



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways, Government of India)

जी-5 एवं 6, सेक्टर-10, द्वारका, नई दिल्ली - 110 075 • G-5 & 6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110075

दूरभाष/Phone : 91-11-25074100 / 25074200



NHAI/Bharatmala/ICR/PAB/AE/2022

Dated: 20.04.2023

To

All Bidders (As per list enclosed)

Subject: Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana - Evaluation of Technical Proposal - Regd.

Ref: Bids submitted on 01.12.2022 for the above mentioned work.

Kindly refer NHAI letter no. NHAI/Bharatmala/ICR/PAB/AE/2022 dated 23.03.2023 vide which result of technical evaluation was uploaded on NIC portal and bidders were given opportunity to respond by 30.03.2023, in case of any observation.

2. The representation have been received from below-mentioned Nine (9) bidders:

Bid No.	Name of the Bidder
1/10	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Shree Bhawani Consultancy Service Pvt Ltd
2/10	M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited
3/10	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited
4/10	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s Kaius Consulting Private Limited
5/10	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS
6/10	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s Intratech civil Solution & Consultant
7/10	M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Private Limited in association with M/s Parisha Engineers LLP
8/10	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited
9/10	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Open Solutions Infrastructure Consultancy Services Private Limited

3. The representations as received have been examined by the constituted Evaluation Committee and replies to the representation as approved by Competent Authority is enclosed at Annexure-I.

4. The result of technical evaluation after considering the representations of the bidder is as under -

S. No.	Name of the Applicant	Relevant experience for the assignment	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	Total	Remarks
	Responsive firms					
1	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV	40.00	20.00	34.94	94.94	Senior Pavement

S. No.	Name of the Applicant	Relevant experience for the assignment	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	Total	Remarks
	with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Shree Bhawani Consultancy Service Pvt Ltd					Specialist scored less than 75% marks
2	M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited	40.00	20.00	34.68	94.68	-
3	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	40.00	20.00	32.34	92.34	Resident cum Highway Engineer II and Senior Pavement Specialist scored less than 75% marks
4	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s Kaius Consulting Private Limited	35.00	20.00	36.36	91.36	-
5	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS	35.00	19.00	35.28	89.28	-
6	M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Private Limited in association with M/s Parisha Engineers LLP	35.00	20.00	35.94	90.94	Road Safety Expert scored less than 75% marks
7	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited	34.50	20.00	34.76	89.26	Resident cum Highway Engineer II scored less than 75% marks
8	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Open Solutions Infrastructure Consultancy Services Private Limited	40.00	20.00	36.24	96.24	-
Non-Responsive firms						
1	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s Intratech civil Solution & Consultant	NHIDCL vide letter dated NHIDCL/AE/R-J/2018/1879 dated 06.04.2023 has declared M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s LTelford Consulting Engineer Pvt. Ltd. as "Non-performer" as per para-9 of MORTH Circular dated 07.10.2021 i.e. "Upon Declaration of non-performer, the AE/IE/CSE/PMC will not be able to participate in any bid for National Highways Projects with MoRTH or any other executing agencies till such time the Non-Performer persists or the AE/IE/CSC/PMC is removed from the list of non-performers. The AE/IE/CSC/PMC shall include its JV partners, promoters etc. whose credentials were considered while qualifying them for the project".				

S. No.	Name of the Applicant	Relevant experience for the assignment	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	Total	Remarks
		In view of above, the bid of M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s Intratech civil Solution & Consultant has been declared as technically non-responsive.				
2	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with M/s Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	The bidder, M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with M/s Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited fails to meet the minimum eligibility criteria as per RFP Clause 15 (A) i.e. "The firm should have minimum experience of preparation of detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report of 2/4/6*-laning/Bridge project of aggregate length equal to 2 times or more (174 km) of similar category for which RFP is invited". Further, Mr. Avnish Kumar proposed as Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer by the bidder, M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with M/s Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited, scored less than 75% marks. Accordingly, the bidder M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with M/s Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited has been declared as technically non-responsive in terms with Clause 15 (A) of Section-1 & Clause 3.4 (x)(e) of Section-2 of RFP.				

Copy of the final technical evaluation sheet as approved by the Competent Authority is enclosed at Annexure-II.

5. The financial bids of the technically responsive bidders mentioned in Para (4) above will be opened on 21.04.2023 (1100 hrs IST) in IT training room, Ground Floor at NHAI (HQ). Accordingly, the bidders shall depute their representatives with authorization letter for attending the opening of financial bids.


 (Shashi Bhushan)
 General Manager (Tech) Bharatmala

Encl. As above.

Subject: Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

List of Bidders

Bid No.	Name of the Bidder
1/10	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Shree Bhawani Consultancy Service Pvt Ltd
2/10	M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited
3/10	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited
4/10	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s Kaius Consulting Private Limited
5/10	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS
6/10	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s Intratech civil Solution & Consultant
7/10	M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Private Limited in association with M/s Parisha Engineers LLP
8/10	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited
9/10	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Open Solutions Infrastructure Consultancy Services Private Limited
10/10	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with M/s Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited

Annexure-I
(Replies to representations)

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

1. M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Shree Bhawani Consultancy Service Pvt Ltd

S. No.	Representation		Reply of NHAI
1	Senior Pavement Specialist : Mr. Kamlesh Kumar Singh Sr. No. 2 (iv), Experience in similar capacity on EPC project (of length 40% of project length or more similar configuration (2/4/6/ laning **) and above) (Assigned Marks for the criteria=0)	Project No-1: Design Review and Construction Supervision of Tamil Nadu Road Sector Project: Contract Package TNRSP-01: Length: 378 Km; 2 lane; Flexible Pavement; Funded by: The World Bank Position: - Highway cum Pavement Engineer Total Length – 378 km (2 Lane) Page No-1178-1183 Infracon Sr. No-08	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon project no. 8 as claimed by the bidder in its representation for the said criteria is not a Specified Major Highway project. Therefore, there is no eligible project under the said criteria. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "0" as assigned earlier for the criteria.
2	Senior Quality/Material Expert- Mr. Rajkumar Gupta Sr. No. 2 (iii), Experience in similar capacity in handling Similar Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) (Assigned Marks for the criteria=27.5)	Project No-1: Construction and Maintenance of NH-3 from Shiv Puri to Mohana (25 Km.), Executed as per FIDIC conditions of contract. Length of Project: 25 Km and Rehabilitation and strengthening of State Highway from Datiya Dinara to Chanderi Road (45 Km.) and Ambha Porssa to Bhind (35 Km.) Two Lane, Client: MPPWD, Length of Project: 80 Km Total Length – 105 km (2 Lane) Page No-1252-1254 Infracon Sr. No-05 Project No-2: Project: Consultancy Services for Improvement and Maintenance (Four Lane) of NH 79 & 79A from Kishangadh (Ajmer) to Jojrokakheda (Chittorgadh),; Package-I Client: NHAI, Length of Project: 183.9 Km(Km 0.00 to 35.00 of NH-79A & Km 15.00 to Km 163.900 of NH-79), Cost of Project: 52.00 Crore approx. Total Length – 183.9 km (4 Lane) Page No-1240-1242 Infracon Sr. No-08 Project No-3: Consultancy services for Authority Engineer for Supervision of rehabilitation and upgradation to 2/4 Laning of (i) Ambha-Pinhat Road (23.115 km) (ii) Tekna- Manpur-Rameshwar road (19.410km),(iii) Nadigaon-Seondha Road (22.140 km) & (iv) Satanbada-Narwar Road (25.54km) (v) Jawasa-Sunarpura road (22.625km) (vi) Pawai-Prithvipura road (22.343km) on EPC mode (Client :-MPRDC)	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon project no. 5,15&16 are the only eligible assignments under the category. The Infracon project no. 8 is not in similar capacity and Infracon project no. 14 is not a Major Highway project, therefore are not considered under the said criteria. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and hence, no change in marks assigned for the criteria.

