

MINUTES OF MEETING

Sub: RFP for Consultancy Services for Supervision Consultants of Operation & Maintenance of Dalkhola to Ghoshpukur Section [including Islampur Bypass] of NH-31 from km 447+000 to km 551+000 in the state of West Bengal - **Final Evaluation of Technical Proposal - Reg.**

Venue: NHAI, RO-Kolkata

Date: 05 Apr 2023

As per observations of the Committee, both the participated firms, (1) M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt Ltd & (2) M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd were fulfilling the requirement with respect to Technical capacity provision for maximum works to be permitted with one Consultant as per Clause 16(C). In this context, Evaluation Committee in its meeting dated 16 Mar 2023 decided the following:-

(a) upload the result of Technical Evaluation of above mentioned 02 (two) nos bidders on the NHAI website giving opportunity to the bidders to respond within 7 days in case they have any objections before opening of Financial Bids as per RFP provision.

(b) Intimation is to be given to the Concessionaires/ Contractor of the subject project for any conflict of interest.

2. According to the above decision, both the participated firms were asked to provide their comments in respect of Technical capacity & Technical result assessed by the Authority.

3. Presently the entire stretch of Dalkhola to Ghoshpukur section of NH-31 is under O&M stage being maintained by PIU-Jalpaiguri. Therefore, letter for conflict of interest with the Contractors/ Concessionaire was not issued.

4. M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Ltd has not raised any objections regarding Technical capacity or Technical marks obtained by them. However, M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt Ltd vide their letter no LASA/BD/Clarification/NHAI/IE O&M/WB/D-G/71693/2023 dated 23 Mar 2023 has raised few objections and requested Authority for necessary consideration.

5. The Details of compliance given by the Firm's and comments of the committee is as follows:

Sl. No.	Description	Max Marks	Marks Recommended by Committee	Remarks given by Committee	Marks Claimed by Firm for Review	Compliance given by the Firm	Final Marks given by the committee	Comments
A. M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt Ltd								
1	Road Safety Expert	4	2.24	In the experience certificate, the firm has certified that, Candidate has worked as Dy Engineer, However in the Undertaking, the candidate has claimed to have worked as Road Safety Engineer.	3.84	Letter dated 23 Mar 2023 alongwith marks obtained by the proposed personnel in similar tender at NHAI HQ has been attached.	3.84	Based on the submission of the Firm and based on undertaking given by the candidate in Infracon Portal, the Committee accepts the submission of the bidder.

[Signature]

[Signature]

[Signature]

[Signature]

6. As per Clause 5.3 (i) of RFP, the technical proposal should score atleast 75 points to be considered responsive. The Authority shall shortlist 5 (five) top firms on the basis of their technical score on the basis of their technical score not in the conflict of interest with the Concessionaire. In this instant case, both the participated firms have scored more than 75 points.

7. Further, there were calculation errors in giving weightage on Key Professional Staff. The same has been rectified in the below mentioned Table.

8. The bidder wise Final technical Scores are tabulated as under:-

Sr N o.	Name of Firm	Relevant experience for the assignment		Quality of approach and methodology		Experience in use of technology and road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Total	
		35		05		20		40		100	
		Claime d	Assesse d	Claimed	Assesse d	Claimed	Assesse d	Claime d	Assesse d	Claime d	Assesse d
1	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt Ltd	35	35	5	5	20	20	37.45	36.50	97.45	96.50
2	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd	35	35	5	5	20	20	37.3	36.85	97.3	96.85

9. As per assessment of Technical capacity & reassessment of Technical Scores, the committee unanimously decided to declare the following firms as Technically responsive and recommends for opening of the Financial Bids at the earliest date as per convenient to the Committee members, subject to approval of Competent Authority:-

(i) M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt Ltd

(ii) M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd

10. The date of opening of Financial e-bids may be intimated to the above mentioned Technically responsive bidders for their information.

11. The meeting concluded with vote of thanks to Chair.


L P Bhagat
Dy Manager (F&A)
FARO-Kolkata
Member


A Sharma
Dy Manager (Tech)
RO-Kolkata
Member


D K Choudhary
Project Director
PIU-Kolkata
Member Secretary


S K Sharma
Project Director
PIU-Jalpaiguri
Chairperson

Submitted for approval of Competent Authority: