



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण
(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय)
National Highways Authority of India
(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways)
जी-5 एवं 6, सेक्टर-10, द्वारका, नई दिल्ली-110075
G-5 & 6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110075

दूरभाष / Phone : 91-11-25074100/25074200
फैक्स / Fax : 91-11-25093507 / 25093514

NHAI/PC/Chandikhhol Paradip/IE/2022

Date: 26.09.2023

To,

All Bidders (As per list enclosed)

Subject: Consultancy Service for Independent Engineer Services for "Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole - Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH (O). **Technical Evaluation of Bids- Regarding**

Ref :- (i) Bids submitted on 21.03.2023 for the above mentioned work [Tender ID : 2023_NHAI_143351_1].

Dear Sir,

This is with reference to the Bids submitted on 21.03.2023 [Tender ID: 2023_NHAI_143351_1] for the subject proposal. The results with respect to Technical Evaluation as approved by the Competent Authority is as under:

A. First stage technical evaluation:-

(i) It was observed that the bidder M/s Bloom Companies LLC in JV with M/s Geo Designs and Research Private Limited and in association with M/s Sunnily Consultants Private Limited does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement per Clause 15 (B) of RFP *as the lead partner and JV partner fails to jointly meet the 1.20 times the eligibility criteria as mentioned at 1(a) of table in para 15 (A).*

Further, it was also observed that the other/JV partner (M/s Geo Designs and Research Private Limited) does not meet the requirement [the JV partner should fulfill atleast 40% of eligibility criteria as indicated at 1(a) of table in clause 15 (A) of RFP] as per Clause 15 (B) of RFP. *[w.r.t experience of preparation of DPR/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design report and experience of Project Supervision/IC, both].*

In view of above, the bidder "M/s Bloom Companies LLC in JV with M/s Geo Designs and Research Private Limited and in association with M/s Sunnily Consultants Private Limited" is considered as **non-responsive**.

(ii) It was observed that the bidder M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in associate with M/s Infinite Civil Solutions Private Limited does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement for *firm experience regarding preparation of Detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design as per clause 15(A), section-1 of RFP.*

In view of above, the bidder "M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in associate with M/s Infinite Civil Solutions Private Limited" is considered as **non-responsive**.

(iii) It was observed that the other/JV partner (M/s CMEC Consulting Engineers Private Limited) of the bidder M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Private Limited in JV with M/s CMEC Consulting Engineers Private Limited in association with M/s Upham International Corporation does not meet the requirement [the JV partner should fulfill atleast 40% of eligibility criteria as indicated at 1(a) of table in clause 15 (A) of RFP] as per Clause 15 (B) of RFP. [w.r.t *experience of preparation of DPR/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design report and experience of Project Supervision/IC, both*].

In view of above, the bidder “M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Private Limited in JV with M/s CMEC Consulting Engineers Private Limited in association with M/s Upham International Corporation” is considered as **non-responsive**.

(iv) It was observed that the bidder M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement for *firm experience regarding preparation of Detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design as per clause 15(A), section-1 of RFP*.

In view of above, the bidder “M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited” is considered as **non-responsive**.

(v) It was noted that NHIDCL vide letter no. NHIDCL/AE/R-J/2018/1879 Dated 06.04.2023 has declared the firm “M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s LTelford consulting engineer Pvt Ltd” as “non-Performer” and upon declaration of non-performer, the consultant will not be able to participate in any bids for National Highway Projects with MoRTH or any other executing agencies till such time the Non-Performer persists or the AE/IE/CSC/PMC is removed from the list of non-performers.

Further it was also observed that the bidder M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s Intratech Civil Solutions and Consultants does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement for *firm experience regarding project supervision/IC as per clause 15(A), section-1 of RFP*.

In view of above, the bidder “M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s Intratech Civil Solutions and Consultants” is considered as **non-responsive**.

(vii) It was observed that the remaining 6 bidders meet the minimum eligibility requirements defined in the RFP and hence, considered for second stage evaluation.

B. Second Stage Technical Evaluation:

(i) It was noted that the Key Personnel Sh. Dnyanoba Bilapate proposed as Senior Pavement Specialist by the bidder M/s TPF Engineering Private Limited in association with M/s MAV Associates LLP has been debarred/blacklisted by NHIDCL letter no. NHIDCL/Assam/AE/Numaligarh Jhanji/2021/2026 dated 10.01.2023, from participating in future projects of NHIDCL/MORTH for a period of 2 Year. The debarment order is before the bid due date of the subject work. Accordingly, Zero marks have been awarded to the Key Personnel.



