



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय - गांधीनगर (गुजरात)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India)

Regional Office - Gandhinagar (Gujarat)

दूरभाष / Phone : 079-29650607, 29650608 ई-मेल / e-mail : rogujarat@nhai.org

पहली मंजील, बी.एस.एन.एल. टेलीफोन एक्सचेंज बिल्डिंग, "च" रोड, सेक्टर-11, गांधीनगर-382011 (गुजरात)

1st Floor, BSNL Telephone Exchange Building, "CH" Road, Sector-11, Gandhinagar-382011(Gujarat)



NHAI/RO-GNR/NH-48/AE/Aslali-Dumad-Nar/2023/D-540

Date: 20.02.2024

To,

All Bidders

Sub: Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of (i) Construction and Operation & Maintenance of Long term measures for rectification of Accident Blackspots with Blackspots ID (1) Aslali Bypass - GJ 02-151, (2).Bidaj Patiya, GJ-02-219, (3). Vadala Junction GJ-02-214] on Ahmedabad - Vadodara section of NH-48 on EPC Basis (ii) Operation & Maintenance of Improvement Works at Dumad Junction at Merging of Ahmedabad Vadodara Section of NH-48, Ahmedabad Vadodara NE-1 & Sama-Savli Road (iii) Operation & Maintenance of Six-lane Motachiloda - Nanachiloda section of NH-48 from Km.540.595 to Km.555.905 in the State of Gujarat [Tender ID - 2023_NHAI_162319_1]" - Revised Evaluation of Technical Bids - Reg.

Ref: (i) Bids submitted on 31.08.2023 for the above-mentioned work.
(ii) This office letter No. NHAI/RO-GNR/NH-48/AE/Aslali-Dumad-Nar/2023/D-331 dated 02.02.2024

Sir,

Kindly refer NHAI letter dated 02.02.2024 vide which results of technical evaluation was intimated to the bidders and bidders were given opportunity to respond within seven days in case of any objection.

2. Representations were received from the following bidders within the stipulated 7 days' time:

- M/s Geo Designs & Research (P) Ltd.
- M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd.
- M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s Manglam Infra & Engineering Ltd.

3. The representations submitted by the bidders have been examined and replies to the representations as approved by the competent authority are enclosed in Annexure-I.

4. Based on the deliberations, the Committee observed that after evaluation of the representations from the bidders, there are some changes in the technical evaluation of the firms. Summary of revised marks are as below:

Applicant No.	Name of Applicant	Original Technical Score	Final Technical Score	Rank (Technical)
1/7	M/s AICONS Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Almondz Global Infra-Consultant Limited in association with Torchbearer	95.63	95.63	5

Handwritten signature

Applicant No.	Name of Applicant	Original Technical Score	Final Technical Score	Rank (Technical)
2/7	M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Infinite Civil Solutions Private Limited in association with NU-Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	Non-Responsive	Non-Responsive	-
3/7	M/s Geo Designs & Research (P) Ltd.	88.04	88.04	6
4/7	M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd.	93.04	96.04	4
5/7	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in association with Intratech Civil Solutions and Consultant	96.68	96.68	2
6/7	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	97.87	97.87	1
7/7	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s Manglam Infra & Engineering Ltd.	96.64	96.64	3

5. The financial bids of technically responsive bidders will be opened at 1200 hrs on 22.02.2024 at Regional Office-Gandhinagar, Gujarat. Accordingly, the bidders may depute their representatives with authorization letter for attending the opening of financial bids.

यह सक्षम प्राधिकारी के अनुमोदन से प्रस्तुत है।


 (अजय कुमार स्वामी)
 उप-महाप्रबंधक (तकनीकी)
 क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय-
 गांधीनगर(गुजरात)

Replies to Bidders' Representations

Sub: Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of (i) Construction and Operation & Maintenance of Long term measures for rectification of Accident Blackspots with Blackspots ID (1) Aslali Bypass - GJ 02-151, (2). Bidaj Patiya, GJ-02-219, (3). Vadala Junction GJ-02-214] on Ahmedabad - Vadodara section of NH-48 on EPC Basis (ii) Operation & Maintenance of Improvement Works at Dumad Junction at Merging of Ahmedabad Vadodara Section of NH-48, Ahmedabad Vadodara NE-1 & Sama-Savli Road (iii) Operation & Maintenance of Six-lane Motachiloda - Nanachiloda section of NH-48 from Km.540.595 to Km.555.905 in the State of Gujarat [Tender ID - 2023_NHAI_162319_1]

