

**NATIONAL HIGHWAYS AUTHORITY OF INDIA
MADURAI REGION**

Minutes of Meeting of Tender Evaluation Committee (Technical Evaluation) dated 04.11.2022 for the work of "Operation & Maintenance for One Year from Km 0+000 to Km 16+376 including Incident management in Nagercoil to Kavalkinaru Section of NH-47B in the State of Tamil Nadu (2nd Call) (Tender Ref. No. NHAI/17011/01/59/2022).

1. Regional Office, NHAI, Madurai invited bids vide Tender ID 2022_NHAI_131971_1 for the works of "Operation & Maintenance for One Year from Km 0+000 to Km 16+376 including Incident management in Nagercoil to Kavalkinaru Section of NH-47B in the State of Tamil Nadu (2nd Call)" with an estimated cost of Rs.193.82 Lakh (excluding GST).

2. A committee has been constituted with the following members to carry out tender evaluation;

- i. Shri Umesh K Garg, DGM (T), RO-Madurai - Convenor
- ii. Shri T Velraj, DGM(T) & PD Nagercoil - Member
- iii. Shri S Thamizharasan, Manager(T), RO-Madurai - Member
- iv. Shri Mahendra Meena, Dy. Manager (T), RO-Madurai - Member
- v. Shri B Somasundaram, Head, F&A Unit, RO-Madurai - Member

3. Last Date of submission of bids and Technical bid opening was scheduled on 28th and 29th October, 2022 respectively.

4. As per MoRTH Circular No. RW/NH-37010/4/2010-EAP (Printing) Vol.IV Dated 30.04.2020, evaluation of bids can be carried out with the available scanned copy of documents as per RFP requirement. However, successful bidder has to submit the Original Documents physically with the concerned authority before issue of LOA.

5. Accordingly, the Committee opened the e-bids submitted through online and decrypted. Totally 3 Nos. of Bids were received through online. The details of bids received and Financial Instruments submitted by bidders were furnished to Accounts Division. In response, Accounts Division has confirmed the receipt of bid document cost towards bid document fee and Bid Security.

6. Subsequently, the Committee has admitted & evaluated the 3 Nos. of bids on 04.11.2022 based on available scanned copies and the detailed technical evaluation as furnished vide Annexure-A. Summary of the same is submitted hereunder:

S. No	Name of Bidder	Bid ID	Recommendations
1	Shri M Muthukrishnan, Tirunelveli	477277	Qualified
2	M/s SK Constructions, Visakhapatnam	481563	Qualified
3	M/s Enfive Systems Private Limited, Dindigul	481844	Disqualified

Detailed Technical Evaluation is under Annexure-A

[Signature]

[Signature]

[Signature]

[Signature]
04/11/22

[Signature]

7. As above, with reference to the bid received from Shri M Muthukrishnan, Tirunelveli (Bid ID: 477277), it is to submit that, though the bidder has furnished all machinery/documents in compliance with the criteria set forth in RFP, upon examining the details of Qualification Information submitted by the bidder, it is observed that, documentary evidence for the same has not been furnished as per Clause-1 of Section-III of RFP. In this regard, it is submitted that, this bidder has been awarded several O&M works by NHAI in the past and currently conducting several O&M works as per attached LOA issued by NHAI. Hence, looking at the urgency of work (As this is 2nd call) and to avoid the situation of single bid, RO-Madurai vide email dated 01.11.22 has sought clarification to the bidder, in response, Shri M Muthukrishnan, Tirunelveli vide email dated 02.11.22 has submitted the clarification along with necessary documents. Hence, tender evaluation committee has recommended to consider the bid as "Responsive".

8. Further, with reference to the bid received from M/s SK Constructions, Visakhapatnam (Bid ID: 481563), it is to submit that, the bidder has furnished all requisite qualification details and the similar work experiences for technical qualification criteria. In this regard, in order to qualify the bidder w.r.t. technical criteria set-forth in RFP, the Committee has recommended to obtain confirmation from the concerned Authority before considering the bid for technical evaluation. Accordingly, RO-Madurai vide email dated 01.11.22 has sought confirmation for the project experience as submitted by the bidder to the experience certificate issued Authority i.e. PD, PIU, Visakhapatnam. In response, PD, PIU, Visakhapatnam vide email dated 02.11.22 has given confirmation for the requisite project experience for the Bidder. Hence, tender evaluation committee has recommended to consider the bid as "Responsive".

