



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय - गांधीनगर (गुजरात)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India)

Regional Office - Gandhinagar (Gujarat)

दूरभाष / Phone : 079-29650607, 29650608 ई-मेल / e-mail : rogujarat@nhai.org

पहली मंजील, बी.एस.एन.एल. टेलीफोन एक्सचेंज बिल्डिंग, "च" रोड, सेक्टर-11, गांधीनगर-382011 (गुजरात)

1st Floor, BSNL Telephone Exchange Building, "CH" Road, Sector-11, Gandhinagar-382011(Gujarat)



NHAI/RO-GNR/Bhav-Tal/NH51/2022/IE/D- 600

Date: 01.03.2023

To,
All Bidders

Subject: "Independent Engineer (IE) services for Operation and Maintenance stage and balance construction work for four laning of Bhavnagar-Talaja section of NH - 51 from km. 07.090 to km 53.585 (Design Ch. From km 6.945 to km 54.990) (Pkg-1) through Hybrid Annuty Mode in the state of Gujarat." - **Technical Evaluation of Bids - Reg.**

Ref: (i) Bids submitted on 03.02.2023 for the above-mentioned work.

Dear Sir,

This is with reference to the bids submitted on 03.02.2023 for the subject proposal. The results with respect to Technical Evaluation as approved by the Competent Authority is as under:

Sr. No.	Name of the Bidder	Responsive/ Non-Responsive	Remark
1	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	Responsive	The bidder is technically responsive.
2	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	Responsive	The bidder is technically responsive.
3	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	Responsive	The bidder is technically responsive.
4	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP	Responsive	The bidder is technically responsive.

The detailed evaluation sheet is enclosed herewith. Bidders are given opportunity to respond within 7 days, in case of any objection and to submit the requisite details/documents within this period.

यह सक्षम प्राधिकारी के अनुमोदन से प्रस्तुत है।

(सुजीत कुमार)
महाप्रबंधक (तकनीकी)
कृते, क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय-गांधीनगर(गुजरात)

Name of the Project		Annexure-I
Independent Engineer (IE) services for Operation and Maintenance stage and balance construction work for four laning of Bhavnagar-Talaja section of NH - 51 from km. 07.090 to km 53.585 (Design Ch. From km 6.945 to km 54.990) (Pkg-1) through Hybrid Annuty Mode in the state of Gujarat.		
Length of the project (Km.)		48.05
List of the Applicants:-		
Applicant No:-	Name of the Applicant	Status of the Applicant Sole/JV/ Association
1	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	Association
2	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	Sole
3	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	Association
4	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP	Association

Name of the Project													
Independent Engineer (IE) services for Operation and Maintenance stage and balance construction work for four laning of Bhavnagar-Talaja section of NH - 51 from km. 07.090 to km 53.585 (Design Ch. From km 6.945 to km 54.990) (Pkg-1) through Hybrid Annuty Mode in the state of Gujarat.													
Annexure-I													
Average annual turnover from consultancy services after following enhancement factor													
Required annual turnover		5 cr											
RFP Invited in FY		2022-23											
S.No.	Name of Consultancy Firm/Entity (Sole Bidder/Bidder in JV)	Average annual turnover from consultancy services after following enhancement factor										Annual Average Turnover in Last 3 years 2017-18 to 2019-20	After FactorAnnual Average Turnover in Last 5 years 2015-16 to 2019-20
		2021-22		2020-21		2019-20		2018-19		2017-18			
		1.1	1.21	1.33	1.46	1.61							
1	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	113.70	125.07	105.00	127.05	89.10	118.50	98.49	143.80	70.00	112.70	123.54	125.42
2	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	211.23	232.35	195.78	236.89	130.79	173.95	98.08	143.20	72.02	115.95	214.40	180.47
3	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	140.27	154.30	123.23	149.11	114.39	152.14	91.26	133.24	82.02	132.05	151.85	144.17
4	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP	27.64	30.40	37.82	45.76	37.72	50.17	26.98	39.39	25.56	41.15	42.11	41.38

Independent Engineer (IE) services for Operation and Maintenance stage and balance construction work for four laning of Bhavnagar-Talaja section of NH - 51 from km. 07.090 to km 53.585 (Design Ch. From km 6.945 to km 54.990) (Pkg-1) through Hybrid Annuity Mode in the state of Gujarat.

