

MINUTES OF CWC-I MEETING HELD ON DATED **22.08.2023** FOR PRICE BID EVALUATION

Name of work	:	Term Contract for Artificer's work for Civil Maintenance of Production & Non-Production Buildings inside Factory area at MPF Ambernath as per Items under MES SSR 2020.
Demand No.	:	RD - 2218
Administrative Approval No	:	0503/TC (Inside)/01/2023-24/EO/MPF Dt. 02.05.2023.
Code Head	:	809/01 (Revenue)
T.E. NO.	:	0503/TC (Inside)/01/2023-24/EO/MPF
Tender ID No.	:	2023_AVNL_154806_1
1.	Nature of work	: Term Contract for Artificer's work for Civil Maintenance of Production & Non-Production Buildings inside Factory area at MPF Ambernath as per Items under MES SSR 2020.
2.	a) Basic Cost based on latest SSR without Market Variation.	: Rs. 25,00,000/-
	b) Market Variation	: Nil
	c) Total Estimated Cost (a+ b)	: Rs. 25.00 Lakhs (Rs Twenty Five Lakhs only)
3.	Mode of Tender	: Open tender Enquiry (OTE) through etenders.gov.in of Central Public Procurement Portal
4.	Bid Submission Starting Date & Time	: 22/05/2023 & 05.00 PM
5.	Bid Submission Closing Date & Time	: 05/06/2023 & 05.30 PM
6.	Corrigendum (if any)	: No.
7.	Tender Opening Date & time	: 08/06/2023
8.	Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) amount	: Rs. 50,000/-
9.	Decision of CWC held on dated 17.07.2023 for Technical evaluation.	: MTPF CWC-I (Fy) after detailed deliberations decided to open Price Bids of Three Technically Eligible participated Firms namely: 1. M/s AGS Enterprises, Ambernath 2. M/s J. K. Enterprises, Ambernath 3. M/s Vijayan Enterprises, Ambernath.
10.	As per recommendation of CWC-I dated 17.07.2023, price bids of three eligible bidders were opened on 27.07.2023.	
	The details of bid received is shown below:	

	Sl. No.	Name of Firm	Amount as per quotation(Rs.)	Offer Valid up to		
	1	M/s J. K. Enterprises, Ambernath	25,00,000/- with 2.00% Below MES SSR 2020	05.09.2023	90 Days	
	2.	M/s AGS Enterprises, Ambernath	25,00,000/- with 2.00% Above MES SSR 2020	05.09.2023	90 Days	
	3.	M/s Vijayan Enterprises, Ambernath.	25,00,000/- with 6.00% Above MES SSR 2020	05.09.2023	90 Days	
11.	Freak rate quoted by L-1 bidder (if any)-					
	Item No.	Description	Quantity	Total estimated rate based on SSR+ MV %	Rate quoted by lowest bidder	Percentage above or below estimated rate
	NIL (Being Term Contract)					
	12. Analysis of L-1 bidder:					
	a)	Offer of L-1 (Lowest) bidder			M/s J. K. Enterprises, Ambernath with 2.00% Below MES SSR 2020	
	b)	Offer of L1 bidder above / below the estimated cost in percentage. (Based on SSR' + MV%, at time of estimation) (Estimated Cost: Rs. 25,00,000.00 + Nil above)			2.00% Below MES SSR 2020	
	c)	Offer of L1 bidder above / below the estimated cost in percentage. (Based on SSR 2020 + 0 %, at the time of analysis of the offer) (Estimated Cost: Rs. 25.00 Lakh)			2.00% Below MES SSR 2020	
13	Details of the correspondence done with the L1 bidder to obtain clarification of freak rates.- Nil (Being Term Contract)					
	Details of clarification received from the lowest bidder and details revised rates offered by the lowest bidder (if any): Nil					
	Item No.	Description	Quantity	Total estimated	Quoted % rate below/above	Revised Rate by

		cost (based on SSR-2020)	MES SSR-2020 by L-1	lowest bidder	estimated rate
Analysis of L-1 bidder:-					
a)	Revised Offer of L-1 (Lowest) bidder (if any)				M/s J. K. Enterprises, Ambernath with 2.00% Below MES SSR 2020
b)	Offer of L1 bidder above / below the estimated cost in percentage. (Based on SSR' + MV%, at time of estimation) (Estimated Cost: Rs. 25,00,000.00 + Nil above)				2.00% Below MES SSR 2020
c)	Offer of L1 bidder above / below the estimated cost in percentage. (Based on SSR 2020 + 0 %, at the time of analysis of the offer) (Estimated Cost: Rs. 25.00 Lakh)				2.00% Below MES SSR 2020

14. Deliberation/ discussion:

1. The offer submitted by the L-1 Firm M/s J. K. Enterprises, Ambarnath is 2.00% below MES SSR 2020.
2. It is noted that work order for similar work was placed in Fin. Year 2022-23 at 8.00% below MES SSR 2020. However, considering fact that the work is required to be carried out within Factory area i.e. restricted area and considering escalation of prices, the offer submitted by L-1 firm at 2.00% below MES SSR 2020 is considered as reasonable.
3. It is noted that issue regarding Negotiation with L-1 vendor is not mentioned in SOP for Civil Works in AVNL 2021. However Para 10.5.4 of SOP for Civil Works in AVNL states that MES Contract Manual to be referred on the issues not mentioned in SOP. Hence MES Contract Manual 2020 published vide MES Letter No. 66546/Manual/Revision/54/E8 Dtd. 06 July 2021.
4. As per Para 3.16.5 of MES Manual on Contract 2020, "No negotiations, even with the lowest tenderer, are permissible. Only when the lowest tender after detailed analysis is found competitive, reasonable and most acceptable as whole, but contains a few freakishly high rates having nominal financial effect, then under such circumstances only the freakishly high rates shall be referred to the lowest tenderer in writing for reconsideration and downward revision. If the lowest tenderer offers reduction, the same shall be accounted for in acceptance and if lowest tenderer declines to reduce the rates, tender may be accepted with freak high rates considering the overall quotation. Such freakishly high rates as well as freakishly low rates shall be dealt as per guidelines contained in Appendix 3.13".
5. In the subject case there are no Freak Rate being Term Contract where the Tenderer quotes in terms of percentage above or below MES SSR. Hence the Offer of L-1 Firm M/s J. K. Enterprises, Ambarnath which is 2.00% below MES SSR 2020 is considered as reasonable, keeping in view that subject work consists of all types of works from MES SSR 2020 which are required to be carried out inside Factory area with all security & safety

	procedures to be followed by the Contractor.
	6. Hence it is recommended to place the work order on L-1 Firm M/s J. K. Enterprises, Ambarnath for 2.00% below MES SSR 2020 for subject work.
15.	Decision:
	MTPF CWC-I (Fy) after detailed deliberations decided to place the work order for subject work on L-1 Firm M/s J. K. Enterprises, Ambarnath for Rs. 25.00 Lakh (Rs. Twenty Five Lakh Only) and at 2.00% below MES SSR 2020.


(Vikas Poonia)

WM / Civil
(Member Secretary)


(S. M. Salve)

General Manager / Operations
(Member / Engg & User)


(Imran Khan)

DGM / Finance
(Member/ Finance)


(P. K. Bummerkar)

Chief General Manager
(Chairman)