9. With reference to the bid received from M/s Enfive Systems Private Limited, Dindigul (Bid ID: 481844), it is to submit that, the bidder has submitted all requisite documents, machinery, CVs of Key Personnel, etc., in compliance with the criteria set forth in RFP. However, on perusing the submitted documents it is found that the bidder has submitted one similar O&M work experience certificate i.e. "Routine Maintenance and Incident Management for the project Highway from Km 138/800 to Km 266/865 of NH-45B of Madurai - Tuticorin section in Tamil Nadu" issued by the Project Manager, M/s Madurai - Tuticorin Expressways Limited vide letter dated 20.07.2021. The said stretch is awarded to the Concessionaire i.e. M/s Madurai - Tuticorin Expressways Ltd., Hyderabad by the Competent Authority of NHAI as per the Concession Agreement signed on 24.07.2006. In this regard, it is to state that as per Section-III, Clause 1.4 (a) of RFP, "In case of nominated/approved sub-contractor - a certificate from the Executive Engineer or equivalent of the Prime Employer should be obtained from whom an approval for subcontractor has been obtained".





x T. V. V. V. V.


04/11/22



10. In this regard, earlier, PD, PIU-Tuticorin was requested vide RO-Madurai letter no. 2337 dated 28.09.2022 to confirm whether the firm/company of M/s Enfive Systems Pvt. Ltd., Dindigul is an approved sub-contractor of NHAI for the aforesaid work in order to qualify the bidder and finalize the technical evaluation. In response, PD-Tuticorin vide letter no.1208 dated 30.09.2022 has submitted that, the bidder was not engaged as a sub-contractor in the said project work. Since, the bidder has not submitted the similar work experience set forth in Clause 4.4 A (b) of RFP. Also, the another work experience submitted by the bidder is not satisfying the qualification criteria set forth in RFP. Hence, the tender evaluation Committee has recommended to consider the bid as "Non-responsive".

In view of the above, the Committee recommends to accept the bids received from (i) Shri M Muthukrishnan, Tirunelveli and (ii) M/s SK Constructions, Visakhapatnam. Further, the bid received from M/s Enfive Systems Private Limited, Dindigul shall be considered as "Non-Responsive" citing non-compliance towards the specific technical criteria set forth in RFP. Committee further decided to meet at a convenient date to open & evaluate financial bids of the technically qualified bidders upon approval of Competent Authority.


