

**Minutes of the Bid Evaluation Committee held in the chamber of Dy CSTE  
Project-II on 23.11.2023**

**1. NAME OF THE WORK:-** Infringement Removal and execution of signalling & Telecom works in connection with construction of FOBs to control Mid Section Tress passing at different locations of Mumbai Division of Central Railway.

**2. BID EVALUATION COMMITTEE**

| Sr. No. | Officers             | Designation        | As               |
|---------|----------------------|--------------------|------------------|
| 1       | Shri R. R. Potdar    | Dy CSTE Project II | Convener         |
| 2       | Shri G. Kanna Naresh | Dy FA&CAO II       | Finance Member   |
| 3       | Shri M. G. Katke     | Dy CE Civil        | Technical Member |

**3. BACKGROUND**

Mumbai Urban Transport Project-III (MUTP-III) project is sanctioned under Item no. 597 of Central Railway in Railway Budget 2015-16 under PH-81-MTP. Trespass Control on Mid-Section on Central & Western Railway is a part of MUTP-III. The Abstract cost sanctioned in Railway Budget 2015-16 was adjusted to March 2016 price as Rs. 449 Crores by taking 6.29% and 5.5% (estimated) inflation during 2014-15 & 2015-16 respectively.

Detailed Construction Estimate for Trespass Control on Mid-Section on suburban sections of Central & Western Railways Under Mumbai Urban Transport Project Phase III (MUTP III) (PH-81-MTP) was sanctioned by CMD vide Note No MRVC/W/Mid-Section/estimate/420 Dated 05.02.2018 with department wise breakup of cost as under:

**Table I**

| Departments | Amount in Rs.    |
|-------------|------------------|
| CIVIL       | 363,82,68,931.69 |
| ELECTRICAL  | 108,63,24,595.77 |
| S&T         | 28,72,76,413.32  |
| TOTAL       | 501,18,69,940.78 |
| CRRM        | 25,00,000.00     |
| NET TOTAL   | 500,93,69,940.78 |

It is noted that Sanctioned Detailed Estimate for S&T portion of the project is Rs. 28,72,76,413/-, out of which tender has been awarded for execution of S&T portion of the work at a total cost of Rs. 12,66,67,842.10. The expenditure incurred so far by S&T Department is only Rs. 8,51,03,182.66. This Tender was floated based on the further requirements advised by CPM V vide Note No. MRVC/CPM-V/FoB/PB/TPC/Misc. Corre.CR/52 Dated 06.01.2023. Earlier, a Tender was called for and Bid Evaluation Committee meeting was held on 11.09.2023. In the Bid Evaluation Report, the recommendation was to discharge the Tender and to reinvite the Tender after reviewing the terms & conditions of the contract. Accordingly after reviewing, a fresh Tender was called.

The Tender was invited vide **Tender Notice No. MRVC/W/134R Dated 18.09.2023** at an Estimated cost of Rs.6,54,82,478.36 under "National Open Competitive Procurement (NoCT), (One-Envelope Tendering Process without

Prequalification)". Tender Schedule was vetted by Finance vide letter No. MRVC/FIN/Midsec Trespass/S&T Dated 27.07.2023. (Folio No.1)

#### 4. SCOPE OF WORK

The scope of Signal & Telecommunication portion of work includes following as mentioned in the sanctioned scope of work:

1. Infringement removal related work of signalling & Telecommunication system due to alignment of foundations at various locations.
2. Provision of Passenger Information system (PIS), like Train information display boards, Public Address system, clocks etc.
3. Provision of CCTV system and integrate with existing surveillance.
4. Provision of Unreserved Ticketing system (UTS) at booking office.

#### 5. BID DOCUMENT

The Bid was invited through "National Open Competitive Procurement (NoCT) (One-Envelope Tendering Process without Prequalification)" on e-procurement website <https://eprocure.gov.in>

#### 6. BID INVITATION PROCESS

National Open Competitive Bid was invited through online E-tendering on e-procurement website <https://eprocure.gov.in> vide RFB No. MRVC/W/134R dated 18.09.2023 and published in reputed newspapers and uploaded on website [www.mrvc.indianrailways.gov.in](http://www.mrvc.indianrailways.gov.in) of MRVC vide Note Dated 18.09.2023 (Folio No.03)