(ii) The summary of the technical evaluation is as under:

(a) Technically Non-Responsive Bidders:

S. No.	Name of Firm	Result of Stage-I /II Evaluation	Remarks
1	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in JV with M/s Geo Designs and Research Private Limited and in association with M/s Sunnily Consultants Private Limited	Non-Responsive	The bidder does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement per Clause 15 (B) of RFP <i>as the lead partner and JV partner fails to jointly meet the 1.20 times the eligibility criteria as mentioned at 1(a) of table in para 15 (A).</i> Further, the other/JV partner (M/s Geo Designs and Research Private Limited) does not meet the requirement [the JV partner should fulfill atleast 40% of eligibility criteria as indicated at 1(a) of table in clause 15 (A) of RFP] as per Clause 15 (B) of RFP.
2	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in associate with M/s Infinite Civil Solutions Private Limited	Non-Responsive	The bidder does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement for firm experience regarding preparation of Detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design as per clause 15(A), section-1 of RFP
3	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Private Limited in JV with M/s CMEC Consulting Engineers Private Limited in association with M/s Upham International Corporation	Non-Responsive	The other/JV partner (M/s CMEC Consulting Engineers Private Limited) does not meet the requirement [the JV partner should fulfill atleast 40% of eligibility criteria as indicated at 1(a) of table in clause 15 (A) of RFP] as per Clause 15 (B) of RFP.
4	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited	Non-Responsive	The bidder does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement for firm experience regarding preparation of Detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design as per clause 15(A), section-1 of RFP
5	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s Intratech Civil Solutions and Consultants	Non-Responsive	The bidder is considered as non-responsive as the firm M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s LTelford consulting engineer Pvt Ltd has been declared as non-performer vide NHIDCL letter no. NHIDCL/AE/R-J/2018/1879 Dated 06.04.2023 and upon declaration of non-performer, the consultant will not be able to participate in any bids for National Highway Projects with MoRTH or any other executing agencies till such time the Non-Performer persists or the AE/IE/CSC/PMC is removed from the list of non-performers. Further, the bidder does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement for firm experience regarding project supervision/IC as per clause 15(A), section-1 of RFP

Bye

(b) Technically Responsive Bidders

S. No.	Name of Firm	Firm Score	Technology Score	CV Score	Final Technical Score
	Maximum Marks	40.00	20.00	40.00	100.00
1	M/s K & J Projects Private Limited in JV with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Private Limited	36.50	20.00	34.55	91.05
2	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Private Limited in association with M/s Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited	37.00	20.00	37.31	94.31
3	M/s MSV International Inc. in association with M/s D. N. Consultant	36.00	20.00	35.05	91.05
4	*M/s TPF Engineering Private Limited in association with M/s MAV Associates LLP	36.00	20.00	29.40	85.40
5	M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Private Limited	40.00	20.00	35.86	95.86
6	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers and M/s Consultants Private Limited	40.00	20.00	31.82	91.82

(*Note:- This is in pursuant of outcome of court case Writ petition 11893/2023 dated 05.09.2023 in the High Court of Delhi)

2. The detailed evaluation sheet for the responsive Bidders is enclosed herewith. Bidders are given opportunity to respond by 03.10.2023, in case of any objection and to submit the requisite details/document within this period.



(Asheesh Kumar Jain)
General Manager (T)-PC

Name of the Project		Annexure-B
Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).		
Length of the project (Km.)		76.646
List of the Applicants:-		
Applicant No:-	Name of the Applicant (M/s)	Status of the Applicant Sole/JV/ Association
1/11	Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in Association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd	Association
2/11	LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited	Association
3/11	TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP	Association
4/11	URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd	JV
5/11	K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED	JV
6/11	MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT	Association
7/11	M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. In Associate with M/s. INFINITE Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	Association
8/11	Bloom Companies LLC in Joint Venture with Geo Designs And Research (P) Ltd and in association with Sunnily Consultants Pvt. Ltd	JV/Association
9/11	HIGHWAY ENGINEERING CONSULTANT. in Association with Infratech Civil Solutions & Consultant	Association
10/11	Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	Sole
11/11	SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED In JV with CMEC CONSULTING ENGINEERS PVT. LTD. in Association with Upham International Corporation.	JV/Association

