

MINUTES OF CWC-I MEETING HELD ON DATED		FOR TECHNICAL EVALUATION
Name of work	:	Provision of Retaining wall to arrest Soil Erosion at MTPF D Type Quarters area and provision of Boundary Wall around MTPF D Type Quarters for Demarcation of Area at Ord. Estate Ambarnath.
Demand No.	:	ND - 2305
Administrative Approval No	:	0503/04/2023-24/EO/MPF Dt. 24.08.2023
Code Head	:	920/34 (Capital)
T.E. NO.	:	0503/04/2023-24/EO/MPF
Tender ID No.	:	2023_AVNL_166788_1
1.	Nature of work	: Provision of Retaining wall to arrest Soil Erosion at MTPF D Type Quarters area and provision of Boundary Wall around MTPF D Type Quarters for Demarcation of Area at Ord. Estate Ambarnath.
2.	a) Basic Cost based on latest SSR without Market Variation.	: Rs. 138.21 Lakhs
	b) Market Variation	: Nil
	c) Total Estimated Cost (a+b)	: Rs. 138.21 Lakhs (Rs One Hundred & Thirty Eight Lakhs Twenty One Thousand only)
3.	Mode of Tender	: Open tender Enquiry (OTE) through etenders.gov.in of Central Public Procurement Portal
4.	Bid Submission Starting Date & Time	: 07/09/2023 & 05.00 PM
5.	Bid Submission Closing Date & Time	: 21/09/2023 & 05.00 PM
6.	Corrigendum	: Yes 1. For extension of Bid submission closing & bid opening date as 03.10.2023 & 07.10.2023 resp. (Ref: EOC Noting No. 0503/04/2023-24/EO/MPF Dtd. 22.09.2023) 2. For extension of Bid submission closing & bid opening date as 14.10.2023 & 18.10.2023 resp. (Ref: EOC Noting No. 0503/04/2023-24/EO/MPF Dtd. 05.10.2023). 3. For extension of Bid submission closing & bid opening date as 25.10.2023 & 28.10.2023 resp. (Ref: EOC Noting No. 0503/04/2023-24/EO/MPF Dtd. 17.10.2023)
7.	Tender Opening Date	: 28/10/2023

Vikas

8.	Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) amount		:	Rs. 2,13,210.00	
The details of EMD submitted by the bidders are as follows					
9.	Sl. No.	Name of the Civil Contractor	EMD required	EMD DETAIL	EMD Validity
	1.	M/s Sagar Construction Co. Ulhasnagar.	Yes	1. FDR No. 002462115 Dt. 11.10.2023 of BOI ULAHASNAGAR Br. For Rs. 213200.00/- 2. DD No. 000431 Dt. 13.10.2023 of BOI Shahad Br. For Rs. 500.00 <u>Date of submission to EOC MTPF - 13.10.2023</u>	Up to 11.10.2025 & 13.01.2024
	2.	M/s Sunbud Multiventures Pvt Ltd, Ambernath	Yes	FDR No. 7846797 for Dt. 12.09.2023 of IDBI Bank Ambernath Br. For Rs. 2,14,000/- <u>Date of submission to EOC MTPF - 13.09.2023</u>	12.12.2023
	3.	M/s Kugan Construction Ambernath	Yes	FDR Sr. No. 503358 for Dt. 18.09.2023 of Canara Bank Ambernath Br. For Rs. 2,14,000/- <u>Date of submission to EOC MTPF - 21.09.2023</u>	27.12.2023
	4.	M/s Jha P & Company, Ulhasnagar	Yes	FDR Sr. No. 615983 for Dt. 13.10.2023 of Central Bank of India Ulhasnagar Br. For Rs. 2,13,210/- <u>Date of submission to EOC MTPF - 14.10.2023</u>	13.10.2024
10.	Eligibility Criteria as mentioned in the tender:				
	A)	Experience of having successfully completed similar type of works during last 07 years ending last day of month previous to the one in which applications are invited should be either of the following:			
	a)	Three similar works each costing not less than 40% of the estimated cost. (Rs. 55.28			

