



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways, Government of India)

जी-5 एवं 6, सेक्टर-10, द्वारका, नई दिल्ली - 110 075 • G-5 & 6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110075

दूरभाष/Phone : 91-11-25074100 / 25074200



NHAI/Bharatmala/DPR/Patna-Purnia/2022/E-150268

Date: 03.01.2023

To
All Bidders

Subject: Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for development of Greenfield Access Controlled Highway from Patna to Purnia in the State of Bihar under Bharatmala Pariyojana Phase-II - **Final Result of Evaluation of Technical Proposal and opening of Financial Proposal regd.**

This is with reference to NHAI letter dated 23.11.2022 vide which result of Technical Evaluation was uploaded on NIC Portal and bidders were given opportunity to respond, in case of any objection.

2. The representation had been received from the below-mentioned bidders:

S. No.	Name of the Bidders
1	M/s C. E. Testing Company Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s KQC Global Consultants Pvt. Ltd.
2	M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd.
3	M/s Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd.
4	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Intratech Civil Solutions & Consultant
5	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Arun Soil Lab Pvt. Ltd.
6	M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Private Limited in JV with M/s Altinok Consulting Engineering Inc. and in association with M/s Synergy Engineers Group Pvt. Ltd.
7	M/s Monarch Surveyors & Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd. In JV with M/s K & J Projects Private Limited
8	M/s RITES Limited in association with M/s JC Technocrats Pvt. Ltd.
9	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Upham International Corporation
10	M/s Sheladia Associates Inc. in association with M/s Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd. and M/s PNT Designs (Pvt.) Ltd.
11	M/s STUP Consultants Pvt. Ltd. In association with M/s Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited
12	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.
13	M/s TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s MAV Associates LLP

3. The representations as received have been examined and replies to the representation as approved by the Competent Authority is enclosed. Based on the above deliberations, the final technical evaluation marks obtained by firms is indicated as below:

S. No.	Name of the Applicant	Relevant experience for the assignment	Material Testing Survey and Investigation, Equipment and Software Proposed	Qualifications and relevant experience of the proposed key personnel	Final Marks
	Responsive firms				
1	M/s AICONS Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s ARKITECHNO Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s MSPARK Futuristics and Associates	37.00	20.00	36.84	93.84
2	M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd.	39.00	20.00	38.64	97.64

S. No.	Name of the Applicant	Relevant experience for the assignment	Material Testing Survey and Investigation, Equipment and Software Proposed	Qualifications and relevant experience of the proposed key personnel	Final Marks
3	M/s Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd.	38.00	18.00	37.60	93.60
4	M/s FP India Project Management Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Indian Engineering Consultants India Pvt. Ltd.	39.00	20.00	38.04	97.04
5	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Arun Soil Lab Pvt. Ltd.	40.00	20.00	39.28	99.28
6	M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Private Limited in JV with M/s Altinok Consulting Engineering Inc. and in association with M/s Synergy Engineers Group Pvt. Ltd.	40.00	20.00	32.00	92.00
7	M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in JV with M/s Global Infra Solutions	37.00	20.00	35.52	92.52
8	M/s Monarch Surveyors & Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd. In JV with M/s K & J Projects Private Limited	40.00	20.00	36.08	96.08
9	M/s RITES Limited in association with M/s JC Technocrats Pvt. Ltd.	40.00	20.00	36.28	96.28
10	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Upham International Corporation	40.00	20.00	37.24	97.24
11	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	36.00	20.00	36.18	92.18
12	M/s TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s MAV Associates LLP	36.00	20.00	37.24	93.24
13	M/s Voyants Solutions Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Nu-Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	38.00	20.00	36.98	94.98
	Non-Responsive				
14	M/s C. E. Testing Company Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s KQC Global Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	TL is scoring less than 75% marks			
15	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Intratech Civil Solutions & Consultant	TL is scoring less than 75% marks			
16	M/s MSV International Inc. in association with M/s Vaishnavi Infratech Services Pvt. Ltd.	Fails in the minimum eligibility criteria as per clause 12.1 of the data sheet of the RFP.			
17	M/s Sheladia Associates Inc. in association with M/s Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd. and M/s PNT Designs (Pvt.) Ltd.	Fails in the minimum eligibility criteria as per clause 12.1 of the data sheet of the RFP for experience of DPR/ feasibility of aggregate length as per RFP. Also the TL is scoring less than 75% marks.			
18	M/s STUP Consultants Pvt. Ltd. In association with M/s Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited	Fails in minimum eligibility regarding technical capacity as per clause 3.1.3 of LOI of the RFP			

4. Accordingly, the financial bids of the above mentioned 13 (thirteen) Technically Responsive bidders will be opened on 04.01.2023 at 1100 hrs in the IT Training Room, Ground Floor at NHAI, Head Quarter.