Name of the Project												
Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).												
Average annual turnover from consultancy services after following enhancement factor												
Estimated Project Cost (Rs. In Crore)			2957.88									
Required annual turnover			59.16									
									Annual Average Turnover in Last 5 years 2015-16 to 2019-20	Annual Turnover in each of preceding 2 years 2020-21 to 2021-22	Eligibility	
S.No.	Name of Consultancy Firm/Entity (Sole Bidder/Bidder in JV)		Annual Average Turnover					Lead Member			Other Member	Sole/ JV
			2021-22	2020-21	2019-20	2018-19	2017-18					
1/11	Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in Association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd	Association	171.60	163.53	140.55	119.27	102.22	139.43	163.53	Yes	-	Yes
2/11	LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited	Association	356.16	325.67	371.10	347.01	272.87	334.56	325.67	Yes	-	Yes
3/11	TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP	Association	72.87	68.06	89.72	59.12	45.55	67.06	68.06	Yes	-	Yes
4/11	URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd	Lead	82.87	78.25	99.44	114.48	98.39	94.69	78.25	Yes	-	Yes
		Other	62.79	50.63	51.31	50.87	26.39	48.40	50.63	-	Yes	
5/11	K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED	Lead	46.18	39.04	51.42	56.98	43.84	47.49	39.04	Yes	-	Yes
		Other	42.07	27.37	42.54	46.35	43.67	40.40	27.37	-	Yes	
6/11	MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT	Association	140.27	123.23	114.39	91.26	82.02	110.23	123.23	Yes	-	Yes
7/11	M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. In Associate with M/s. INFINITE Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	Association	75.06	63.39	48.73	56.11	43.38	57.33	63.39	Yes	-	No
8/11	Bloom Companies LLC in Joint Venture with Geo Designs And Research (P) Ltd and in association with Sunnily Consultants Pvt. Ltd	Lead	113.75	105.04	89.09	98.48	70.04	95.28	105.04	Yes	-	Yes
		Other	42.44	36.94	31.62	23.69	19.63	30.86	36.94	-	Yes	
9/11	HIGHWAY ENGINEERING CONSULTANT. in Association with Infratech Civil Solutions & Consultant	Association	61.33	63.99	71.13	71.37	54.74	64.51	61.33	Yes	-	Yes
10/11	Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	Sole	382.78	332.09	340.75	378.09	306.06	347.95	332.09	-	-	Yes
11/11	SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED In JV with CMEC CONSULTING ENGINEERS PVT. LTD. in Association with Upham International Corporation.	Lead	130.54	113.91	101.82	79.86	59.42	97.11	113.91	Yes	-	Yes
		Other	30.61	29.97	31.02	29.54	28.92	30.01	29.97	-	Yes	

Input cells

Minimum Eligibility Criteria w.r.t. Determination of Technical Capacity.