Vikus

		Lakhs)			
	b)	Two similar works each costing not less than 50% of the estimated cost. (Rs. 69.10 Lakhs)			
	c)	One similar work costing not less than 80% of the estimated cost. (Rs. 110.56 Lakhs)			
Details of the bidders with reference to eligibility criteria mentioned in technical bid are as follows.					
Sr. No.	Name of Bidder	Estimated cost	Value of work Successfully completed by the contractor (Rs)	Contract Agreement No./ Year of completion	Remarks (Eligibility Criteria)
1.	M/s Sagar Construction Co., Ulhasnagar	Rs.138.21 Lakhs	1,74,74,304/-	अनप/बांधकाम/2021-22/280 dt. 29/07/2021 M/s Ambernath Municipal Council / 2018	Complied
2.	M/s Sunbud Multiventures Pvt Ltd, Ambernath	Rs.138.21 Lakhs	3,23,59,714/-	1.AMC/WSSD/2022-23/229 dt. 30.11.2022 M/s Ambernath Municipal Council. / 2021	Complied
3.	M/s Kugan Construction, Ambernath	Rs.138.21 Lakhs	3,71,48,991/-	TECH/MP/156/21-22 DT.18.02.2022 M/s HPCL MUMBAI. / 2021	Complied
4.	M/s Jha P & Company, Ulhasnagar	Rs.138.21 Lakhs	7,05,60,200/-	उमपा/साबांवि/30/2022 dt. 06.06.2023 M/s Ulhasnagar Municipal Corporation / 2021	Complied
B) Average Annual Turnover during last Three (03) years, ending 31st march of the previous financial year, will be at least 30% of the estimated cost. The bidder's financial capability will be decided based on the average annual turnover.					
The details of GSTIN and the Average annual turnover of bidders are as follows:					
Sr. No.	Name of Bidder	GSTIN	Average annual turnover of last three years (FY 2020-21, 2021-22 & 2022-23)	30% of Estimated Cost	Remarks (Eligibility Criteria)



1.	M/s Sagar Construction Co., Ulhasnagar	27AGNP K8282H1 ZU	Rs. 674.61 Lakhs/- Based on Fin. Year ending 2020-21, 2021-22 & 2022-23	Rs. 41.46 Lakh	Complied
2.	M/s Sunbud Multiventures Pvt Ltd, Ambernath	27AAUC S6940G1 ZR	Rs. 5,58,66,666/- Based on Fin. Year ending 2019-20, 2020-21 & 2021-22	Rs. 41.46 Lakh	Complied
3.	M/s Kugan Construction, Ulhasnagar	27AESP N0007L1 ZA	Rs. 5,00,91,021/- Based on Fin. Year ending 2021-22, 2022-23 & 2023-24	Rs. 41.46 Lakh	Complied
4.	M/s Jha P & Company, Ulhasnagar	27AFEPJ 4456N1 Z1	Rs. 56,83,08,602.00 Based on Fin. Year ending 2019-20, 2020-21 & 2021-22	Rs. 41.46 Lakh	Complied

11. Deliberation / Discussion :-

1. Total Four Firms participated in the subject Tender by submitting required EMD as per details mentioned under SI No. 9 above.

2. It is observed that all participated firms have uploaded required documents along with online Tender. Further it is also noted that one of the participating Firm's i.e. M/s Jha P & Co. Ulhasnagar is having very poor performance in ongoing Three awarded works at MTPF.

3. Details of civil works awarded to M/s Jha P & Co. Ulhasnagar at MTPF are appended as below:-

a.) Repairs/Renovation of East Gate & Main Gate at MPF, WO No. 17133 Dated:-02/12/2022
Total Value:-Rs.41,93,313.00 PDC:-04/02/2023 extended D.P: dated: 05/03/2023, 21/04/2023, 25/05/2023, 30/06/2023, 14/08/2023, 28/09/2023 & 11/11/2023 (Seven times).

- The progress of work is very poor & also issues regarding bad workmanship were reported.

Vikas

Firm was expedited to improve progress of work vide MPF Letters Dtd. 02.02.2023, 17.02.2023, 22.02.2023, 28.02.2023, 02.03.2023, 21.03.2023, 27.03.2023, 05.04.2023, 28.04.2023, 01.06.2023, 23.06.2023, 06.07.2023, 22.08.2023, 12.09.2023, 16.10.2023, 23.10.2023.