The summary of few of the Newspaper publication cuttings in National Press regarding Open Competitive Bid Notice is detailed as under:

| Sr. No. | News Paper          | Date Of Publications | Name Of City | Folio No |
|---------|---------------------|----------------------|--------------|----------|
| 1       | Mumbai Tarun Bharat | 22.09.2023           | Mumbai       | 151      |
| 2       | Vritta Manas        | 22.09.2023           | Mumbai       | 152      |
| 3       | Dainik Samna        | 22.09.2023           | Mumbai       | 153      |
| 4       | Navakal             | 22.09.2023           | Mumbai       | 154      |
| 5       | Maharashtra Times   | 22.09.2023           | Mumbai       | 155      |
| 6       | Dainik Jagran       | 22.09.2023           | Lukhnow      | 156      |
| 7       | Dainik Bhaskar      | 22.09.2023           | Chandigarh   | 157      |
| 8       | Dainik Bhaskar      | 22.09.2023           | Jaipur       | 158      |
| 9       | Young Leader        | 22.09.2023           | Ahmadabad    | 159      |
| 10      | Dabang Duniya       | 22.09.2023           | Mumbai       | 160      |
| 11      | K. Aajtak           | 22.09.2023           | Mumbai       | 161      |
| 12      | Yashobhumi          | 22.09.2023           | Mumbai       | 162      |
| 13      | Navbharat Times     | 22.09.2023           | Mumbai       | 163      |
| 14      | Navbharat Times     | 22.09.2023           | Delhi        | 164      |
| 15      | Economics Times     | 22.09.2023           | Mumbai       | 165      |
| 16      | Economics Times     | 22.09.2023           | Delhi        | 166      |
| 17      | Times Of India      | 22.09.2023           | Mumbai       | 167      |
| 18      | Times Of India      | 22.09.2023           | Kolkata      | 168      |
| 19      | Times Of India      | 22.09.2023           | Hyderabad    | 169      |

|    |                |            |           |     |
|----|----------------|------------|-----------|-----|
| 20 | Times Of India | 22.09.2023 | Delhi     | 170 |
| 21 | Times Of India | 22.09.2023 | Chennai   | 171 |
| 22 | Times Of India | 22.09.2023 | Bangalore | 172 |

No Pre – Bid meeting was held for this Tender.

## 7. BID RESPONSE AND BID OPENING

The Bids were opened online by the committee of Shri N. K. Khare, AGM Civil II and Shri B. P. Singh, Dy CEE. No representatives of bidding firms attended the Bid opening. Only one bidder submitted e-bid offer before 1230 hours of 16.10.2023 (Closure time and date for Bid submission as per the tender conditions). As per Para 8 of Specific Procurement Notice - Request for Tender (RFT) (Folio No. 7 to 9) the physical Documents submitted by Tenderer are (a) original Tender Security in form of Demand Draft; (Folio No.186) and (b) original affidavit regarding correctness of information furnished with tendering document. (Folio No.179 to 182)

After Scrutinising submitted documents, offer of the bidder was opened online on 16.10.2023 at 1833 hours,

Details of the firm participated along with the offer cost is as follows:

| Offer No. | Bidder Id No. | Name of the Firm              | Offered Cost in Rs. |
|-----------|---------------|-------------------------------|---------------------|
| 1/1       | L1            | M/s Teletech Services, Mumbai | 5,38,83,908.80      |

## 8. BID SECURITY

As per Para 11 of Specific Procurement Notice - Request for Tender (RFT), (Folio No. 7 to 9) The bidders for the subject work were required to submit Bid Security of Rs. 4,77,000/- (Rs. Four Lakh Seventy Seven Thousand Only) valid for 45 days beyond the original tender validity period of 119 days in format stipulated in the clause. Only One Bidders has submitted Bid security amount of Rs. 4,77,000/- with following details at (Folio No. 186)

| Sr. No. | Name of Tenderer        | Bid Security Format Details                                                                      | Bid Security Amount in Rs. |
|---------|-------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------|
| 1       | M/s. Teletech Services. | DD No. 394029, Dated 03.10.2023, Issued by Central Bank of India, Drawee Branch 2684-SSB Mumbai. | 4,77,000.00                |

## 9. BID DOCUMENT COST

Not Applicable

## 10. EXAMINATION OF BIDS

Tender Evaluation Committee discussed the offers received from Bidders. It was noted that M/s Teletech Services, Mumbai happens to be single Bidder. The summary of the Bids received from the Bidders are tabulated under Para No. 7 above.

