



नेशनल हाइवेज लॉजिस्टिक्स मैनेजमेंट लिमिटेड
National Highways Logistics Management Limited

(A 100% owned SPV of NHAI)
(Under Ministry of Road Transport and Highways)



NHLML/Ropeways/Varanasi/IE/2022

Dated: 31.03.2023

To

All Bidders (As per list enclosed)

Sub: Independent Engineer services for Supervision of Development of Ropeways from Varanasi Cantt. to Godowlia Chowk in the State of Uttar Pradesh in Hybrid Annuity Mode - Result of Technical Evaluation - Reg.

Ref: Bids submitted on 13.03.2023 for the above-mentioned work.

This is with reference to the bids submitted on 13.03.2023 for the subject proposal.

A. First stage technical evaluation

NHLML vide letter dated 17.03.2023 requested clarification from the 03 bidders with an opportunity to respond within four days (i.e. upto 21.03.2022), in case of any objection.

2.1 The representations were received from below mentioned 03 bidders:

Applicant No.	Name of Applicant
1/3	M/s Ardanuy Ingineria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited
2/3	M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.
3/3	M/s Salzmann Ingenieure ZT GmbH in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd

2.2 The clarifications as received have been examined by the constituted Evaluation Committee and accepted by Competent Authority.

B. Summary of the Second Stage Technical Evaluation

3.1 The summary of technical evaluation with marks obtained by the 03 qualified firms is indicated below:

Bidder. No.	Name of Firm	Firm Score	Approach and Methodology	CV Score	Final Technical Score
	Maximum Marks	50.00	10.00	40.00	100.00
1/3	M/s Ardanuy Ingineria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited	46.00	10.00	34.33	90.33
2/3	M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee	40.00	10.00	35.61	85.61

Bidder. No.	Name of Firm	Firm Score	Approach and Methodology	CV Score	Final Technical Score
	Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.				
3/3	M/s Salzmann Ingenieure ZT Gmbh in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd	41.50	10.00	33.22	84.72

4. The detailed evaluation sheet for the responsive Bidders is enclosed herewith. Bidders are given opportunity to respond by 06.04.2023 upto 1700 Hrs, in case of any objection and to submit the requisite details/documents within this period.

Yours sincerely


(Ravinder)
COO NHLML

**Independent Engineer Services for Supervision of Development of Ropeways from Varanasi Cantt. to Godowlia Chowk in the State of
Uttar Pradesh on Hybrid Annuity Mode.**

Length of the project	3.85 Km
2 times of project length	7.7 Km
40% of the length of the project	1.54 Km
Cost of the Project (Rs. In Cr)	474
Annual T/O (3% of the cost of project) (Rs.in Cr)	14.220
Bid due Date	13.03.2023

Name of the Project		
Independent Engineer services for Supervision of Development of Ropeways from Varanasi Cantt. to Godowlia Chowk in the State of Uttar Pradesh in Hybrid Annuity Mode.		
Applicant No:-	Name of the Applicant	Status of the Applicant Sole/JV/ Association
1/3	M/s Ardanuy Ingenieria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited	JV/Associate
2/3	M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	JV
3/3	M/s Salzmänn Ingenieure ZT GmbH in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd	JV/Associate

Annexure-I

Independent Engineer services for Supervision of Development of Ropeways from Varanasi Cantt. to Godowlia Chowk in the State of Uttar Pradesh in Hybrid Annuity Mode.						
MINIMUM ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA as per 16(A) of RFP						
S.No.	Name of the Applicants	Preparation of DPR / Design / Feasibility Report	Project Supervision/ Independent Consultant / Independent Engineer		Annual Turnover	Whether the Applicant is Technical "Responsive" or "Non-Responsive"
		The firm should have minimum experience of preparation of Feasibility Study / Detailed Project Report of Passenger Cable-Propelled Transit systems, Metro / Railways Station Design, Inter-modal stations, Mega Bus Terminals / Airport Terminal Building with minimum building ground footprint of 5000m2 shall only be considered.	The firm should have minimum experience of Project Supervision / Independent Engineer of Passenger Cable-Propelled Transit systems for aggregate length of 2 times (i.e., 7.7 kms) the project length for MGD / bi-cable detachable gondola / 3S gondola system.	Firm should also have experience of Project Supervision / Independent Engineer / Authority Engineer of at least one Ropeway Project of MGD / bi-cable detachable gondola / 3S gondola Systems	Annual turnover (updated average of last 5 years) of the firm from consultancy business should be equal to or more than Rs. 14 Crore	
1/3	M/s Ardanuy Ingenieria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
2/3	M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
3/3	M/s Salzmänn Ingenieure ZT GmbH in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive

Annexure-I-"A"										
Name of the Project										
Independent Engineer services for Supervision of Development of Ropeways from Varanasi Cantt. to Godowlia Chowk in the State of Uttar Pradesh in Hybrid Annuity Mode.										
Annexure-II										
Average annual turnover from consultancy services										
		In Cr.								
Project Cost		474								
Required annual turnover		14.22								
3.75 marks		14.22								
4 marks		18.96								
4.25 marks		23.70								
4.5 marks		28.44								
4.75 marks		33.18								
5 marks		37.92								
S.No.	Name of Consultancy Firm/Entity (Sole Bidder/Bidder in JV)		Average annual turnover from consultancy services after following enhancement factor					Annual Average Turnover in Last 5 years 2017-18 to 2021- 22	Eligibility (>= 14 Crore)	Combined Annual Average Turnover
			2021-22	2020-21	2019-20	2018-19	2017-18			
1/3	M/s Ardanuy Ingenieria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited	Lead	119.22	74.42	46.64	42.39	38.67	64.27	Yes	161.39
		Other 1	130.55	113.92	101.82	79.87	59.43	97.12	Yes	
		Other 2						0.00	No	
2/3	M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	Lead	2.31	1.93	2.36	2.26	2.24	2.22	No	419.39
		Other 1	69.53	79.57	88.22	67.33	41.44	69.22	Yes	
		Other 2	382.78	332.09	340.75	378.09	306.06	347.95	Yes	
3/3	M/s Salzmann Ingenieure ZT Gmbh in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd	Lead	9.68	13.78	14.05	11.55	11.74	12.16	Yes	177.11
		Other 1	220.75	175.19	151.79	136.16	140.84	164.95	Yes	
		Other 2						0.00	No	

Annexure III								
Name of the Project								
Independent Engineer services for Supervision of Development of Ropeways from Varanasi Cantt. to Godowlia Chowk in the State of Uttar Pradesh in Hybrid Annuity Mode.								
FIRMS RELEVANT EXPERIENCE FOR THE ASSIGNMENT								
S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/3		2/3		3/3	
	Description		M/s Ardanuy Ingenieria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited		M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Salzmänn Ingenieure ZT GmbH in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd	
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	Average Annual Turnover (last five financial years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	< Rs. 14 Crore - 0 marks	0						
	= Rs. 14 Crore - 3 marks	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
	Add 1 (One) mark for every additional Rs. 3 Crore subject to a maximum 2 (Two) marks	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
2	Nos. of Cable Propelled Transit / Architecture Professionals with the firm* (Max No. of Architect shall be considered two for evaluation purposes)	10	10	10	6	10	10	10
	< 5	0						
	>= 5 and <= 10	6			6			
	> 10 and <= 15	8						
	> 15	10	10	10		10	10	10

The Cable Propelled Transit / Architecture professionals who possess a degree in Mechanical Engineering/ Electrical Engineering/ Civil Engineering/ Architecture and 8 years' experience and should have been employed with the firm for at least 3 months before bid due date. The current Employment Certificate showing date of joining shall be Submitted by the firm during bid submission.

* Required documents for all the Cable Propelled Transit / Architecture Professional shall be submitted along with a one-page summary: Name, Address, Phone Number, Aadhaar details and any other legal document.

3	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Authority Engineer/ Construction Supervision in Passenger Cable Propelled Transit for an aggregate length of 2 times the project length (7.7km) for MGD/ bi-cable detachable gondola/ 3S gondola system designed for 6 m/s speed in the last 10 years.	10	9	10	7.5	10	8.5	10
	< 7.7 km - 0 marks	0						
	= 7.7 km - 7.5 marks	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
	Add 0.5 (zero point five) mark for every additional 3 km subject to a maximum mark of 2.5 (Two Point Five) marks	2.5	1.5	2.5		2.5	1	2.5
4	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Authority Engineer/ Construction Supervision of Passenger Cable Propelled projects involving MGD/ bi-cable detachable gondola/ 3S detachable gondola system (each project shall have a minimum length of 1.5 kms) designed for 6 m/s speed in the last 10 years.	15	13	15	12	15	13	15
	= 2 Projects - 11 marks	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add 1 (One) mark for each additional project, to a maximum of 4 (Four) marks	4	2	4	1	4	2	4
5	Experience as Independent Engineer / Authority Engineer / Supervision Consultant in Passenger Cable Propelled Transit Projects for Urban Transportation	5	5	5	5	5	0	5
	= 1 Project - 5 marks	5	5	5	5	5	0	5