(B. Somasundaram)
Member


(T. Velraj)
Member


(Umesh K Garg)
Convenor


(Mahendra Meena)
Member


(S. Thamizharasan)
Member

S. No	Name of the Contractor Qualifying Criteria	Requirement as per Bid Document	Shri M. Muthukrishnan, Tirunelveli (477277)				M/s SK Constructions, Visakhapatnam (481563)				M/s Enfive Systems Private Limited (481844)					
1	Cost of tender document	Rs 50,000/-	Ref No. NIL Tamilnad Mercantile Bank Transfer Rs. 50,000/- dated 15.10.2022 (Pg 1)				Ref No. 963107921 dated 27.10.2022 NEFT by ICICI Bank (Pg 2)				Ref No. 963755178 NEFT Rs. 50,000/- dated 27.10.2022 (Pg 3)					
2	Bid Security	Bid Securing (EMD) viz., BG/DD for an amount of Rs. 3,88,000/-	DD No. 765314 Dated 17.10.2022 for an amount of Rs. 4,00,000/- by Tamilnad Mercantile Bank, Palayamkottai (Pg 2)				DD No. 507465 dated 19.10.2022 for an amount of Rs. 3,88,000/- by ICICI Bank, Madurai (Pg 4)				DD No. 501376 Dated 27.10.2022 for an amount of Rs. 3,88,000/- by ICICI Bank, Madurai (Pg 4)					
3	Average Annual Turn over for Last 3 years.	Rs. 58.15 Lakh	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakh)	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakh)	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakh)		
			2019-20	1008.21	1.33	1340.92	2019-20	543.15	1.33	722.39	2019-20	418.09	1.33	556.06		
			2020-21	1073.82	1.21	1299.32	2020-21	904.62	1.21	1094.59	2020-21	314.14	1.21	380.11		
			2021-22	1239.18	1.10	1363.10	2021-22	1405.21	1.10	1545.73	2021-22		1.10	0.00		
			Total			4003.34	Total			3362.71	Total			936.17		
			Average Turnover (pg 15)			1334.45	Average Turnover (pg 29)			1120.90	Average Turnover (pg 51)			312.06		
4	Similar nature of work completed during the last 7 years	One Similar completed Work costing not less than amount equals to 155.06 Lakhs or Two Similar completed Works costing not less than amount equal to each of 96.91 Lakhs or Three Similar completed Works costing not less than amount equal to each of 77.53 Lakhs	Repair and Maintenance of the stretches for Package No.NHA/IVPM/NH-66/R&M/2015-16/03 in section-II from Km 166/620 to Km 219/782 from Singarapettai to Krishnagiri of Section NH-66 in the State of Tamil Nadu. value of work done Rs 7,83,81,686.50/- Work Completed on 12.12.2015. Work Experience Certificate issued by the Project Director NHA, Viluppuram vide letter no. 2101 dated 19.09.2019 (pg 89)				Short term improvement and Routine Maintenance of Anandapuram - Visakhapatnam - Anakapalli from Km 682/980 to Km 741/256 of NH-16 in the State of Andhra Pradesh value of work done Rs 2,66,81,035/- certificate issued by PD, PUI, Visakhapatnam dated 03.01.2022. (Pg 20)				Nil					
5	Registration	Organisation Registered with Central, State Government, P&T/CPWD, Railways / State PWD and other Govt. organisations	Registration No.11/2008-2009 1st class Contractor's code 02-TV-A-0051-S renewed vide letter No. 1162/2022 2023/C.R. (10 Yr) /D-1 dated 12.05.2022 valid upto 31.03.2023 (Pg 4)				Registration No. 410 of 2019 by the Government of Andhra Pradesh vide letter No. AP15 76919/17 dated 01.04.2019 (Pg 12)				Registration No. U74900TZ2014PTC021491 dated 28.08.2014. (Pg 15)					
(i)	Place of Registration		Tirunelveli				Visakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh				Dindigul					
(ii)	Principal Place of Business		Tirunelveli				Visakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh				Dindigul					
6	Power of Attorney to sign the bid document	Furnished / Not Furnished	Not applicable				Furnished (Pg 7-9)				Not applicable					
7	Bid Validity 165 days after the date of bid submission	Furnished / Not Furnished	Furnished (Pg 6)				Furnished (Pg 110)				Furnished (Pg 66)					
8	Bid Capacity Available assessed bid (A x N x 2.5 - B) (Cl 4.6)	Rs. 193.82 Lakh	Rs.3307.745 Lakhs (Pg 12)				Rs 3864.325 Lakhs (Pg 24)				Rs 1076.02 Lakhs (Pg 6)					
9	Evidence of availability of lay equipments (either owned, lease or rented)	Requirement as per Bid Document (Age: Max 5 Years)	Nos.	Age (Years) should not be aged more than 2/5 years as on bid due date i.e. 10.09.2022	Owned	Leased	Total Nos.	Remarks	Owned	Leased	Total Nos.	Remarks	Owned	Leased	Total Nos.	Remarks
		Patrol Vehicle	1	2	1	0	1	Owned RC Copy furnished (Pg 18)	1	0	1	Owned RC Copy furnished (Pg 48)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC Copy furnished (Pg 70-73)
		Crane of 20 Tonne Capacity	1	2	1	0	1	Owned RC Copy furnished (Pg 19)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC Copy furnished (Pg 49-51)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC Copy furnished (Pg 74-76)
		Mechanical Broom with VTS	1	2	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with invoice Copies furnished (Pg 20-21)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC Copy & invoice furnished (Pg 49-52)	1	0	1	Owned invoice furnished (Pg 81)
		Water Tanker (6000 Litre Capacity)	1	5	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with invoice Copies furnished (Pg 24-25)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC Copy furnished (Pg 58-53)	1	0	1	Owned invoice furnished (Pg 86)
		Tractor with Trolley	1	5	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC Copies furnished (Pg 34-39)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC Copy furnished (Pg 56-60)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC Copy furnished (Pg 82-85)
		Tipper (10 Tonne Capacity)	1	5	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC Copy furnished (Pg 24-27)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC Copy furnished (Pg 49-55)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC Copy furnished (Pg 87-90)
		Plate Compactor	1	5	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with invoice furnished (Pg 28-29)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with invoice furnished (Pg 61-63)	1	0	1	Owned invoice furnished (Pg 91)
		Front End Loader (0.6 cum Bucket Capacity)	1	5	1	0	1	Owned invoice furnished (Pg 32)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with RC Copy furnished (Pg 49-55)	1	0	1	Owned invoice furnished (Pg 93)
		Mobile Road Repair and Patching Machine	1	5	1	0	1	Owned invoice furnished (Pg 33)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with Invoice furnished (Pg 67-70)	1	0	1	Owned invoice furnished (Pg 94)
		Dozer 80 HP With attachment	1	5	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with invoice furnished (Pg 30-31)	0	1	1	Lease Agreement with invoice furnished (Pg 64-66)	1	0	1	Owned invoice furnished (Pg 86)

