



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय - गांधीनगर (गुजरात)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India)

Regional Office - Gandhinagar (Gujarat)

दूरभाष / Phone : 079-29650607, 29650608 ई-मेल / e-mail : rogujarat@nhai.org

पहली मंजील, बी.एस.एन.एल. टेलीफोन एक्सचेंज बिल्डिंग, "च" रोड, सेक्टर-11, गांधीनगर-382011 (गुजरात)

1st Floor, BSNL Telephone Exchange Building, "CH" Road, Sector-11, Gandhinagar-382011(Gujarat)



NHAI/RO-GNR/Pip-Bhav/Pkg-1/OM/2023/D- 3817

Date: 27.12.2023

To,
All Bidders

Subject: Independent Engineer (IE) Services for Operation & Maintenance Stage of Widening of Pipli - Bhavnagar-Section Pkg 1 from km 136.025 to 169.328 (Design Chainage km 136.000 to 169.308) Near Adhelai Village to Nari Junction to four laning in the State of Gujarat on Hybrid Annuity Mode. [Tender ID - 2023_NHAI_162398_1]" - Revised Technical Evaluation of Bids - Reg.

Ref: (i) Bids submitted on 01.09.2023 for the above-mentioned work.
(ii) This office letter No. NHAI/RO-GNR/Pip-Bhav/Pkg-1/OM/2023/D-3604 dated 06.12.2023

Sir,

Kindly refer NHAI letter dated 06.12.2023 vide which results of technical evaluation was intimated to the bidders and bidders were given opportunity to respond within seven days in case of any objection.

- Representations were received from the following bidders within the stipulated 7 days' time:
 - M/s Artefact Projects Ltd in Association with Renaissance IOT LLP
 - M/s FP Project Management in association with Translink Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd
 - M/s Geo Designs & Research (P) Ltd
 - M/s K & J Projects Pvt Ltd in JV with G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt Ltd
 - M/s MSV International Inc. in association with Manglam Infra Engineering Ltd
 - M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt Ltd in JV with M/s Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s Aartav Engineering Pvt Ltd
 - M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in Association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.
- The representations submitted by the bidders have been examined and replies to the representations as approved by the competent authority are enclosed in Annexure-I.
- Based on the deliberations, the Committee observed that after evaluation of the representations from the bidders, there are some changes in the technical evaluation of the firms. Summary of revised marks are as below:

Applicant No.	Name of Applicant	Original Technical Score	Final Technical Score
1/10	M/s Artefact Projects Ltd in Association with Renaissance IOT LLP	91.39	92.24
2/10	M/s FP Project Management in association with Translink Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd	95.05	95.05

दिनेश शेरवत

Applicant No.	Name of Applicant	Original Technical Score	Final Technical Score
3/10	M/s Geo Designs & Research (P) Ltd	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
4/10	M/s K & J Projects Pvt Ltd in JV with G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt Ltd	95.37	95.37
5/10	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd	96.00	90.05
6/10	M/s MSPARK Futuristics & Associates IN JV with AICONS Engineering Pvt. Ltd. and in association with KKS Global Infra	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
7/10	M/s MSV International Inc. in association with Manglam Infra Engineering Ltd	95.61	95.61
8/10	M/s Sheladia Associates Inc. in association with M/s Almonds Global Infra Consultants ltd and M/s LSI Engineering & Consultants Ltd	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
9/10	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt Ltd in JV with M/s Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s Aartav Engineering Pvt Ltd	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive
10/10	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in Association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	93.74	93.74

7. The financial bids of following top 5 (five) scoring bidders out of the above technically responsive bidders will be opened at 1400 hrs on 28.12.2023 at Regional Office, Gandhinagar, Gujarat.

Applicant No.	Name of Applicant	Final Technical Score
1	M/s MSV International Inc. in association with Manglam Infra Engineering Ltd	95.61
2	M/s K & J Projects Pvt Ltd in JV with G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt Ltd	95.37
3	M/s FP Project Management in association with Translink Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd	95.05
4	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in Association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	93.74
5	M/s Artefact Projects Ltd in Association with Renaissance IOT LLP	92.24

8. Accordingly, the bidders may depute their representatives with authorization letter for attending the opening of financial bids.

