

## MINUTES OF CWC-I MEETING HELD ON DATED

## FOR TECHNICAL EVALUATION

|                            |                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|----------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Name of work               | :                                                           | Replacement of Street Light Poles in MPF                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| Demand No.                 | :                                                           | ND - 2302                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| Administrative Approval No | :                                                           | 0503/13/2022-23/EO/MPF Dt. 17.07.2023.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| Code Head                  | :                                                           | 920/34 (Capital)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| T.E. NO.                   | :                                                           | 0503/13/2022-23/EO/MPF                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| Tender ID No.              | :                                                           | 2023_AVNL_162587_1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 1.                         | Nature of work                                              | : Replacement Street Lights Poles in MPF.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 2.                         | a) Basic Cost based on latest SSR without Market Variation. | : Rs. 95,23,000/-                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|                            | b) Market Variation                                         | : Nil                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|                            | c) Total Estimated Cost (a+b)                               | : Rs. 95.23 Lakhs (Rs Ninety Five Lakhs Twenty Three Thousand only)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 3.                         | Mode of Tender                                              | : Open tender Enquiry (OTE) through etenders.gov.in of Central Public Procurement Portal                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 4.                         | Bid Submission Starting Date & Time                         | : 03/08/2023 & 05.00 PM                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 5.                         | Bid Submission Closing Date & Time                          | : 17/08/2023 & 05.00 PM                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 6.                         | Corrigendum                                                 | : Yes<br>1. For extension of Bid submission closing & bid opening date as 28.08.2023 & 31.08.2023 resp. (Ref:EOC Noting No. 0503/13/2022-23/EO/MPF Dtd. 18.08.2023)<br>2. For extension of Bid submission closing & bid opening date as 07.09.2023 & 12.09.2023 resp. (Ref:EOC Noting No. 0503/13/2022-23/EO/MPF Dtd. 29.08.2023).<br>3. For extension of Bid submission closing & bid opening date as 27.09.2023 & 30.09.2023 resp. (Ref:EOC Noting No. 0503/13/2022-23/EO/MPF Dtd. 15.09.2023)<br>4. For extension of Bid submission closing & bid opening date as 07.10.2023 & 11.10.2023 resp. (Ref:EOC Noting No. 0503/13/2022-23/EO/MPF Dtd. 29.09.2023). |
| 7.                         | Tender Opening Date                                         | : 11/10/2023                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| 8.                         | Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) amount                          | : Rs. 1,67,845/-                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |

Vik

|    |                                                            |                                            |              |                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|----|------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|--------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 9. | The details of EMD submitted by the bidders are as follows |                                            |              |                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|    | Sl. No.                                                    | Name of the Civil Contractor               | EMD required | EMD DETAIL                                                                                                                                   | EMD Validity                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|    | 1.                                                         | M/s R. R. Electricals, Ambernath           | Yes          | FDR No. 503146 Dt. 21.08.2023 of Canara Bank Ambernath East Br. For Rs. 1,68,000/-<br><u>Date of submission to EOC MTPF - 14.09.2023</u>     | Up to 21.02.2024                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|    | 2.                                                         | M/s Adarsh Electricals, Thane              | Yes          | Demand Draft No. 632184 Dt. 11.10.2023 of SVC Co-op Bank Thane Br. For Rs. 1,67,845/-<br><u>Date of submission to EOC MTPF - 11.10.2023</u>  | Up to 11.01.2024<br>1. Firm initially made FDR in form of DD in the name of Armoured Vehicles Nigam Ltd. On Dtd. 27.09.2023 & uploaded same with online tender.<br>2. However, Firm vide email Dtd. 07.10.2023 requested to accept revised DD in the name of CGM MTPF & the same was submitted to EOC on 11.10.2023 |
|    | 3.                                                         | M/s HiTech Construction Group, Navi Mumbai | Yes          | Demand Draft No. 000546 Dt. 07.10.2023 of Bank of India Belapur Br. For Rs. 1,67,845/-<br><u>Date of submission to EOC MTPF - 07.10.2023</u> | Up to 08.02.2024                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|    | 4.                                                         | M/s Ajay Enterprises, Ulhasnagar           | Yes          | Demand Draft No. 017028 Dt. 17.08.2023 of IDBI Bank Ambernath East Br. For Rs. 1,70,000/-<br><u>Date of submission to EOC</u>                | 17.11.2023                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |

*Vikky*

|    |                                             |     |                                                                                                                                                       |                          |  |
|----|---------------------------------------------|-----|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------|--|
|    |                                             |     |                                                                                                                                                       | <u>MTPF - 17.08.2023</u> |  |
| 5. | M/s Sunbud Multiventures Pvt Ltd, Ambernath | Yes | FDR Sr. No. 7846796 for Dt. 12.09.2023 of IDBI Bank Ambernath Br. For Rs. 1,68,000/-<br><u>Date of submission to EOC MTPF - 13.09.2023</u>            | 12.12.2023               |  |
| 6. | M/s Jha P & Company, Ulhasnagar             | Yes | FDR Sr. No. 615799 for Dt. 13.09.2023 of Central Bank of India Ulhasnagar BR. For Rs. 1,67,845/-<br><u>Date of submission to EOC MTPF 14.09.2023.</u> | 13.09.2024               |  |

10.

|                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                            |                                                              |                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Eligibility Criteria as mentioned in the tender:                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                            |                                                              |                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| A)                                                                                                       | Experience of having successfully completed similar type of works during last 07 years ending last day of month previous to the one in which applications are invited should be either of the following: |                                                                                            |                                                              |                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|                                                                                                          | a)                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Three similar works each costing not less than 40% of the estimated cost. (Rs.38.09 Lakhs) |                                                              |                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|                                                                                                          | b)                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Two similar works each costing not less than 50% of the estimated cost. (Rs. 47.61 Lakhs)  |                                                              |                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|                                                                                                          | c)                                                                                                                                                                                                       | One similar work costing not less than 80% of the estimated cost. (Rs. 76.18 Lakhs)        |                                                              |                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| Details of the bidders with reference to eligibility criteria mentioned in technical bid are as follows. |                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                            |                                                              |                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| Sr. No.                                                                                                  | Name of Bidder                                                                                                                                                                                           | Estimated cost                                                                             | Value of work successfully completed by the contractor (Rs.) | Contract Agreement No./ Year of completion                         | (Remarks) Eligibility criteria                                                                                                                                                            |
| 1.                                                                                                       | M/s R. R. Electricals, Ambernath                                                                                                                                                                         | Rs. 95.23 Lakhs                                                                            | 1. 39,98,581.45<br>2.45,17,141.68                            | 1.OFA/Cont./035/<br>EOC of 2020-21<br>3.0503/13/2016-<br>17/EO/MPF | Not Complied<br>1. The work completion certificates uploaded by Firm were not sufficient as per Eligibility Criteria.<br>2. Hence EOC vide email Dtd. 20.10.2023 requested Firm to submit |

Vikky

|    |                               |                 |               |                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|----|-------------------------------|-----------------|---------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                               |                 |               |                                                                                                                     | another work completion certificates.<br>3. Firm vide email Dtd. 26.10.2023 intimated that 'at the time of submitting tender we have submitted all documents whatever firm is having'.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 2. | M/s Adarsh Electricals, Thane | Rs. 95.23 Lakhs | 1,14,46,000/- | Completion certificate Dtd. 03.02.2022 countersigned by M/s JSW for Order No. VSND/21-22/9100128742 Dtd. 04.10.2021 | <p><b>Complied</b></p> <p>1. The Firm submitted appreciation certificates from various Firms for works completed with online Tender. However cost of work completed is not mentioned in it.</p> <p>2. Hence EOC vide email Dtd. 20.10.2023 requested firm to submit work completion certificates as required.</p> <p>3. The firm vide email Dtd. 30.10.2023 forwarded project wise purchase orders &amp; completion certificates, one of which is considered for evaluation.</p> |