 (Shashi Bhushan)
 General Manager (Tech)
 Bharatmala Division

Encl : As above

Reply to Representation of bidders for “Consultancy Services for preparation of DPR for Consultancy Services for preparation of **DPR** for development of Greenfield Access Controlled Highway from **Patna to Purnia** in the State of Bihar under Bharatmala Pariyojana Phase-II”

S. No	Representation	Reply of NHA
	M/s C. E. Testing Company Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s KQC Global Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	
1	In the CV of the proposed Key Personnel i.e. Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer - Sh. Bora Ete (65% marks) which is less than the minimum requirement i.e. 75% marks, therefore, the proposal of bidder is Non-Responsive as per clause 3.2.4 (ii) of the RFP. Therefore, as per above mentioned facts, bidder is not qualifying for financial stage and considered Non-Responsive. Experience in Highway Projects - Experience in Planning, project preparation and design of Highway Projects (2/4/6 Laning of NH/SH/Expressways) < 12 years - 0 12-15 years - 19 15-18 years - 22 >18 years - 25 2,3,4,5,9,11,13,15,16,18,21,23,24,26,27,28,29,30,31,32,33,34,35,36,37,38,39,40,42,43,44,52,53,54&55	As per the requisite criteria mentioned in RFP, the experience of key personnel for planning, project preparation and design of NH/SH/Expressways only have been considered. Experience of projects which are not NH/SH/Expressways (i.e.MDR/ODR/ other road etc). or projects of execution, supervision, proof checking, for traffic dispersal system, base line master plan etc., have not been considered under this category. Further as per information in Infracon, there is no experience of the key personnel after 31/01/2017. In view of the above the CV have been re-evaluated and there is no change in marks allotted earlier. As the CV of the Team Leader-cum-Senior Highway Engineer scores less than 75% marks the bid submitted by M/s C. E. Testing Company Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s KQC Global Consultants Pvt. Ltd. remains as Technically Non-Responsive as declared earlier.
	M/s Sheladia Associates Inc. in association with M/s Infinite Civil Solutions Pvt. Ltd. and M/s PNT Designs (Pvt.) Ltd.	
2	1. Aggregate Length of DPR / Feasibility study of 2/4/ 6 lane projects 1.1 More than the indicative Length of the package applied for (250 km.) 8-Marks 1.2 More than 2 times the indicative length of the package applied for (500 km.) 9-Marks 1.3 More than 3 times the indicative length of the package applied for (750 km.) 10-Marks	The Bidder has claimed projects as ongoing listed at page no. 46-51 & 52-55 of technical proposal. The same have been evaluated as follows:

S. No	Representation	Reply of NHAI	
	We qualify the minimum eligibility criteria in terms of both aggregate length of 2/4/6 laning 250 kms and single project 2/4/6 laning minimum length 100 km. Please refer Projects 1&2 (detailed below) mentioned at page 32 & 33 of the bid Document which itself meets the above two criteria. Copies of Project Description sheets and Experience Certificate for Project 1 & 2 are submitted at page no 46 to 59 of bid Document highlighting the Highway Details are also attached for ready reference.	Page No.	Reply
		46-51	The bidder has enclosed the client certificate for various road improvement work without mentioning the details of the highway projects along with their length and lane configuration. In view of the representation submitted by the bidder and in absence of the lane configuration and length of the highways the project has been considered as 2 lane highway project for evaluation of the bid.
		52-55	The bidder has enclosed the client certificate from west Bengal highway development corporation limited (A wholly owned company of Govt. of West Bengal) dated 24.08.2013 for the aforesaid project which is prior to 7 years of Bid Due date, where in it has been mentioned that they have been completed alignment option study and feasibility report. There is no certificate from client for completion of DPR work within 7 years from the bid due date. As Such the projects prior to 7 years has not been considered for evaluation
		Accordingly it has been observed that the bidder falls to meet minimum eligibility criteria of Preparation of feasibility/ DPR of aggregate length equal to 250 Km. as stipulated in the RFP. The bidder remains as Technically Non-Responsive as declared earlier.	