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

		Total Length – 106.4 km (2 Lane), 26.6 (4 Lane) Page No-1222-1224 Infracon Sr. No-14 Project No-4: Project: Four laning of Gwalior- Shivpuri section of NH- 3 from km 15.600 of NH-75 (End of Gwalior bypass) to km 236.000 of NH-3 in the state of Madhya Pradesh under NHDP phase IV on BOT (Toll) on DBFOT pattern- regarding operation and maintenance: Repair/Replacement of damaged MBCBs	
--	--	---	--

2. M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited

S. No.	Representation		Reply of NHAI
1	Relevant Experience of the Firm Average Annual Turnover (last three years from consultancy business (Assigned Marks for the criteria=1.75)	It has been observed that Annual Turnover of URS Scott Wilson India Pvt. Ltd. For the financial year of 2021-2022 has not been taken in consideration for evaluation. Its requested to kindly consider our Turnover for the financial year 2021-2022 i.e. 82.67 Cr. Balance sheet in support of the same is enclosed for your reference. Same can also be checked from Infracon. In view of same we request you to kindly increase our 0.25 marks for the same.	In view of facts and supporting documents submitted by the bidder, the representation of bidder has been considered and the marks assigned for the criteria have been revised to "2" in place of "1.75" marks assigned earlier.
2	Team Leader cum Highway Engineer: Mr. Pankaj Kumar S. No. 2(b), Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of project Preparation including design of major highway Project (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above). < 2 Project -0 marks 2 Projects -11 Add 2 mark for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks. (Assigned Marks for the criteria=0)	Request you to kindly consider Infracon Project Sr. No. 11, 13, 15 & 16 (Refer page no. 917 to 977 of TP) It would be 4 projects in the category of similar capacity with Project Preparation including design. Project no. 15 & 16 are with consultancy firms as Project Manager/General Manager is equivalent to Team Leader. In view of above we request you to kindly increase 15 marks for the same.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 11, 13, 15 & 16 are not in similar capacity of Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer for project Preparation including design of major highway Project. Therefore, there is no eligible project under the said criteria. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "0" as assigned earlier for the criteria.
3	Resident cum Highway Engineer – II : Mr. Rajesh Srivastava	Request you, kindly consider Infracon Project Sr. No. 3, 7, 9 & 11 and 6 & 10 with formulation of 2/3 (Refer page no. 1018 to 1068 of TP) It would be more than 11 years in	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

	S. No. 2(ii), Experience as Resident Engineer/Project Director/Project Manager/Superintending Engineer or equivalent/Executive Engineer or equivalent on construction works/Independent Engineer Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*) and above) (Assigned Marks for the criteria=18)	the category of similar capacity.	that Infracon Project no. 3,6,7,8,9,10,11 are the eligible project under the criteria and the total experience for these works is more than 10 years In view of above, the representation has been considered and marks assigned for the criteria have been revised to "20" in place of "18" marks assigned earlier.
4	Resident cum Highway Engineer – II : Mr. Rajesh Srivastava S. No. 2(iii), Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) (Assigned Marks for the criteria=22)	Request you, kindly consider Infracon Project Sr. No. 3, 7 & 11 and 6 & 10 with formulation of 2/3 (Refer page no. 1018 to 1068 of TP) It would be 4 Projects in the category of similar capacity with similar configuration.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 3,7,11 are the eligible project in similar capacity and Infracon Project no. 6,10 are the eligible project in next lower capacity. In view of above, the representation has been considered and marks assigned for the criteria have been revised to "25" in place of "22" marks assigned earlier.
5	Resident cum Highway Engineer – II : Mr. Rajesh Srivastava S. No. 2(iv), Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/Construction Supervision/IC on EPC Mode (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) (Assigned Marks for the criteria=4)	Request you, kindly consider Infracon Project Sr. No. 3 and 6 & 10 with formulation of 2/3 (Refer page no. 1018 to 1068 of TP) It would be 2 Projects in the category of EPC with similar capacity.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 3 is the eligible project in similar capacity and Infracon Project no. 6,10 are the eligible project in next lower capacity. In view of above, the representation has been considered and marks assigned for the criteria have been revised to "5" in place of "4" marks assigned earlier.
6	Bridge/Structural Engineer - I : Mr. R. K. Pandey S. No. 2(ii), Experience in similar capacity in Design /Construction/Construction Supervision of	Request you, kindly consider Infracon Project Sr. No. 3, 4, 5, 6, 9 to 17 (Refer page no. 1070 to 1130 of TP) It has more than 10 years experience in similar configuration.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 3, 12, 14, 16 are the eligible experiences under the criteria which have total effective duration of 9 years. In view of above, the representation has not

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

	Bridges/ROB/Flyover/Interchanges/any other such structures (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) < 5 years -0, 5 years -15 Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 5 (Assigned Marks for the criteria=19)		been considered and marks remains "19" as assigned earlier for the criteria.
7	Bridge/Structural Engineer - I : Mr. R. K. Pandey S. No. 2(iv), Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures < 2 – 0 2 nos -08 > 3 nos -10 (Assigned Marks for the criteria=8)	Request you, kindly consider Infracon Project Sr. No. 3, 11, 15 & 17 (Refer page no. 1070 to 1130 of TP) It would be more than 3 Projects and 4 Bridges in this category.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 3, 15, 17 are the only eligible experiences under the criteria. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "8" as assigned earlier for the criteria.
8	Road Safety Expert : Mr. Ashish Kumar Agarwal S. No. 1(ii), Post Graduation in Traffic/Transportation/Safety Engineering or equivalent. Post-Graduation in Transportation planning will also be considered provided it is obtained after Graduation in Civil Engineering. (Assigned Marks for the criteria=0)	It has been observed that the Authority has evaluated Mr. Ashish Kumar Agarwal's CV at 91 marks. It seems that Authority has not awarded the vital 4 marks for his Master's in Technology – Civil Engineering which was done on full time basis - Transportation Engineering. (PI refer page 1274 of TP). In view of above we request you to kindly increase our 4 marks for the same. As per the above representation, we request you to kindly evaluate and increase our technical to 96.60 marks from 94.03 marks.	In view of facts and supporting documents submitted by the bidder, the representation of bidder has been considered and the marks assigned for the criteria have been revised to "4" in place of "0" marks assigned earlier.

3. M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited

S. No.	Representation		Reply of NHAI
1	Relevant Experience of the Firm:	The following projects are in hand DPR projects :	The marks assigned for the criteria have

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

	In hand DPRs of Highway/Bridge/Tunnel Projects (presently under progress) <2 – 0 marks 2-5 – 5 marks >5 – 10 marks (Assigned Marks for the criteria=5)	P-1 – (Page no. 624-630) P-2 – (Page no. 631-638) P-3 – (Page no. 639-647) P-4 – (Page no. 648-655) P-5 – (Page no. 656-664) P-6 – (Page no. 689-694) P-7 – (Page no. 674-688) P-8 – (Page no. 665-673) The above referred letters are attached for ready reference. It may please be seen that we have 8 nos. in hand DPR projects and we are eligible to score 10 marks. We request you to kindly award 10 marks as against 5 marks evaluated.	been reassessed and it has been observed that bidder has more than 5 no. of eligible experiences under the criteria. In view of above, the representation has been considered and the marks assigned for the criteria have been revised to "10" in place of "5" marks assigned earlier.
2	Resident cum Highway Engineer-II : Mr. Anil Kumar S. No. 2(iii), Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) < 2 nos -0 2 nos -19 Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks. (Assigned Marks for the criteria=0)	The Proposed candidate (Mr. Anil Kumar) has experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in the following projects: P5 – (Page no. 1198-1200) P-6 – (Page no. 1195-1197) P-4 – (Page no. 1192-1194) It may be seen that the proposed key person has required experience in similar capacity in 2 projects and in next lower capacity in 1 project and is eligible to score 21 marks (19+(3*2/3)). We request you to kindly award 21 marks as against 0 marks evaluated.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 5 is the only eligible experiences under the criteria. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "0" as assigned earlier for the criteria.
3	Senior Pavement Specialist : Mr. Basit Ali Khan S. No. 2(ii), Experience in Similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of 2/4/6-laning** of major Highway Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) < 5 years -0 5 years -15	The Proposed candidate (Mr. Basit Ali Khan) has experience in Similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of 2/4/6-laning** of major Highway Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in the following projects: P-1 – (Page no. 1488-1490) P-2 – (Page no. 1485-1487) It may be seen that the proposed key person has required experience of 10 years & 10 months in next lower capacity in 2 projects and is eligible to score 13.33 marks (20*2/3). We request you to kindly award 13.33 marks as against 0 marks evaluated.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that CV has less than 5 years eligible experiences in similar capacity as per RFP under the criteria. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "0" as assigned earlier for the criteria.

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks. (Assigned Marks for the criteria=0)		
4	Senior Pavement Specialist : Mr. Basit Ali Khan S. No. 2(iii), Experience in similar capacity as Pavement/Geo-technical Engineer in construction/ construction supervision of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) < 2 nos – 0 2 nos – 20 Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 5 marks. (Assigned Marks for the criteria=0)	The proposed candidate (Mr. Basit Ali Khan) has experience in similar capacity as Pavement/Geo-technical Engineer in construction/ construction supervision of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in the following projects: P-1 – (Page no. 1488-1490) P-2 – (Page no. 1485-1487) It may be seen that the proposed key person has experience of 2 projects in next lower capacity.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that CV no eligible experiences in similar capacity as per RFP under the criteria. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "0" as assigned earlier for the criteria.
5	Road Safety Expert : Mr. P. Sreenivasulu S. No. 1 (ii), Post Graduation in Traffic/Transportation/Safety Engineering or equivalent. (Assigned Marks for the criteria=0)	The Proposed candidate (Mr. P. Sreenivasulu) had done his Masters in Technology in Urban Engineering (Later renamed as Transportation Engineering) from Anna University, Chennai. (Page no. 1548-1549) The course Urban Engineering was under division of Transportation Engineering and was designed to train graduates in Urban Transportation. The course later was renamed as Transportation Engineering by the University. Attached the M. Tech certificate of candidate and relevant information from university website clearly indicating the remaining of the name of course as Transportation Engineering for ready reference. We kindly request you to award 4 marks as against 0 marks evaluated.	In view of facts and supporting documents submitted by the bidder, the representation of bidder has been considered and the marks assigned for the criteria have been revised to "4" in place of "0" marks assigned earlier.