यह सक्षम प्राधिकारी के अनुमोदन से प्रस्तुत है।

दिनेश शेरवत

(दिनेश कुमार शेरवत)
प्रबंधक (तकनीकी)
क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय-गांधीनगर(गुजरात)

Replies to Bidders' Representations

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply
A.	M/s Artefact Projects Ltd in Association with Renaissance IOT LLP	
1.	In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects For DPR project length > the length of project for which RFP invited -5 Marks. For DPR project length > two times the length of project for which RFP invited -7.5 Marks. For project length > three times the length of project for which RFP invited - 10 Marks. NHAI- Evaluation marks- 7.5 Self - Evaluation marks- 10 In this particular submission we have submitted 3 number of NHAI ongoing DPR projects of 4-Lane from page no 151 to 184 of the Technical Proposal. While evaluating our submission for the above criteria, the evaluation committee have given 7.5 marks as against self-assessed 10 marks. Despite the basis for evaluation of our submissions is not clarified or elaborated, however in this context we hereby submit our clarification as below:- In our bid proposal, we have submitted below mentioned In Hand DPR projects of NHAI: - 1. DPR Vadape-Gonde = 6 Lane/ 96.64 kms, Bid Page No. 154 to 158 2 DPR Allahabad City = 4 Lane/ 100 kms, Bid Page No. 159 to 167 (Attached LOA which clearly mention the project length) Annexure 1. 3. DPR Guwahati Ring Road = 4 Lane/ 72.45 kms, Bid Page No. 168 to 171 Total Length = 269.09 kms As per the demarcation of the said clause, to score full marks the applicant firm should have In Hand DPRs for NHAI projects having total aggregate length in excess of three times for which the RFP is invited i.e in this instant case, $33.303 \times 3 = 99.90$ kms. As illustrated above, (The Single DPR Allahabad City 4 lane = 100 Kms) its fulfilled RFP Requirement, also the total aggregate length of our In Hand DPR projects of NHAI is 269.09 kms. Thus, our submissions stand eligible to score full 10 marks as against 7.50 marks given by your good office. In support of the fact that the DPR projects are ongoing assignments, we also attach herewith latest NHAI working correspondences as Annexure 2.	The representation of bidder was examined. It is to mention that the documents submitted by the bidder do not establish that the DPR work of the claimed projects is in progress. In view of above, the marks awarded for this criterion shall remain unchanged.

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply
2.	Experience as Independent Engineer /Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFOT/OMT/ O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years 1 project - 6 marks. Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks. NHAI- Evaluation marks- 7.5 Self - Evaluation marks- 8 In this particular submission we have attached total 13 Projects of IE/IC/ Supervision Consultant under DBFOT/ OMT/ O&M of 4/6 Lane. In actual total 10 qualifying projects of Independent Engineer/ Supervision Consultant under DBFOT/OMT/ O&M of 4/6 lanes are attached from page no. 188 to 227 of the technical proposal out of that 4 projects of are considered as per the marking given by your good office. However, remaining projects which are greater than 50% of the indicative project length as per RFP i.e, greater than 16.65 Km are not considered. In these projects we have continued to work during O&M period after completion of construction for substantial period. We again attach the qualifying projects herewith for your ready reference. i) Independent Engineer Services for Operation & Maintenance of Palanpur-Radhanpur Section (Km.340.00 to Km.458.00) of NH-14 and Radhanpur- Samakhiyali section (Km.138.00 to Km.281.300) of NH-15 on OMT basis in the state of Gujarat (OMT Pkg.-1) ii) Independent Engineer services for Operation and Maintenance of Kota-Baran section Km 388.263 to Km 492.322 of NH-76 in the state of Rajasthan on OMT basis (Package-8). iii) INDEPENDENT SERVICES FOR OPERATION AND MAINTENANCE FOR (Hyderabad- Bangalore (AP/Karnataka Border)) IN THE STATE OF (AP) ON OMT BASIS (Package No: OMT-13 (NS) on NH-7 iv) Independent Consultancy Services for 4/6 laning of Chhattisgarh/Maharashtra Border - Wainganga Bridge (km 405 - km 485) of 80 km NH-6 under NHDP Phase IIIA in the State of Maharashtra (BOT Project) Consultancy Package No. IC/ PhIIIA /NH6 /MH /01/07 v) Independent Consultancy services Rehabilitation and Upgradation to four lane of Jhansi - Lalitpur section from km 49.700 to km 99.005 - 49.3 KM of NH - 26 in the State of Uttar Pradesh - Package No. NSI/IC/UP - 3 on BOT basis vi) Independent Consultancy Services for 4/6 laning of Trichy-Dindigul section (km.333 - km 421.273) on NH 45 in the State of Tamilnadu on BOT Basis. Consultancy Package No. IC/PhIIIA/NH68 /TN /003 /2007 Tamilnadu. vii) Independent Consultancy Services for 4/6 Laning of Bangalore-Kolar-Mulbagal Section (Km. 237 - Km. 318) on NH-4 in the State of Karnataka on BOT Basis for Package No. IC/PHIIIA/NH4/KNT/001/07	The representation of bidder was examined. It is to mention that following projects have not been considered as eligible experience: i) Consultancy services for O&M phase whose completion date is older than 7 years from the bid due date of this tender.(Projects at Sr, No. 4 to 8 of your representation). ii) In the project at Sr. No. (10) mentioned in bidder's representation, completion certificate was not attached in original bid. In view of above, the marks awarded for this criterion shall remain unchanged.