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply												
A.	M/s Geo Designs & Research (P) Ltd.													
(i)	Reference your Technical Bid evaluation received, we submit our representation for re-assessment and re-evaluation of our Technical Bid as we have complied with the RFP criteria and pre-conditions and as per our self-evaluation, we're eligible for 96.90 marks, making us "Responsive", which are detailed below: As Per RFP Clause Appendix-EC Evaluation Criteria for Assessment of Experience in use of Technology for road inspection. We have more than 5 Retro Reflectometer projects & Own Equipment, which is more than the minimum 3 projects required, making us eligible for full marks.	In view of representation submitted by the bidder, the the submission of the bidder was reviewed based on RFP criteria. Note 'A' below the clause 10 (ii) of Data Sheet in RFP (Pg 27 of RFP) states "<i>The experience of a firm / associate firm for a private concessionaire / contractor shall not be considered</i>". Considering this, the original evaluation has been found in order. Hence, marks awarded in the mentioned criteria shall remain unchanged.												
(ii)	Our proposed Team of Key Personnel are fully complying with the RFP criteria on experience and qualifications and the same has been demonstrated in the self-evaluation Form attached with the Technical Bid, where we have scored 36.90 marks, as shown briefly below: We would like to draw your kind attention to the evaluation of the Technical Proposal for the subject project. We have carefully reviewed the evaluation sheets and would like to share our observations with you. As per the Evaluation sheet we have got 2.86 marks less as per the proposed marking of key personnel's. The detail description of difference in markings has been mentioned below.	The evaluation of the said CVs were reviewed in view of representation submitted by the bidder. The original evaluation has been found in order wrt RFP criteria and the submission of the bidder. Hence, marks awarded to the mentioned CVs shall remain unchanged.												
<table><tr><th>S No</th><th>Description</th><th>Max Marks</th><th>Awarded Marks</th><th>Claimed marks</th><th>Marks Difference</th></tr><tr><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr></table>			S No	Description	Max Marks	Awarded Marks	Claimed marks	Marks Difference						
S No	Description	Max Marks	Awarded Marks	Claimed marks	Marks Difference									

S. No.	Firm's Representation						Committee's Reply
	1	Team Leader Cum Senior Bridge Engineer	12	10.80	10.92	0.12	
	2	Resident cum Highway Engineer	06	3.78	5.46	1.68	
	3	Bridge/Structural Engineer	06	5.30	5.46	0.16	
	4	Senior Pavement Specialist	06	5.58	5.76	0.18	
	5	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	06	5.46	5.46	0.00	
	6	Road safety Expert	04	3.12	3.84	0.72	
	Total		40	34.04	36.90	2.86	
B.	M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd						
(i)	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection (a) Experience of 1-2 projects - 1 mark (b) Experience of 3-5 projects - 2 mark (c) Experience of >5 projects - 3 mark Under evaluation, out of 3 marks, 1 mark has been allocated. We would like to bring to your kind notice that we have executed the MOU with Indian Road Survey & Management Pvt. Ltd for Network Survey Vehicle (NSV). MOU, Letter of Association and copy of invoice enclosed at Page No. 385 to 390 submitted in our Proposal. The firm has experience in the use of NSV for more than 18 Projects (11 Projects executed by K&J and 7 Projects executed by IRSM (Associate Partner). The experience certificate issued/authenticated by the concerned competent Government Department already submitted with our proposal at Page No. 408 to 443. Considering the above, kindly provide additional 2 marks.						In view of representation submitted by the bidder, the the submission of the bidder was reviewed based on RFP criteria. The representation of the bidder has been accepted. Hence, the marks awarded for this criterion are revised from 1 (earlier) to 3.
(ii)	Experience in retro reflectometer technology (a) Experience of 1-3 projects - 1 mark (b) Experience of >3 projects - 2 mark Under evaluation, out of 2 marks, 1 mark has been allocated. We would like to bring to your kind notice that the K&J has owned Retro Reflectometer Unit. The invoice copy enclosed at Page No. 404 to 407 submitted in our proposal. The firm has experience in the use of Retro reflectometer technology for more than 8 Projects. The experience certificate issued/authenticated by the concerned competent Government Department already submitted with our proposal at Page No. 518 to 539 Considering above, kindly provide additional 1 mark.						In view of representation submitted by the bidder, the the submission of the bidder was reviewed based on RFP criteria. The representation of the bidder has been accepted. Hence, the marks awarded for this criterion are revised from 1 (earlier) to 2.

