

MINUTES OF MEETING

Sub: RFP for Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for Four laning of Krishnagar-Baharampore section of NH-34 from Km. 115.00 to KM. 193.000 in the state of West Bengal under NHDP phase III on (Package No. NHDP/III/BOT/WB/02) - "on DBFOT(Annuity) Basis - **Final Evaluation of Technical Proposal - Reg.**

Venue: NHAI, RO-Kolkata

Date: 27 July 2023

As per observations of the Committee, all the participated firms, namely (1) M/s Bloom Companies LLC JV with Marc (2) M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt Ltd (3) M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd & (4) M/s MSV International Inc were fulfilling the requirement with respect to Technical capacity provision for maximum works to be permitted with one Consultant as per Clause 16(C). In this context, Evaluation Committee in its meeting dated 10 July 2023 decided the following:-

(a) upload the result of Technical Evaluation of above mentioned 04 (four) nos bidders on the NHAI website giving opportunity to the bidders to respond within 7 days in case they have any objections before opening of Financial Bids as per RFP provision.

(b) Intimation is to be given to the Concessionaires/ Contractor of the subject project for any conflict of interest.

2. According to the above decision, all the 04 nos participated firms were asked to provide their comments in respect of Technical capacity & Technical result assessed by the Authority.

3. Also, letter for conflict of interest with the Concessionaire was issued to M/s SEW Krishnagar Baharampore Highways Ltd vide letter no 787 dated 14 July 2023.

4. M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt Ltd, M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd & M/s MSV International Inc have not raised any objections regarding Technical capacity or Technical marks obtained by them. However, M/s Bloom Companies LLC JV with Marc vide their letter no Bloom/SA/HO/NHAI/2023/2212 dated 21 July 2023 has raised few objections and requested Authority for necessary consideration.

5. The Details of compliance given by the Firm's and comments of the committee is as follows:

Sl. No.	Description	Max Marks	Marks Recommended by Committee	Marks Claimed by Firm for Review	Compliance given by the Firm	Final Marks given by the committee	Comments
A. M/s Bloom Companies LLC JV with Marc							
1	In Hand DPR Projects for NHAI Projects • For DPR project length > the length of project for which RFP invited - 5 Marks • For DPR project length > two times the length of project for which RFP invited - 7.5 Marks • For project length > three times the length of project for which RFP invited - 10 Marks	10	5	10	Letter no Bloom/SA/HO/NHAI/2023/2212 dated 21 July 2023 submitted mentioning DPR in hands for Lead Partner as well as for JV Partner. Total aggregate length of In Hand DPR Lead+JV comes to 864.3 km.	10	Based on the submission of the Firm and based on certificates available in Infracon Portal, the Committee accepts the submission of the bidder.

6. The Concessionaire of the subject project has not communicated any information regarding Conflict of interest with the participated Consultancy firms within stipulated date & time. Therefore,

Added
27/07/23

Subash
27/7/2023

Sam
27/7/23

Shaukey

it is presumed that, any of the participated firms has not Conflict of interests with the Concessionaire, M/s SEW Krishnagar Baharampore Highways Ltd.

7. The bidder wise Final technical Scores are tabulated as under:-

Sr No.	Name of Firm	Relevant experience for the assignment		Quality of approach and methodology		Experience in use of technology and road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Total	
		35		05		20		40		100	
		Claim ed	Assess ed	Claim ed	Assess ed	Claim ed	Assess ed	Claim ed	Assess ed	Claim ed	Assess ed
1	M/s Bloom Companies LLC JV with Marc	35	34.75	5	5	20	20	36.4	36.36	96.4	96.11
2	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt Ltd	35	35	5	5	20	20	37.39	37.39	97.39	97.39
3	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd	35	35	5	5	20	20	37.8	37.07	97.8	97.07
4	M/s MSV International Inc	35	35	5	5	20	20	37.36	36.40	97.36	96.40

8. As per Clause 5.3 (i) of RFP, the technical proposal should score atleast 75 points to be considered responsive. The Authority shall shortlist 5 (five) top firms on the basis of their technical score on the basis of their technical score not in the conflict of interest with the Concessionaire. In this instant case, all the participated firms have scored more than 75 points.

9. As per assessment of Technical capacity & reassessment of Technical Scores, the committee unanimously decided to declare the following firms as Technically responsive and recommends for opening of the Financial Bids at the earliest date as per convenient to the Committee members, subject to approval of Competent Authority:-

- M/s Bloom Companies LLC JV with Marc Technocrats Pvt Ltd in Association with Infradev Solutions Pvt Ltd
- M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt Ltd
- M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.
- M/s MSV International Inc in Association with DN Consultants.

10. The date of opening of Financial e-bids may be intimated to the above mentioned Technically responsive bidders for their information.

11. The meeting concluded with vote of thanks to Chair.

A Sh Sharma
A Sharma
Dy Manager (Tech)
RO-Kolkata
Member

A Sarkar
A Sarkar
DGM (F&A) & Head
FAU-Kolkata
Member

D Das
D Das
DGM (Tech)
RO-Kolkata
Member

Raju Kumar
Raju Kumar
Project Director
PIU-Krishnagar
Member

D K Choudhary
D K Choudhary
Project Director
PIU-Kolkata
Chairperson

Submitted for approval of Competent Authority:

Ar. Prof. ...
3/8