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply																		
	viii) Independent Engineer for the project of four laning of Nagpur - Wainganga bridge section from km 498.00 to 544.200 of NH-6 in the state of Maharashtra to be executed on DBFOT basis under NHDP Phase III ix) Independent Engineer services for 4 Laning of Walayar-Vadakkancherry from existing Km. 182.250 to Km. 240.000 in the State of Kerala under NHDP Phase-II to be executed on BOT (Toll) project on DBFOT Pattern. x) Independent Engineer services for Four-Laning of Rajsamand (NH-8)-Gangapur-Bhilwara (NH-79) in the section of NH-758 (from km 0.000 to km 87.250) in the state of Rajasthan under on Design, Build, Finance, Operate and Transfer (DBFOT) basis. The above mentioned projects were executed under OMT & DBFOT basis and have lengths in excess of 50% of the project length for which the RFP is invited, thereby satisfying the requirements of the stipulated criteria and should be considered eligible for further evaluation. Taking into account our above clarifications provided, it is requested to kindly review our submission and full 8 marks be awarded as against 7.5 marks.																			
3	Team Leader cum Sr. Highway Engineer:- Mr Anil Prasad Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M of completed 4/6 lane highway sections <3 years -0 3 years -30 Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of Experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks. NHA- Evaluation marks- 30 Self - Evaluation marks- 35 a) In reference to the above stipulated criteria, we have submitted project experiences of the candidate i.e Project no. 12 & 16. The said clause prescribes that to score full 35 marks, the candidate should have Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M More than 5 Years of completed 4/6 lane highway sections of major highway Project . b) b) Projects claimed in the bid : Infracon Project No. 04 (As per submitted bid proposal CV- Page No. 11) Infracon Project No. 09 (As per submitted bid proposal CV- Page No. 09)	Experience claimed by the bidder for this CV has been rechecked and accordingly, found that there is 2 Projects with 5 year experience and therefore the total marks for TL has been increased from 86 to 91. Accordingly, the revised score of the bidder is as below: <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th><th>Earlier</th><th>Revised</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Firm</td><td>30.50</td><td>30.50</td></tr> <tr> <td>Work Plan & Methodology</td><td>5.00</td><td>5.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Technology for road inspection</td><td>20.00</td><td>20.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Key Personnel</td><td>35.89</td><td>36.74</td></tr> <tr> <td>Total</td><td>91.39</td><td>92.24</td></tr> </tbody> </table>		Earlier	Revised	Firm	30.50	30.50	Work Plan & Methodology	5.00	5.00	Technology for road inspection	20.00	20.00	Key Personnel	35.89	36.74	Total	91.39	92.24
	Earlier	Revised																		
Firm	30.50	30.50																		
Work Plan & Methodology	5.00	5.00																		
Technology for road inspection	20.00	20.00																		
Key Personnel	35.89	36.74																		
Total	91.39	92.24																		
B.	M/s FP Project Management in association with Translink Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd																			
1.	Evaluation Criteria for Assessment of Experience of the Firm Sl. no. 4: Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7	The representation of bidder was examined. It is to mention that in the project claimed at Sr. No. 1in																		

