



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय - गांधीनगर (गुजरात)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India)

Regional Office - Gandhinagar (Gujarat)

दूरभाष / Phone : 079-29650607, 29650608 ई-मेल / e-mail : rogujarat@nhai.org

पहली मंजील, बी.एस.एन.एल. टेलीफोन एक्सचेंज बिल्डिंग, "च" रोड, सेक्टर-11, गांधीनगर-382011 (गुजरात)

1st Floor, BSNL Telephone Exchange Building, "CH" Road, Sector-11, Gandhinagar-382011(Gujarat)



NHAI/RO-GNR/NH-753B/Sag-Ded-Net/SC/2023/D-490

Date: 14.02.2024

To,

All Bidders

Subject: Supervision Consultancy (SC) Services during O&M of Two lane Maharashtra border-Sagbara-Dediapada-Netrang section of NH- 753B from Km. 117.400 to Km. 175.400 (Length 58.000 Km) in the state of Gujarat [Tender ID - 2023_NHAI_162413_1]" - Revised Evaluation of Technical Bids - Reg.

Ref: (i) Bids submitted on 08.09.2023 for the above-mentioned work.
(ii) This office letter No. NHAI/RO-GNR/NH-753B/Sag-Ded-Net/SC/2023/D-68 dated 05.01.2024

Sir,

Kindly refer NHAI letter dated 05.01.2024 vide which results of technical evaluation was intimated to the bidders and bidders were given opportunity to respond within seven days in case of any objection.

- Representations were received from the following bidders within the stipulated 7 days' time:
 - M/s Artefact Projects Ltd in Association with Renaissance IOT LLP
 - M/s Almondz Global Infra Consultants ltd in Association with Ekam Venture
 - M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd
 - M/s MSPARK Futuristics & Associates in JV with AICONS Engineering Pvt Ltd and in association with KKS Global Infra
 - M/s MSV International Inc. in association with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd
- The representations submitted by the bidders have been examined and replies to the representations as approved by the competent authority are enclosed in Annexure-I.
- Based on the deliberations, the Committee observed that after evaluation of the representations from the bidders, there are some changes in the technical evaluation of the firms. Summary of revised marks are as below:

Applicant No.	Name of Applicant	Original Technical Score	Final Technical Score
1/8	M/s Artefact Projects Ltd in Association with Renaissance IOT LLP	90.36	90.36
2/8	M/s Almondz Global Infra Consultants ltd in Association with Ekam Venture	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
3/8	M/s Geo Designs & Research (P) Ltd	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive

[Signature]

Applicant No.	Name of Applicant	Original Technical Score	Final Technical Score
4/8	M/s K & J Projects Pvt Ltd in JV with G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt Ltd	95.35	95.35
5/8	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd	89.99	96.64
6/8	M/s MSPARK Futuristics & Associates in JV with AICONS Engineering Pvt Ltd and in association with KKS Global Infra	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
7/8	M/s MSV International Inc. in association with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	95.89	96.36
8/8	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in Association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	95.96	95.96

5. The financial bids of following top 5 (five) scoring bidders out of the above technically responsive bidders will be opened at 1600 hrs on 15.02.2024 at Regional Office, Gandhinagar, Gujarat.

Applicant No.	Name of Applicant	Final Technical Score
1	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd	96.64
2	M/s MSV International Inc. in association with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	96.36
3	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in Association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	95.96
4	M/s K & J Projects Pvt Ltd in JV with G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt Ltd	95.35
5	M/s Artefact Projects Ltd in Association with Renaissance IOT LLP	90.36

6. Accordingly, the bidders may depute their representatives with authorization letter for attending the opening of financial bids.

