



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways, Government of India)



क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय : 4 थी मंजिल, एमटीएनएल टी.ई. बिल्डिंग, प्लॉट नं-22, सेक्टर-11, सीबीडी बेलापुर, नवी मुंबई - 400614.

Regional Office : 4th Floor, MTNL T. E. Building, Plot No. 22, Sector-11, CBD Belapur, Navi Mumbai- 400 614

दूरभाष / Tel.: 022-2756 4100 / 8200, 022-2087 6412 / 6411, E-mail : romumbai@nhai.org, Website : http://www.nhai.gov.in

NHAI/RO/MUM/A*Nagar/SC/NH-222/RTE/2023-24/

791

Date: 22.08.2023

To

All Bidders.

Sub.: Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant (SC) for Operation & Maintenance from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101/000 to Km 161/570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161/570 to Km 211/000 & from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH-211 Km 284/000 to Km 337/000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH-222 (New NH-61) in the state of Maharashtra - **Final outcome of Technical Evaluation of bids - Reg.**

Ref.:

1. NIT no. NHAI/RO/MUM/A*Nagar/NH-61/SC/O&M/2023-24/2 dated 03.05.2023.
2. RO-Mumbai letter no. 741 dated 11.08.2023.

Based on the representations received from the Responsive bidder(s), the Evaluation Committee has reviewed the technical outcome published vide this office letter no. 741 dated 11.08.2023. Accordingly, the Final outcome of Technical Evaluation is detailed below:

Bid No.	Name of the Bidders	Final Technical Score
1/5	M/s L. N. Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	97.20*
2/5	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. in association with MAPS Global Civiltech Pvt. Ltd.	79.11**
3/5	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Upham International Corporation and in association with CDF Infra Con Pvt. Ltd.	97.28
4/5	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited	96.41
5/5	M/s MSV International Inc. in association with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd	97.11

Note:

* In respect of "Quality of approach and methodology" category, Evaluation Committee has re-evaluated the marks awarded to bidder and found that marks are awarded as per RFP provisions and there is no change. Further, in respect of "Qualification and competence of the key staff for the assignment" category, the lesser marks due to inadvertent error are now corrected.

** The representation made by bidder is examined by Evaluation Committee and it is found that proposed TL i.e. M. Ram Mohan Rao was debarred by NHAI HQ vide letter dated 16.06.2023. However, the date of submission of bid by the bidder is 19.06.2023. Therefore, Evaluation Committee recommended not to consider the representation of bidder. The CV of said Key Personnel is awarded Zero marks.

2. Further, the opening of financial bid is scheduled on 23.08.2023 (15:00 Hrs. onwards, if possible).
3. This is for your kind information and necessary action please.

A. S. Rathore
22/08/23

(D. S. Rathore)
Manager (Tech)

Regional Office - Mumbai

Copy to:

1. CGM(T), NHAI HQ, Mah. Div. - for kind information please.
2. PD PIU Ahmednagar - for information.

Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant during Oand M phase from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101 000 to Km 161 570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161 570 to Km 211 000 and from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH 211 Km 284 000 to Km 337 000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH 61 in the state of Maharashtra.

Application No.	Name of Applicant	Infracon ID
1/5	M/s L N MALVIYA INFRA PROJECTS PVT. LTD.	2023-703-16497_3643
2/5	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. in association with MAPS Global Civiltech Pvt. Ltd.	2023-703-176_9655
3/5	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Upham International Corporation and in association with CDF Infra Con Pvt. Ltd.	2023-703-364_2953
4/5	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited	2023-703-674_2462
5/5	M/s MSV International Inc. in association with STERLING INDO TECH CONSULTANTS P LTD	2023-703-806_9187

Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant during Oand M phase from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101 000 to Km 161 570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161 570 to Km 211 000 and from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH 211 Km 284 000 to Km 337 000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH 61 in the state of Maharashtra.								
			Annual average turnover	Minimum Eligibility Criteria as per RFP				
Experience of the firm in last 7 years			Annual average turnover for last 5 years of the firm should be equal to or more than Rs.2.5 Crores.	The firm should have prepared DPR/FS cum PPR for at least two projectsof 4/6 laning** of 30% (20.43 km) of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50%(34.04 km) of project length.	The firm should have experience of Project Supervision/IE of a. At least two construction projects of four/six laning** of 30% of project length each (20.43 km) or one projectof 4/6laning of 50% (34.04 Km) of project length and At least one O&M project under DBFOT/OMT/ O & M of four/six laning** of 50% (34.04 Km) of project length.	Requirements with respect to Technical Capacity Provisions for maximum works to be permitted with one Consultant	Whether firm is debbared /blacklisted during the bidding process	Whether eligible for detailed evaluation
Application No.	Name of Firm	Sole/JV/Association						
1/5	M/s L. N. Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	Sole	Yes (Rs. 180.47 Cr)	Yes (Proportionate Length as per fee received L=309.08 Km 4/6L, Pg.168)	Yes (Proportionate Length as per fee received L= 85.72 Km,4-L 2. O&M: L=93 Km, Pg.221)	Yes	No	Eligible
2/5	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd.	Association with MAPS Global Civiltech Pvt. Ltd.	Yes (Rs. 75.17 Cr)	Yes (Proportionate Length as per fee received L=68.39 Km(60% Fee received) 2L, Pg.164 and Proportionate Length as per fee received L=50.943 Km(60% Fee received) 4L,)	Yes (Proportionate Length as per fee received L= 52.83 Km,4-L, Pg. 79 & L=56.00 Km Pg. 87) 2. O&M: L=128.35 Km, Pg.369)	Yes	No	Eligible
3/5	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	JV with Upham International Corporation and in association with CDF Infra Con Pvt. Ltd.	Yes (Rs. 125.82 Cr and Rs. 32.38)	Yes (Proportionate Length as per fee received L=281.745 Km 4L, Pg.296) & (Proportionate Length as per fee received L=129.5 Km 6L, Pg.618)	Yes (Proportionate Length as per fee received L= 107.15 Km,6-L, 2. O&M: L=116.101 Km, & (Proportionate Length as per fee received L= 64.75 Km,6-L Pg. 584 & 2. O&M: L=116.101 Km,	Yes	No	Eligible
4/5	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited	Association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited	Yes (Rs. 182.45 Cr)	Yes (Proportionate Length as per fee received L=152.543 Km, 4L, Pg.388)	Yes (Proportionate Length as per fee received L= 72.644 Km,6-L, Pg. 55 & L= 76.064 Km,4-L, Pg. 59 2. O&M: L=128.065 Km, Pg.523)	Yes	No	Eligible
5/5	M/s MSV International Inc	Association with Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	Yes (Rs. 144.17 Cr)	Yes (Proportionate Length as per fee received: , L=101.7 Km 4L, Pg.287)	Yes (Proportionate Length as per fee received L= 100.79 Km,4-L, Pg. 165 2. O&M: L=102.745 Km, Pg.453)	Yes	No	Eligible

Note:-
1.Similar project means 2/4/6 lane as applicable for the project for which RFP is invited. For 2-lane projects experience of 4/6 lane also to be considered with a multiplication factor of 1.5. Experience of 4/6 lane shall be considered interchangeably for 4/6 laning projects. For 4/6 laning projects, experience of 2 lane will be considered with a multiplication factor of 0.4, but only for those 2 lane projects whose cost of consultancy services was more than Rs.3.0 crores.
2. The JV share of the firms has been taken as per actual MOU certificate(MOU for sharing of payment or transfer of fund is not considered as valid Document),In absence of clear demarcation of JV share in client certificate, the weightage has been treated as 60 % for lead partner and 40% for minor partner.

Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant during Oand M phase from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101 000 to Km 161 570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161 570 to Km 211 000 and from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH 211 Km 284 000 to Km 337 000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH 61 in the state of Maharashtra.																	
A1: Relevant Experience for the Assignment (35 M)																	
Sr. No.	Description	Maximum Marks	M/s L N MALVIYA INFRA PROJECTS PVT. LTD.			M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. in association with MAPS Global Civiltech Pvt. Ltd.			M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Upham International Corporation and in association with CDF Infra Con Pvt. Ltd.			M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited			M/s MSV International Inc. in association with STERLING INDO TECH CONSULTANTS P LTD		
			Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation
1	Year of Establishment of the Firm (In case of JV year of establishment of Lead Member shall be considered) (Min 5 years) For 5 years - 1.5 marks More than 5 years - 2 marks	2	2	Yr 2002 (Pg.64)	2	2	Yr 2003 Infracon	2	2	Yr 2003 (Pg.25)	2	2	Yr 1998 (Pg.28)	2	2	Yr 2001 (Pg.17)	2
2	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years) from consultancy business (Min 5 Crore) For >50 Crores - 2 marks For 20-50 Crores- 1.5 marks For 10-20 Crores- 1 mark For 5-10 Crores- 0.5 mark	2	2	(Rs.179.26 Cr)	2	2	(Rs.75.06 Cr)	2	2	(Rs.115.42 & 39.18 Cr)	2	2	(Rs.158.56 Cr)	2	2	(Rs.125.96 Cr)	2
3	Numbers of key personnel with the firm more than one year with the firm. < 4 personnel - 0 marks 4 to 12 - Linearly varying from 0.25 to 2 > 12 personnel - 2 marks	2	2	150 No.	2	2	76 No	2	2	69& 43 No.	2	2	148 No.	2	2	208 No.	2
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years 2 project 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4 marks Or 1 project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1marks.	5	5	1. Sole, L=309.08 Km 4L (Pg.161) 2. Sole, L=1156.07 Km 4L (Pg.164) 3. Sole, L=186.36 Km 4L (Pg. 169) 4. Sole, L=139.8 Km 4L (Pg. 179) 5. Sole, L=170.80 Km 4L (Pg. 180)	5	5	1. JV, L=58.08 Km 4L (Pg. 188) 2. Sole, L=50.93 Km 4L (Pg. 159) 3. JV, L=68.39 Km 4L (Pg. 164) 4. Sole, L=59.2 Km 4L (Pg. 170) 5. Sole, L=65.52 Km 4L (Pg. 176)	5	5	1. Sole, L=281.745 Km 4L (Pg 296) 2. Sole, L=104.797 Km 4L (Pg. 300) 3. Sole L=94.16 Km 4L, Pg.303 4. Sole L=227 Km Pg. 312 5. Sole L=109 Km Pg. 323 No expirience of JV	5	5	1. Sole, L=79.45 Km 4L (Pg.383) 2. Sole, L=152.543 Km 4L, (Pg.386) 3. Sole, L=144.66 Km 4L (Pg. 400) 4. Sole L=50 Km 6L, Pg.392 5. Sole L=49.917 Km, Pg. 394 6. Sole, L=71.582 Km 4L (Pg.381)	5	5	1. Lead, L=75 Km 4L (Pg.287) 2. Lead, L=96.4 Km 4L, (Pg.293) 3. Lead, L=40.07 Km 4L (Pg. 299) 4. Sole L=69.68 Km 4L, Pg.307 5. Sole L=59.25 Km, Pg. 304	5