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply
	years 2 project 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4 marks Or 1 project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks. NHAI- Evaluation marks- 4.25 Self - Evaluation marks- 4.75 The Evaluation committee had considered 2 Nos. of project of the firm under S.N. 4 sub criteria for Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR. However, we have worked on 3 Nos. of completed DPR project. The project experience certificates were enclosed on page no. 35 - 58 of our technical proposal. All our 3 nos. of projects are mentioned below: 1. Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for development of Economic Corridors, Inter Corridors, Feeder Routes and Coastal Roads to improve the efficiency of freight movement in India - "Mumbai - Kolkata Corridor (Stretch: Khambale - Sinnar - Pohegaon - Vaijpur - Aurangabad section and Mehkar - Sarangpur - Karanja - Vilegaon - Hiwra Budruk section of SH-171, SH-207, SH-212 and SH-199) (Pkg: Lot-1/ Maharashtra/ Pkg -1) (Project Length: 326 Km; 4 Lane) Mar 2017 -Dec 2017. Page no. 48-51 2. Consultancy Services for Project Management including preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of selected road stretches/ corridors from up-gradation of Two/Four lane with paved shoulder NH configuration under BHARATMALA project from Firozpur - Khema (Indo-Pak Border) - Bhikhiwind - Chabal Kalan - Amritsar (NH-3) - Ajnala - Ramdas - Dera Baba Nanak - Gurdaspur in the State of Punjab. (Length: 201.607 Km/ 2/4 Lane (29.768 Km/ 4 Lane & 171.839 Km/ 2 Lane); Experience Certificate Page No. 52-57 3. Consultancy Services for Carrying out Feasibility Study cum Detailed Project Preparation for Redesigning, Rehabilitation and Up-gradation to Four Lane configuration of new NH-709A Bhiwani-Mundal-Jind-Karnal road up to UP border in the State of Haryana. (Project Length: 221.40 Km/ 4 lane; May 2016 - (Substantially Completed) (Final DPR submitted on May 2017). Page no. 58 - 58. In view of the above, we request you to kindly consider the same.	bidder's representation, the client certificate mentions that the DPR work has been foreclosed at the Feasibility Stage. In view of above, the marks allotted to the bidder in this criterion shall remain unchanged.
C.	M/s Geo Designs & Research (P) Ltd	
	Reference your Technical Bid evaluation received, we submit our representation for re-assessment and re-evaluation of our	The representation of bidder has been examined. In this

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply
	Technical Bid as we have complied with the RFP criteria and pre-conditions and as per our self-evaluation, we're eligible for 97.58 marks, making us "Responsive", which are detailed below: At least one O&M Project under DBFOT / OMT /O&M of 4/6 laning** of 50%of project length We have completed 1 operation and maintenance project of 62.600 km (4 lane) which is more than the minimum 16.500 km required, making us eligible for full marks. Operation & Maintenance of Four laning of Ahmednagar Aurangabad Road SH-60 Section Vadala to Aurangabad Road km 162/000 to 224/600 (B.O.T.) Under Executive Engineer. World Bank Project Division, Ahmednagar in the State of Maharashtra. Length: 62.600 Km (Four Lane) Please Refer Page No.: 484-494 Therefore, as demonstrated above, we have complied with all the RFP criteria and pre-conditions, in our submitted Technical Proposal, so we request the Authority to kindly re-assess and re-evaluate our technical proposal, in light of the above representation. Considering our attached self-evaluation, we should be eligible for at least 97.58 marks, making us "Responsive".	regard, please refer to Note under para 8 (i) of Data Sheet of RFP (Pg. No. 24 of RFP), which mentions <i>"Experience of Consultant for having offered consultancy services to a private organization shall also be considered as relevant experience for current assignment, provided the experience is duly endorsed by the respective Government Agency."</i> It is to mention that in the project claimed in bidder's technical bid and representation, the completion certificate /experience is certified by a private client which is not endorsed by the respective government agency. In view of above, the representation of the bidder has not been considered, and the bidder shall remain Non-Responsive.
D	K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED	
	Team Leader cum Highway Engineer - Mr. Sandeep Oberoi Experience in similar capacity* in Highway Development Projects taken up under PPP 1 projects - 4 marks add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks Request you to kindly consider the experience in similar capacity against project no. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7 & 8 as per CV submitted in our Proposal. Considering the above fact, kindly provide 5 marks.	The experience claimed by the bidder for this CV in this category 2(iii) has been re-verified and no such project meeting the criteria of highway development project on PPP mode found. Therefore, there is no increase in marks.
	Bridge/Structural Engineer - Mr. Thota Muralidhar Experience in similar capacity in Design/Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Flyover/Interchanges/any other such structures including rehabilitation 1 Project -16 Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional Project subject to maximum 4(Four) marks Request you to kindly consider experience as similar capacity in Construction/ Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/	The experience claimed by the bidder for this CV in this category 2(ii) has been re-verified and marks are still same as no additional project found eligible in this category other than project no. 14 and 15 in similar capacity. Therefore, there is no increase in