यह सक्षम प्राधिकारी के अनुमोदन से प्रस्तुत है।


 (अजय कुमार स्वामी)
 उप-महाप्रबंधक (तकनीकी)
 क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय-गांधीनगर(गुजरात)

ANNEXURE-I

Sub: Supervision Consultancy (SC) Services during O&M of Two lane Maharashtra border-Sagbara-Dediapada-Netrang section of NH- 753B from Km. 117.400 to Km. 175.400 (Length 58.000 Km) in the state of Gujarat [Tender ID - 2023_NHAI_162413_1]

Replies to Bidders' Representations

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply												
A.	W/s Artefact Projects Ltd In Association with Renaissance IOT LLP													
	In hand DPRs for NHAI of Highway/ Bridge/Tunnel Projects (presently under progress) For DPR project length > the length of project for which RFP invited - 5 Marks For DPR project length > two times the length of project for which RFP invited - 7.5 Marks For project length > three times the length of project for which RFP invited - 10 Marks It has been observed that our submissions of On Going DPR assignments for the said criteria are evaluated by the Authority and 5.0 marks are awarded as against 10 marks. It is to be mentioned that to satisfy the requirements of the said clause i.e. Point No. 5 under Firms Relevant Experience for The Assignment, we have submitted following DPR projects that are On Going DPR assignments in our bid proposal at page numbers as given below: <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>S. No.</th><th>Project Name</th><th>Bid Page No</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td><td>Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for 6-Laning of Existing 4-Lane Gonde-Vadape Section from Km 440.00 to Km 539.500 of NH-3 in the State of Maharashtra. (LOA date- 09.06.2017) 4 Lane/ 96.64 kms Artefact Projects Ltd (Sole)</td><td>153-158</td></tr> <tr> <td>2</td><td>Consultancy Services for preparation of Feasibility Report of construction of 4 Lane Inner Ring Road in and around Allahabad City in the state of Uttar Pradesh. (Agreement date- 04.12.2017) 4 Lane/ 100 kms Artefact Projects Ltd In association with Renaissance IOT LLP</td><td>159-167</td></tr> <tr> <td>3</td><td>Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for construction of Guwahati Ring Road from Khanapara-Narengi Chowki (Tinali)-Narengi End-Kurua End-Dumunichowki- Baihata Chairali- Jalukbari of approx. 72.45 km length under Bharatmala Pariyojana in the State of Assam. (Agreement date- 22.04.2022) 4 Lane/ 72.45 kms Global Infra Solutions JV with Artefact Projects Ltd</td><td>168-171</td></tr> </tbody> </table>	S. No.	Project Name	Bid Page No	1	Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for 6-Laning of Existing 4-Lane Gonde-Vadape Section from Km 440.00 to Km 539.500 of NH-3 in the State of Maharashtra. (LOA date- 09.06.2017) 4 Lane/ 96.64 kms Artefact Projects Ltd (Sole)	153-158	2	Consultancy Services for preparation of Feasibility Report of construction of 4 Lane Inner Ring Road in and around Allahabad City in the state of Uttar Pradesh. (Agreement date- 04.12.2017) 4 Lane/ 100 kms Artefact Projects Ltd In association with Renaissance IOT LLP	159-167	3	Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for construction of Guwahati Ring Road from Khanapara-Narengi Chowki (Tinali)-Narengi End-Kurua End-Dumunichowki- Baihata Chairali- Jalukbari of approx. 72.45 km length under Bharatmala Pariyojana in the State of Assam. (Agreement date- 22.04.2022) 4 Lane/ 72.45 kms Global Infra Solutions JV with Artefact Projects Ltd	168-171	The representation of bidder was examined. It is to mention that the documents submitted by the bidder do not establish that the DPR work of the claimed projects is in progress. In view of above, the marks awarded for this criterion shall remain unchanged.
S. No.	Project Name	Bid Page No												
1	Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for 6-Laning of Existing 4-Lane Gonde-Vadape Section from Km 440.00 to Km 539.500 of NH-3 in the State of Maharashtra. (LOA date- 09.06.2017) 4 Lane/ 96.64 kms Artefact Projects Ltd (Sole)	153-158												
2	Consultancy Services for preparation of Feasibility Report of construction of 4 Lane Inner Ring Road in and around Allahabad City in the state of Uttar Pradesh. (Agreement date- 04.12.2017) 4 Lane/ 100 kms Artefact Projects Ltd In association with Renaissance IOT LLP	159-167												
3	Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for construction of Guwahati Ring Road from Khanapara-Narengi Chowki (Tinali)-Narengi End-Kurua End-Dumunichowki- Baihata Chairali- Jalukbari of approx. 72.45 km length under Bharatmala Pariyojana in the State of Assam. (Agreement date- 22.04.2022) 4 Lane/ 72.45 kms Global Infra Solutions JV with Artefact Projects Ltd	168-171												