5	In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects For DPR project length > the length of project for which RFP invited -5 Marks For DPR project length > two times the length of project for which RFP invited -7.5 Marks For project length > three times the length of project for which RFP invited - 10 Marks	10	10	In hand NHAI DPR works (Length= 485.1 Km) > 3 times	10	10	In hand NHAI DPR works (Length= 430.455 Km) >2 times	10	10	In hand NHAI DPR works (Length= 485.1 Km) >3 times	10	10	In hand NHAI DPR works (Length > 3times	10	10	In hand NHAI DPR works (Length > 3times	10
6	Experience as Independent Engineer/Authority Engineer/ Supervision Consultant two construction projects of four/six laning ** of 30% of project length each or one project of four/six laning ** of 50% project length in last 7 years. 2 construction projects 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4marks Or 1 construction project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4marks Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 2 (two) mark.	6	6	1. JV, L=85.72 Km 4L (Pg. 80) 2. JV, L=50.04 Km 4L (Pg. 82) 3. JV, L=98.49 Km 4L (Pg. 84) 4. Sole, L=83.32 Km 6L (Pg. 87) 5. Sole, L=273 Km 4L (Pg. 97) 6. Sole, L= 80 Km 4L (Pg. 100)	6	6	1. Associate, L=52.83 Km 4L (Pg. 79) 2. Associate, L=56 Km 4L (Pg. 87) 3. Associate, L=101.56 Km 4L (Pg. 112) 4. Associate, L= 37.93 Km 4L (Pg 92) 5. Associate, L= 38.54 Km 4L (Pg 96)	6	6	1. Sole, L=90.99 Km 4L (Pg.220) 2. Sole, L=62.304 Km 4L, (Pg.224) 3. Sole, L=50.97 Km 4L (Pg. 286) 4. Sole L=73.155 Km 4L, Pg.258 5. Sole L=71.61 Km 4L, Pg.266	6	6	1. Sole, L=72.644 Km 4L (Pg.53) 2. Sole, L=76.064 Km 4L, (Pg.57) 3. Sole, L=68.259 Km 4L (Pg. 69) 4. Sole L=69.072 Km 4L, Pg.73 5.Sole L=80.2 Km 4L, Pg.83	6	6	1. Sole, L=54 Km 4L (Pg.150) 2. JV, L=48.04 Km 4L, (Pg.153) 3. Sole, L=88.47 Km 4L (Pg. 156) 4. Sole L=42.64 Km 4L, Pg.162 5.Sole L=123.454 Km 6L, Pg.165	6
7	Experience as Independent Engineer/Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFOT/OMT/O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years 1 project - 6 marks Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	8	8	1. Sole, L=485.45 Km 4L (Pg.243) 2. Sole, L=93 Km 4L (Pg.221) 3. Sole, L=101.59 Km 4L (Pg. 223) 4. Sole, L=132.31 Km 4L (Pg. 227) 5. Lead, L=128.6 Km 6L (Pg. 238)	8	8	1. JV, L=128.81 Km 4L (Pg. 369) 2. Lead, L=45.430 Km 4L (Pg. 350) 3. Lead, L=80 Km 4L (Pg. 351) 4. Lead, L=37.93 Km 4L (Pg. 350) 5. Lead, L=56 Km 4L (Pg. 350)	8	8	1. Sole, L=116.11 Km 4L (Pg.365) 2. Sole, L=217.35 Km 4L, (Pg.367) 3. Sole, L=84.78 Km 4L (Pg. 369) 4. Sole L=82.77 Km 4L, Pg.373 5. Sole L=113.41 Km 4L, Pg.375	8	8	1. Sole, L=128.065 Km 4L (Pg.521) 2. Sole, L=42.78 Km 4L, (Pg.529) 3. Sole, L=102.035 Km 4L (Pg. 536) 4. Sole L=81.8 Km 4L, Pg.549 5. Sole L=75.07 Km, Pg.552	8	8	1. Sole, L=66.725 Km 4L (Pg.456) 2. Sole, L=76 Km 4L, (Pg.464) 3. Sole, L=64.94 Km 4L (Pg. 469) 4. Sole L=83.655 Km 4L, Pg.473 5. Sole L=55.84 Km, Pg.476	8
Total		35	35		35	35		35	35		35	35		35	35		35

Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant during Oand M phase from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101 000 to Km 161 570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161 570 to Km 211 000 and from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH 211 Km 284 000 to Km 337 000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH 61 in the state of Maharashtra.

Evaluation Criteria for Adequacy of the Proposed work Plan and Methodology	
--	--

A2: Quality of approach & Methodology	
---------------------------------------	--

[illegible]

Total Marks	5	4.5	5	4.75	5	4.75	5	4.75	5	4.75	5
Note : With reference to bid submitted by M/s L. N. Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. and in respect of "Quality of approach and methodology" category, Evaluation Committee has re-evaluated the marks awarded to bidder and found that marks are awarded as per RFP provisions and there is no change.											

Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant during Oand M phase from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101 000 to Km 161 570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161 570 to Km 211 000 and from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH 211 Km 284 000 to Km 337 000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH 61 in the state of Maharashtra.

A3: Experience in use of technology for road inspection

[illegible]

Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant during Oand M phase from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101 000 to Km 161 570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161 570 to Km 211 000 and from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH 211 Km 284 000 to Km 337 000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH 61 in the state of Maharashtra.																	
Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.																	
Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer			M/s L N MALVIYA INFRA PROJECTS PVT. LTD.			M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. in association with MAPS Global Civiltech Pvt. Ltd.			M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Upham International Corporation and in association with CDF Infra Con Pvt. Ltd.			M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited			M/s MSV International Inc. in association with STERLING INDO TECH CONSULTANTS P LTD		
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Darshan Mathur			M. Ram Mohan Rao			Laxmikant Shridharrao Joshi			Piyush Yadav			Anupam Khare		
			Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation
1	General Qualification i. Graduate in Civil Engineering - 21marks ii. Post Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/ Highway stream of civil engineering-04 marks.	25 21 4	21 21 0	Infracon Infracon Infracon	21 21 0	0 0 0	The representation made by bidder is examined and it is found that proposed TL i.e. M. Ram Mohan Rao was debarred by NHAI HQ vide letter dated 16.06.2023. However, the date of submission of bid by the bidder is 19.06.2023. Therefore, CV of said Key Personnel is awarded Zero marks.	25 21 4	25 21 4	Infracon Infracon Infracon	25 21 4	21 21 0	Infracon Infracon Infracon	21 21 0	21 21 4	Infracon Infracon Infracon	25 21 4
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	70		70	0		65	70		70	70		70	70		70
a)	Professional Experiene in Highway Projects:																
i)	Total Highway Professional Experience < 10 years -0 10 years -22 Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	30	Infracon	30	0		30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30
ii)	Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M of completed 4/6 lane highway sections < 3 years -0 3 years -30 Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.	35	35	Infracon (S.N. 30,28,27,24,19,)	35	0		30	35	Infracon (S.N. 6-65)	35	35	Infracon S.N.9,8,7	35	35	Infracon (S.N. 12)	35
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in Highway Development Projects taken up under PPP 1 projects - 4 marks add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks	5	5	Infracon (S.N. 25,20)	5	0		5	5	Infracon (S.N. 6-65)	5	5	Infracon S.N.11,10	5	5	Infracon (S.N. 10, 8)	5
3	Employment with the Firm < 1 year -0 1 year -3 Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	5		5	0		0	0		0	0		0	0		0
	Total:	100	96		96	0		90	95		95	91		91	95		95
Note: *Similar Capacity includes the following positions i. On behalf ofConsultant: Team Leader/Resident Engineer (Construction Supervision/IE), ii. On behalf ofContractor: Project Manager (Construction/Construction Supervision), iii. In GovernmentOrganizations: Superintending Engineer (orequivalent)and above.																	
In case of experience on behalf of Consultant or Contractor, the experience shall be duly endorsed by the respective Government agency.In case of non-availability of endorsement from Govt. Agency, the experience uploaded on Infracon Portal will be taken into consideration. However, the key personnel/ bidder will be solely responsible for any fake information/ CV, which may result in debarment.																	

Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant during Oand M phase from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101 000 to Km 161 570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161 570 to Km 211 000 and from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH 211 Km 284 000 to Km 337 000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH 61 in the state of Maharashtra.

Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.

Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer -1		Name of firms															
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	M/s L N MALVIYA INFRA PROJECTS PVT. LTD.			M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. in association with MAPS Global Civiltech Pvt. Ltd.			M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Upham International Corporation and in association with CDF Infra Con Pvt. Ltd.			M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited			M/s MSV International Inc. in association with STERLING INDO TECH CONSULTANTS P LTD		
			Pandurang Kulkarni			A R Ananda Reddy			V B Bhale			Pramod Kumar			SUJIT DASGUPTA		
			Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation
1	General Qualification	25	21		21	21		21	21		21	21		21	21		25
	i Graduate in Civil Engineering- 21 marks	21	21		21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21
	ii. Post Graduation in Highway Engg.- 04 marks	4	0		0	0		0	0	Infracon	0	0		0	0	PG degree of Highway Engg. is required. However PG degree of structural engg is uploaded.	4
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	70		70	70		70	70		70	67.5		67.5	70		70
a)	Professional Experience																
i)	Experience in Highway works (inspection/design/construction/maintenance) <7 years -07years -22 Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30
ii)	Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature < 3 years -03 years -12 Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	15	15	Infracon S.N.17,16,15,	15	15	Infracon S.N.9-17	15	15	Infracon S.N.2-42	15	15	Infracon S.N.2&5	15	15	Infracon S.N.2,3,5,7,8	15
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/Expressways 1 project -20 Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.	25	25	Infracon S.N.17,16,15,	25	25	Infracon S.N.11,13, 15	25	25	Infracon S.N.2-42	25	22.5	Infracon S.N.5, 2,	22.5	25	Infracon S.N.7,2,3	25
3	Employment with the Firm < 1 year -01 year -3 Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	0		0	0		0	0		0	5		5	0		0
Total:		100	91		91	91		91	91		91	93.5		93.5	91		95

Note:
*Similar Capacity includes the following positions
i. On behalf ofConsultant: Highway Engineer/ Highway Maintenance Engineer/ Resident Engineer (Construction Supervision/IE)
ii. On behalf ofContractor: Highway Engineer / Project Manager (Construction/Construction Supervision)
iii. In GovernmentOrganizations: Executive Engineer (orequivalent)and above.
In case of experience on behalf of Consultant or Contractor, the experience shall be duly endorsed by the respective Government agency.In case of non-availability of endorsement from Govt. Agency, the experience uploaded on Infracon Portal will be taken into consideration. However, the key personnel/ bidder will be solely responsible for any fake information/ CV, which may result in debarment.

Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant during Oand M phase from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101 000 to Km 161 570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161 570 to Km 211 000 and from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH 211 Km 284 000 to Km 337 000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH 61 in the state of Maharashtra.

Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.

Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer -2		Name of firms															
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	M/s L N MALVIYA INFRA PROJECTS PVT. LTD.			M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. in association with MAPS Global Civiltech Pvt. Ltd.			M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Upham International Corporation and in association with CDF Infra Con Pvt. Ltd.			M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited			M/s MSV International Inc. in association with STERLING INDO TECH CONSULTANTS P LTD		
			K V K Ravi Kumar			santosh vitthal shinde			Santosh G. Londhe			sunil klumar singh			K. Muni Sreenivasulu		
			Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation
1	General Qualification	25	21		21	21		21	21		21	21		21	21		21
	i Graduate in Civil Engineering- 21 marks	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21
	ii. Post Graduation in Highway Engg.- 04 marks	4	0		0			0	0		0	0		0	0		0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	70		70	70		70	70		70	70		70	70		70
a)	Professional Experience																
i)	Experience in Highway works (inspection/design/construction/maintenance) <7 years -0 7years -22 Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30
ii)	Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature < 3 years -0 3 years -12 Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	15	15	Infracon S.N.8,5,4,3	15	15	Infracon S.N.4-10	15	15	Infracon S.N.13-14	15	15	Infracon S.N.3-13	15	15	Infracon S.N.3,4,5	15
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/Expressways 1 project -20 Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.	25	25	Infracon S.N.8,5,4,3	25	25	Infracon S.N.6-9	25	25	Infracon S.N.11-14	25	25	Infracon S.N.13,10,9	25	25	Infracon S.N.4,6,7	25
3	Employment with the Firm < 1 year -0 1 year -3 Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	0		0	0		0	3.5		3.5	0		0	0		0
Total:		100	91		91	91		91	94.5		94.5	91		91	91		91

Note:
*Similar Capacity includes the following positions
i. On behalf ofConsultant: Highway Engineer/ Highway Maintenance Engineer/ Resident Engineer (Construction Supervision/IE)
ii. On behalf ofContractor: Highway Engineer / Project Manager (Construction/Construction Supervision)
iii. In GovernmentOrganizations: Executive Engineer (orequivalent)and above.
In case of experience on behalf of Consultant or Contractor, the experience shall be duly endorsed by the respective Government agency.In case of non-availability of endorsement from Govt. Agency, the experience uploaded on Infracon Portal will be taken into consideration. However, the key personnel/ bidder will be solely responsible for any fake information/ CV, which may result in debarment.

Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant during Oand M phase from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101 000 to Km 161 570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161 570 to Km 211 000 and from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH 211 Km 284 000 to Km 337 000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH 61 in the state of Maharashtra.																	
Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.																	
Bridge/Structural Engineer																	
Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	M/s L N MALVIYA INFRA PROJECTS PVT. LTD.			M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. in association with MAPS Global Civiltech Pvt. Ltd.			M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Upham International Corporation and in association with CDF Infra Con Pvt. Ltd.			M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited			M/s MSV International Inc. in association with STERLING INDO TECH CONSULTANTS P LTD		
			Neelkanth Choubey			Ashutosh Sharan			Neeraj Kumar Pandey			Sanjaya Kumar Acharya			Netradipak Krushnarao Bodkhe		
			Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation
1	General Qualification	25	21		21	21		21	25		25	21		21	21		25
	Graduate in Civil Engineering - 21 marks	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21
	Post Graduation in Structural Engineering - 04 marks.	4	0			0											
				Infracon	0		Infracon	0	4		4	0		0	0	PG DEGREE OF STRUCTURAL ENGG. IS REQUIRED	4
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	70		70	70		70	70		70	69		70	70		70
i)	Total Professional Experience <7 years -0	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30
	7years -22 Add two mark extra for each additional completed year subject to maximum 8(eight) marks.																
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/ Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation < 3 years -0	20	20	Infracon S.N. 16,14,13,12, 9	20	20	Infracon S.N. 11,6,5,4	20	20	Infracon S.N.9,8,7,6, 5	20	20	Infracon S.N. 9,8,7,6,5	20	20	Infracon Sr. 18-20,15,14	20
	3 years -16 Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.																
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/ Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation of 4/6 lane highway/expressway or similar project. 1 Project -16	20	20	Infracon S.N. 16,14,13,12, 9	20	20	Infracon S.N. 11,6,5,4	20	20	Infracon S.N.9,8,7,6, 5	20	19	Infracon S.N. 11,8,7,5,	20	20	Infracon Sr. 18-20,15,14	20
	Add1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) mark																
3	Employment with the Firm < 1 year -0	5	5	Infracon	5	0		0	0		0	0		3	0		0
	1 year -3 Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks																
	Total:	100	96		96	91		91	95		95	90		94	91		95