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply
	any other structures including rehabilitation from Sept 2017 to Mar. 2021, July 2015 to Aug 2017, Jul 2011 to Jun 2015 & Feb 2008 to Jul 2008 (Project No. 1, 2, 3 & 5 as per CV submitted in our Proposal). He has more than 11 years of Experience in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges & Structures in Similar Capacity. Considering the above fact, Kindly provide additional 9.33 marks.	marks.
	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/ Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation of 4/6 lane highway/Expressway or similar projects. Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks. Request you to kindly consider the experience in similar capacity against project no. 1, 2, 3, & 5 as per CV submitted in our Proposal. Considering the above fact, kindly provide additional 3.33 marks.	The experience claimed by the bidder for this CV in this category 2(iii) has been re-verified and marks are still same as no additional project found eligible in this category other than project no. 14 and 15 in similar capacity. Therefore, there is no increase in marks.
E.	M/s MSV International Inc. in association with Manglam Infra Engineering Ltd	
	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer (Mr. Ramesh Chandra Shukla) Experience in similar capacity* in Highway Development Projects taken up under PPP We have already show cased the details of Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer. In this criteria required 2 Projects taken up under PPP and he has 02 project as given below: Project no. 17 Construction supervision of widening and strengthening of Banda Nareni Kalingar road from 2 lane to 4 lane in distt Banda UP: PPP Project; 01/01/2017 to 30/04/2021 59.87 Km, 4 Lane Designation – Superintending Engineer Project no. 18 Construction Supervision of four lane of 67.00 km with paved shoulder from Banda- Chitrkut Road Section in Uttar Pradesh: PPP Project; 01/01/2017 to 30/04/2021 Length – 67 Km, 4 Lane Designation – Superintending Engineer NHAI- Evaluation marks- 0 Self - Evaluation marks- 5	The bidder has claimed marks 5 out of 5 for Experience in this category for PPP Projects. The Project no.17 and 18 has been reviewed again and it is found that for Project no. 17, "Nil" has been Shown against the head of "Whether EPC or PPP or Hybrid Annuity Mode." On Infracon Portal. Also no supporting Documents attached for considering the project in PPP mode. Further, for Project No. 18 it is found that "EPC" has been Shown against the head of "Whether EPC or PPP or Hybrid Annuity Mode." On Infracon Portal. Also no supporting Documents attached for considering the project in PPP mode. Therefore there is no increase in marks.
F.	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt Ltd in JV with M/s Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s Aartav Engineering Pvt Ltd	
	The criteria in RFP states as "At least one O&M project	The representation of bidder

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply
	under DBFOT / OMT /O&M of 4/6 laning** of 50% of project Length." Please find the relevant experience certificates in the Technical Proposal (TP) on the specified page numbers as mentioned in the following paragraphs. M/S TASPL, as the lead partner, fulfills the criteria outlined in section 12 A (b) with an experience certificate required for eligibility criteria for the above concerned project. Kindly refer the experience certificate provided in TP (Technical Proposal) at page number 1230 M/s TASPL is the lead partner and have the required experience certificate fulfilling the criteria of section 12 A (b), which states 'At least one O&M project under DBFOT/OMT/O&M of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length' also as per section 12 B, "Lead partner and the JV partner both shall have experience of at least one project of eligible category". This is to clarify that our bid was submitted on 01/09/2023 and validity of the certificate was up to 26/09/2023. The same must be reconsider for qualifying criteria. Also eligible in accordance with the eligibility criteria of section 12 A, b. The details are mentioned as below- M/s MC Consulting Engineers Private Limited (Now TASPL) in JV with L.N Malviya Project Name- Consultant Services for operation & Maintenance stage of four laning of Lakhnadon-Seoni section from km. 547.400 to km. 596.750 of NH-7 under NHDP-IT on BOT (Annuity) basis in the state of Madhya Pradesh. Completion Date - 26.09.2016 Date till experience certificate is valid - 26.09.2023. Although the certificate indicates issuance date of 29.01.2015, it's important to note that the actual completion date, as stated in the certificate, is 26.09.2016. Therefore, it is requested to consider the firm's experience from the actual completion date." Length of project-49.75 km 4 lane, Since-M/s MC (now TASPL) is lead partner, thereafter it holds an experience of 29.85 km that is 60 percent of total project length. Whereas required experience as per 12 A b, is 50 percent of 33.308 km that is 16.654 km. Thereafter, Lead partner qualifies the mentioned criteria.	was examined. It is to mention that in the project claimed in bidder's representation, the client certificate has been issued before actual completion / substantial completion (90% progress) of the work. In view of above, the representation of the bidder has not been considered, and the bidder shall remain Non-Responsive.
G.	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in Association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd. Bridge/Structural Engineer (Mahaveer Boragall) It is gathered from the detailed Evaluation Sheets assessed at your level that instead of 19 marks, the Evaluation Committee of NHA has awarded 16 marks (3 marks less than self assessment) in item 2(ii) of Evaluation Sheet. In this context reference is invited at page 990 of the proposal (The Employment Record of Mr. Mahaveer Boragall). Experience in similar capacity in Construction / Construction Supervision of Bridge / Interchange /any other structures including rehabilitation	The experience was rechecked on INFRACON portal from Nov 2014 onwards again as claimed by the firm. However, there is '0' reported on Infracon Portal under the head of "No. of Bridges where rehabilitation and repair was done" except for project no.9 for period from 19.03.2018 to 30.06.2020.