*Vikas*

|    |                                             |                 |                                    |                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|----|---------------------------------------------|-----------------|------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 3. | M/s HiTech Construction Group, Navi Mumbai  | Rs. 95.23 Lakhs | 9,79,36,590.00                     | NMMC/EE (E)/650/2022 DT. 04/10/2022 from Navi Mumbai Municipal Corp.               | Complied                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 4. | M/s Ajay Enterprises, Ulhasnagar            | Rs. 95.23 Lakhs | 1,01,87,000.00                     | SE/O&M/WRD/TECH DT. 02/02/2017 from MSEDCL Wardha Maharashtra                      | Complied                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 5. | M/s Sunbud Multiventures Pvt Ltd, Ambernath | Rs. 95.23 Lakhs | 1. 61,90,800.00<br>2. 51,21,980.00 | 1.AMC/ELE/129/2022-23 DT. 25/01/2023<br><br>2.AMC/PWD/2023-2024/750 DT. 11/09/2023 | Complied                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 6. | M/s Jha P & Company, Ulhasnagar             | Rs. 95.23 Lakhs | 74,94,263.00                       | Invoice No. 2022-23/568 dt. 31/03/2023 for Thane Municipal Corp. work.             | Not Complied<br><br>1. The completion certificate uploaded by Firm does not suffice the Eligibility criteria.<br><br>2. However no correspondence was carried out with Firm as the Firm has very poor performance in other three ongoing awarded |

*Vikas*

|                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                         |                                                                                  |                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                         |                                                                                  |                       | works at MTPF.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                         |                                                                                  |                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| B)                                                                              | Average Annual Turnover during last Three (03) years, ending 31st march of the previous financial year, will be at least 30% of the estimated cost. The bidder's financial capability will be decided based on the average annual turnover. |                         |                                                                                  |                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| The details of GSTIN and the Average annual turnover of bidders are as follows: |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                         |                                                                                  |                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| Sr. No.                                                                         | Name of Bidder                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | GSTIN                   | Average annual turnover of last three years<br>(FY 2020-21, 2021-22 & 2022-23)   | 30% of Estimated Cost | Remarks<br>(Eligibility criteria)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 1.                                                                              | M/s R. R. Electricals, Ambarnath                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 27AGQP<br>P4960N1<br>ZG | Rs. 83,70,616/-<br><br>Based on Fin. Year ending 2020, 2021 & 2022               | Rs. 28.56 Lakh        | Complied                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 2.                                                                              | M/s Adarsh Electricals, Thane                                                                                                                                                                                                               | 27ABDP<br>D2850M<br>1ZO | Rs. 20,22,20,617.00<br><br>Based on Fin. Year ending 202-20, 2020-21 & 2021-2022 | Rs. 28.56 Lakh        | Complied<br><br>1. The Firm did not uploaded Turnover certificate as per Eligibility Criteria along with tender.<br>2. Hence EOC vide email Dtd. 20.10.2023 asked firm to submit the same.<br>3. Firm vide email Dtd. 27.10.2023 submitted the Turnover certificate for FY 2018-19 to 2021-22 |

Vikas

|    |                                             |                         |                                                                       |                   |          |
|----|---------------------------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|----------|
| 3. | M/s HiTech Construction Group, Navi Mumbai  | 27ADGP<br>G9451N1<br>Z1 | Rs. 24,91,76,666.00<br>Based on Fin. Year ending<br>2020, 2021 & 2022 | Rs. 28.56<br>Lakh | Complied |
| 4. | M/s Ajay Enterprises, Ulhasnagar            | 27ADOP<br>T0028N<br>2Z0 | Rs. 2,12,78,361.00<br>Based on Fin. Year ending<br>2020, 2021 & 2022  | Rs. 28.56<br>Lakh | Complied |
| 5. | M/s Sunbud Multiventures Pvt Ltd, Ambernath | 27AAUC<br>S6940G1<br>ZR | Rs. 5,58,66,666.00<br>Based on Fin. Year ending<br>2020, 2021 & 2022  | Rs.28.56<br>Lakh  | Complied |
| 6. | M/s Jha P & Company, Ulhasnagar             | 27AFEPJ<br>4456N1<br>Z1 | Rs. 56 83 08 602.00<br>Based on Fin. Year ending<br>2020, 2021 & 2022 | Rs.28.56<br>Lakh  | Complied |