*Similar Capacity includes the following positions

i. On behalf of Consultant: Bridge Engineer/ Bridge Design Engineer/ Structural Engineer

ii. On behalf of Contractor: Bridge Engineer/ Bridge Design Engineer/ Structural Engineer

iii. In Government Organizations: Executive Engineer (or equivalent) and above

In case of experience on behalf of Consultant or Contractor, the experience shall be duly endorsed by the respective Government agency. In case of non-availability of endorsement from Govt. Agency, the experience uploaded on Infracon Portal will be taken into consideration.

However, the key personnel/ bidder will be solely responsible for any fake information/ CV, which may result in debarment.

Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant during Oand M phase from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101 000 to Km 161 570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161 570 to Km 211 000 and from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH 211 Km 284 000 to Km 337 000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH 61 in the state of Maharashtra.																	
Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.																	
Road Safety Expert																	
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	M/s L N MALVIYA INFRA PROJECTS PVT. LTD.			M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. in association with MAPS Global Civiltech Pvt. Ltd.			M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Upham International Corporation and in association with CDF Infra Con Pvt. Ltd.			M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited			M/s MSV International Inc. in association with STERLING INDO TECH CONSULTANTS P LTD		
			Devansh Jain			Madhavi Mansing Shinde			Dr Sidde Gowda			Sunil Bhargava			Biswajit Jena		
		Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained	Reference	Self Evaluation	Marks obtained
1	Essential qualification: Minimum 15 days certification course on road safety audit from IAHE / IITs / NITs/ CRRI		Yes	Infracon	Yes	Yes	Infracon	Yes	Yes	Infracon	Yes	Yes	Infracon	Yes	Yes	Infracon	
2	General Qualification	25	21		21	21		21	21		21	21		21	25		25
	Graduate in Civil Engineering - 21 marks	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21	21	Infracon	21
	Post-Graduation in Traffic/Transportation/Safety Engineering- 04 marks	4	0		0	0		0	0		0	0		0	4	Infracon	4
3	Adequacy for the Project	70	68		70	70		70	70		70	70		70	70		70
i)	Total Professional Experience <7years -0 7years -22 Add two mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	28	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30	30	Infracon	30
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Works of Major Highway Projects (4/6 laning Projects) < 3years -0 3years -17 Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3(three) marks.	20	20	Infracon 1,3,4,5,6,8	20	20	Infracon S.N.2-9	20	20	Infracon S.N.13, 12, 11,10	20	20	Infracon S.N.44-30	20	20	Infracon S.N. 66,39,38,32	20
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audit of 4/6 lane highway/Expressway projects. 1 nos. -12 Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 3(three) marks.	15	15	Infracon 1,3,4,5,6,8	15	15	Infracon S.N.6,5,3,2	15	15	Infracon S.N.13, 12, 11,10	15	15	Infracon S.N.44-30	15	15	Infracon S.N. 66,39,38,32	15
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in preparation of Road Safety Management Plan for Inter Urban Highways 1project -3marks More than one project - 5 marks	5	5	Infracon 1,3,4,5,6,8	5	5	Infracon S.N.6,5,3,2	5	5	Infracon S.N.13, 12, 10	5	5	Infracon S.N.44-30	5	5	Infracon S.N.81,80	5
4	Employment with the Firm < 1 year - 0 1 year - 3 Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	5	Infracon	5	5		5	0		0	3	0	3.5	0		0
	Total:	100	94		96	96		96	91		91	94		94.5	95		95
Note: *Similar Capacity includes the following positions. (i) On behalf of Consultant: Road Safety Expert (Construction Supervision/IE), (ii) On behalf of Contractor: Road safety Expert (Construction/Construction Supervision), (iii) In Government Organizations: Executive Engineer (or equivalent) and above. In case of experience on behalf of Consultant or Contractor, the experience shall be duly endorsed by the respective Government agency. In case of non-availability of endorsement from Govt. Agency, the experience uploaded on Infracon Portal will be taken into consideration. However, the key personnel/ bidder will be solely responsible for any fake information/ CV, which may result in debarment.																	

Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant during Oand M phase from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101 000 to Km 161 570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161 570 to Km 211 000 and from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH 211 Km 284 000 to Km 337 000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH 61 in the state of Maharashtra.

Summary of Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment																						
S. N.	Description	Marks	M/s L N MALVIYA INFRA PROJECTS PVT. LTD.				M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. in association with MAPS Global Civiltech Pvt. Ltd.				M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Upham International Corporation and in association with CDF Infra Con Pvt. Ltd.				M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited				M/s MSV International Inc. in association with STERLING INDO TECH CONSULTANTS P LTD			
			Marks obtained		self assesed marks		Marks obtained		self assesed marks		Marks obtained		self assesed marks		Marks obtained		self assesed marks		Marks obtained		self assesed marks	
1	Team Leader cum Highway Engineer	19.00	96	18.24	96	18.24	0	0	90	17.1	95	18.05	95	18.05	91	17.29	91	17.29	95	18.05	95	18.05
2	Highway maintenance cum Resident Engineer - 1	6.00	91	5.46	91	5.46	91	5.46	91	5.46	91	5.46	91	5.46	93.5	5.61	93.5	5.61	91	5.46	95	5.7
	Highway maintenance cum Resident Engineer - 2	6.00	91	5.46	91	5.46	91	5.46	91	5.46	94.5	5.67	94.5	5.67	91	5.46	91	5.46	91	5.46	91	5.46
3	Road Safety Expert	5.00	94	4.7	96	4.8	96	4.8	96	4.8	91	4.55	91	4.55	94	4.7	94.5	4.725	95	4.75	95	4.75
4	Bridge/Structural Engineer	4.00	96	3.84	96	3.84	91	3.64	91	3.64	95	3.8	95	3.8	90	3.6	94	3.76	91	3.64	95	3.8
Total		40.00		37.70		37.80		19.36		36.46		37.53		37.53		36.66		36.85		37.36		37.76

Note : With reference to bid submitted by M/s L. N. Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. and in respect of “Qualification and competence of the key staff for the assignment” category, Evaluation Committee has re-evaluated the marks awarded to bidder and fthe lesser marks due to inadvertent error are now corrected.

Consultancy Services of Supervision Consultant during Oand M phase from Malshej Ghat to Ane Ghat Km 101 000 to Km 161 570, from end of Ane Ghat to Start of Ahmednagar Bypass Km 161 570 to Km 211 000 and from Kharwandi Kasar to Junction of NH 211 Km 284 000 to Km 337 000 of two lane with paved shoulder on NH 61 in the state of Maharashtra.

Summary of Marks											
Sr. no.	Name of Firm	Relevant Experience of Firm for the Assignment (A1)		Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology (A2)		Assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection (A3)		Qualification and relevant experience of the proposed key personnel		Total	
1	Max. Marks	35.00		5.00		20.00		40.00		100.00	
		Marks obtained	Marks self assessed	Marks obtained	Marks self assessed	Marks obtained	Marks self assessed	Marks obtained	Marks self assessed	Marks obtained	Marks self assessed
1	M/s L N MALVIYA INFRA PROJECTS PVT. LTD.	35.00	35.00	4.50	5.00	20.00	20.00	37.70	37.80	97.20	97.80
2	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. in association with MAPS Global Civiltech Pvt. Ltd.	35.00	35.00	4.75	5.00	20.00	20.00	19.36	36.46	79.11	96.46
3	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Upham International Corporation and in association with CDF Infra Con Pvt. Ltd.	35.00	35.00	4.75	5.00	20.00	20.00	37.53	37.53	97.28	97.53
4	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited	35.00	35.00	4.75	5.00	20.00	20.00	36.66	36.85	96.41	96.85
5	M/s MSV International Inc. in association with STERLING INDO TECH CONSULTANTS P LTD	35.00	35.00	4.75	5.00	20.00	20.00	37.36	37.76	97.11	97.76