6	Experience in Preparation of DPR/ Feasibility Study related to Passenger Cable Propelled Transit System/ Metro/ Railways Station Design, Inter-modal stations, Mega Bus Terminals/ Airport Terminal Building with minimum building ground footprint of 5000m2 in the last 10 years.	5	4	5	4.5	5	5	5
	< 1 Project - 0 marks	0						
	= 1 Project - 3.5 marks	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5
	Add 0.5 (Zero Point Five) marks for each additional project, subject to a maximum mark of 1.5 (One Point Five) marks	1.5	0.5	1.5	1	1.5	1.5	1.5
		50	46	50	40	50	41.5	50

1

2

3

Name of the Project											
Independent Engineer services for Supervision of Development of Ropeways from Varanasi Cantt. to Godowlia Chowk in the State of Uttar Pradesh in Hybrid Annuity Mode.											
										Annexure-V	
Final Comparative Technical Evaluation Score.											
S. No.	Name of Bidder	Approach and Methodology		Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Total		Rank of the Firm	Whether the Technical Responsive Applicant/ Bidder Eligible for opening of Financial proposal**
		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed		
	Maximum marks	10	10	50	50	40	40	100	100		
1/3	M/s Ardanuy Ingenieria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited	10.00	10.00	50.00	46.00	37.70	34.33	97.70	90.33	1	Eligible
2/3	M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	10.00	10.00	50.00	40.00	38.08	35.61	98.08	85.61	2	Eligible
3/3	M/s Salzmann Ingenieure ZT Gmbh in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd	10.00	10.00	50.00	41.50	37.35	33.22	97.35	84.72	3	Eligible

Summary Sheet of CV's														
Independent Engineer services for Supervision of Development of Ropeways from Varanasi Cantt. to Godowlia Chowk in the State of Uttar Pradesh in Hybrid Annuity Mode.														
S. No.	Details	Total Marks	1/3				2/3				3/3			
			M/s Ardanuy Ingenieria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited				M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.				M/s Salzmänn Ingenieure ZT GmbH in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd			
			Name	Score	Claimed@40	Assessed @40	Name	Score	Claimed@40	Assessed @40	Name	Score	Claimed@40	Assessed @40
1	Team Leader cum Ropeway Expert	15	Ximena Garcia Forero	81	14.25	12.15	Gregorio Clemente Perez	89	15	13.35	Stephan Salzmänn	97	15	14.55
2	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	7	Asheesh Verma	84	6.37	5.88	Daniel Zapatero	90	6.72	6.3	Pramod K Ray	85	5.95	5.95
3	Senior Structural Engineer	8	Suryakant Singh	92.5	7.68	7.4	Jose Francisco Fernandez Ridocci	95	8	7.6	J.K. Singh	85	7.6	6.8
4	Senior Architect	6	Swapnil Nimbhorkar	85	5.4	5.1	Dheeraj Kumar Bhasme	82	4.92	4.92	Pratik Ranjan	42	5.28	2.52
5	Contract Specialist	4	Dipak Kumar	95	4	3.8	Palaniappan Manavalan	86	3.44	3.44	H.K. Sahu	85	3.52	3.4
		40			37.70	34.33			38.08	35.61			37.35	33.22

Team Leader cum Ropeway Expert								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/3		2/3		3/3	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Ardanuy Ingenieria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited		M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Salzmänn Ingenieure ZT GmbH in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd	
	Name of Key Personnel		Ximena Garcia Forero		Gregorio Clemente Perez		Stephan Salzmänn	
	Date of Birth of KP's		18/07/1972		01/08/1961		04/07/1967	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	20	20	20	25	25	25
i)	Graduation in Civil / Mechanical / Electrical Engineering	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
ii)	Minimum 3 months core certification on Cable Propelled Transit System by any Ropeway Public Authority	5	0	0	0	5	5	5
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
a)	Professional Experience	35						
i)	Total Professional Experience	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	< 18 years - 0 marks	0						
	= 18 years - 11 marks	15	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add 1 (One) mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (Four) marks		4	4	4	4	4	4
ii)	Experience in years handling Cable Propelled Transit Project	10	0	10	10	10	10	10
	< 10 years - 0 marks	0	0					
	= 10 years - 7 marks	7		7	7	7	7	7
	Add 1 (One) mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to additional maximum 3 (Three marks).	3		3	3	3	3	3