B. S. S.

S. J. S.

S. J. S.

T. V. S.

S. J. S.

Sl. No.	Name of the Contractor Qualifying Criteria	Requirement as per Bid Document		Shri M. Muthukrishnan, Tirunelveli (477277)		M/s SK Constructions, Visakhapatnam (481563)		M/s Enfive Systems Private Limited (481844)	
				Shri P K Chandrasekar B Tech (Civil Engineering) Year of Completion: 2008 Particular Experience: 10 Years	Age Proof & Degree Certificate furnished (Pg 49-55)	Shri Y V Naveen Kumar B E (Civil Engineering) Year of completion: 2008 Particular Experience: 09 Years	Age Proof & Degree Certificate furnished (Pg 72-78)	Shri J Sabar, Murugan B E (Civil Engineering) Year of Completion: 2008 Particular Experience: 14 Years	Age Proof & Degree Certificate furnished (Pg 98-98)
10	Project Manager cum Highway Engineer	<u>Minimum Qualification</u> Graduation in Civil Engineering 5 Years as Project Manager on NH/SH bridge construction/ Maintenance works	1						
11	Site Engineer cum Surveyor Engineer	<u>Minimum Qualification</u> Diploma in Civil Engineering / 5 years experience on Highway Construction/ Maintenance works	2	1) Shri V K Ashokkumaravel M E (Structural Engineering) Year of Completion: 2013 Particular Experience: 6 years 2) Shri Sankar Raj P Diploma (Civil) Year of Completion: 2000 Particular Experience: 19 years	Age Proof & Diploma Certificate furnished (Pg 57 to 67)	1) Shri Bendi Rama Rao Diploma (Civil Engineering) Year of completion: 2001 Particular Experience: 21 years 2) Shri Gondu Lokesh B Tech (Civil Engineering) Year of completion: 2016 Particular Experience: 06 years	Age Proof & Degree Certificate furnished (Pg 79-95)	1) Shri V Natarajan Diploma (Civil) Year of Completion: 2015 Particular Experience: 7 years 2) Shri A Balasubramanian, Diploma (Civil), Year of Completion: 2012 Particular Experience: 7 years	Age Proof & Diploma Certificate furnished (Pg 99-104)
12	Material cum Quality Control Engineer	<u>Minimum Qualification</u> Diploma in Civil Engineering 5 years on Highway Construction/ Maintenance works	1	Shri Philips J B E (Civil) Year of Completion: 2008 Particular Experience: 12 Years	Age Proof & Degree Certificate furnished (Pg 68-72)	Shri Katta Rama Rao B Tech (Civil Engineering) year of completion: 2007 Particular Experience: 11 years	Age Proof & Degree Certificate furnished (Pg 96-106)	Shri D Sankararathi Diploma (Civil) Year of Completion: 2012 Particular Experience: 6 years	Age Proof & Degree Certificate furnished (Pg 105-107)
13	Information on litigation history in which the Bidder is involved	Furnished / Not Furnished		Furnished (Pg 13)		Furnished (Pg 108)		Furnished (Pg 68)	
14	Affidavit on Stamp paper that information furnished in bid document is correct in all respects	Furnished / Not Furnished		Furnished (Pg 17)		Furnished (Pg 107)		Furnished (Pg 49)	
15	Undertaking (Minimum cash upto 25%)	Furnished / Not Furnished		Furnished (Pg 5)		Furnished (Pg 109)		Furnished (Pg 65)	
16	Undertaking (For Bid validity of 165 days)	Furnished / Not Furnished		Furnished (Pg 6)		Furnished (Pg 110)		Furnished (Pg 66)	
17	Undertaking Refer Cl. 4.4 (B) (b) (i)	Furnished / Not Furnished		Furnished (Pg 14)		Furnished (Pg 111)		Furnished (Pg 67)	
18	Recommendations of Committee	Qualified / Disqualified		Tender Evaluation Committee has recommended to consider the bid as "Responsive Bid"		Tender Evaluation Committee has recommended to consider the bid as "Responsive Bid"		Bidder has not furnished similar work experience as prescribed in Clause 4.4 A. (b) of RFP. Hence, as per Clause 4.4 B (aj) (iii) of RFP the tender evaluation committee recommends to consider the bid as "Non-Responsive"	
				Qualified		Qualified		Disqualified	


(B. Somasundaram)
Member


(Mahendra Meena)
Member


(S. Thamizharasan)
Member


(T. Velraj)
Member


(Umesh K Garg)
Convenor