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply		
	With above facts and documents presented herewith and as per the demarcation for the said criterion, it is requested to your good office kindly review the same and full 10 marks be awarded as against 7.50 marks.			
B.	M/s Almondz Global Infra Consultants ltd in Association with Ekam Venture			
	With reference to the above, regarding the Technical Evaluation of tender submitted by M/s Almondz Global Infra Consultant Limited in association with M/s Ekam Venture in respect of the subject mentioned project, we came to understand that as per evaluation committee the bidder does not meet the eligibility Criteria of atleast one O&M project of 2/4/6 laning of 50% Length of the project ie. (50% X 58 km=29 km). In view of the above, we request you to kindly consider following project: <table><tr><td>Independent Engineer for Development and Operation / Maintenance of Sikar-Bikaner section of NH-11 from Km. 340.188 of NH-11 to Km. 557.775 of NH-11 via Sikar bypass and Bikaner Bypass from Km. 553.869 of NH-11 to Km. 267.325 of NH-89 by Two laning with paved shoulder in the State of Rajasthan.</td><td>Total Length of project 237.5 km (2 lane 205.288 km and 4 lane 32.290 km) Role: Associate length as associate more than 29 km Certificate in Technical Proposal Page 127-128</td></tr></table>	Independent Engineer for Development and Operation / Maintenance of Sikar-Bikaner section of NH-11 from Km. 340.188 of NH-11 to Km. 557.775 of NH-11 via Sikar bypass and Bikaner Bypass from Km. 553.869 of NH-11 to Km. 267.325 of NH-89 by Two laning with paved shoulder in the State of Rajasthan.	Total Length of project 237.5 km (2 lane 205.288 km and 4 lane 32.290 km) Role: Associate length as associate more than 29 km Certificate in Technical Proposal Page 127-128	The representation of the bidder has been examined. Reference is hereby given to Note below clause 12 (B) of Section 1 of RFP which states: “**For weightage of experience in any past Consultancy assignment experience certificate from the client shall be accepted. In the absence of experience certificate from the client, proportion of payment received towards Consultancy work duly certified by statutory body like Chartered Accountant or Independent Auditors who are competent to do so as recognised by the State concerned shall be accepted. Annual turnover duly certified by Chartered Accountant shall be accepted. In case of non-availability of such documents no weightage of turnover/experience will be considered.” The documents submitted by the bidder in support of the mentioned experience do not specify the share of the firm as associate member in the project experience claimed. Hence, the representation has not been considered. Therefore, the bidder remains non-responsive.
Independent Engineer for Development and Operation / Maintenance of Sikar-Bikaner section of NH-11 from Km. 340.188 of NH-11 to Km. 557.775 of NH-11 via Sikar bypass and Bikaner Bypass from Km. 553.869 of NH-11 to Km. 267.325 of NH-89 by Two laning with paved shoulder in the State of Rajasthan.	Total Length of project 237.5 km (2 lane 205.288 km and 4 lane 32.290 km) Role: Associate length as associate more than 29 km Certificate in Technical Proposal Page 127-128			

[Signature]

21/3/21

[Signature]

[Signature]