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

4. M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s Kaius Consulting Private Limited

S. No.	Representation	Reply of NHAI
1	Relevant experience of firm for the assignment In hand DPRs of Highway/Bridge/Tunnel Projects (presently under progress) <2 Projects – 0 marks 2-5 Projects – 5 marks >5 Projects – 10 marks (Assigned Marks for the criteria=5) As per Technical Evaluation, we have been assigned 5 marks out of 10 marks. 1- Consultancy Services for carrying out feasibility study and detailed project preparation for Improvement, Upgradation, Redesigning, Rehabilitation and Up-gradation including 4/6 laning roads Ambala- Shazadpur-Naraingarh- Kala Amb (NH72) in the State of Haryana., India Package PWD/HR/PKL/15 (4/6 Lane, Length 45 Km) The proof of above is enclosed with technical proposal. Page no. 286-290 2- Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for development of Economic Corridors, Inter Corridors, Feeder Routes and Border roads to improve the efficiency of freight movement in India under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Ara–Sasaram-Patna road section of NH-119A in the State of Bihar, India, (Lot-7/ Package 2), 4 lane configuration, Total Length 119 Km The proof of above is enclosed with technical proposal. Page no. 305-311 3- Consultancy services for preparation of Detailed Project Report of selected stretches/corridors of National Highways for up gradation to 2/4/6- lane with paved shoulders configuration "Stretch from Kothakota – Gudur upto Mantralayam on NH 167".in the State of Telangana, India (2/4/6 Lane, Length 70 Km) The proof of above is enclosed with technical proposal. Page no. 312-315 4- Consultancy Services for Preparation of DPR for Development of Expressways, Economic Corridors and Inner Corridors under Bharatmala Pariyojana Phase II (LOT 10 / Package 1 Pune Ahmednagar –Aurangabad Experience) The proof of above is enclosed with technical proposal. Page no. 343-351 5- Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for development of Economic Corridors, Inter Corridors, Feeder Routes and Border roads to improve the efficiency of freight movement in India under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Muzzafarpur to Begusarai in the State of Bihar, India, (Lot-7/ Package 2), 4 lane configuration. Total Length= 317 Km. The proof of above is enclosed with technical proposal. Page no. 305-311 6- Preparation of the detailed estimates along with Schedules and Bid documents for 3 No's VUP (Blackspot locations) Construction of Flyover at Krishna Nagar Junction Opp to ITC, Krishna Nagar, Kurnool City AP State in between Bellary Chowrastha to Gooty Petrol Bunk in Kurnool City, and two RUBs (VUPs) near Dhone town The proof of above is enclosed with technical proposal. Page no. 336-342	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that the bidder has total 5 no. of In-hand DPR projects with NHAI which are eligible to be considered under the criteria as per RFP. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "5" as assigned earlier for the criteria.

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

		7- Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for development of Economic Corridors, Inter Corridors, Feeder Routes and Border to improve the efficiency of freight movement in India under Bharatmala Pariyojana (Package 5/Lot-7 Delhi-Bilaspur 200 Km) The proof of above is enclosed with technical proposal. Page no. 300-304 8- Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for development of Dehradun Ring Road, Total Length 70 Km The proof of above is enclosed with this letter. Moreover, supporting document in form of latest communication which substantiates that the DPR is under preparation, is enclosed with this letter. Therefore, from the above it can be seen that we have more than 5 In-Hand DPR Projects. Hence, you are requested to assign the full 10 marks.	
2	Resident cum Highway Engineer : Mr. Anand Bahilani S. No. 1(i), Graduate in Civil Engineering (Assigned Marks for the criteria=0)	Reference to the subject matter for the above said project we are in knowledge through the Technical opening vide letter NHAI/Bharatmala/ICR/PAB/AE/2022 dated 23.03.2023 that the CV of Anand Bahilani is not considered on the basis of part time degree. For the above said reason we would like to bring to your kind notice that the same candidate has been given technical score of 91 in recent opening under BHARAMALA/NHAI in Shahjahanpur bypass & Durg to Raipur-PKG1 & 2. As the matter of Part time degree is concerned the candidate has carried out the degree in the span of 5 years doing the classes in evening, and has carried out successful tenure with LN Malvia, Feedback, Scott Willision, Stanley Consultant etc. at different times with different government bodies. Hence in the lieu of above said reason we request you kindself to reconsider the degree for technical evaluation which will further bring the competition on financial bid. For your ready reference we enclosing herewith the technical evaluation sheet in accordance with the RFP qualification criteria.	In view of facts and supporting documents submitted by the bidder, the representation of bidder has been considered and the CV has been assigned "91" in place of "0" marks assigned earlier.

5. M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS

S. No.	Representation	Reply of NHAI
1	- Lead member of Bidder is debarred by NHIDCL vide letter dated NHIDCL/Ladakh/K-Z/DPR/2020-21/1214 dated 13.03.2023 As per the above-mentioned reference letter, the bid submitted by M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K. Engineers was declared by the Authority as 'Non-Responsive' because of the Lead Member of Bidder is debarred by NHIDCL vide letter no. NHIDCL/Ladakh/K-Z/DPR/ 2020-21/1214 dated 13th March 2023 for 12 months	The representation of bidder has been examined and it has been observed that the debarment order issued by NHIDCL vide letter dated NHIDCL/Ladakh/K-Z/DPR/2020-21/1214 dated 13.03.2023 for the bidder M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited, is stayed by

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

		from the date of issue. We are surprised to have a negative response against our bid. We believe that your decision to term our bid as "non responsive" is totally against the conditions laid down in the RFP for the subject project. We would like to draw your attention to RFP Clause 17 of Section 1 – Information to Consultants wherein it is mentioned as: "17. The Bidder including individual or any of its Joint Venture Member should, in the last 2 years, have neither failed to perform for the consultancy services pertaining to Expressways, National Highways, ISC (Inter State Connectivity) & EI (Economic Importance) works, as evidenced by imposition of a penalty by an arbitral or judicial authority or a judicial pronouncement or arbitration award against the Bidder including individual or any of its Joint Venture Member, as the case may be, nor has been expelled or terminated by Ministry of Road Transport & Highways or its implementing agencies for breach by such Bidder including individual or any of its Joint Venture Member. Consultants (sole firm or lead firm and any of the JV partners) who have been debarred by NHAI and the debarment is in force as on date of application, need not apply as their RFP proposal will not be entertained." Please recall that bids for the subject project were submitted on 1st December 2022 and as on that date we were not debarred by any Department/Agency. So, we strongly believe that our exclusion from the list of responsive bidders is against the laid down RFP conditions. Also, in the matter of the debarment of NHIDCL, we herewith submit that the Hon'ble High Court of Jammu & Kashmir and Ladakh at Srinagar has stayed the action of debarment by NHIDCL against us. A copy of the Court Stay Order is attached herewith for your ready reference. Therefore, we herewith reiterate that, • Our bid is mistakenly termed as "nonresponsive" on the ground of Debarment by NHIDCL, because this impugned debarment is effective from 13th March 2023, whereas eligibility of the bid is relevant as on date of submission of bid [on 1st December 2022] • Secondly, the very action of debarment by the NHIDCL is stayed by the orders of Honorable High Court of Jammu & Kashmir and Ladakh at Srinagar. Considering the above, we request the Authority to re-consider its decision to term bid submitted by us as "Non Responsive". Kindly evaluate our bid for the subject project and publish the revised technical evaluation results and give us time to submit our representations, if any, against our technical score.	Hon'ble High Court of Jammu & Kashmir and Ladakh at Srinagar vide order dated 28.03.2023. In view of above, bid submitted by M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K. Engineers, has been considered for further evaluation and assigned 89.28 technical score.
--	--	---	--

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

6. M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s Intratech civil Solution & Consultant

S. No.	Representation		Reply of NHAI
1	-	-	NHIDCL vide letter dated NHIDCL/AE/R-J/2018/1879 dated 06.04.2023 has declared M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s LTelford Consulting Engineer Pvt. Ltd. as "Non-performer" as per para-9 of MORTH Circular dated 07.10.2021 i.e. "Upon Declaration of non-performer, the AE/IE/CSE/PMC will not be able to participate in any bid for National Highways Projects with MoRT&H or any other executing agencies till such time the Non-Performer persists or the AE/IE/CSC/PMC is removed from the list of non-performers. The AE/IE/CSC/PMC shall include its JV partners, promoters etc. whose credentials were considered while qualifying them for the project". In view of above, M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s Intratech civil Solution & Consultant has not been considered for further evaluation and the bid of the bidder is declared as technically non-responsive.