iii)	Experience in Construction / Construction Supervision of Passenger Cable Propelled Transit System of aggregate length 2 times the project length (i.e., 7.7 km)	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
	< 7.7 km - 0 marks	0						
	= 7.7 km - 7 marks	7	7	7	7	7	7	7
	Add 1 (One) mark extra for additional 2 km subject to additional maximum 3 (Three) marks	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
b)	Experience as Team Leader	30						
i)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in years in execution/ supervision/ Independent Engineer of Passenger Cable Transit System involving MGD/ bi-cable detachable gondola/ 3S gondola system with designed speed of at least 6 m/s.	10	9	10	9	10	8	10
	< 5 years - 0 marks	0						
	= 5 years - 7 marks	7	7	7	7	7	7	7
	Add 1 (One) mark extra for each additional year of experiences subject to maximum 3 (Three) marks	3	2	3	2	3	1	3
ii)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Construction/ Construction Supervision of Passenger Cable Propelled Transit Project of length 1.5km (for each project) of MGD/ bi-cable detachable gondola/ 3S gondola systems with designed speed of at least 6 m/s.	16	13	16	12	16	15	16
	< 2 projects - 0 marks	0						
	= 2 projects - 12 marks	12	12	12	12	12	12	12
	Add 1 (One) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum of 4 (Four) marks.	4	1	4		4	3	4
iii)	Experience as Team Leader or similar Capacity in operation and maintenance of Passenger Cable Propelled Transit Systems involving MGD/ bi-cable detachable gondola/ 3S gondola system.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	< 1 project - 0 marks	0					0	
	= 1 project - 3 marks	3			3			
	= 2 or more projects - 4 marks	4	4	4	1	4	4	4
c)	Experience in Preparation of DPR / Feasibility study related to Passenger Cable Propelled Transit System	5	5	5	4	5	5	5

	< 1 project - 0 marks	0					0	
	= 1 project - 4 marks	4			4			
	= 2 or more projects - 5 marks	5	5	5		5	5	5
3	Employment with the Firm	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	< 1 year - 0 marks	0						
	= 1 year - 3 marks	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to additional maximum 2 (Two) marks	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Total	100	81	95	89	100	97	100
	Weightage @ 40	15	12.15	14.25	13.35	15	14.55	15
				1		2		3

Senior Quality cum Material Expert								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/3		2/3		3/3	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Ardanuy Ingenieria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited		M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Salzmänn Ingenieure ZT GmbH in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd	
	Name of Key Personnel		Asheesh Verma		Daniel Zapatero		Pramod K Ray	
	Date of Birth of KP's		31/01/1970		25/03/1979		12/08/1974	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	21	21
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
ii)	Postgraduate in Geotechnical Engineering/ Foundation Engineering/ Soil Mechanics/ Rock Mechanics	4	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
i)	Total Professional Experience	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	< 15 years - 0 marks	0						
	= 15 years - 12 marks	12	12	12	12	12	12	12
	Add 1 (One) mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (Three) marks	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
ii)	Experience as Senior Quality cum Material Expert or similar capacity in years in Construction/ Construction Supervision of any large-scale infrastructure projects	25	19	25	25	25	25	25
	< 05 years - 0 marks	0						
	= 05 years - 19 marks	19	19	19	19	19	19	19
	Add 2 (Two) marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks	6		6	6	6	6	6

iii)	Experience as Senior Quality cum Material Expert or similar capacity in handling works related to Quality of Station / Building (having a min building ground footprint of 5000 m2) / Airport / Transmission Towers / Passenger Cable Propelled Transit Systems.	25	25	25	19	25	19	19
	< 3 projects - 0 marks	0						
	= 3 projects - 19 marks	19	19	19	19	19	19	19
	Add 2 (Two) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks	6	6	6		6		
iv)	Experience in Preparation of DPR / Feasibility study / Safety Audit of large-scale infrastructure project.	5	4	5	5	5	5	5
	< 1 project - 0 marks	0						
	= 1 Project - 4 marks	4	4					
	= 2 or more projects - 5 marks	5		5	5	5	5	5
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	5	5	0	0
	< 1 year - 0 marks	0	0	0			0	0
	= 1 year - 3 marks	3			3	3		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to additional maximum 2 (Two) marks	2			2	2		
	Total	100	84	91	90	96	85	85
	Weightage @ 40	7	5.88	6.37	6.3	6.72	5.95	5.95
			1		2		3	