Sl. No.	Name of the Bidder	Type	(1) Average Consultancy Turnover (last 3 Years)	(2) Full time Key Professionals	Firm-1 (LM)						(8) Average Consultancy Turnover (last 3 Years)	(9) Full time Key Professionals	Firm-2 (OM)						(12) Total Ongoing Projects of NHAI	(14) Eligibility for new Projects (nos.)		(15) Share LM	(16) Share OM	(17) Weighted Average Consultancy Turnover (last 3 Years)	(18) Weighted Average Full time Key Professionals	JV						(24) Result for Remaining Capacity									
					(3) Max. no. of NHAI projects incl. ongoing at a time can be allotted			(5) Total Ongoing Projects of NHAI		(7) Eligibility for new Projects (nos.)			(10) Max. no. of NHAI projects incl. ongoing at a time can be allotted			(11) Total Ongoing Projects of NHAI										(19) Max. no. of NHAI projects incl. ongoing at a time can be allotted			(21) Weighted Average Total Ongoing Projects of NHAI		(23) Remaining Capacity for new Projects (nos.)										
					Total	DPR	IE/AE	DPR	IE/AE	DPR			IE/AE	Total	DPR	IE/AE	DPR	IE/AE								Total	DPR	IE/AE	Total	DPR	IE/AE			DPR	IE/AE	DPR	IE/AE	DPR	IE/AE	DPR	IE/AE
1	Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in Association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd	Association	158.56	75	40	40	30	9.00	9.40	22	21	45.55	23	6	6	4	2.65	5.10	0	0	60.00	40.00	113.36	54.20	25	25	18	6.46	7.68	11	10	Eligible	Eligible								
2	LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited	Association	350.98	64	40	40	30	2.00	23.00	15	7	0.00	0	0	0	0	0.00	0.00	0	0	100.00	0.00	350.98	64.00	40	40	30	2.00	23.00	15	7	Eligible	Eligible								
3	TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP	Association	76.88	59	25	25	18	2.80	9.70	13	8	34.25	0	0	0	0	0.00	1.80	0	0	100.00	0.00	76.88	59.00	25	25	18	2.80	9.70	13	8	Eligible	Eligible								
4	URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd	JV	86.85	60	40	40	30	5.45	0.00	35	30	54.91	61	25	25	18	0.75	11.25	13	7	60.00	40.00	74.07	60.40	40	40	30	3.57	4.50	32	26	Eligible	Eligible								
5	K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED	JV	45.55	37	12	12	9	2.65	5.10	4	4	37.33	56	25	25	18	0.00	6.86	18	11	51.00	49.00	41.52	46.31	25	25	18	1.35	5.96	18	12	Eligible	Eligible								
6	MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT	Association	125.96	62	40	40	30	10.00	13.00	17	17	0.00	0	0	0	0	0.00	0.00	0	0	100.00	0.00	125.96	62.00	40	40	30	10.00	13.00	17	17	Eligible	Eligible								
7	M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. In Associate with M/s. INFINITE Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	Association	62.39	43	25	25	18	3.55	7.09	14	11	0.00	0	0	0	0	0.00	0.00	0	0	100.00	0.00	62.39	43.00	25	25	18	3.55	7.09	14	11	Eligible	Eligible								
8	Bloom Companies LLC in Joint Venture with Geo Designs And Research (P) Ltd and in association with Sunnily Consultants Pvt. Ltd	JV/Association	102.63	27	12	12	9	2.77	2.50	7	7	37.00	45	25	25	18	0.80	4.58	20	13	60.00	40.00	76.38	34.20	12	12	9	1.98	3.33	7	6	Eligible	Eligible								
9	HIGHWAY ENGINEERING CONSULTANT. in Association with Infratech Civil Solutions & Consultant	Sole	65.48	61	40	40	30	7.05	15.50	17	15	0.00	0	0	0	0	0.00	0.00	0	0	100.00	0.00	65.48	61.00	40	40	30	7.05	15.50	17	15	Eligible	Eligible								
10	Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	Sole	351.87	56	25	25	18	3.00	6.00	16	12	11.15	6	0	0	0	2.25	0.00	0	0	100.00	0.00	351.87	56.00	25	25	18	3.00	6.00	16	12	Eligible	Eligible								
11	SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED In JV with CMEC CONSULTING ENGINEERS PVT. LTD. in Association with Upham International Corporation.	JV/Association	115.42	67	40	40	30	1.00	23.18	16	7	30.54	11	6	6	4	0.00	0.00	6	4	75.00	25.00	94.20	53.00	25	25	18	0.75	17.39	7	0.61	Eligible	Eligible								

Note 1. Only Form 26AS for FY 2021-22 Or 2022-23 has been considered as proof of employment with the firm
2. The minimum eligibility criteria as per Section-1, Clause 15 (A)/(B) of RFP has been evaluated only for those bidders who qualify w.r.t. minimum technical capacity criteria. The bidders not fulfilling the requisite criteria at any stage are not further evaluated.
3. Wherever the declared share of lead partner & JV partner is not 100 collectively, the same is proportionately adjusted w.r.t. 100 to determine the technical capacity of JV Bidder.

Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).

MINIMUM ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA

S.No.	Name of the Applicants	Preparation of DPR (NH/SH/Equivalent)	Project Supervision/IC (NH/SH/Equivalent)		Annual Turnover	Technical capacity	whether the Applicant is Technical "Responsive" or "Non-Responsive".
		The firm should have minimum experience of preparation of detailed Project Report/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report of 2/4/6** laning project of aggregate length equal to 2 times or more of similar category for which RFP is invited.	The firm should have minimum experience of Project Supervision/IC of 2/4/6**laning project of aggregate length equal to 3 times or more of similar category for which RFP is invited.	Firm should also have experience of Project Supervision/IC of at least one project of similar category of two/four/six** laning of length equal to 40% of project length.	Annual turnover (updated average of last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) of the firm from consultancy business should be equal to or more than 2% of Total Project Cost (TPC).	whether the Applicant is Technical "Eligible" or "In-Eligible".	
1/11	Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in Association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd	No	YES	YES	YES	Eligible	Non-Responsive
2/11	LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited	YES	YES	YES	YES	Eligible	Responsive
3/11	TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP	YES	YES	YES	YES	Eligible	Responsive
4/11	URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd	YES	YES	YES	YES	Eligible	Responsive
5/11	K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED	YES	YES	YES	YES	Eligible	Responsive
6/11	MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT	YES	YES	YES	YES	Eligible	Responsive
7/11	M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. In Associate with M/s. INFINITE Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	No	YES	YES	YES	Eligible	Non-Responsive
8/11	Bloom Companies LLC in Joint Venture with Geo Designs And Research (P) Ltd and in association with Sunnily Consultants Pvt. Ltd	No	No	YES	YES	Eligible	Non-Responsive
9/11	HIGHWAY ENGINEERING CONSULTANT. in Association with Infratech Civil Solutions & Consultant	YES	No	YES	YES	Eligible	Non-Responsive
10/11	Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	YES	YES	YES	YES	Eligible	Responsive
11/11	SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED In JV with CMEC CONSULTING ENGINEERS PVT. LTD. in Association with Upham International Corporation.	No	No	YES	YES	Eligible	Non-Responsive