7. M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Private Limited in association with M/s Parisha Engineers LLP

S. No.	Representation		Reply of NHAI
1	Relevant Experience for the Assignment In hand DPRs of Highway/Bridge/Tunnel Projects (presently under progress) <2 Projects – 0 marks 2-5 Projects – 5 marks >5 Projects – 10 marks (Assigned Marks for the criteria=5)	In this regard we would like to inform you that Upham International Corporation in JV with SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED have 7 nos. of In hand DPRs of Highway (presently under progress). The details of the Projects as submitted in technical proposal are as under; Upham International Corporation (Lead Partner) Annexure I 1. Phase – II (Lot-9/Package-III) SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED (JV Partner) Annexure II Project no. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 & 6 copy enclosed in Annexure II. Hence we should be given 10 marks instead of 5 marks as given in this criteria.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that the bidder has total 3 no. of In-hand DPR projects with NHAI which are eligible to be considered under the criteria as per RFP. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "5" as assigned earlier for the criteria.

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

2	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer – Mr. Vijay Srivastava S. No. 1(ii), Post Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering (Assigned Marks for the criteria=0)	In this regard we would like to inform you that the proposed key Expert Mr. Vijay Srivastava have done post graduation in Soil Mechanics & Foundation Engineering in 2012 from Punjab Technical University. Please refer our Technical Proposal Page no. 738. Therefore in light of fact and circumstances the proposed expert should be given 4 marks instead of 0 marks as given in technical evaluation under this criteria.	In view of facts and supporting documents submitted by the bidder, the representation of bidder has been considered and the marks assigned for the criteria have been revised to "4" in place of "0" marks assigned earlier.
3	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer – Mr. Vijay Srivastava S. No. 2(b), Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of project Preparation including design of major highway Project (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above). < 2 Project -0 marks 2 Projects -11 Add 2 mark for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks. (Assigned Marks for the criteria=11)	In this regard we would like to inform you that the proposed key Expert Mr. Vijay Srivastava having experience of 3 DPR Projects. The details of the projects as submitted in technical proposal are as under: 1. Please refer our technical proposal page no. 720 2. Please refer our technical proposal page no. 721 3. Please refer our technical proposal page no. 722 Therefore in light of fact and circumstances the proposed expert should be given 13 marks instead of 11 marks as given in technical evaluation under this criteria. Hence he should be given 93 marks instead of 87 marks.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 6&8 are the only eligible experiences under the criteria. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "11" as assigned earlier for the criteria.
4	Bridge/Structural Engineer – I : Mr. Vinay Kumar Jain S. No. 2(iv), Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures < 2 – 0 2 nos -08 > 3 -10 (Assigned Marks for the criteria=8)	In this regard we would like to inform you that the proposed key Expert Mr. Vinay Kumar Jain having experience of more than 19 structures in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures. The details of the projects as submitted in technical proposal are as under: 1. Please refer our technical proposal page no. 833 2. Please refer our technical proposal page no. 835 3. Please refer our technical proposal page no. 838-840. Therefore in light of fact and circumstances the proposed expert should be given 10 marks instead of 8 marks as given in technical evaluation under this criteria. Hence he should be given 91 marks instead of 89 marks.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 13,15,18 are the only eligible experiences under the criteria. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "8" as assigned earlier for the criteria.

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

5	Bridge/Structural Engineer – II : Mr. Ramnik Singh	We are utterly surprised to see letter under reference addressed to all participants declaring result of technical proposal, where our proposed Bridge/Structural Engineer, Mr. Ramnik Singh CV was not evaluated citing the reason that the proposed expert is debarred by NHAI for participating NHAI/MoRTH from 27.06.2022 to 27.06.2023. We would like to draw your attention that Mr. Ramnik Singh, Bridge/Structural Engineer proposed on 4L of Karwar (Km. 281.980 of Nh-62 Nagpur road) to Dangiyavas of Jodhpur Ring Road (Pkg-II) by Artefacts Projects Ltd. In JV with Global Infra Solutions & in Association with Renaissance IOT LLP appeared for interview before the competent authority on 27.06.2022. Where he was not found suitable and declared restricted/not allowed to participate for one year in NHAI either directly and indirectly from the date of interview i.e. 27.06.2022 in accordance with NHAI policy circular no. 10.01.30/2021 dated 15.11.2021. The NHAI Policy circular under reference vide debarment of Mr. Ramnik Singh stands amended/modified by Policy Circular no. 10.2.25/2022 dated 11.10.2022 the letter Policy circular supersede the previous policy circular and clearly says that, those key personnel who have been declared not suitable/not recommended in the previous interaction (before issue of this circular) may be allow to reappear before interview expert committee if they have completed satisfied time period of three months as mentioned above. Further it is also brought to kind notice that at the time of bidding the CV was available on Infracon Portal from where the Infracon ID was created and accordingly it was made available. Hence in light of facts & circumstances above CV of Mr. Ramnik Singh should be evaluated and revised marks should be given as per the merit of the CV. However as per our internal assessment he should be given 94.5 marks.	The representation of bidder has been examined and it has been observed that the debarment of Sh. Ramnik Singh has been lapsed on 27.09.2022 as per NHAI Policy Circular no. 10.2.25/2022 dated 11.10.2022. In view of above, CV of Sh. Ramnik Singh has been evaluated and assigned 94.50 marks against 0 marks as assigned earlier.
6	Senior Quality cum Material Expert : Mr. Raghavendra Uday Lad S. No. 2(iii), Experience in similar capacity in handling Similar Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) < 2 nos -0 2 nos -25	In this regard we would like to inform you that the proposed key Expert Mr. Raghavendra Uday Lad have experience of more than 4 projects in similar capacity in handling Similar Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above). The details of the projects as submitted in technical proposal are as under: 1. Please refer our technical proposal page no. 942 2. Please refer our technical proposal page no. 941 3. Please refer our technical proposal page no. 940 4. Please refer our technical proposal page no. 945 5. Please refer our technical proposal page no. 943	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 9,10,11 are the eligible project in similar capacity and Infracon Project no. 5,7 are the eligible project in next lower capacity. In view of above, the representation has been considered and marks assigned for the criteria have been revised to "30" in place of "27.50" marks assigned earlier.

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks. (Assigned Marks for the criteria=27.50)	As per RFP if a key personnel has worked in next lower category to similar capacity, the marks allotted to key personnel in the category 'experience in similar capacity' shall be reduced to two-thirds of marks in this category. This shall be applicable for evaluation of all key personnel. Therefore in light of fact and circumstances the proposed expert should be given 29.2 marks instead of 27.5 marks as given in technical evaluation.	
7	Senior Quality cum Material Expert : Mr. Raghavendra Uday Lad S. No. 3, Employment with the Firm < 1 year – 0 1 year – 3 Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks (Assigned Marks for the criteria=3.50)	In this regard we would like to inform you that the proposed key Expert Mr. Raghavendra Uday Lad have been working with our JV Partner (SAICPL) since 25th November 2019 to till date i.e. more than 3 years Therefore in light of fact and circumstances the proposed expert should be given 4 marks instead of 3.5 marks as given in technical evaluation. Hence he should be given 93.7 marks instead of 92 marks. Considering the above facts and with respect to our submission it is therefore requested that the evaluation may please be reviewed.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that CV has employment of more than 3 years with the bidder. In view of above, the representation has been considered and marks assigned for the criteria have been revised to "4" in place of "3.5" marks assigned earlier.

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

8. M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited

S. No.	Representation		Reply of NHA
1	Relevant Experience of the Firm Experience in DPR/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report preparation for Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length (40% of project Length or more in last 7 years. 1 project: 4 marks 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 mark. (Assigned Marks for the criteria=4.5)	• DPR Lot-2 UP Pkg 1 (Rupaida to Barabanki) • DPR Haridwar to Nagina in UP & Uttarakhand • DPR Nagpur-Umred-Nagbhir-Brahmapuri-Armori Section • Feasibility Report for Akbarpur-Jaunpur UP • Feasibility Report for Bahraich-Faizabad UP • Feasibility Report for Farenda-Balrampur Gonda UP • Feasibility Report for Mouradabad-Chandausi- Badaun UP • DPR Rajasthan Border-Fatehpur Salasr Rajasthan • Feasibility Report for Basti-Mehndawal-Tamkuhi UP	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that the bidder has only 2 no. of completed projects of DPR/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report preparation for Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning of length (40% of project Length or more) in last 7 years. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "4.5" as assigned earlier for the criteria.
2	Relevant Experience of the Firm In hand DPRs of Highway/Bridge/Tunnel Projects (presently under progress) <2 Projects – 0 marks 2-5 Projects – 5 marks >5 Projects – 10 marks (Assigned Marks for the criteria=5)	• DPR Gollapudi Y Junction to Ibrahimpatnam Circle AP • DPR Bharatmala Pariyojna Phase II (Lot 11) • DPR Bharatmala Pariyojna (Lot-2). "(LOT-2/UP/Package-1)" • DPR Hospet Bellary Karnataka • DPR Ganga Connecting Matihani-Shambo in the State of Bihar • DPR Cuddalore Port in the State of Tamil Nadu • DPR Vikkravandi-Pinalur-Sethiyahopu section of NH-45C in the State of Tamilnadu • DPR Umred By Pass Package-1 A on NH-353D in the State of Maharashtra. • DPR 4 Lane Tirupati-Tiruthani-Chennai of NH-205 in the State of Tamil Nadu • DPR 4 Lane Kerala/TN Border to Villukuri to Kanyakumari	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that the bidder has total 2 no. of In-hand DPR projects with NHA which are eligible to be considered under the criteria as per RFP. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "5" as assigned earlier for the criteria.
3	Resident cum Highway Engineer – II – Mr. Sunil Kumar Vidyarthi S. No. 2 (iii), Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) < 2 nos -0 2 nos -19	Refer IP. No. 5 (Bid Page No. 1253- 1254) Refer IP. No. 4 (Bid Page No. 1255- 1256) Total: 2 nos.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 5 is the only eligible project under the said criteria. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "0" as assigned earlier for the criteria.