Senior Structural Engineer								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/3		2/3		3/3	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Ardanuy Ingenieria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited		M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Salzmänn Ingenieure ZT GmbH in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd	
	Name of Key Personnel		Suryakant Singh		Jose Francisco Fernandez Ridocci		J.K. Singh	
	Date of Birth of KP's		19/01/1963		12/09/1976		02/10/1966	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	25	25	25	25
i)	Graduation in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4	0		4	4	4	4
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
i)	Total Professional Experience	15	15	15	13	15	15	15
	< 15 years - 0 marks	0						
	= 15 years - 11 marks	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add 1 (One) mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (Four) marks	4	4	4	2	4	4	4
ii)	Experience as Structural Engineer/Expert in years in Feasibility / DPR / Construction / Supervision of bridges / Viaducts / Mega building (of min building ground footprint 5000 m2) / Extra High-Tension Transmission Towers / Passenger Cable Propelled Transit System	20	20	20	17	20	20	20
	< 5 years - 0 marks	0						
	= 5 years - 11 marks	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add 1 (One) mark extra for each additional year of experiences subject to maximum 9 (Nine) marks	9	9	9	6	9	9	9
iii)	Experience as Senior Structural Engineer or similar capacity in Construction / Construction Supervision of major bridges / viaducts / Mega Building (of min building ground footprint 5000 m2) / Extra High Tension Transmission Towers / Passenger Cable Propelled Transit System	25	25	25	25	25	25	25
	< 2 projects - 0 marks	0						
	= 2 projects - 19 marks	19	19	19	19	19	19	19
	Add 2 (Two) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks	6	6	6	6	6	6	6
iv)	Experience as Structural Engineer / Expert in Preparation of DPR / Feasibility study related to major bridges / viaducts / Mega Building (of min building ground footprint 5000 m2) / Extra High Tension Transmission Towers / Passenger Cable Propelled Transit System	10	7	10	10	10	0	10
	= 1 project - 7 marks	7	7	7	7	7	0	7

	Add 1 (One) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 3 (Three) marks	3		3	3	3		3
3	Employment with the Firm	5	4.5	5	5	5	0	0
	< 1 year - 0 marks	0					0	0
	= 1 year - 3 marks	3	3	3	3	3		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to additional maximum 2 (Two) marks	2	1.5	2	2	2		
	Total	100	92.5	96	95	100	85	95
	Weightage @ 40	8	7.4	7.68	7.6	8	6.8	7.6
			1	2	3			

Senior Architect								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/3		2/3		3/3	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Ardanuy Ingenieria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited		M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Salzmänn Ingenieure ZT GmbH in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd	
	Name of Key Personnel		Swapnil Nimbhorkar		Dheeraj Kumar Bhasme		Pratik Ranjan	
	Date of Birth of KP's		01/09/1979		20/06/1986		09/09/1981	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	20	20	20	20	20	20
i)	Graduation in Planning / Architecture	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
ii)	Post Graduation in Planning / Architecture	5	0		0		0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
i)	Total Professional Experience	15	15	15	12	12	14	15
	< 12 years - 0 marks	0						
	= 12 years - 12 marks	12	12	12	12	12	12	12
	Add 1 (One) mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks	3	3	3			2	3
ii)	Experience in years as Senior Architect in design / layout / façade / master planning / construction / Construction Supervision of malls, convention centre, Station Building / Airport Terminal Building (having a min building ground footprint of 5000 m2)	20	20	20	20	20	0	20
	< 8 years - 0 marks	0					0	
	= 8 years - 15 marks	15	15	15	15	15		15
	Add 2.5 (Two Point Five) marks extra for each additional year of experiences subject to maximum 5 (Five) marks	5	5	5	5	5		5
iii)	Experience as Architect in design / layout / façade / master planning / construction / Construction Supervision of malls, convention centre, Station Building / Airport Terminal Building (having a min building ground footprint of 5000 m2)	30	30	30	30	30	0	30
	< 05 projects - 0 marks	0					0	
	= 05 projects - 22 marks	22	22	22	22	22		22
	Add 2 (Two) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 8 (Eight) marks	8	8	8	8	8		8
iv)	Experience as an Architect in design / layout / Construction / Construction Supervision of Passenger Ropeway Stations	5	0	5	0	0	5	0
	= 1 Project – 5 marks	5	0	5	0	0	5	0
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	3	3
	< 1 year - 0 marks	0	0	0	0	0		
	= 1 year - 3 marks	3					3	3
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to additional maximum 2 (Two) marks	2						
	Total	100	85	90	82	82	42	88
	Weightage @ 40	6	5.1	5.4	4.92	4.92	2.52	5.28
			1		2		3	