82

[Signature]

215/21

[Signature]

[Signature]

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply															
(iii)	Resident cum Highway Engineer - Mr. Deepak Kumar Shivvedi Post-Graduation in Transportation/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering/geotechnical engineering -04 marks Out of 4 marks, 0 marks have been allocated Request you to kindly consider his education certificate of Masters in Construction Tech. & Management mentioned on Page No. 602 to 603 of the Technical proposal. Considering the above fact, kindly provide 4 marks.	As per the criteria of RFP, Post-Graduation in Transportation/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering/geotechnical engineering is required. Hence, marks awarded for this criterion shall remain unchanged. The total marks of the firm are revised as per below: <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th><th>Earlier</th><th>Revised</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Firm</td><td>40.00</td><td>40.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Technology for road inspection</td><td>17.00</td><td>20.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>Key Personnel</td><td>36.04</td><td>36.04</td></tr> <tr> <td>Total</td><td>93.04</td><td>96.04</td></tr> </tbody> </table>		Earlier	Revised	Firm	40.00	40.00	Technology for road inspection	17.00	20.00	Key Personnel	36.04	36.04	Total	93.04	96.04
	Earlier	Revised															
Firm	40.00	40.00															
Technology for road inspection	17.00	20.00															
Key Personnel	36.04	36.04															
Total	93.04	96.04															
C.	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s Manglam Infra & Engineering Ltd.																
(i)	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer (Mr. Ajay Dixit) is scored 94 marks but our observation as under: - Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation and Maintenance of Major Highway (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above). 1 project - 4 marks; Add 1 mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 (one) mark. Project No. 3 Project Name - Operation and Maintenance and Reconstruction for 2/4 Lane Karim Nagar to Warangal State Highway No (1-A) in the state of Andhra Pradesh, Length: 60 km 2/4 Lane. Client: R&B, Government of Andhra Pradesh. Duration- 05/11/1998 to 30/12/2000 Designation - Project Manager Nature of Assignment - O&M Project No. 17 Project Name - Independent Engineer Services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 6-Lanning Project of Etawah (Km. 323.475) to Chakeri (Km. 483.687) Section of NH-2 (New NH-19) on DBFOT basis under NHDP Phase-V in the State of Uttar Pradesh. Duration- 24/10/2019 to 09/07/2020 Designation - Senior Engineer (Project Co-ordinator). Nature of Assignment - O&M	The evaluation of the said CV were reviewed in view of representation submitted by the bidder. The original evaluation has been found in order with respect to RFP criteria and the submission of the bidder. Hence, marks awarded to the mentioned CV shall remain unchanged.															

82

[Signature]
21/5/21

[Signature]

[Signature]

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply
(ii)	Senior Quality cum Material Expert (Mr. Binod Kumar Thakur) is scored 91 marks but our observation as under: Post Graduation in Geotechnical Engineering/ Foundation Engineering/ Soil Mechanics/ Rock Mechanics We have already showcased the details of the Senior Quality cum Material Expert. He has done Master in Engineering (Material) from EIMSR, Govt. of Delhi on Regular Basis. As per the government rules distance or an online learning get same value as per the regular learning. As per a guideline, UGC / DEB / 2013, dated 14/10/2013, any degree obtained from an open or distance learning institution will be equivalent to a traditional university or educational institution. Assessed by client- 0 out of 4; as per our assessment - 4 out of 4	Please refer to Supreme court Order dated 03.11.2017 in the case Orissa Lift Irrigation Corp. Ltd. v/s Rabi Sankar Patro wherein the Supreme court has quoted the stand of AICTE that conferral of degrees in Engineering through distance education mode is not approved. The apex court gave one time relaxation to the candidates enrolled during the academic years 2001-2005 by appearing in test conducted by AICTE; failing which their degrees shall stand suspended and withdrawn. Further, the court stated in the order dated 22.01.2018: <i>"The facts still remain that conferral of degrees in Engineering through distance education mode was never approved in principle by AICTE and the Study Centres were never inspected or approved. We therefore reject the submission of Mr. Anupam Lal Das, learned Advocate."</i> Further, the mentioned institute is not an AICTE approved Institute for providing Engineering courses as per AICTE website. Hence, marks awarded to the mentioned CV shall remain unchanged.

82

[Signature]
21/01/20

[Signature]

[Signature]

Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by AJAY KUMAR SWAMI
Date: 2024.02.20 19:16:28 +05'30
Location: eProcurement System for Central PSUs