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

	Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks. (Assigned Marks for the criteria=0)		
4	Resident cum Highway Engineer – II – Mr. Sunil Kumar Vidyarthi S. No. 2 (iv), Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/Construction Supervision/IC on EPC Mode (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) 1 Project- 4 Marks Add 1 (One) Marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 (One) Marks (Assigned Marks for the criteria=4)	Refer IP. No. 5 (Bid Page No. 1253) Refer IP. No. 4 (Bid Page No. 1255) Total: 2 nos.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 5 is the only eligible project under the said criteria. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "4" as assigned earlier for the criteria.
5	Bridge/Structural Engineer – I : Mr. Sushil Kumar Singh S. No. 2 (iv), Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures < 2 – 0 2 nos -08 > 3 -10 (Assigned Marks for the criteria=8)	Refer I.P. No. 12 (Bid Page no. 1279-1280) Refer I.P. No. 10 (Bid Page no. 1283-1284) Refer I.P. No. 9 (Bid Page no. 1285-1286) Total: More than 3 nos.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 9,10,12 are the only eligible experiences under the criteria. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "8" as assigned earlier for the criteria.
6	Senior Quality cum Material Expert : Mr. Ashish Nandi S. No. 2 (ii), Experience in similar capacity in Construction /Construction Supervision of major Highway Projects ((similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) < 5 years -0 5 years -19 Add 2.0 (two) marks extra for each additional year	Refer I.P. No. 8 (Bid Page no. 1441- 1442) Refer I.P. No. 4 (Bid Page no. 1449- 1450) Refer I.P. No. 3 (Bid Page no. 1451- 1452) Refer I.P. No. 1 (Bid Page no. 1455- 1456) Total: More Than 8 Years	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 1,3,4 are the only eligible experiences under the criteria having effective duration of 7 years. The Infracon Project no. 8 is not in similar capacity therefore not considered. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "23" as assigned earlier for the criteria.

Reply to representations of the Bidders on the Technical Evaluation of the Bids for the Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

	of experience subject to maximum 6 (six) marks. (Assigned Marks for the criteria=23)		
7	Senior Quality cum Material Expert : Mr. Ashish Nandi S. No. 2 (iii), Experience in similar capacity in handling Similar Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) < 2 nos -0 2 nos -25 Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks. (Assigned Marks for the criteria=27.50)	Refer I.P. No. 8 (Bid Page no. 1441- 1442) Refer I.P. No. 4 (Bid Page no. 1449- 1450) Refer I.P. No. 3 (Bid Page no. 1451- 1452) Refer I.P. No. 1 (Bid Page no. 1455- 1456) Total: 4 nos.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 1,3,4 are the only eligible experiences under the criteria. The Infracon Project no. 8 is not in similar capacity therefore not considered. In view of above, the representation has not been considered and marks remains "27.50" as assigned earlier for the criteria.

9. M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s Open Solutions Infrastructure Consultancy Services Private Limited

S. No.	Representation		Reply of NHAI
1	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer : Mr. Dilip Chandra Jha S. No. 2(d), Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation and Maintenance of Major Highway (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above). 1 project - 4 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 (one) marks (Assigned Marks for the criteria=0)	Total Length of project is 86.513km and 40% length is 34.60km He has handled the following O&M project as Project Manager: Improvement/Upgradation of Bihta Naubatpur-Newa- Dumri-Beldarichak- Kansari-Daniyawan and Chandi-Noorsarai-Bhaganbigha-Rahui-Bind-Gopalbad- Sarmera Road (SH-78) 2-Lane, Length 100.40 KM of Bihar State Highway Project after converting to 4 lane. Total length will be 100X0.4= 40km i.e. more than required length.	The marks assigned for the criteria have been reassessed and it has been observed that Infracon Project no. 8 is the eligible experiences under the criteria. In view of above, the representation has been considered and marks assigned for the criteria have been revised to "4" in place of "0" marks assigned earlier.

Annexure-II
(Final Technical Evaluation Sheets)

Name of the Project		
Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana		
List of the Applicants:-		
Length of Project		86.513
Applicant No:-	Name of the Applicant	Status of the Applicant Sole/JV/ Association
1/10	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI CONSULTANCY SERVICE PVT LTD	JV/ Association
2/10	M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited	JV/ Association
3/10	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	Sole
4/10	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED	Association
5/10	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS	Association
6/10	M/s HIGHWAY ENGINEERING CONSULTANT in association with M/s Intratech civil Solution & Consultant	Association
7/10	M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in association with M/s PARISHA ENGINEERS LLP	JV/ Association
8/10	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited	Association
9/10	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s OPEN SOLUTIONS INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANCY SERVICES PRIVATE LIMITED	JV/ Association
10/10	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with M/s AVALOZ CONSULTANT INDIA PRIVATE LIMITED	Association

Annexure-I

Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana

MINIMUM ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA

S.No.	Name of the Applicants	Technical Capacity	Technical Responsive (TL Score)	Preparation of DPR (NH/SH/Equivalent)	Project Supervision/IC (NH/SH/Equivalent)		Annual Turnover	whether the Applicant is Technical "Responsive" or "Non-Responsive".
		Technical Capacity Provisions for maximum works to be permitted with one consultant:	CV of proposed Team Leader should score at least 75% marks	The firm should have Minimum experience of Preparation of detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report of 2/4/6**- laning/ Bridge project of aggregate length equal to 2 times or more of similar category for which RFP is invited.	The firm should have minimum Experience of Project Supervision/ Independent Engineer/ Consultant of 2/4/6**- laning/ Bridge project of aggregate length equal to 3 times or more of similar category** for which RFP is invited.	Firm should also have experience of Project Supervision/ Independent Engineer/ Authority' Engineer of at least one project of similar category of four / six** laning/ bridge work of length equal to 40% of project length	Annual turnover (updated average of last 3 years) of the firm from consultancy business should be equal to or more than 2% of Estimated Project Cost.	
1/10	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
2/10	M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
3/10	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
4/10	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
5/10	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
6/10	M/s HIGHWAY ENGINEERING CONSULTANT in association with M/s Intratech civil Solution & Consultant	NHIDCL vide letter dated NHIDCL/ AE/R-J/2018/1879 dated 06.04.2023 has declared M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s LTelford Consulting Engineer Pvt. Ltd. as "Non-performer" as per para-9 of MORTH Circular dated 07.10.2021						Non -Responsive
7/10	M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in association with M/s	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
8/10	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
9/10	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s OPEN SOLUTIONS	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
10/10	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with M/s AVALOZ CONSULTANT INDIA PRIVATE LIMITED	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Non- Responsive

Name of the Project											
Consultancy Services for Authority’s Engineer for Supervision of Construction of Six lane access-controlled Paniyala-Barodameo Inter Corridor Route from Km 0+000 to Km 86+513 in the State of Rajasthan on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana											
Final Comparative Technical Evaluation Score.											
S. No.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Total		Rank of the Firm	whether the Technical Responsive Applicant/Bidder Eligible for opening of Financial proposal**
		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed		
	Maximum marks		40	40	20	20	40	40	100		
1/10	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI CONSULTANCY SERVICE PVT LTD	40.00	40.00	20.00	20.00	36.32	34.94	96.32	94.94	2	Eligible
2/10	M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited	40.00	40.00	20.00	20.00	36.92	34.68	96.92	94.68	3	Eligible
3/10	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	40.00	40.00	20.00	20.00	39.32	32.34	99.32	92.34	4	Eligible
4/10	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED	40.00	35.00	20.00	20.00	36.60	36.36	96.60	91.36	5	Eligible
5/10	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS	40.00	35.00	20.00	19.00	36.60	35.28	96.60	89.28	7	Eligible
6/10	M/s HIGHWAY ENGINEERING CONSULTANT in association with M/s Intratech civil Solution & Consultant	NHIDCL vide letter dated NHIDCL/AE/R-J/2018/1879 dated 06.04.2023 has declared M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s LTelford Consulting Engineer Pvt. Ltd. as “Non-performer” as per para-9 of MORTH Circular dated 07.10.2021. In view of above, the bid of M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s Intratech civil Solution & Consultant has been declared as technically non-responsive.							-	InEligible	
7/10	M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in association with M/s PARISHA ENGINEERS LLP	40.00	35.00	20.00	20.00	37.10	35.94	97.10	90.94	6	Eligible
8/10	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited	40.00	34.50	20.00	20.00	36.50	34.76	96.50	89.26	8	Eligible
9/10	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s OPEN SOLUTIONS INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANCY SERVICES PRIVATE LIMITED	40.00	40.00	20.00	20.00	36.40	36.24	96.40	96.24	1	Eligible
10/10	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in association with M/s AVALOZ CONSULTANT INDIA PRIVATE LIMITED	Non-Responsive as per RFP Clause 3.4 (X) (e) of section 2 & 15 (A) of section 1								InEligible	