Contract Specialist								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/3		2/3		3/3	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Ardanuy Ingenieria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited		M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Salzmänn Ingenieure ZT GmbH in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd	
	Name of Key Personnel		Dipak Kumar		Palaniappan Manavalan		H.K. Sahu	
	Date of Birth of KP's		31/05/1971		07/05/1963		08/07/1958	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	20	25	20	20	25	25
i)	Graduate in Civil / Mechanical / Electrical Engineering	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
ii)	Degree in Law	5	0	5	0	0	5	5
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
i)	Total Professional Experience	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	< 15 years - 0 marks	0						
	= 15 years - 12 marks	12	12	12	12	12	12	12
	Add 1 (One) mark for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (Three) marks	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
ii)	Experience in years as Contract Specialist	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	< 10 years - 0 marks	0						
	= 10 years - 13 marks	13	13	13	13	13	13	13
	Add 1 (One) mark for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 2 (Two) marks	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
iii)	Experience in years as Contract Specialist of large-scale infrastructure project	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	< 5 years - 0 marks	0						
	= 5 years - 12 marks	12	12	12	12	12	12	12
	Add 1 (One) mark for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (Three) marks	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
iv)	Experience in Contract Management of large-scale infrastructure project	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	< 3 projects - 0 marks	0						
	= 3 projects - 12 marks	12	12	12	12	12	12	12
	Add 1 (One) mark for each additional Project subject to maximum 3 (Three) marks	3	3	3	3	3	3	3

v)	Experience in Arbitration cases related to construction / PMC supervision of large-scale infrastructure project	10	10	10	6	6	0	0
	< 1 project - 0 marks	0						0
	= 1 project - 6 marks	6	6	6	6	6		
	Add 2 (Two) marks for each additional Project subject to maximum 4 (Four) marks	4	4	4				
3	Employment with the Firm	5	5	5	0	0	0	3
	< 1 year - 0 marks	0			0			
	= 1 year - 3 marks	3	3	3			0	3
	Add 0.5 (Zero Point Five) marks for each subsequent year subject to additional maximum 2 (Two) marks	2	2	2				
	Total	100	95	100	86	86	85	88
	Weightage @ 40	4	3.8	4	3.44	3.44	3.4	3.52
				1	2		2	

Name of the Project				
Independent Engineer services for Supervision of Development of Ropeways from Varanasi Cantt. to Godowlia Chowk in the State of Uttar Pradesh in Hybrid Annuity Mode.				
S.N o.	Applicant No.	1/3	2/3	3/3
	Key Position:	M/s Ardanuy Ingenieria S.A. in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd and in Association with Ardanuy India private Limited	M/s Ingenieria Y Control De Obras E Instalaciones S.L. in JV with Peyco Proyectos Estudios Y Construcciones S.A. and Aarvee Associates Architecture Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Salzmänn Ingenieure ZT GmbH in JV with Bernard Gruppe ZT GmbH and in Association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (India) Pvt Ltd
1	Team Leader cum Ropeway Expert	Ximena Garcia Forero	Gregorio Clemente Perez	Stephan Salzmänn
		18/07/1972	01/08/1961	04/07/1967
2	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	Asheesh Verma	Daniel Zapatero	Pramod K Ray
		31/01/1970	25/03/1979	12/08/1974
3	Senior Structural Engineer	Suryakant Singh	Jose Francisco Fernandez Ridocci	J.K. Singh
		19/01/1963	12/09/1976	02/10/1966
4	Senior Architect	Swapnil Nimbhorkar	Dheeraj Kumar Bhasme	Pratik Ranjan
		01/09/1979	20/06/1986	09/09/1981
5	Contract Specialist	Dipak Kumar	Palaniappan Manavalan	H.K. Sahu
		31/05/1971	07/05/1963	08/07/1958