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply																		
	<3 years -0, 3 years -16 Add one marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (Four) marks. March 2018 to July 2023 - 5 Years Nov. 2014 to Oct. 2015 - 1 Year NHAI- Evaluation marks- 84 Self - Evaluation marks- 87	Therefore, there is no change in marks.																		
	Road Safety Expert (Prem Chandra Sharma) CV of Road Safety Expert has been awarded 17.33 marks against 20, as assessed in self-Evaluation reasons to deduct 2.67 marks is not mentioned. It is further to stress that Mr. Prem Chandra Sharma proposed Road Safety Expert had carried out Road Safety Audit/Identified Accident Prone area and Black Spots on Border Roads during the period of Sept. 1997 to Mar. 2015. Refer Page 970 of proposals. He had also under gone Road Safety course for 15 days conducted by IABSE. You are requested to kindly consider the submitted documents and give due score to us by increasing 1.03 marks. NHAI- Evaluation marks- 73.33 Self - Evaluation marks- 91	As per the marking description mentioned in 2.(ii) category for RSE evaluation Table in RFP, only (4/6 lane) projects are to be considered, therefore there is no change in marks. As per the marking description mentioned in 2.(iii) category for RSE evaluation Table in RFP, Road safety audit is required specifically in 4/6 lane highway/expressway projects. However, after reviewing of projects it is seen that there is no such project for this CV. Therefore, there is no change in marks.																		
H	L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.*																			
	Some discrepancy was observed in the CV submitted by the bidder for the position of Team Leader cum Highway Engineer. Clarification regarding the same was sought from the bidder and the key personnel, to which the Key Personnel submitted that the mentioned discrepancy was a typographical error and the key personnel had already received corrected certificate from employee and had requested INFRACON to permit him to submit corrected details. (*Observation of evaluation committee)	Based on the submission of the bidder/ key personnel, the CV of the proposed Team Leader cum Highway Engineer was re-evaluated and the total marks awarded to the CV were revised from 91 (earlier) to (56). Accordingly, the revised score of the bidder is as follows: <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th><th>Earlier</th><th>Revised</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Firm</td><td>34.50</td><td>34.50</td></tr> <tr> <td>Work Plan & Methodology</td><td>5.00</td><td>5.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Technology for road inspection</td><td>20.00</td><td>20.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Key Personnel</td><td>36.50</td><td>30.55</td></tr> <tr> <td>Total</td><td>96.00</td><td>90.05</td></tr> </tbody> </table>		Earlier	Revised	Firm	34.50	34.50	Work Plan & Methodology	5.00	5.00	Technology for road inspection	20.00	20.00	Key Personnel	36.50	30.55	Total	96.00	90.05
	Earlier	Revised																		
Firm	34.50	34.50																		
Work Plan & Methodology	5.00	5.00																		
Technology for road inspection	20.00	20.00																		
Key Personnel	36.50	30.55																		
Total	96.00	90.05																		

Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by AJAY KUMAR SWAMI
Date: 2023.12.27 18:32:33 IST
Location: eProcurement System for Central PSUs