Tender Evaluation Committee discussed the eligibility of the lowest bidder i.e. M/s Teletech Services-Mumbai with respect to the eligibility condition mentioned under **Section III of Part 1, Evaluation and Qualification Criteria**. The item wise **Evaluation and Qualification Criteria** with requirement and documents submitted by sole bidder are detailed below:

| Criteria                                       | Requirement                                                                         | Documents Submitted                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>3.1 Eligibility</b>                         |                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 3.1.1                                          | <b>Nationality</b>                                                                  | Nationality in accordance with ITT 4.4                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 3.1.2                                          | <b>Conflict of Interest</b>                                                         | EL1 -1.1<br>Folio No. 226.<br>(With attachment of copies of ITR and CA Certificate.<br>Folio No. 213 to 219)                                                                                                      |
| 3.1.3                                          | <b>Bank Eligibility</b>                                                             | Letter of Tender.<br>Folio No. 183 to 185.                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 3.1.4                                          | <b>State-Owned Enterprise or Institution of the Recipient country</b>               | Letter of Tender.<br>Folio No. 183 to 185.                                                                                                                                                                        |
| <b>3.2 Historical Contract Non-Performance</b> |                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 3.2.1                                          | <b>History of Nonperforming Contracts</b>                                           | EL1 -1.1<br>Folio No. 226.<br>(With attachment of Company Registration certificate From Maharashtra State & Declaration.<br>Folio No. 225-227 )                                                                   |
| 3.2.2                                          | <b>Suspension Based on Execution of Tender-Securing Declaration by the Employer</b> | Non performance of a contract did not occur as a result of contractor default since 1st January 2018                                                                                                              |
| 3.2.3                                          | <b>Pending Litigation</b>                                                           | Letter of Tender.<br>Folio No. 183 to 185.                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 3.2.4                                          | <b>Litigation History</b>                                                           | Tenderer's financial position and prospective long-term profitability still sound according to criteria established in 3.3.1 below and assuming that all pending litigation will be resolved against the Tenderer |
|                                                |                                                                                     | Form CON -2,<br>Folio No. 225.                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|                                                |                                                                                     | Form CON -2,<br>Folio No. 225                                                                                                                                                                                     |



|                                                |                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 3.2.5                                          | <b>Declaration: Environmental, Social, Health, and Safety (ESHS) past performance</b> | Declare any Signaling and Telecommunication work contracts that have been suspended or terminated and/or performance security called by an employer for reasons related to the noncompliance of any environmental, or social, or health, or safety requirements or safeguard in the past five years.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Form CON 3, Folio No. 223                                                                                                                                                                          |
| <b>3.3 Financial Situation and Performance</b> |                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| 3.3.1                                          | <b>Financial Capabilities</b>                                                         | <p>(i) The Tenderer shall demonstrate that it has access to, or has available, liquid assets, unencumbered real assets, lines of credit, and other financial means (independent of any contractual advance payment) sufficient to meet the work cash flow requirements estimated as: <b>INR 123 Lakh including GST</b> for the subject contract(s) net of the Tenderers other commitments.</p> <p>(ii) The audited balance sheets or, if not required by the laws of the Tenderer's country, other financial statements acceptable to the Employer, for the last 5 (Five) years shall be submitted and must demonstrate the current soundness of the Tenderer's financial position and indicate its prospective long- term profitability as indicated below: -</p> <p>a) Profit Before Tax (PBT) should be positive for two financial years out of last five years.</p> <p>b) Average Net-Worth (Total Assets – Total Liabilities) of the last five financial years, should not be less than as mentioned below: Estimated Requirement as: <b>Rs. 65 Lakh including GST</b></p> | <p>Forms FIN-3.3.1, Folio No. 222. FIN-3.3.3, Folio No.221. FIN-3.3.4, Folio No. 220. Audited and Certified Copies of Financial Statements of Last 3 years are Provided. Folio No. 213 to 219.</p> |
| 3.3.2                                          | <b>Average Annual Turnover</b>                                                        | Minimum average annual turnover of <b>INR 655 Lakh including GST</b> , calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress and/or completed within the last 3 years, divided by 3 years                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Form FIN-3.3.2 (Folio No. 221) (Minimum Average Annual Turnover is Rs. 977.957 Lakhs.)                                                                                                             |

| <b>3.4 Experience</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                      |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| 3.4.1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | <b>General Signalling and Telecommunication Experience</b>              | Experience under Signalling and/or Telecommunication contracts in the role of prime contractor, JV member, sub-contractor, or management contractor for at least the last 5 years, starting 1 <sup>st</sup> January 2018                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Form EXP-3.4.1 (Folio No. 201 & 202) |
| 3.4.2 (a)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | <b>Specific Signalling and Telecommunication Management Experience.</b> | Participation, as a prime contractor, joint venture member or sub-contractor should have successfully completed within the qualifying period i.e. the last three financial years and current financial year up to date of opening of the tender (even though the work might have commenced before the qualifying period), at least one <b>Similar Work*</b> costing not less than <b>INR 327 Lakh including GST.</b><br>The Similar work* is defined as under- | Form EXP-3.4.2(a) Folio No. 211.     |
| <b>*Definition of Similar Work</b> - "Similar Work" shall mean any Signal/ Telecom/combined work which includes Supply of Signalling/Telecom cables, Supply & Installation of Passenger Information of Suburban Train Indicator Display Boards, Handicapped Beepers, Computerized Passenger Announcement System and trenching & laying of Signalling/Telecom cables." |                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                      |