Name of the Project											
Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).											
Final Comparative Technical Evaluation Score											
S. No.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment#		Total		Rank of the Firm	whether the Technical Responsive Applicant/Bidder Eligible for opening of Financial proposal
		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed		
		Maximum marks	40	40	20	20	40	40	100	100	
1/11	Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd in Association with Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd	Non-Responsive The bidder do not meet the minimum eligibility criteria as per clause 15(A) of RFP.									Non-Responsive
2/11	LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited	40.00	37.00	20.00	20.00	37.43	37.31	97.43	94.31	2	Responsive
3/11	TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP	40.00	36.00	20.00	20.00	36.56	29.40	96.56	85.40	6	Responsive*
4/11	URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd	40.00	40.00	20.00	20.00	37.12	35.86	97.12	95.86	1	Responsive
5/11	K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED	40.00	36.50	20.00	20.00	36.64	34.55	96.64	91.05	4	Responsive
6/11	MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT	40.00	36.00	20.00	20.00	36.68	35.05	96.68	91.05	4	Responsive
7/11	M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. In Associate with M/s. INFINITE Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	Non-Responsive The bidder do not meet the minimum eligibility criteria as per clause 15(A) of RFP.									Non-Responsive
8/11	Bloom Companies LLC in Joint Venture with Geo Designs And Research (P) Ltd and in association with Sunnily Consultants Pvt. Ltd	Non-Responsive The bidder do not meet the minimum eligibility criteria as per clause 15(A) & 15(B) of RFP.									Non-Responsive
9/11	HIGHWAY ENGINEERING CONSULTANT. in Association with Infratech Civil Solutions & Consultant	Non-Responsive The bidder do not meet the minimum eligibility criteria as per clause 15(A) of RFP.									Non-Responsive
10/11	Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	40.00	40.00	20.00	20.00	38.47	31.82	98.47	91.82	3	Responsive
11/11	SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED In JV with CMEC CONSULTING ENGINEERS PVT. LTD. in Association with Upham International Corporation.	Non-Responsive The bidder do not meet the minimum eligibility criteria as per clause 15(A) & 15(B) of RFP.									Non-Responsive

* Subject to Outcome of the W.P © 11893/2023 dated 05.09.2023 filed by TPF Engineering PVT Ltd in the High Court of Delhi.

Name of the Project														
Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).														
FIRMS RELEVANT EXPERIENCE FOR THE ASSIGNMENT													ANN	
S.N o.	Applicant No.		2/11		3/11		4/11		5/11		6/11		10/11	
	Description	Max Marks	LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited		TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP		URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd		K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED		MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT		Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	
			Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed
			40.00	37.00	40.00	36.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	36.50	40.00	36.00	40.00	40.00
1	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	< 2% of TPC - 0 marks	0												
	2% of TPC - 1.5 marks	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5
	Add for additional turnover 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks for every 1% of TPC above 2% of TPC subject to maximum 0.5 marks.	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5
2	Nos. of Highway Professionals with the firm *	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
	<10 - 0 marks	0												
	10 to 20 - 8 marks	8												
	> 20 but <=30 - 9 marks	9												
	> 30 - 10 marks	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
3	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Construction Supervision in Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length (40% of project length) or more in last 7 years.	12	12	12	12	11	12	12	12	11	12	12	12	12
	1 project - 9 marks	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9
	Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	3	3	3	3	2	3	3	3	2	3	3	3	3
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report preparation for Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length (40% of project length) or more in last 7 years.	6	6	5	6	5	6	6	6	5.5	6	4	6	6
	1 project - 4 marks	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	2	2	1	2	1	2	2	2	1.5	2	0	2	2
5	In hand DPRs of Highway/ Bridge/ Tunnel Projects (presently under progress)	6	6	4	6	4	6	6	6	4	6	4	6	6
	< 2 projects - 0 marks	0												
	2-5 projects - 4 marks	4		4		4				4		4		
	> 5 projects - 6 marks	6	6		6		6	6	6		6		6	6
6	Experience in Construction Supervision/ DPR/ Design Review of Major structures having length of more than 500 metre in last 7 years.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	1 project - 2 marks	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Add 0. 5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Total	40.00	40.00	37.00	40.00	36.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	36.50	40.00	36.00	40.00	40.00