S. No	Representation	Reply of NHAI
3	In the CV of the proposed Key Personnel i.e. Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer - Sh. Ajit Kumar Sahu (65% marks) which is less than the minimum requirement i.e. 75% marks, therefore, the proposal of bidder is Non-Responsive as per clause 3.2.4 (ii) of the RFP. Therefore, as per above mentioned facts, bidder is not qualifying for financial stage and considered Non-Responsive On perusal of the detailed evaluation of shri Ajit Kumar Sahu the following are noticed. a) In General Qualification (I)(ii) Post Graduation in Highway Engg./Structures/Traffic and Transportation/Soil Mechanics and Foundation Engineering/Construction Management/Transportation[AICTE Approved]" the allotted marks are 0 as against 5. Mr. Ajit kumar Sahu, had completed his master in Engineering from regional Engineering college,Rourkela (an Autonomous Collage) under Sambalpur University in the year 1998. The certificate downloaded from INFRACON portal is also attached at page no 249 of bid Document and copy of the same is attached for ready reference. It is pertinent to mentioned that sambalpur University is a Public University established in 1966 by the Odisha Legislature and regional Engineering College is a Government Engineering College under Sambalpur University. It is now called as "NIT Rourkela" b) Mr. Sahu has Total Professional Experience over the span of 37 years in various levels under Government of Odisha and also Private Consulting Firms. During his vast span he served as Assistant Engineer, Manager(Civil) under NHAI, Resident, Team Leader cu Sr. Highway Engineer and was involved in Project planning, Preparation and highway Design Mr. Sahu also complete several Detailed Project Report Projects as Team Leader Cum Sr. Highway Engineer under NHAI. Please review his candidate and experience from 1985 to 2021. The CV and detailed experience downloaded from INFRACON are available at page no. 239 to 350 of bid Document. Considering his vide span of experience in Project Planning, Preparation and Design, he is eligible for total score of 25 against the allocated 25.	In view of the representation, only the marks towards Post Graduation degree has been considered. Further the CV has been re-evaluated and only the highway projects wherein in experience in planning, project preparation and Design of highway projects has been mentioned as per the details/Description of duties uploaded on INFRACON are considered for evaluation under the relevant criteria clause (II)(b). The CV score less than 75% marks. As the firm fails in meeting minimum eligibility criteria and CV of Team Leader score less than 75% marks the bid remain as Technically Non-Responsive as declared earlier.
M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Arun Soil Lab Pvt. Ltd.		
4	Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer - Sh. Rajesh Kumar Patyal Experience in Highway Projects - Experience in Planning, project preparation and design of Highway Projects (2/4/6 Laning of NH/SH/Expressways) < 12 years - 0 12-15 years - 19 15-18 years - 22 >18 years - 25	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer has been re-evaluated and there is no change in mark assigned earlier evaluation in this criteria.

S. No	Representation	Reply of NHAI
	NHAI have provided “19” marks out of “25” in item no. 2(b) whereas, the proposed Team Leader has more than 18 years of Experience in Highway Project-Experience in Planning, project preparation and design of Highway Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/ SH/ Expressways). He is eligible to get “25” marks out of “25”. Please refer page no.311 to 314 of Technical Proposal as Annex-I. In addition to the above we are also enclosing of the evaluation done by Bharatmala Division NHAI under Bharatmala Pariyojana (Lot-1 & Lot-7) proposals of our Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer where he got “100” marks which is enclosed herewith for your ready reference in Annexure-IA. Please consider the same	
M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Ishita Info Solutions Pvt. Ltd.		
5	1. Aggregate Length of DPR / Feasibility study of 2/4/ 6 lane projects 1.1 More than the indicative Length of the package applied for (250 km.) 8-Marks 1.2 More than 2 times the indicative length of the package applied for (500 km.) 9-Marks 1.3 More than 3 times the indicative length of the package applied for (750 km.) 10-Marks The bidder has claimed 8 projects at page no. 83-84, 87, 93, 96, 112, 115, 121-122 & 154-155 of Technical Proposal as eligible projects.	In view of the representation submitted by the bidder, the bid have been re-evaluated and as the bidder meets the minimum eligibility criteria and accordingly declared Technically Responsive.
M/s TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s MAV Associates LLP		
6	Experience of the Firm 1.) Specific experience of the DPR consultancy related to the assignment for eligibility 1.1) Aggregate Length of DPR / Feasibility study of 4/6 lane projects As per above clause, TPFEPL has aggregate length of 885.678 Km which is more than three times the indicative length of the package. The bidder has claimed 2 projects at page no. 134-136, & 137-143 of Technical Proposal as eligible projects and claimed 10 out of 10 marks in the category.	The two laning project wherein consultancy fee has not been mentioned, is not considered for evaluation. Hence, there is no change in the marks allotted earlier under this criteria.
7	Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer - Mr. Rajesh Kumar Verma	
i)	Post Graduation in Highway Engg./Structures/Traffic and Transportation/Soil Mechanics and Foundation Engineering/Construction Management/Transportation	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer has been re-evaluated and marks have been assigned for the Post graduation degree.

