChoudhary@pellfrischmann.com (Pg 10)	Plot No: 551/2417, Samanthalapur Chhak, Old Town, Bhubaneswar - 751 002. Tel: +91 -9437001665 INFRACON ID: cmecbbsr@rediffmail.com (Pg 12)	Head Office, B-10, Krishna Industrial Estate, Vadodara, Gujarat - 390 016. Phone No. : +91 -82380 98212 INFRACON ID: tendergth2012@gmail.com (Pg 20)	Survey No. 50/2A, 434/1, BT Kawde Road, Nanai Baug Ghorpadi, Pune, Maharashtra - 411 036. Phone No. : +91 -9766556746 INFRACON ID: enquiry@monarchpune.in (Pg 58)	A-49, Engine House, Mohan Cooperative Industrial Estate, New Delhi - 110 044. Contact: 011-40590844. INFRACON ID: info@masp.co.in (Pg 8)
		Incorporated on 21.12.2010 (Pg 39)	Incorporated on 13.02.1995 (Pg 13)	Incorporated on 06.03.1998 (Pg 17)	Incorporated on 21.03.2007 (Pg 50)	Incorporated on 20.07.1999 (Pg 34)	Incorporated on 28.02.2014 (Pg 9)
		Consultancy experience in R&B projects - 12 years (Pg 4)	Consultancy Experience in R&B projects: 26 Years (Pg 10)	Consultancy Experience in R&B projects: 24 Years (Pg 12)	Consultancy Experience in R&B projects: 26 Years (Pg 20)	Consultancy Experience in R&B projects: 23 Years (Pg 58)	Consultancy Experience in R&B projects: 9 Years (Pg 8)
8	Approach and Methodology proposed for the assignment (Furnished/ Not furnished)	Furnished (Pg 66-76)	Furnished (Pg 42-49)	Furnished (Pg 41-43)	Furnished (Pg 87-92)	Furnished (Pg 60-78)	Furnished (Pg 11-13)
9	Power of Attorney for Authorised signatory	Furnished (Pg 157) Shri Shailendra Mohan	Furnished (Pg 36) Shri Nitai Chandra Choudhary	Furnished (Pg 6) Sh. Kishore Chandra Sahoo	Furnished (Pg 47) Sh. Tarun Modi	Furnished (Pg 10) Sh. Anuran Gayali	Furnished (Pg 120) Sh. Md. Mashkur Ahmad
10	Power of Attorney holder & Digital Signatory both are same	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
11	Integrity Pact Furnished/Not Furnished	Furnished (Pg 150)	Furnished (Pg 159)	Not Furnished	Furnished (Pg 238)	Furnished (Pg 137)	Furnished (Pg 106)
12	No conflict of interest Certificate Furnished/Not Furnished	Furnished as NIL (Pg 149)	Furnished as NIL (Pg 151)	Not Furnished	Furnished as NIL (Pg 230)	Furnished as NIL (Pg 126)	Furnished as NIL (Pg 97)
Recommendation	Considering the above, the tender evaluation committee recommends to consider the bid as "Responsive"	Considering the above, the tender evaluation committee recommends to consider the bid as "Responsive"	i) The bidder has not submitted the No conflict of interest Certificate & Integrity Pact in his bid. Considering the above, the tender evaluation committee recommends to consider the bid as "Non-Responsive"	Considering the above, the tender evaluation committee recommends to consider the bid as "Responsive"	Considering the above, the tender evaluation committee recommends to consider the bid as "Responsive"	Considering the above, the tender evaluation committee recommends to consider the bid as "Responsive"	Considering the above, the tender evaluation committee recommends to consider the bid as "Responsive"
	Qualified	Qualified	Disqualified	Qualified	Qualified	Qualified	Qualified

(Prabhat Chandra Nirmohi)
Member

(Sumit Dewda)
Member

(V Nagaraj)
Member

(A Harikumar)
Convener