

Evaluation of Technical Bids

Tender Notice No.1/HDO/NH/2023-24 Dated. 16.06.2023.

Date of Meeting 28.12.2023.

Minutes of the Evaluation Committee Meeting for the evaluation of Technical Bid for the work of “Improvements to Riding Quality at km 32/000-33/400, km 35/640-37/000, km 47/000-57/400, km 59/200-64/400, km 68/800-77/200, km 83/600-84/000, km 84/400-95/000, km 95/400-96/200, km 98/200-99/350, km 99/750-100/400, km 101/100 to 101/700, km 102/100-102/700 and km 103/700-104/400 of Tuticorin – Tiruchendur - Kanyakumari section of NH 32 on Engineering, Procurement & Construction (EPC) Basis Contract in the state of Tamil Nadu. (Job No.NH-32-TN-2023-24-PR-001)”

Estimate Amount: Rs.5009.46 Lakhs

Value Put to Tender: Rs. 3970.09 Lakhs

Members Present :

- 1.Er. R.Geetha, Chief Engineer, National Highways, Chennai – Chairman.**
- 2.Thiru.S.Vijaya Kumar, CE - RO, MORT&H, Chennai – Member.**
- 3.Thiru.M.S.Rajesh, Deputy Secretary to Government, Highways & Minor ports Department – Member.**
- 4.Tmt.T.Santhi, Superintending Engineer (NH), Tirunelveli – Member.**
- 5.Thiru.A.Anaiappan, Divisional Engineer (NH), Tirunelveli– Member-Secretary**

1. The tenders received through online for the above work were opened by the Evaluation Committee on 03.08.2023. The technical bids were evaluated by the Committee on 18.08.2023 & 07.09.2023. The Committee declared the technical bids of two bidders 1) M/s Sindu Muruga Constructions Pvt Ltd & 2) Thiru M.Shanmugavelu as **“Responsive”** and the bids of 1) M/s SS & Co & 2) Tmt K.Selvi as **“Non-Responsive”**.
2. The Committee directed the Superintending Engineer (NH) Tirunelveli to upload the technical evaluation in e-procurement portal. The Superintending Engineer (NH) Tirunelveli informed the committee that the results of technical evaluation were uploaded 08.09.2023 in CPPP portal. The date of opening of financial bids was fixed as 19.09.2023.

Sd./xxx

**DE (NH)
Tirunelveli**

Sd./xxx

**SE (NH)
Tirunelveli**

Sd./xxx

**DS to Govt.
H&MP Dept.**

Sd./xxx

**CE-RO, MoRTH,
Chennai**

Sd./xxx

**Chief Engineer
(NH), Chennai**

3. The bidder M/s. SS & Co has filed a writ petition (WP (MD) No 22287 of 2023) on 11.09.2023 in the Hon'ble Madurai Bench of Madras High Court to quash the decision of the evaluation committee declaring the bid of the Petitioner as 'Non- Responsive' (as the bidder has not submitted the bid security in the format specified in Appendix-II of RFP). The case was listed for hearing on 13.09.2023, 19.09.2023, 21.09.2023, 26.09.2023, 05.10.2023, 31.10.2023, 06.11.2023, 07.11.2023 and finally the case came for hearing on 08.11.2023 during which the Hon'ble Madurai Bench of Madras High Court passed order (Web copy received on 20.12.2023) stating the following:

"I permit the petitioner to take part in the tender process. The department is not going to suffer in any manner. I hold that the disqualification of the petitioner on the ground set out in the impugned communication is unsustainable. This writ petition stands allowed. The petitioner's bid will also be taken up for technical evaluation. No costs, Consequently, connected miscellaneous petitions are closed".

4. The Evaluation Committee during its meeting held on 18.08.2023 declared the bid of M/s SS & Co as Non Responsive as the bidder has not submitted the bid security in the format specified in Appendix-II of RFP. In this connection Superintending Engineer (NH) Tirunelveli has apprised the Evaluation Committee that the bidder M/s. SS & Co has now submitted the amended BG with same BG number as submitted by the bidder along with bid documents, which is as per format given in RFP and the genuiness of the BG has also been confirmed by the concerned bank.
5. Keeping in view of the order passed by the Hon'ble Madurai Bench of Madras High court and amended BG submitted by the bidder M/s SS & Co, the Evaluation Committee reviewed the matter and decided to evaluate the technical bids of M/s SS & Co as per RFP.

Sd./xxx	Sd./xxx	Sd./xxx	Sd./xxx	Sd./xxx
DE (NH) Tirunelveli	SE (NH) Tirunelveli	DS to Govt. H&MP Dept.	CE-RO, MoRTH, Chennai	Chief Engin (NH), Chen

Brief findings of the technical bids of the four bidders are as under

Name of Bidder	Bid Capacity	Technical Threshold Capacity	Average Annual Turn Over	Net Worth	Similar Nature single value of work completed	Remarks
Minimum Requirement	Rs. 3970.09 Lakhs	Rs. 2977.57 Lakhs	Rs. 595.51 Lakhs	Rs. 198.50 Lakhs	Rs. 794.02 Lakhs	Responsive / Non Responsive
Thiru.M. Shanmugavelu	Rs. 6613.27 Lakhs	Rs. 5338.91 Lakhs	Rs. 3534.62 Lakhs	Rs. 1152.77 Lakhs	Rs. 1241.59 Lakhs	Responsive
Tmt.K.Selvi	Rs. 5114.93 Lakhs	Reply to the clarification not submitted by the bidder as per clause 3.1.4 of RFP	Rs. 1238.12 Lakhs	Rs. 1172.99 Lakhs	Rs. 1034.47 Lakhs	Non Responsive
M/s. SinduMuruga Constructions Pvt.Ltd.	Rs. 15296.63 Lakhs	Rs. 7601.80 Lakhs	Rs. 14293.54 Lakhs	Rs. 4098.19 Lakhs	Rs. 3111.75 Lakhs	Responsive
M/s SS & Co	Rs. 7043.17 Lakhs	Rs. 4151.83 Lakhs	Rs. 2924.69 Lakhs	Rs. 1358.30 Lakhs	Rs. 1441.55 Lakhs	Responsive

6. After detailed deliberations and in view of the positions stated in the para-5, the Evaluation Committee declared the technical bid of 1) Thiru M.Shanmugavelu 2) M/s Sindu Muruga Constructions Pvt Ltd 3) M/s SS & Co as **“Responsive”** and the bidder Tmt K.Selvi as **“Non-Responsive”**.

7. Superintending Engineer (NH), Tirunelveli apprised that, the bid validity has been extended by all three bidders.

8. Further, the Evaluation Committee directed the Superintending Engineer (NH) Tirunelveli to upload the amended results of technical evaluation in CPPP portal in accordance with the Ministry’s extant guidelines.

Sd./xxx
**DE (NH)
Tirunelveli**

Sd./xxx
**SE (NH)
Tirunelveli**

Sd./xxx
**DS to Govt.
H&MP Dept.**

Sd./xxx
**CE-RO, MoRTH,
Chennai**

Sd./xxx
**Chief Engineer
(NH), Chennai**