- The extensions [7 times] were issued to firm as it was necessary to complete work of East Gate as incomplete work offers unaesthetic look to main entry of Factory. CAG Local Test Audit Party-II vide Memo No. 07 dated: 16.10.2023 has raised the audit objection i.e. "The original work was to complete on 04.02.2023 as per work order. The same was extended 6th time up to 28.09.2023. Reason may please be elicited to Audit for giving 6th time extension for PDC. Why were necessary action not initiated against the firm such as cancellation of contract at Firm's risk & cost may be elicited to Audit". Reply for the same has been sent to Audit team.

b.) Repairs to building No. 55 (MA-16) at MPF Ambarnath WO. No.17604 dt. 18/03/2023
Total Value:-19,99,836.00 PDP: 31/07/2023 extended PDC: 11/11/2023.

- The progress of this work is also far from satisfactory. The date of Handing over of site was 03.04.2023 and scheduled Date of Completion of work is 31.07.2023. As per Firm's request, the date of completion of work is extended up to 11.11.2023 with Compensation for Delay.

- Firm was intimated to improve work progress of work vide MPF Letters dtd. 30.05.2023, 05.07.2023, 25.07.2023, 12.09.2023, 10.10.2023, 26.10.2023 based on poor progress report from Site in Charge of work. However, there is no progress of this work on site.

c.) Replacement HT power cable from OFA to MPF WO. No. 01/15052023 dt. 15/05/2023
Total Value:-Rs. 64,69,900.00 PDC:-14/11/2023.

- The progress of this work is also far from satisfactory. The date of Handing over of site was 15.05.2023 and scheduled Date of Completion of work is 14.11.2023. However firm the work on 09.10.2023 & progress of work is very poor. The Firm has damaged one of the underground cable while excavation on 11.10.2023 & does not carry out necessary rectifications even after repeated reminders.

- Firm was intimated to improve work progress of work vide MPF Letters dtd. 30.05.2023, 19.06.2023, 25.07.2023, 16.08.2023, 16.10.2023 based on poor progress report from Site in Charge of work. However, progress of this work is far from satisfactory & it is unlikely to complete the work within original PDC i.e. 14.11.2023.

4. Further as per Tender Condition, all participating Firms are required to upload sealed and signed Declaration on Firm's Letterhead w.r.t. the Tender Documents mentioning that the 'Firm has read & understood all the conditions mentioned on each page of Tender Document, Instruction to Bidders, Eligibility Criteria, Technical Specifications & all other conditions before quoting for tender'.

5. It is observed that M/s Sagar Construction, M/s Kugan Construction & M/s Sunbud Multiventures Pvt. Ltd. have submitted required declaration. However M/s Jha P & Co. Ulhasnagar has uploaded declaration regarding Evaluation / Eligibility Criteria only. The Firm M/s Jha P & Co. Ulhasnagar was not requested to submit required declaration as the Firm is having very poor performance in ongoing Three awarded works at MTPF as illustrated above.

Vikas

	6. From the above deliberation and as illustrated under Para 3a, 3b & 3c, it is observed that one of the participating Firms i.e. M/s Jha P & Co. Ulhasnagar is having consistent poor performance in all three awarded works to Firm at MTPF Ambarnath and hence considered as not eligible. 7. Thus Three participating Firms except M/s Jha P & Co. Ulhasnagar are technically eligible and also have fulfilled required criteria of uploading / submission of sealed and signed declaration w.r.t. Tender Documents. Hence it is recommended for opening the price bids of Three technically eligible participating firms namely M/s Sagar Construction Co. Ulhasnagar, M/s Sunbud Multiventures Pvt Ltd, Ambarnath & M/s Kugan Construction Ambarnath.
12	Decision:
	MTPF CWC-I (Fy) after detailed deliberations decided to open the Price Bids of Three Technically Eligible participated firms namely, 1. M/s Sagar Construction Co., Ulhasnagar, 2. M/s Sunbud Multiventures Pvt Ltd, Ambarnath, 3. M/s Kugan Construction, Ulhasnagar.



(Vikas Poonia)
WM / Civil
(Member Secretary)



(S. M. Salve)
General Manager / Operations
(Member / Engg & User)



(Ms D. Chakravorty)
DGM / Finance
(Member/ Finance)



(P. K. Bummerkar)
Chief General Manager
(Chairman)

Signature Not Verified Page 6 of 6

Digitally signed by YOGESH ATMARAM
BHALERAO
Date: 2023.11.17 11:16:20 IST
Location: eProcurement System for Central
PSUs