



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय - गांधीनगर (गुजरात)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India)

Regional Office - Gandhinagar (Gujarat)

दूरभाष / Phone : 079-29650607, 29650608 ई-मेल / e-mail : rogujarat@nhai.org

पहली मंजील, बी.एस.एन.एल. टेलीफोन एक्सचेंज बिल्डिंग, "च" रोड, सेक्टर-11, गांधीनगर-382011 (गुजरात)

1st Floor, BSNL Telephone Exchange Building, "CH" Road, Sector-11, Gandhinagar-382011(Gujarat)



BHARATMALA
ROAD TO PROSPERITY

NHAI/PIU-Godhra/IE-O-M/VME/Pkg-I,II,III/2022-23/D-527

Dated: 23.02.2023

To

All Bidders (As per list enclosed)

Sub: Consultancy services for Independent Engineer (IE) services during O&M period for construction of 8L VME from km 355 to km 378.74 (Pkg I-Padra To Vadodara), from km 323 To km 355 (Pkg II -Sanpa To Padra) And From km 292 To km 323 (Pkg III - Manubar To Sanpa) in the state of Gujarat on HAM. - **Technical Evaluation of Bids - Reg.**

Ref: (i) Bids submitted on 06.01.2023 for the above-mentioned work.
(ii) RO Gujarat letter No. 311 dated 03.02.2023

Dear Sir,

Kindly refer NHAI letter dated 03.02.2023 vide which result of technical evaluation was intimated to the bidders and bidders were given opportunity to respond within seven days in case of any objection.

2. The representations were received from below-mentioned bidder:

S.No.	Name of Applicant
1	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited.

3. The representation as received had been examined by the constituted Evaluation Committee and reply to the representation as approved by Competent Authority is enclosed at Annexure- I.

4.1 A complaint was received against the CV of Mr. Raj Prasad Singh, Bridge/Structural Engineer proposed by M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited for misrepresenting his employment/ work experience, and attaching a fake experience certificate which was not issued by the employer (the complainant). The experience as claimed by the Key Personnel on Infracon was found to be contradicting with the experience as mentioned in his joining letter and the resignation letter of Mr. Raj Prasad Singh produced by the employer (the complainant) along with the complaint.

Accordingly, the same was intimated to M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited and Mr. Raj Prasad Singh vide letter No. NHAI/PIU-Godhra/IE-O-M/VME/Pkg-I,II,III/2022-23/D-419 dated 13.02.2023 directing to respond within 3 days. However, no response has been received from the bidder and/or the key personnel. In this view, 0 (zero) marks have been awarded to the CV of above mentioned key personnel.

4.2 The result of technical evaluation was uploaded vide letter No. NHAI/PIU-Godhra/IE-O-M/VME/Pkg-I,II,III/2022-23/D-311 dated 03.02.2023 on e-tender portal, in which the CV

of Mr. Nawal Kishor Singh, ATMS Expert proposed by M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. was awarded 88 marks.

However, it was later noted that as per the INFRACON CV of the said key personnel, Mr. Nawal Kishore Singh, he has graduated in B.Sc. (Science), which does not meet the minimum academic qualification requirements. Since the CV does not meet the minimum academic qualification, the overall score of his CV is awarded 0 (zero) as per clause 3.4 vii) f. of Section 2 (Letter of Invitation to Consultants) of RFP.

5. In view of the above considerations, the result of technical evaluation is as under-

S. No.	Name of Firm	Original Technical Score	Final Technical Score
1	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited.	97.77	97.77
2	M/s MSV International Inc in association with Manglam Associates.	96.55	96.55
3	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	94.51	90.11
4	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited.	94.76	89.69

5. The financial bids of the above technically responsive bidders will be opened on **24.02.2023 at 1500 Hrs** at RO Gujarat. Accordingly, the bidders may depute their representatives with authorization letter for attending the opening of financial bids.

यह सक्षम प्राधिकारी के अनुमोदन से प्रस्तुत है।



(सुजीत कुमार)

महाप्रबंधक (तकनीकी)

क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय-गांधीनगर(गुजरात)

ANNEXURE-I

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply
A.	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.	
1.	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFOT/OMT/O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years 1 project - 6 marks Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks. As per marks assessed by bidder, marks to be increased from 7.5 to 8	Those projects in which client completion certificate is not provided in the bid, have not been considered. In this view, the marks awarded in this criterion remains unchanged.
2.	Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00 As per marks assessed by bidder, marks to be increased from 1.5 to 2	No change in marks.
3.	Bridge/Structural Engineer - Mr. Raj Prasad Singh Experience in similar capacity in Construction/ Construction Supervision of Bridge/ Interchange/ any other structure including rehabilitation of 4/6 lane highway/expressway o similar project. 1 Project -16 Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) mark Reference Project No. 7,9,11,13,14 on INFRACON Profile. Marks awarded -13 Marks self assessed by the bidder - 15	CV awarded 0 (zero) marks as CV was found to be inflated in view of the complaint received regarding inflated CV.
4.	Road Safety Expert - Sunil Bhargava Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Works of Major Highway Projects (4/6 laning Projects) < 3years -0 3years -17 Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3(three) marks.	Marks in this sub-criterion increased from 18 (earlier) to 20.
5.	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audit of 4/6 lane highway/Expressway projects.	Marks in this sub-criterion increased from 14 (earlier) to 15.







S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply																											
	1 nos. -12 mks Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 3(three) marks. Total 5 nos. (Ref. bid page no. 1186-1187)	<table><tr><th>S. No.</th><th>Description</th><th>Marks assessed earlier</th><th>Marks now assessed</th></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>Firm Experience</td><td>34.50</td><td>34.50</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>Proposed work plan & Methodology</td><td>4.50</td><td>4.50</td></tr><tr><td>3</td><td>Use of Technology</td><td>20.00</td><td>20.00</td></tr><tr><td>4</td><td>Key personnel</td><td>35.76</td><td>30.69</td></tr><tr><td></td><td>Total</td><td>94.76</td><td>89.69</td></tr></table>				S. No.	Description	Marks assessed earlier	Marks now assessed	1	Firm Experience	34.50	34.50	2	Proposed work plan & Methodology	4.50	4.50	3	Use of Technology	20.00	20.00	4	Key personnel	35.76	30.69		Total	94.76	89.69
S. No.	Description	Marks assessed earlier	Marks now assessed																										
1	Firm Experience	34.50	34.50																										
2	Proposed work plan & Methodology	4.50	4.50																										
3	Use of Technology	20.00	20.00																										
4	Key personnel	35.76	30.69																										
	Total	94.76	89.69																										

[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]