MINIMUM ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA

S.No.	Name of the Applicants	Technical Capacity	Preparation of DPR (NH/SH/Equivalent)	Project Supervision/IC (NH/SH/Equivalent)		Annual Turnover	Whether the Applicant is Technical "Responsive" or "Non-Responsive".
		Technical Capacity Provisions for maximum works to be permitted with one consultant	The firm should have prepared DPR/FS cum PPR for at least two projects of 4/6 laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length.	The firm should have experience of project Supervision/IE of a. At least two construction projects of 4/6 laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6laning of 50% of project length	At least one O&M project under DBFOT / OMT /O&M of 4/6 laning** of 50%of project length	Annual turnover (updated average of last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) of the firm from consultancy business should be equal to or more thanRs.5 Crores	
1	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
2	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
3	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
4	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive

Independent Engineer (IE) services for Operation and Maintenance stage and balance construction work for four laning of Bhavnagar-Talaja section of NH - 51 from km. 07.090 to km 53.585 (Design Ch. From km 6.945 to km 54.990) (Pkg-1) through Hybrid Annuty Mode in the state of Gujarat.

Technical Capacity

S. No.	List of Applicant	Share	Sole/JV/ Association	Avg. annual Turnover of Firm in Last 3 FY in Crores	No. of Key Profession al on full time rolls (with form	Max. no. of project can be allotted as per RFP			Project Awarded			Remaining Technical Capacity	Eligible
						Total	DPR	AE/IE	Total	DPR	AE/IE	AE/IE	
1	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	NA	Association	123.54	44	25	25	18	5.25	2.75	2.50	15.50	Eligible
2	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	NA	Sole	214.40	60	40	40	30	30.36	1.70	28.66	1.34	Eligible
3	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	NA	Association	151.85	60	40	40	30	23.00	10.00	13.00	17.00	Eligible
4	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP	NA	Association	42.11	25	12	12	9	2.54	0.49	2.05	6.95	Eligible

Final Score

Name of the Project								
Independent Engineer (IE) services for Operation and Maintenance stage and balance construction work for four laning of Bhavnagar-Talaja section of NH - 51 from km. 07.090 to km 53.585 (Design Ch. From km 6.945 to km 54.990) (Pkg-1) through Hybrid Annuity Mode in the state of Gujarat.								
Summary of Marks								
Final Comparativ e Technical Evaluation Score.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*	Proposed work plan and Methodology	Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment#	Total	Rank of the Firm	whether the Technical Responsive Applicant/Bidder Eligible for opening of Financial proposal**
		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed		
	Maximum marks	35	5	20	40	100		
1	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	34.00	5.00	20.00	36.88	95.88	1	Responsive
2	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	34.50	5.00	20.00	35.85	95.35	2	Responsive
3	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	35.00	5.00	20.00	34.88	94.88	3	Responsive
4	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP	33.00	5.00	20.00	36.38	94.38	4	Responsive

Independent Engineer (IE) services for Operation and Maintenance stage and balance construction work for four laning of Bhavnagar-Talaja section of NH - 51 from km. 07.090 to km 53.585 (Design Ch. From km 6.945 to km 54.990) (Pkg-1) through Hybrid Annuty Mode in the state of Gujarat.