FIRMS RELEVANT EXPERIENCE FOR THE ASSIGNMENT

S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/10		2/10		3/10		4/10		5/10		7/10		8/10		9/10	
	Description		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI CONSULTANCY		M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS		M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED		M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s	
			Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed
1	Average Annual Turnover (last three years) from consultancy business	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
1.1	< 2% of TPC	0	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
1.2	2% of TPC	1.5																
1.3	Add additional 0.25 (zero point two five) mark for every 1% of TPC above 2% of TPC subject to maximum marks 0.5 marks.																	
2	Nos. of Highway Professionals with the firm	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
2.1	<10	0	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
2.2	10 to 20	8																
2.3	>20 but < or equal to 30	9																
2.4	>30	10																
3	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Authority Engineer/ Construction Supervision in Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
3.1	1 project: 8 marks	8	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
3.2	Add 1 (one) mark extra for completed assignment of Authority Engineer/ Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero	2																
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report preparation for Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length (40% of project Length or more in last 7 years.	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	4.5	5	5	5
4.1	1 project: 4 marks	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	4.5	5	5	5
4.2	0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 mark.	1																
5	In hand DPRs of Highway/Bridge/Tunnel Projects (presently under progress)	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	5	10	5	10	5	10	5	10	10	10
5.1	<2	0	10	10	10	10	10	10	5	10	5	10	5	10	5	10	10	10
5.2	2-5	5																
5.3	>5	10																
6	more than 3 -10	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
6.1	1 project - 2.0 marks	2	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
6.2	Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1.0 marks	1																
		40	40	40	40	40	40	40	35	40	35	40	35	40	34.5	40	40	40

Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection																		
S.No	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/10		2/10		3/10		4/10		5/10		7/10		8/10		9/10	
			M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI CONSULTANCY SERVICE		M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS		M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in		M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s	
			Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed
1	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7
1.1	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
1.2	(i) Experience of 1-2 projects	1	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
	(ii) Experience of 3-5 projects	2																
	(iii) Experience of >5 projects	3																
2	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
2.1	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
2.2	(i) Experience of 1-3 projects	1	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	(ii) Experience of > 3 projects	2																
3	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit (MBIU) or better technology for bridges inspection	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	4	5	5	5	5	5	5
3.1	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
3.2	(i) Experience of 1-2 projects	1	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	2	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
	(ii) Experience of 3-5 projects	2																
	(iii) Experience of >5 projects	3																
4	more than 3-10	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
4.1	Own Equipment/Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
4.2	(i) Experience of 1-3 projects	1	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	(ii) Experience of >3 projects	2																
Total			20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	19.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00

Summary Sheet of CV's

S. No.	Details	Total Marks	1/10				2/10			
			M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI CONSULTANCY SERVICE PVT LTD				M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited			
			Name	Score	Assesed	Claimed	Name	Score	Assesed	Claimed
1	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	12	Brij Mohan Lakwal	91	10.92	10.92	Pankaj kumar	75	9	10.92
2	Resident cum Highway Engineer - I	4	Satyendra Kumar Singh	91	3.64	3.64	B.P.Singh	91	3.64	3.64
	Resident cum Highway Engineer - II	4	vikash kumar pathak	87	3.48	3.48	Rajesh Srivastava	91	3.64	3.64
3	Bridge/structural engineer - I	4	Anil Kumar	91	3.64	3.64	R K Pandey	88	3.52	3.64
	Bridge/structural engineer - II	4	Ajit M. Khatal	91	3.64	3.64	ajay kumar	95	3.8	3.8
4	Senior Pavement Specialist	4	Kamlesh Kumar Singh	61	2.44	3.6	Sandeep kumar singh	91	3.64	3.64
5	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	4	Rajkumar gupta	88.5	3.54	3.64	Ghasi Ram Sharma	91	3.64	3.64
6	ROAD SAFETY EXPERT	4	Anil Kumar Gupta	91	3.64	3.76	Ashish Kumar Agrawal	95	3.8	4
		40			34.94	36.32			34.68	36.92

Summary Sheet of CV's

S. No.	Details	Total Marks	3/10				4/10			
			M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited				M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED			
			Name	Score	Assesed	Claimed	Name	Score	Assesed	Claimed
1	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	12	Birendra Kumar Singh	76	9.12	12	Sukumar Kumar Padhy	90	10.8	10.8
2	Resident cum Highway Engineer - I	4	ak	95	3.8	4	Ajay Kumar Kundu	92	3.68	3.68
	Resident cum Highway Engineer - II	4	Anil Kumar	65	2.6	3.8	Anand Bahilani	91	3.64	3.64
3	Bridge/structural engineer - I	4	SUDHIR KUMAR	96	3.84	4	Shailendra Prasad Singh	90	3.6	3.6
	Bridge/structural engineer - II	4	Rajesh Kumar Singhi	89	3.56	3.84	Manoj Kumar Jha	89	3.56	3.64
4	Senior Pavement Specialist	4	Basit Ali Khan	45	1.8	3.84	Satya Pal Singhmar	91	3.64	3.8
5	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	4	Anand Kumar Sinha	96	3.84	3.84	bijay kumar	91	3.64	3.64
6	ROAD SAFETY EXPERT	4	P Sreenivasulu	94.5	3.78	4	Dr. Pratap Singh	95	3.8	3.8
		40			32.34	39.32			36.36	36.60

Summary Sheet of CV's

S. No.	Details	Total Marks	5/10				7/10			
			M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS				M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in association with M/s PARISHA ENGINEERS LLP			
			Name	Score	Assesed	Claimed	Name	Score	Assesed	Claimed
1	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	12	Syamtanu Datta	79	9.48	10.44	Vijay Srivastava	91	10.92	11.16
2	Resident cum Highway Engineer - I	4	Ashok Kumar Saini	91	3.64	3.64	RAKESH KUMAR	91	3.64	3.64
	Resident cum Highway Engineer - II	4	Satish Kumar	89	3.56	3.64	Shriram Bajaj	91	3.64	3.64
3	Bridge/structural engineer - I	4	Siya Ram Singh	89	3.56	3.64	vinay kumar jain	89	3.56	3.64
	Bridge/structural engineer - II	4	Pawan Kumar Singh	91	3.64	3.8	ramnik singh	94.5	3.78	3.78
4	Senior Pavement Specialist	4	H K Ahirwar	95	3.8	3.8	Mrinal Kanti Tah	91	3.64	3.64
5	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	4	prabhat kumar	91	3.64	3.64	Raghavendra Uday Lad	95	3.8	3.8
6	ROAD SAFETY EXPERT	4	RAVEENDRA BABU TALLURI	99	3.96	4	Pradeep Agrawal	74	2.96	3.8
		40			35.28	36.60			35.94	37.10

Summary Sheet of CV's										
S. No.	Details	Total Marks	8/10				9/10			
			M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited				M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s OPEN SOLUTIONS INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANCY SERVICES PRIVATE LIMITED			
			Name	Score	Assesed	Claimed	Name	Score	Assesed	Claimed
1	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	12	Anil Kumar Rai	88	10.56	11.16	Dilip Chandra Jha	90	10.8	10.92
2	Resident cum Highway Engineer - I	4	MALAY CHAKRABORTY	91	3.64	3.64	Md. Jahangir Alam	91	3.64	3.64
	Resident cum Highway Engineer - II	4	Sunil Kumar Vidyarthi	65	2.6	3.4	Rajesh Dwivedi	91	3.64	3.64
3	Bridge/structural engineer - I	4	Sushil Kumar Singh	89	3.56	3.64	Ajit Kumar Mishra	91	3.64	3.64
	Bridge/structural engineer - II	4	Raj Prasad Singh	89	3.56	3.64	Satish Kumar	90	3.6	3.64
4	Senior Pavement Specialist	4	Sanjay Kumar Singh	88.5	3.54	3.54	Dharam Vir Singh Dahiya	91	3.64	3.64
5	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	4	Ashis Nandi	86.5	3.46	3.64	Vimlesh Kumar	91	3.64	3.64
6	ROAD SAFETY EXPERT	4	Ranajit Kumar Jana	96	3.84	3.84	Siyaranjan Sigh	91	3.64	3.64
		40			34.76	36.50			36.24	36.40

Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer																
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/10		2/10		3/10		4/10		5/10		7/10		8/10	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI CONSULTANCY SERVICE PVT Brij Mohan Lakwal 01-06-1959		M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited Pankaj kumar 08/12/1966		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited Birendra Kumar Singh 02/08/1969		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED Sukumar Kumar Padhy 08/08/1972		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS Syamtanu Datta 01/03/1964		M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in association with M/s PARISHA ENGINEERS LLP Vijay Srivastava 04-01-1968		M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited Anil Kumar Rai 10-01-1966	
	Name of Key Personnel		Assessed		Assessed		Assessed		Assessed		Assessed		Assessed		Assessed	
	Date of Birth of KP's		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed	
	Description															
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	21	25	25	21	21	21	25	25	21	25
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering	4	0	0	0	0	0	4	4	4	0	0	4	4	0	4
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	70	70	54	70	50	70	65	65	58	66	66	68	67	68
a)	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:															
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
	< 12 years -0															
i)	12 years -8		8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 2 (two) marks.		2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	13	15	15	15	15	15
	< 5 years - 0															
ii)	5 years - 11		11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	2	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) on EPC	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	0	5	5	5	5	5
iii)	1 Project- 4 Marks		4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	0	4	4	4	4	4
	add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	0	1	1	1	1	1
	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of project Preparation including design of major highway Project (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	15	15	15	0	15	0	15	11	11	13	11	11	13	13	13
b)	< 2 Project -0 marks				0		0									
	2 Projects -11		11	11		11		11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	more than 3 -10		4	4		4		4	0	0	2	0	0	2	2	2
	Experience in position of Team Leader/Project Manager or similar capacity in Construction Supervision/IC involving length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6** laning) and above	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	18	20	20	20	20	20
c)	< 2 projects - 0															
	2 Projects - 16		16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) marks		4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	2	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation and Maintenance of Major Highway (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	5	5	5	4	5	0	5	4	4	4	5	5	5	4	5
d)	1 project - 4 marks		4	4	4	4	0	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 (one) marks		1	1	0	1	0	1	0	0	0	1	1	1	0	1
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	5	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	< 1 year -0		0	0	0	0			0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
3	1 year -3						3	3								
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks						2	2								
	Total	100	91	91	75	91	76	100	90	90	79	87	91	93	88	93
	Weightage @ 40	12	10.92	10.92	9	10.92	9.12	12	10.8	10.8	9.48	10.44	10.92	11.16	10.56	11.16

Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer				
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	9/10	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s OPEN SOLUTIONS INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANCY SERVICES PRIVATE	
			Dilip Chandra Jha	
			10-06-1966	
			Assessed	Claimed
	Description			
1	General Qualification	25	21	21
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering	4	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	69	70
a)	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:			
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	10	10	10
	< 12 years -0			
	12 years -8		8	8
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 2 (two) marks.		2	2
ii)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	15	15	15
	< 5 years - 0			
	5 years - 11		11	11
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4
iii)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) on EPC	5	5	5
	1 Project- 4 Marks		4	4
	add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks		1	1
	b)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of project Preparation including design of major highway Project (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	15	15
< 2 Project -0 marks				
2 Projects -11			11	11
more than 3 -10			4	4
c)	Experience in position of Team Leader/Project Manager or similar capacity in Construction Supervision/IC involving length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6** laning) and above	20	20	20
	< 2 projects - 0			
	2 Projects - 16		16	16
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) marks		4	4
d)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation and Maintenance of Major Highway (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	5	4	5
	1 project - 4 marks		4	4
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 (one) marks		0	1
	3	Employment with the Firm	5	0
< 1 year -0			0	0
1 year -3				
Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks				
	Total	100	90	91
	Weightage @ 40	12	10.8	10.92

[illegible]

Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer																		
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/10		2/10		3/10		4/10		5/10		7/10		8/10		9/10	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI CONSULTANCY SERVICE PVT LTD		M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS		M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in association with M/s PARISHA ENGINEERS LLP		M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s OPEN SOLUTIONS INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANCY SERVICES	
	Name of Key Personnel		vikash kumar pathak		Rajesh Srivastava		Anil Kumar		Anand Bahilani		Satish Kumar		Shriram Bajaj		Sunil Kumar Vidyarthi		Rajesh Dwivedi	
	Date of Birth of KP's		01/07/1982		23-07-1971		05-07-1962		25-06-1973		02-10-1972		01-12-1982		25-11-1971		31-08-1971	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering/Geotechnical Engineering	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70																
	Professional Experience																	
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	19	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	< 12 years -0																	
i)	12 years -15		15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 5 (Five) marks.		5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	Experience as Resident Engineer/Project Director/Project Manager/Superintending Engineer or equivalent/Executive Engineer or equivalent on construction works/Independent Engineer Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
ii)	< 5 years -0																	
	5 years -15		15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.		5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25	22	22	25	25	0	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	0	19	25	25
iii)	< 2 nos -0						0								0			
	2 nos -19		19	19	19	19		19	19	19	19	19	19	19	0	19	19	19
	Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks.		3	3	6	6		6	6	6	6	6	6	6	0	0	6	6
	Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/Construction Supervision/IC on EPC Mode (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5	4	4	5	5	0	5	5	5	4	5	5	5	4	5	5	5
iv)	1 Project- 4 Marks		4	4	4	4	0	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	more than 3 -10		0	0	1	1	0	1	1	1	0	1	1	1	0	1	1	1
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	4	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	< 1 year -0				0	0			0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
3	1 year -3						3	3										
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks						1	1										
	Total	100	87	87	91	91	65	95	91	91	89	91	91	91	65	85	91	91
	Weightage @ 40	4	3.48	3.48	3.64	3.64	2.6	3.8	3.64	3.64	3.56	3.64	3.64	3.64	2.6	3.4	3.64	3.64

Bridge/structural engineer - I																		
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/10		2/10		3/10		4/10		5/10		7/10		8/10		9/10	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI CONSULTANCY SERVICE PVT Anil Kumar		M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited R K Pandey		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS		M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in association with M/s PARISHA ENGINEERS LLP vinay kumar jain		M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s OPEN SOLUTIONS INFRASTRUCTURE	
	Name of Key Personnel						SUDHIR KUMAR		Shailendra Prasad Singh		Siya Ram Singh				Sushil Kumar Singh		Ajit Kumar Mishra	
	Date of Birth of KP's		15/12/1962		01-10-1964		02/02/1966		25/01/1964		09-10-1961		15-02-1966		30-10-1968		05/02/1972	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	21	25	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	
	II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4	0	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	70	70	67	70	70	70	69	69	68	70	68	70	68	70	70	
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects < 10 years -0	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	
	10 years -11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	
	Add one mark extra for each additional 2 year subject to maximum 4(four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Design /Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Flyover/Interchanges/any other such structures (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	19	20	20	20	19	19	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	
	< 5 years -0																	
	5 years -15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.	5	5	5	4	5	5	5	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Major Highway Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	
	< 2 Bridges -0																	
	2 Bridge -15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	
	Add 2.5 mark extra for each additional bridge subject to maximum 5 (five) mark	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	10	10	10	8	10	10	10	10	10	8	10	8	10	8	10	10	
	< 2 - 0																	
	2 nos -08	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	
	more than 3 -10	2	2	2	0	2	2	2	2	2	0	2	0	2	0	2	2	
v)	Experience in similar capacity of modern bridge construction technology viz., Precast Segmental, Balanced Cantilever Construction, Extradosed Bridge, Full Span Launching, Incremental Launching.	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	
	Experience in 1 project - 4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	
	More than one project - 5 marks	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	5	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
	< 1 year -0		0	0	0	0			0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
	1 year -3	3					3	3										
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	2					2	2										
	Total	100	91	91	88	91	96	100	90	90	89	91	89	91	89	91	91	
	Weightage @ 40	4	3.64	3.64	3.52	3.64	3.84	4	3.6	3.6	3.56	3.64	3.56	3.64	3.56	3.64	3.64	