**Bid of M/s.Teletech Services. has been examined by Tender Committee with respect to Evaluation and Qualification Criteria mentioned in Tender Document and documents submitted by Bidder. Tender Committee after examination has concluded that M/s. Teletech Services. is technically eligible for award of tender.**

#### **11. RATE REASONABILITY:**

It is noted by Bid Evaluation Committee that total estimated cost of the work is Rs. 5,54,93,625.93.80 without GST. The rates mentioned in vetted Tender Schedule is based on LARs of recently accepted Tender in MRVC for Non SOR items. Rates of SOR items have been taken from latest SOR issued by Central Railway in 2021 and issued by Western Railway in 2016. Bidders had to offer individual rates for all schedule items separately.

The rates offered by M/s. Teletech Services have been compared with the rates of the vetted detailed estimate and the comparison is attached as **Annexure A**, which has been prepared based on the latest available LARs and with inclusion of 6% inflation annually for intermediate period. The comparison is attached as Annexure A placed at Folio No. 229 to 240.

#### **Rate Reasonability of Schedule A:**





Tender schedule has in total 2 Nos. of Schedules viz., Schedule A and Schedule B. Schedule A consist of signalling items having 26 Nos of items whose total cost as per tender schedule is Rs. 989593.93 , which happens to be only 1.78% of the overall cost of the tender. All the items of Schedule A has individual cost of less than 0.12% of the overall cost of the tender. The overall cost offered by M/s. Teletech services for Schedule A is only Rs. 10,10,325/- which is only 2.09% higher than estimated cost of Schedule A, which is Rs. 9,89,593.93. Considering these facts, rates offered by M/s. Teletech services is quite reasonable and acceptable on overall basis.

#### Rate Reasonability of Schedule B:

Schedule B consist of Telecommunication items having 97 Nos of items whose total cost as per tender schedule is Rs. 5,28,73,583.80, which happens to be only 98.22% of the overall cost of the tender. The overall cost offered by M/s. Teletech services for Schedule B is only Rs. Rs. 5,38,83,908.80 which is only 2.09% lower than estimated cost of Schedule B, which is Rs. 5,45,04,031.80. There are three items of schedule B which has individual cost of more than 5% when compared to total estimated cost. These three items are item No. 2 , 3 & 87. For these 3 items rates quoted by M/s. Teletech services is on lower side. Considering these facts, rates offered by M/s. Teletech services is quite reasonable and acceptable on overall basis.

#### Rate Reasonability combining Schedule A & Schedule B:

M/s. Teletech services has quoted at a total cost of Rs. 5,38,83,908.80 without GST which is **1.13% below** with estimated cost of Rs. 5,54,93,625,93. Considering these facts, rates offered by M/s. Teletech services is quite reasonable and acceptable on overall basis.

Tender Evaluation Committee also notes that tenderer has a tendency to quote varying rates of individual items keeping the final cost of the tender in background. It is noted by TEC that for major items rates are lesser than the estimated rates.

Considering above facts, It is concluded by Tender Evaluation Committee that, offer of M/s. Teletech Services being lower than estimated cost by 1.13 % on overall basis, is quite reasonable and justified. Considering this fact, Tender Evaluation Committee recommends acceptance of offer of M/s. Teletech Services.

#### 12. RECOMMENDATIONS:

Based on above detailed deliberations, Tender Evaluation Committee recommends award of this tender to M/s. Teletech Services at a total cost of Rs. 5,38,83,908.80 without GST. ] (A)

Acceptance/rejection/modification of Tender Evaluation Committee recommendations are within the power of GM S&T, in terms of Item No. 2.01(a), Schedule 1, Works Matter of SOP issued in July 2022.

  
23/11/2023

R. R. Potdar  
Dy CSTE Project II

  
23/11/23

Shri G. Kanna Naresh  
Dy FA&CAO II

  
23/11/23

Shri M. G. Katke  
Dy CE Civil

Tender Evaluation Committee's Recommendations  
mentioned as (A) above is accepted.

GM S&T

23.11.2023

GM S&T.