FIRMS RELEVANT EXPERIENCE FOR THE ASSIGNMENT

ANNEXURE-I

S.N o.	Applicant No.		1	3	4	2
	Description	Max Marks	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP
			Assesed	Assesed	Assesed	Assesed
1	Year of Establishment of the Firm (In case of JV year of establishment of Lead Member shall be considered)(Min 5 years)	2	2	2	2	2
	For 5 years - 1.5 marks	1.5				
	More than 5 years – 2 Marks	2	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
2	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business	2	2	2	2	1.5
	For 5-10 Crores- 0.5 mark	0.5				
	For 10-20 Crores- 1 mark	1				
	20-50 Crores- 1.5 marks	1.5				1.5
	For >50 Crores - 2 marks	2	2	2	2	
3	Nos. of Key Professionals with the firm *	2	2	2	2	2
	< 4 personnel - 0 marks	0				
	4 to 12 - Linearly varying from 0.25 to 2					
	> 12 personnel - 2 marks	2	2	2	2	2
4	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Authority Engineer/Supervision Consultant two construction projects of four/six laning ** of 30% of project length each or one projects of four/six laning ** of 50% project length in last 7 years.	6	6	6	6	6
	2 construction projects 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each -4marks Or 1 construction project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks	4	4	4	4	4
	Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 2 (two) mark.	2	2	2	2	2
5	Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project t of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years	5	4	4.5	5	4
	2 project 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4 marks Or 1 project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4	4	4	4	4	4
	Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks.	1	0	0.5	1	0
6	In hand DPRs of NHAI Projects (presently under progress)	10	10	10	10	10
	More than Project Length i.e. 86.74 km	5				
	More than 2 times of Project Length i.e. 173.48 km	7.5				
	More than 3 times of Project Length i.e.260.22 km	10	10	10	10	10
7	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFOT/ OMT/ O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years	8	8	8	8	7.5
	1 project - 6 marks	6	6	6	6	6
	Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks	2	2	2	2	1.5
	Total	35	34	34.5	35	33

Supervision Consultancy (SC) services during O&M stage of Six Laning of Surat-Dahisar Section of NH-8 from Km 263.000 to Km 502.000 (Length Km 239.000) in the state of Gujarat and Maharashtra executed as BOT (Toll) on DBFO pattern NHDP Phase V.

Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection

Applicant No.	Max Marks	1	2	3	4
		M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP
		Assesed	Assesed	Assesed	Assesed
Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection	5	5	5	5	5
Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2
Own Equipment	2				
1-2 projects	1				
3-5 projects	2				
>5 projects	3	3	3	3	3
Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement	4	4	4	4	4
Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2
Own Equipment	2				
1-3 projects	1				
> 3 projects	2	2	2	2	2
Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit (MBIU) or better technology for bridges inspection	4	4	4	4	4
Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2
Own Equipment	2				
1-3 projects	1				
>3 projects	2	2	2	2	2
Experience in Retro reflectometer technology	4	4	4	4	4
Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2
Own Equipment	2				
1-3 projects	1				
>3 projects	2	2	2	2	2
Experience in Automatic Traffic Counter cum Classifier	3	3	3	3	3
Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2
Own Equipment	2				
1-3 projects	0.50				
>3 projects	1	1	1	1	1
Total	20	20	20	20	20

Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology

Description		M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.
	Maximum Marks	Marks assessed	Marks assessed	Marks assessed	Marks assessed
Site Appreciation	1	1	1	1	1
(i) Average 0.50 (ii) Good 0.75 (iii) Very Good 1.00					
Quality of Approach and Methodology	2	2	2	2	2
(Review of scope of work and design review, construction supervision methodology, contract management approach, safety review/audit and O&M stage, initial view on project plan including key challenges envisaged and potential solutions to be judged). (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00					
Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan	2	2	2	2	2
(i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00					
Total Marks	5	5	5	5	5

Summary Sheet of CV's														
S. No.	Details	Total Marks	1			2			3			4		
			M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited			M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.			M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.			M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP		
			Name	Score	Weighted score	Name	Score	Weighted score	Name	Score	Weighted score	Name	Score	Weighted score
1	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	17	Avnish Kumar	95	16.15	M Hazarath Ali	86	14.62	Rahul Ballabh	85	14.45	Vijay Kumar Gupta	88.5	15.05
2	Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer	13	S.B Jesabhai	86	11.18	Sunil Kumar Shrivastava	91	11.83	Shiv Kishore Sharma	86	11.18	Shriram Bajaj	91	11.83
3	Bridge / Structural Engineer	5	C.A.Mini	96	4.80	Ajay Kumar	88	4.40	Anil Kumar	91	4.55	R S Chakule	95	4.75
4	Road Safety Expert	5	Dr. Pratap Singh	95	4.75	Jayant Mishra	100	5.00	Vinod Sharma	94	4.70	Rajeev Roy	95	4.75
		40			36.88			35.85			34.88			36.38

Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer						
	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1	2	3	4
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP
	Name of Key Personnel		Avnish Kumar	M Hazarath Ali	Rahul Ballabh	Vijay Kumar Gupta
	Description		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25				
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering	4	4	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70				
a)	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:					
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	30	30	30	30	30
	< 10 years -0					
	10 years -22					
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.					
ii)	Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M of completed 4/6 lane highway sections	35	35	30	30	32.5
	< 3 years - 0					
	3 years - 30					
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.					
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in Highway Development Projects taken up under PPP	5	5	5	4	5
	1 Project- 4 Marks					
	add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks					
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0
	< 1 year -0					
	1 year -3					
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks					
	Total	100	95	86	85	88.5
	Weightage @ 17	17	16.15	14.62	14.45	15.045

Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer						
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1	2	3	4
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP
	Name of Key Personnel		S.B Jesabhai	Sunil Kumar Shrivastava	Shiv Kishore Sharma	Shriram Bajaj
	Description		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25				
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21
	Post Graduation in Highway Engineering- 04marks	4	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70				
	Professional Experience					
i)	Experience in highway works (inspection /design/ construction/ maintenance)	30	30	30	30	30
	< 7 years -0					
	7 years -22					
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.					
ii)	Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature	15	15	15	15	15
	< 3 year - 0					
	3 years -12					
	Add one marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.					
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/ Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/ Expressways	25	20	25	20	25
	1 project -20					
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.					
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0
	< 1 year -0					
	1 year -3					
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks					
	Total	100	86	91	86	91
	Weightage @ 13	13	11.18	11.83	11.18	11.83

Bridge / Structural Engineer						
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1	2	3	4
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP
	Name of Key Personnel		C.A.Mini	Ajay Kumar	Anil Kumar	R S Chakule
	Description		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25				
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70				
i)	Total Professional Experience	30	30	30	30	30
	< 7 years -0					
	7 years -22					
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks					
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Design/Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Flyover/Interchanges/any other such structures including rehabilitation	20	20	20	20	20
	< 3years -0					
	3 years - 16					
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.					
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation of 4/6 lane highway/Expressway or similar projects.	20	20	17	20	19
	1 NOS -16					
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional Project subject to maximum 4(Four) marks					
3	Employment with the Firm	5	5	0	0	5
	< 1 year -0					
	1 year -3					
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks					
	Total	100	96	88	91	95
	Weightage @ 5	5	4.8	4.4	4.55	4.75

Road Safety Expert						
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1	2	3	4
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	M/s Artefact Projects Limited in association with Renaissance IOT LLP
	Name of Key Personnel		Dr. Pratap Singh	Jayant Mishra	Vinod Sharma	Rajeev Roy
	Description		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25				
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Traffic/Transportation/Safety Engineering	4	4	4	4	4
2	Adequacy for the Project	70				
i)	Professional Experience					
	Total Professional Experience	30	30	30	30	30
	< 7 years -0					
	7years -22					
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.					
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety works on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (4/6 laning**) and above).	20	20	20	19	20
	> 3Years-0					
	3 years -17					
	Add one marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.					
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audits of 4/6-laning** Highway/Expressway projects	15	15	15	15	15
	1 nos -12					
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 3(three) marks					
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in preparation of Road Safety Management Plan for Inter Urban Highways.	5	5	5	5	5
	1 project- 3					
	More than 1 project - 5					
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	5	0	0
	< 1 year - 0					
	1 year - 3					
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks					
	Total :	100	94	94	94	95
	Weightage @ 5	5	4.75	4.75	4.75	4.75

Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by AJAY KUMAR SWAMI
Date: 2023.03.01 18:40:24 IST
Location: eProcurement System for Central PSUs