Summary Sheet of CV's			Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).											
S. No.	Details	Total Marks	2/11		3/11		4/11		5/11		6/11		10/11	
			LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited		TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP		URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd		K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED		MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT		Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	
			Assesed Score	Assesed @ 40	Assesed Score	Assesed @ 40	Assesed Score	Assesed @ 40	Assesed Score	Assesed @ 40	Assesed Score	Assesed @ 40	Assesed Score	Assesed @ 40
1	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	12	93	11.16	87	10.44	89	10.68	76	9.12	88.00	10.56	81	9.72
2	Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer	3	96	2.88	91	2.73	85	2.55	88	2.64	88	2.64	93.5	2.805
3	Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer	3	91	2.73	91	2.73	85	2.55	95	2.85	95	2.73	86.5	2.595
4	Bridge / Structural Engineer	3	95.5	2.865	91	2.73	91	2.73	91	2.73	91	2.73	91	2.73
5	Bridge / Structural Engineer	3	91	2.73	81	2.43	91	2.73	91	2.73	91	2.73	65	1.95
6	Senior Pavement Specialist	6	89	5.34	0	0	89	5.34	91	5.46	86	5.16	46	2.76
7	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	6	96	5.76	91	5.46	88	5.28	91	5.46	91	5.46	91	5.46
8	Road Safety Expert	4	96	3.84	72	2.88	100	4	89	3.56	76	3.04	95	3.8
		40		37.31		29.40		35.86		34.55		35.05		31.82
				2		3		4		5				7

Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradiip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(0).															
Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer			Max Marks	2/11		3/11		4/11		5/11		6/11		10/11	
S. No.	Applicant No.	Name of the Applicant		LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. In Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited	TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP	URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd	K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED	MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT	Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited						
	Description			Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed		
1	General Qualification	25	24	24	21	21	22	21	22	21	21	21	21	21	21
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering	3	3	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
iii)	Degree/Diploma/Certificate in Project Management	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70													
a)	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:														
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
i)	< 12 years -0	0													
	12 years -8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 2 (three) marks.	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development projects similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
ii)	< 5 years - 0	0													
	5 years - 11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) on PPP	5	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	4	5	5	5
iii)	1 Project- 4 Marks	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks	1	0	0	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	0	1	1	1
	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of project Preparation including design of major highway Project (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	15	15	15	15	15	15	13	15	0	15	13	15	0	0
b)	<2 Project -0 marks	0													
	2 Projects -11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	0	11	11	11	0	0
	Add 2 mark for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	2	4	0	4	2	4	0	0
	Experience in position of Team Leader/Project Manager or similar capacity in Construction Supervision/IC involving length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6** laning) and above	20	20	20	20	16	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
c)	< 2 projects - 0	0													
	2 Projects - 16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) marks	4	4	4	4	0	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation and Maintenance of Major Highway (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
d)	1 project - 4 marks	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum														

Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).														
Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer														
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/11		3/11		4/11		5/11		6/11		10/11	
	Name of the Applicant		LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited		TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP		URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd		K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED		MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT		Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	
	Description		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering/Geotechnical Engineering	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70												
	Professional Experience													
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	< 10 years -0	0												
i)	10 years -16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience as Resident Engineer/Project Director/Project Manager/Superintending Engineer or equivalent/Executive Engineer or equivalent on construction works/Independent Engineer Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
ii)	< 5 year - 0	0												
	5 years -16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25	25	25	25	25	25	24	25	22	25	22	25	25
iii)	< 2 nos -0	0												
	2 nos -19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19
	Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks.	6	6	6	6	6	6	5	6	3	6	3	6	6
	Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of construction/Construction Supervision/IC on PPP Mode (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5	5	5	5	5	5	0	5	5	5	5	5	2.5
iv)	2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks	5	5	5	5	5	5	0	5	5	5	5	5	2.5
	Employment with the Firm	5	5	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5	5
	< 1 year -0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	1 year -3	3	3	3									3	3
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	2	2	2									2	2
	Total	100	96	96	91	91	91	85	91	88	91	88	96	93.5
	Weightage @ 3	3	2.88	2.88	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.55	2.73	2.64	2.73	2.64	2.88	2.805

Note: In case of qualification, Graduation/ Post Graduation through Private mode/ Distance learning/ Unrecognized Universities is not considered

Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).

Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer														
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/11		3/11		4/11		5/11		6/11		10/11	
	Name of the Applicant		LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited		TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP		URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd		K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED		MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT		Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	
	Description		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	21	21	25	25	25	25	21	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering/Geotechnical Engineering	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	4	4	4	4	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70												
	Professional Experience													
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	< 10 years -0	0												
i)	10 years -16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
ii)	Experience as Resident Engineer/Project Director/Project Manager/Superintending Engineer or equivalent/Executive Engineer or equivalent on construction works/Independent Engineer Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	19
	< 5 year - 0	0												
	5 years -16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	3
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25	25	25	25	25	25	19	25	25	25	25	25	19
	< 2 nos -0	0												
	2 nos -19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19
	Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks.	6	6	6	6	6	6	0	6	6	6	6	6	0
iv)	Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of construction/Construction Supervision/IC on PPP Mode (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	2.5
	2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	2.5
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5	5
	< 1 year -0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	1 year -3	3											3	3
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	2											2	2
	Total	100	91	91	91	91	91	85	95	95	95	95	96	86.5
	Weightage @ 6	3	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.55	2.85	2.85	2.85	2.85	2.88	2.595

Note: In case of qualification, Graduation/ Post Graduation through Private mode/ Distance learning/ Unrecognized Universities is not considered

Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).

S. No.	Bridge/Structural Engineer													
	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/8		3/8		4/11		5/11		6/11		10/11	
	Name of the Applicant		LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited		TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP		URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd		K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED		MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT		Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	
			Description	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4	0	0	0	0	0	0			0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70												
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
i)	< 10 years -0	0												
	10 years -11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional 2 year subject to maximum 4(four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Design/Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Flyover/Interchanges/any other such structures (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	< 5 years -0	0												
	5 years -16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Major Highway Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	< 2 Bridges -0	0												
	2 Bridge -16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add 2 mark extra for each additional bridge subject to maximum 4 (four) marks	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
	< 2 - 0	0												
	2 nos -07	7												
	3 or more -10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
v)	Experience in similar capacity of modern bridge construction technology viz., Precast Segmental, Balanced Cantilever Construction, Extradosed Bridge, Full Span Launching, Incremental Launching.	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	Experience in 1 project - 4	4												
	More than one project - 5 marks	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
3	Employment with the Firm	5	4.5	4.5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	< 1 year -0	0	0	0					0	0	0	0		
	1 year -3	3	3	3										
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	2	1.5	1.5										
	Total	100	95.5	95.5	91	91	91	91	91	91	91	91	91	91
	Weightage @ 6	3	2.865	2.865	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.73
			2		3		4		5		7		7	

Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).

Bridge/Structural Engineer														
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/8		3/8		4/11		5/11		6/11		10/11	
	Name of the Applicant		LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited		TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP		URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd		K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED		MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT		Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	
	Description		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	25	25
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	4	4
2	Adequacy for the Project	70												
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	i) < 10 years -0	0												
	10 years -11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional 2 year subject to maximum 4(four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	ii) Experience in similar capacity in Design/Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Flyover/Interchanges/any other such structures (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	< 5 years -0	0												
	5 years - 16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	iii) Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Major Highway Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	0
	< 2 Bridges -0	0												
	2 Bridge -16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	0
	Add 2 mark extra for each additional bridge subject to maximum 4 (four) marks	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	0
	iv) Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	10	10	10	10	0	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	0
	< 2 - 0	0												
	2 nos -07	7												
	3 or more -10	10	10	10	10	0	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	0
	v) Experience in similar capacity of modern bridge construction technology viz., Precast Segmental, Balanced Cantilever Construction, Extradosed Bridge, Full Span Launching, Incremental Launching.	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	0
	Experience in 1 project - 4	4												
	More than one project - 5 marks	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	0
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5	5
	< 1 year -0	0	0	0					0	0	0	0		
	1 year -3	3											3	3
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	2											2	2
	Total	100	91	91	91	81	91	91	91	91	91	91	100	65
	Weightage @ 6	3	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.43	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.73	2.73	3	1.95

Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).

Senior Pavement Specialist		Max Marks	2/11		3/11		4/11		5/11		6/11		10/11	
S. No.	Applicant No.		LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited		TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP		URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd		K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED		MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT		Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	
	Name of the Applicant		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed	
	Description		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	0	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
I)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	0	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
II)	Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Pavement engineering or equivalent	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70												
a)	Professional Experience													
	Total Professional Experience of Pavement Design/Construction and Maintenance of Highways/Roads/Air Field Runway	20	20	20	20	0	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
i)	< 10 years -0	0												
	10 years -16	16	16	16	16	0	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	0	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in Similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of 2/4/6-laning** of major Highway Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	20	0	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	0
ii)	< 5 year - 0	0												
	5 years -16	16	16	16	16	0	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	0
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	0	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	0
	Experience in similar capacity as Pavement/Geo-technical Engineer in construction/ construction supervision of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	18	20	0	20	18	20	20	20	20	20	0
iii)	< 2 nos - 0	0												
	2 nos - 16	16	16	16	16	0	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	0
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks.	4	4	2	4	0	4	2	4	4	4	4	4	0
	Experience in similar capacity on major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in innovative/non traditional technology and design	5	5	5	5	0	5	5	5	5	5	0	5	0
iv)	1 Project -4	4												0
	2 or more -5	5	5	5	5	0	5	5	5	5	5	0	5	
	Experience in similar capacity on PPP Projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5	5	5	5	0	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	0
v)	2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks	5	5	5	5	0	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	0
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5	5
3	< 1 year -0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	1 year -3	3											3	3
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	2											2	2
	Total	100	91	89	91	0	91	89	91	91	91	86	96	46
	Weightage @ 6	6	5.46	5.34	5.46	0	5.46	5.34	5.46	5.46	5.46	5.16	5.76	2.76

Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).														
Senior Quality cum Material Expert														
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/11		3/11		4/11		5/11		6/11		10/11	
	Name of the Applicant		LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited		TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP		URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd		K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED		MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT		Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	
	Description		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	25	21	21	21	21	21	25	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Geotechnical Engineering/Foundation Engineering/Soil Mechanics/Rock Mechanics	4	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	4	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70												
	Professional Experience													
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
i)	< 10 years -0	0												
	10 years -11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of major Highway Projects ((similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above))	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25
ii)	< 5 year - 0	0												
	5 years -19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19
	Add 2.0 (two) marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6
	Experience in similar capacity in handling Similar Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25	25	25	25	25	25	22	25	25	25	25	25	25
iii)	< 2 nos -0	0												
	2 nos -19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19
	Add 3.0 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.	6	6	6	6	6	6	3	6	6	6	6	6	6
	Experience in similar capacity on major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in innovative/non traditional technology	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
iv)	1 Project -4	4												
	2 or more -5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	Employment with the Firm	5	5	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
3	< 1 year - 0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		
	1 year - 3	3	3	3										
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	2	2	2										
	Total :	100	96	96	91	91	95	88	91	91	91	91	95	91
	Weightage @ 6	6	5.76	5.76	5.46	5.46	5.7	5.28	5.46	5.46	5.46	5.46	5.7	5.46

Independent Engineer Services for Rehabilitation and upgradation from 4 to 8 laning of Chandikhole – Paradip Section of NH-53 (Old NH-5A) from km 0+000 to km 76+646 in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode under NH(O).

Road Safety Expert														
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/11		3/11		4/11		5/11		6/11		10/11	
	Name of the Applicant		LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Ayoleeza Consultants Private Limited		TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP		URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd		K & J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED		MSV INTERNATIONAL INC.In Association with (as a Sub Consultant) D.N. CONSULTANT		Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	
	Description		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	25	25	25	25	21	21	25	25	25	25
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Traffic/Transportation/Safety Engineering or equivalent	4	0	0	4	4	4	4	0	0	4	4	4	4
2	Adequacy for the Project	70												
i)	Professional Experience													
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	0	15	15
	< 10 years -0													
ii)	10 years -11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	0	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	0	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety works on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	11	15	15
iii)	> 5 Years-0	0												
	5 years -11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	0	4	4
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audits of 2/4/6-laning** Highway projects at different stages including at least one at design stage	20	20	20	20	0	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	< 2 nos -0	0												
	2 nos -16	16	16	16	16	0	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16
v)	Add 2 marks extra for each additional projects subject to maximum 4 marks.	4	4	4	4	0	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in identification and improvement of black spots on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	10	10	10	10	7	10	10	10	8	10	10	10	10
	<2 nos. - 0 marks	0												
vi)	2 nos. - 7 marks	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional improvement of black spots subject to maximum 3 marks.	3	3	3	3	0	3	3	3	1	3	3	3	3
	Experience in similar capacity of preparing Road Safety Management Plans for Inter Urban Highway	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	0
vii)	1 project- 4 marks	4												
	2 or more project- 5 marks	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	0
	Experience in similar capacity in field of Road Safety Management Plan	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
3	1 project- 4 marks	4												
	2 or more project- 5 marks	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	Employment with the Firm	5	5	5	0	0	5	5	0	0	0	0	5	5
	< 1 year - 0	0					0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	1 year - 3	3	3	3			3	3					3	3
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	2	2	2			2	2					2	2
	Total :	100	96	96	95	72	100	100	91	89	95	76	100	95
	Weightage @ 4	4	3.84	3.84	3.8	2.88	4	4	3.64	3.56	3.8	3.04	4	3.8
	15 days Course Certificate		Yes		Yes				Yes					