11. Deliberation/ discussion:
1. Total Six Firms participated in the subject Tender by submitting required EMD as per details mentioned under SI No. 9 above.
  2. Out of Six participated firms, Four Firms namely M/s Adarsh Electrical, Thane, M/s Hitech Construction, Belapur Navi Mumbai, M/s Ajay Enterprises, Ulhasnagar & M/s R R Electricals, Ambernath were requested to submit short fall documents as per Eligibility Criteria which were not uploaded during online tender submission. Further M/s Jha P & Co. Ulhasnagar was not requested to submit short fall documents required as per Eligibility Criteria as the Firm is having very poor performance in ongoing Three awarded works at MTPF. The details of these works & M/s Jha P & Co.'s performance against these awarded works is deliberated under Para 3. Below. Further the details of correspondences with other Firms are illustrated under Point 10 (A) & 10 (B) above.
  3. Details of civil works awarded to M/s Jha P & Co. Ulhasnagar at MTPF are appended as below:-
    - a.) Repairs/Renovation of East Gate & Main Gate at MPF, WO No. 17133 Dated:-02/12/2022  
Total Value Rs. 41,93,313.00 PDC:-04/02/2023 extended D.P: dated: 05/03/2023, 21/04/2023, 25/05/2023, 30/06/2023, 14/08/2023, 28/09/2023 & 11/11/2023 (Seven times).
      - The progress of work is very poor & also issues regarding bad workmanship were reported. Firm was expedited to improve progress of work vide MPF Letters Dtd. 02.02.2023, 17.02.2023, 22.02.2023, 28.02.2023, 02.03.2023, 21.03.2023, 27.03.2023, 05.04.2023, 28.04.2023, 01.06.2023, 23.06.2023, 06.07.2023, 22.08.2023, 12.09.2023, 16.10.2023, 23.10.2023.
      - The extensions [7 times] were issued to firm as it was necessary to complete work of East Gate as incomplete work offers unaesthetic look to main entry of Factory. CAG Local Test Audit Party-II vide Memo No. 07 dated: 16.10.2023 has raised the audit objection i.e. "The original work was to complete on 04.02.2023 as per work order. The same was extended 6<sup>th</sup> time up to 28.09.2023. Reason may please be elicited to Audit for giving 6<sup>th</sup> time extension for PDC. Why were necessary action not initiated against the firm such as cancellation of contract at Firm's risk & cost may be elicited to Audit". Reply for the same has been sent to Audit team.

*Trikes*

b.) Repairs to building No. 55 (MA-16) at MPF Ambernath WO. No.17604 dt. 18/03/2023 Total Value Rs.19,99,836.00 PDP: 31/07/2023 extended PDC: 11/11/2023.

- The progress of this work is also far from satisfactory. The date of Handing over of site was 03.04.2023 and scheduled Date of Completion of work is 31.07.2023. As per Firm's request, the date of completion of work is extended up to 11.11.2023 with Compensation for Delay.

- Firm was intimated to improve work progress of work vide MPF Letters dtd. 30.05.2023, 05.07.2023, 25.07.2023, 12.09.2023, 10.10.2023, 26.10.2023 based on poor progress report from Site in Charge of work. However, there is no progress of this work on site.

c.) Replacement HT power cable from OFA to MPF WO. No. 01/15052023 dt. 15/05/2023 Total Value Rs.64,69,900.00 PDC:-14/11/2023.