Bridge/structural engineer - I																		
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/10		2/10		3/10		4/10		5/10		7/10		8/10		9/10	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI CONSULTANCY SERVICE PVT		M/s UKS SCOTT WILSON INDIA Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS		M/s Upnam International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in association with M/s PARISHA ENGINEERS LLP		M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited		M/s Unnrv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s OPEN SOLUTIONS INFRASTRUCTURE	
	Name of Key Personnel		Ajit M. Khatal		ajay kumar		Rajesh Kumar Singhi		Manoj Kumar Jha		Pawan Kumar Singh		ramnik singh		Raj Prasad Singh		Satish Kumar	
	Date of Birth of KP's		02-09-1969		09-11-1971		24/09/1969		04-07-1974		05-01-1974		28/01/1969		23-04-1966		09-09-1972	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	25	25	21	21	21	21	21	25	21	21	21	21	21	
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	
	II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4	0	0	4	4	0	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	70	70	70	70	63	70	68	70	70	70	70	70	68	70	69	70
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	14	15
	< 10 years -0																	
	10 years -11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional 2 year subject to maximum 4(four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	3	4
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Design /Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Flyover/Interchanges/any other such structures (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	< 5 years -0																	
	5 years -15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Major Highway Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	< 2 Bridges -0																	
	2 Bridge -15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	Add 2.5 mark extra for each additional bridge subject to maximum 5 (five) mark	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	10	10	10	10	10	8	10	8	10	10	10	10	10	8	10	10	10
	< 2 - 0																	
	2 nos -08	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8
	more than 3 -10	2	2	2	2	2	0	2	0	2	2	2	2	2	0	2	2	2
v)	Experience in similar capacity of modern bridge construction technology viz., Precast Segmental, Balanced Cantilever Construction, Extradosed Bridge, Full Span Launching, Incremental Launching.	5	5	5	5	5	0	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	Experience in 1 project - 4	4	4	4	4	4	0	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	More than one project - 5 marks	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	5	5	0	0	0	0	3.5	3.5	0	0	0	0
3	< 1 year -0		0	0	0	0			0	0	0	0			0	0	0	0
	1 year -3	3					3	3					3	3				
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	2					2	2					0.5	0.5				
	Total	100	91	91	95	95	89	96	89	91	91	95	94.5	94.5	89	91	90	91
	Weightage @ 40	4	3.64	3.64	3.8	3.8	3.56	3.84	3.56	3.64	3.64	3.8	3.78	3.78	3.56	3.64	3.6	3.64

Senior Pavement Specialist																	
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/10		2/10		3/10		4/10		5/10		7/10		8/10		9/10
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI CONSULTANCY SERVICE PVT LTD		M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS		M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in association with M/s PARISHA ENGINEERS LLP		M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s OPEN SOLUTIONS INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANCY SERVICES PRIVATE LIMITED
	Name of Key Personnel		Kamlesh Kumar Singh		Sandeep Kumar Singh		Basit Ali Khan		Satya Pal Singhmar		H K Ahirwar		Mrinal Kanti Tah		Sanjay Kumar Singh		PRIVATE LIMITED
	Date of Birth of KP's		19-03-1963		20-04-1969		07/07/1982		15/09/1960		09/09/1969		05-12-1972		05-06-1970		Dharam Vir Singh Dahiya
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	25	25	25	21	21	21	21	21
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Pavement engineering or equivalent	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	4	4	4	0	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	40	69	70	70	19	70	70	70	70	70	70	70	67.5	67.5	70
a)	Professional Experience																
	Total Professional Experience of Pavement Design/Construction and Maintenance of Highways/Roads/Air Field Runway	20	20	20	20	20	19	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
i)	< 10 years -0																
	10 years -15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.	5	5	5	5	5	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of 2/4/6-laning** of major Highway Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	0	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
ii)	< 5 years -0						0										
	5 years -15	15	15	15	15	15		15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.	5	5	5	5	5		5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	Experience in similar capacity as Pavement/Geo-technical Engineer in construction/ construction supervision of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25	0	25	25	25	0	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	22.5	22.5	25
iii)	< 2 nos - 0		0				0										
	2 nos - 20	20		20	20	20		20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 5 marks.	5		5	5	5		5	5	5	5	5	5	5	2.5	2.5	5
	Experience in similar capacity on EPC project (of length 40% of project length or more similar configuration (2/4/6/ laning **) and above)	5	0	4	5	5	0	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
iv)	1 Project -4	4	0	4	4	4	0	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	more than 3 -10	1	0	0	1	1		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	5	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
3	< 1 year -0		0	0	0	0			0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	1 year -3	3					3	3									
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	2					2	2									
	Total	100	61	90	91	91	45	96	91	95	95	95	91	91	88.5	88.5	91
	Weightage @ 40	4	2.44	3.6	3.64	3.64	1.8	3.84	3.64	3.8	3.8	3.8	3.64	3.64	3.54	3.54	3.64

Senior Quality cum Material Expert																		
	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/10		2/10		3/10		4/10		5/10		7/10		8/10		9/10	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI		M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS		M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRVATE LIMITED in association with M/s PARISHA ENGINEERS		M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s OPEN SOLUTIONS	
	Name of Key Personnel		Rajkumar gupta		Ghasi Ram Sharma		Anand Kumar Sinha		bijay kumar		prabhat kumar		Raghavendra Uday Lad		Ashish Nandi		Vimlesh Kumar	
	Date of Birth of KP's		03/10/1964		06/07/1964		23-12-1973		22-06-1963		10-08-1968		23-02-1981		19-12-1978		28-11-1967	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	
	II) Post Graduation in Geotechnical Engineering/Foundation Engineering/Soil Mechanics/Rock Mechanics	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	67.5	70	70	70	70	70	70	70	70	70	70	70	65.5	70	70	
	Professional Experience																	
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects < 10 years -0	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	
i)	10 years -11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	
	Experience in similar capacity in Construction /Construction Supervision of major Highway Projects ((similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above))	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	23	25	25	25	
ii)	< 5 years -0																	
	5 years -19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	19	
	Add 2.0 (two) marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	4	6	6	6	
	Experience in similar capacity in handling Similar Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	30	27.5	30	30	30	30	30	30	30	30	30	30	27.5	30	30	30	
iii)	< 2 nos -0																	
	2 nos -25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	25	
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.	5	2.5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	2.5	5	5	5	
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	5	5	0	0	0	0	4	4	0	0	0	
	< 1 year - 0		0	0	0	0			0	0	0	0			0	0	0	
	more than 3 -10	3					3	3					3	3				
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	2					2	2					1	1				
	Total :	100	88.5	91	91	91	96	96	91	91	91	91	95	95	86.5	91	91	
	Weightage @ 40	4	3.54	3.64	3.64	3.64	3.84	3.84	3.64	3.64	3.64	3.64	3.8	3.8	3.46	3.64	3.64	

ROAD SAFETY EXPERT																		
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/10		2/10		3/10		4/10		5/10		7/10		8/10		9/10	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s Frischmann Prabhu India Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s SHREE BHAWANI CONSULTANCY SERVICE PVT LTD		M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in JV with M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in association with M/s Krivam Consultant Private Limited		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s KAIUS CONSULTING PRIVATE LIMITED		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s P.K.ENGINEERS		M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in association with M/s PARISHA ENGINEERS LLP		M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Private Limited		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in JV with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited in association with M/s OPEN SOLUTIONS	
	Name of Key Personnel		Anil Kumar Gupta		Ashish Kumar Agrawal		P Sreenivasulu		Dr. Pratap Singh		RAVEENDRA BABU TALLURI		Pradeep Agrawal		Ranajit Kumar Jana		INFRASTRUCTURE Siyaranjan Singh	
	Date of Birth of KP's		10-05-1959		21/09/1976		10-06-1975		08-04-1958		02-05-1983		01-06-1959		24/11/1976		09-02-1960	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
	General Qualification	25	21	21	25	25	21	25	25	25	25	25	21	21	21	21	21	21
1	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Traffic/Transportation/Safety Engineering or equivalent. Post- Graduation in Transportation planning will also be considered	4	0	0	4	4	0	4	4	4	4	4	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	70	73	70	75	73.5	75	70	70	74	75	53	74	75	75	70	70
	Professional Experience																	
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	14	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	< 10 years -0																	
	10 years -11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	3	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety works on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	14	15	15	15	15	15
	< 5 years -0																	
	5 years -11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	3	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audits of 2/4/6-laning** Highway projects at different stages including at least one at design stage	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	0	20	20	20	20	20
	< 2 nos -0												0					
	2 nos -15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15		15	15	15	15	15
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional projects subject to maximum 5 marks.	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5		5	5	5	5	5
	Experience in similar capacity in identification and improvement of black spots on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
	<2 nos. - 0 marks																	
	more than 3 -10	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional improvement of black spots subject to maximum 2 marks.	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Experience in similar capacity of preparing Road Safety Management Plans for Inter Urban Highway	5	5	4	5	5	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	1 project- 4 marks	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	2 or more project- 5 marks	1	1	0	1	1	0	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
	Experience in similar capacity in field of Road Safety Management Plan	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	1 project- 4 marks	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	2 or more project- 5 marks	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	4	0	5	4.5	5	0	0	5	5	4	4	5	5	0	0
	< 1 year - 0		0		0				0	0					0		0	0
	1 year - 3	3		3		3	3	3			3	3	3	3	3	3		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	2		1		2	1.5	2			2	2	1	1	2	2		
	Total :	100	91	94	95	100	94.5	100	95	95	99	100	74	95	96	96	91	91
	Weightage @ 40	4	3.64	3.76	3.8	4	3.78	4	3.8	3.8	3.96	4	2.96	3.8	3.84	3.84	3.64	3.64

Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by SHASHIBHUSHAN DIPNARAYAN MANDAL
Date: 2023.04.21 11:54:11 IST
Location: eProcurement System for Central PSUs