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply																		
C.	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd																			
	Kindly refer your good office letter dated 05.01.2024 under reference whereby it has been intimated that our proposed Team Leader has scored 56% marks and our overall marks awarded towards technical evaluation of the subject project is 89.99 marks. In this regard it is submitted that the detailed evaluation of the technical proposal have not been provided to us, however, we anticipate that the projects of Operation and maintenance of our proposed Team Leader have not been considered under the sub-category "At least 3 years' experience as Team Leader/Project Manager or in similar capacity in O&M and other related activities (like Maintenance Manual, Maintenance Programmes, Lane Closures, Traffic Management, etc.) of completed 4/6 lane highway sections". The Proposed Team Leader has got experience of 2 projects of Operation & maintenance and as per details mentioned below: 2/4 lane project of Operation and Maintenance of Badnawar-Thandla road (SH-18) under PPP Mode Project in Jhabua & Dhar district in the state of Madhya Pradesh. Total Length of Project 78.8 Km. 2/4 lane project of Operation and Maintenance of Bela – Govindgarh – Churhat Highway on SH49 under PPP Mode Project at Rewa & Sidhi district in the state of Madhya Pradesh. Total Length of project 56.74 Km. Project mentioned at sr. no. 2 i.e. Bela – Govindgarh – Churhat is 2/4 lane project of Operation and Maintenance. Shri Mahesh Puloriya proposed by us as Team Leader vide letter dated 25-12-2023 addressed to RO Gujarat and copy endorsed to us wherein he has furnished his detailed reasons for the discrepancy observed in an Operation and Maintenance project namely Bela-Govindgarh-Churhat highway on SH-49 under PPP MoRTH mentioned in his Infracon CV at sr. no. 16 wherein 4 lane project has been indicated instead of 2/4 lane project. The candidate has furnished that the error in lane of project has occurred due to typographical error and not intentional. He has approached to Infracon Authority vide his letter dated 16-10-2023 for providing edit option for correction of discrepancy crept in his CV, however, he could not get the option to correct the error in his Infracon CV due to non-availability of editing option. In view of the above submission, it is very humbly requested to kindly review the marks awarded to CV of our proposed Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer, Shri Mahesh Puloriya in the captioned consultancy assignment and accordingly revise the marks in our technical proposal. The above captioned project is 2 lane project so kindly consider the 2/4 lane projects of our proposed Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer.	The evaluation of the said CV was reviewed in view of representation submitted by the bidder. Since the tender is for 2-lane stretch, the experience in 2-lane highways has been considered and accordingly the Key Personnel is found to have more than 5 years' experience in mentioned criteria. In view of above, 35 marks are hereby awarded to the key personnel in the mentioned criteria. Accordingly, the marks of the firm are revised as per below: <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th><th>Earlier</th><th>Revised</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Firm</td><td>35.00</td><td>35.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Work Plan & Methodology</td><td>5.00</td><td>5.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Technology for road inspection</td><td>20.00</td><td>20.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Key Personnel</td><td>29.99</td><td>36.64</td></tr> <tr> <td>Total</td><td>89.99</td><td>96.64</td></tr> </tbody> </table>		Earlier	Revised	Firm	35.00	35.00	Work Plan & Methodology	5.00	5.00	Technology for road inspection	20.00	20.00	Key Personnel	29.99	36.64	Total	89.99	96.64
	Earlier	Revised																		
Firm	35.00	35.00																		
Work Plan & Methodology	5.00	5.00																		
Technology for road inspection	20.00	20.00																		
Key Personnel	29.99	36.64																		
Total	89.99	96.64																		

[Signature]

21/8/24

[Signature]

[Signature]

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply																		
D.	M/s MSPARK Futuristics & Associates in JV with AICONS Engineering Pvt Ltd and in association with KKS Global Infra																			
	With reference to clause 12(B) of RFP i.e. "Lead partner and the JV partner both shall have experience of at least one project of eligible category as in para 12 (A) above". In view of above, Lead Partner i.e. MSPARK Futuristics & Associates has an experience of DPR, Supervision and O&M Projects and JV partner i.e. AICONS Engineering Pvt. Ltd., has an experience of DPR project & Supervision Project. Thus, both the firms fulfil the eligibility criteria wherein they have an experience of atleast one project of eligible category. Hence, we request the Competent Authority to look favorably into the matter. We shall be pleased to offer any further clarifications, if so needed.	As per the certificates submitted in the technical bid of the bidder, the JV Partner partner - AICONS Engineering Pvt. Ltd. does not have eligible experience in O&M Projects; therefore the JV partner does not fulfil the criteria of clause 12(B) of RFP i.e. "Lead partner and the JV partner both shall have experience of at least one project of eligible category as in para 12 (A) above". Accordingly, the bidder remains Non-Responsive.																		
E.	M/s MSV International Inc. in association with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd.																			
	Team Leader cum Highway Engineer (K Sambasiva Rao) 1 Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M of completed 4/6 lane highway sections (i) Position: Team Leader cum Senior Bridge Engineer Consultancy services for Authority Engineer for Operation & Maintenance of of two lanning with paved shoulder from 97/487 km to 137/250 of Nagpur-Umred_Nagbhir_Armori NH 353, Section Nagbhir to Armori in the state of Maharashtra on EPC Mode; 2 lane; Project Length: 40 Km; Project Cost: INR 166.60 Crore; Client: National Highway Division. Public works Department. Maharashtra State. (11 months) (ii) Position: Project Manager Operations & Maintenance of the Road Corridor of 100 Km length on NH - 5 between Rajahmundry - Tuni in Andhra Pradesh for National Highways Authority of India as per the terms of the Concession Agreement which included the accomplished the road roughness survey and structural evaluation of the pavement besides routine maintenance. Executed 2 Nos bridges for the Irrigation Canal Crossings in the corridor; 4-lane; Project Length: 100 km; Project Cost: INR 490.00 Crore; Client: NHAI. (June 2006 to Nov 2010) (53 months). Moreover, his experience in similar category for 2 laning should be considered according to the note mentioned in Page no. 62 of RFP which says that "Similar projects means 2/4/6 lane as applicable for the project for which RFP is invited. For 2-lane projects experience of 4/6 lane also to be considered with a multiplication factor of 1.5. Experience of 4/6 lane shall be considered interchangeably for 4/6 laning projects. For 4/6 laning projects, experience of 2 lane will be considered with a multiplication factor of 0.4." So, from above, it can be seen clearly that Mr. K Sambasiva Rao has more than 5 years of experience in the similar capacity. Hence, you are requested to assessed him full 35 marks out 35 marks in this category.	The evaluation of the said CV was reviewed in view of representation submitted by the bidder. The representation of the bidder has been considered as the Key Personnel is found to have more than 5 years' experience in mentioned criteria. In view of above, marks awarded to the Key Personnel in the mentioned criteria are revised from 32.5 (earlier) to 35(now). Accordingly, the marks of the firm are revised as per below: <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th><th>Earlier</th><th>Revised</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Firm</td><td>35.00</td><td>35.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Work Plan & Methodology</td><td>5.00</td><td>5.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Technology for road inspection</td><td>20.00</td><td>20.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Key Personnel</td><td>35.89</td><td>36.36</td></tr> <tr> <td>Total</td><td>95.89</td><td>96.36</td></tr> </tbody> </table>		Earlier	Revised	Firm	35.00	35.00	Work Plan & Methodology	5.00	5.00	Technology for road inspection	20.00	20.00	Key Personnel	35.89	36.36	Total	95.89	96.36
	Earlier	Revised																		
Firm	35.00	35.00																		
Work Plan & Methodology	5.00	5.00																		
Technology for road inspection	20.00	20.00																		
Key Personnel	35.89	36.36																		
Total	95.89	96.36																		