- The progress of this work is also far from satisfactory. The date of Handing over of site was 15.05.2023 and scheduled Date of Completion of work is 14.11.2023. However firm the work on 09.10.2023 & progress of work is very poor. The Firm has damaged one of the underground cable while excavation on 11.10.2023 & does not carry out necessary rectifications even after repeated reminders.

- Firm was intimated to improve work progress of work vide MPF Letters dtd. 30.05.2023, 19.06.2023, 25.07.2023, 16.08.2023, 16.10.2023 based on poor progress report from Site in Charge of work. However, progress of this work is far from satisfactory & it is unlikely to complete the work within original PDC i.e. 14.11.2023.

4. Further as per Tender Condition, all participating Firms are required to upload sealed and signed Declaration on Firm's Letterhead w.r.t. the Tender Documents mentioning that the 'Firm has read & understood all the conditions mentioned on each page of Tender Document, Instruction to Bidders, Eligibility Criteria, Technical Specifications & all other conditions before quoting for tender'.

5. It is observed that M/s Hitech Construction, Belapur Navi Mumbai & M/s Adarsh Electrical, Thane has not uploaded required declaration. It is also observed that M/s Jha P & Co. Ulhasnagar has uploaded declaration regarding Evaluation / Eligibility Criteria only.

6. Hence EO Civil vide email Dtd. 20.10.2023 requested M/s Hitech Construction, Belapur Navi Mumbai & M/s Adarsh Electrical, Thane to submit required sealed & signed declaration on Firm's letter head. Further M/s Jha P & Co. Ulhasnagar was not requested to submit required declaration as the Firm is having very poor performance in ongoing Three awarded works at MTPF as illustrated under Point 3 a, 3 b, 3c above.

7. In response M/s Hitech Construction, Belapur Navi Mumbai forwarded required declaration through email Dtd. 21.10.2023 (case file Pg. No. 200, 201) & M/s Adarsh Electrical, Thane forwarded required declaration through email Dtd. 28.10.2023 (case file Pg. No. 211).

8. From the above deliberation and from remarks against each Firm for Eligibility Criteria, it is noted that M/s R. R. Electricals, Ambernath is not technically eligible as per the Eligibility Criteria for successfully completing similar works during last 7 years. Further as illustrated under Para 3a, 3b & 3c, M/s Jha P & Co. Ulhasnagar is having consistent poor performance in all three awarded works to Firm at MTPF Ambernath and hence considered as not eligible.

Vikas

|     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|-----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|     | 9. Thus Four participating Firms [except M/s R. R. Electricals, Ambernath & M/s Jha P & Co. Ulhasnagar] are technically eligible and also have fulfilled required criteria of uploading / submission of sealed and signed declaration w.r.t. Tender Documents. Hence it is recommended for opening the price bids of four technically eligible participating firms namely M/s Adarsh Electricals, Thane, M/s Hi-Tech Construction Group, Navi Mumbai, M/s Ajay Enterprises, Ulhasnagar & M/s Sunbud Multiventures Pvt Ltd, Ambernath. |
| 12. | Decision:                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
|     | <p>MTPF CWC-I (Fy) after detailed deliberations decided to open the Price Bids of four Technically Eligible participated firms namely,</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. M/s Adarsh Electrical Thane,</li> <li>2. M/s Hi-Tech Construction Group, Navi Mumbai.</li> <li>3. M/s Ajay Enterprises, Ulhasnagar</li> <li>4. M/s Sunbud Multiventures Pvt Ltd, Ambernath.</li> </ol>                                                                                                                                           |



(Vikas Poonia)  
WM / Civil  
(Member Secretary)



(S. M. Salve)  
General Manager / Operations  
(Member / Engg)



(J. B. Meshram)  
General Manager / Services  
(Member / User)



(Ms D. Chakravorty)  
DGM / Finance  
(Member/ Finance)



(P. K. Bummerkar)  
Chief General Manager  
(Chairman)