S. No	Representation	Reply of NHAI
	Mr. Raj Kumar Verma has a Post Graduate Degree in Highway Engineering. The certificate is placed in Technical Volume II on Pg. No. 600. Considering the above Mr. Raj Kumar Verma should get full 05 Marks	
ii)	In Feasibility of 2/4/6 laning works or DPR/IC/Construction Supervision of major highway projects i.e. 2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/Expressways in Similar Capacity (Minimum Aggregate length of 80 km) < 80 km- 0 80 km-150 km - 15 Marks 150km-250km - 17 Marks > 250 km - 20 Marks The Key person has claimed 11 projects at Sr. no. 43,74,75,76,79,80,81,82,84,86, & 87 (537.38 Km) of INFRACON as eligible projects and claimed 20 out of 20 marks in the category.	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer has been re-evaluated and there is no change in mark assigned earlier evaluation in this criteria.
8	Highway Cum Pavement Engineer - Mr. Vinod Sharma In Design/ Pavement Design of Highway Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/Expressways) in Similar Capacity (Minimum aggregate length 80 km) < 80 km- 0 80 km-150 km - 15 Marks 150km-250km - 17 Marks > 250 km - 20 Marks The Key person has claimed 6 projects at Sr. no. 12, 13, 19, 20, 21 & 43 (1071.33 Km) of INFRACON as eligible projects and claimed 20 out of 20 marks in the category.	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Highway Cum Pavement Engineer has been re-evaluated and there is no change in mark assigned earlier evaluation in this criteria.
M/s Monarch Surveyors & Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd. In JV with M/s K & J Projects Private Limited		
9	Experience of the Firm This has reference to your letter no. NHAI/DPR/Bharatmala/Patna -Purnia/2022/E-150268 dated 23.11.2022 regarding the subject cited vide which our proposal of M/s. Monarch Surveyors and Engineering Consultancy Pvt. Ltd Pune in joint venture with M/s. K&J Projects Pvt. Ltd. Nagpur id Declared as technically non-responsive We understand that since the JV partner, M/s. K&J project has been debarred for one (01) year effective 1st November 2022 from participating in tender of MORTH/GOI (Including NHAI, NHIDCL, BRO, Etc.) vide road and Building Department, Govt. of Telangana, NH Circle Hyderabad, Order No. SENH/HYD/T1/DPR/BHEL/NH-65/2020-21 dated 15.11.2022/785, our proposal wrt to the subject projects hasn't been consider for further evaluation	In view of the representation submitted by the bidder where in the order from Hon'ble. High court of judicature at Bombay Nagpur bench dated 25.11.2022 giving the permission to the petitioner to participate in future tender processes has been mentioned, the bid has been evaluated as per provisions of RFP and the bidder is declared as Technically Responsive.

S. No	Representation	Reply of NHAI
	In this regard attached herewith please find the court order of the Hon'ble Court of Judicature at Bombay- Nagpur Bench, dated 25th November 2022(copy enclosed for ready reference) vide which the Hon'ble Court has declared that the aforesaid debarment is country to the show cause notice in as much as the said proposed action was not mention therein and by way of ad-interim relief, directed that the petitioner, M/s. K&J Projects Pvt. Ltd. Nagpur is permitted to participate in the future Tender Process forthwith Here it may be prudent to mention that in response to the NIT vide no. NHAI/Bharatmala/DPR/ Patna-Purnia/2022 Dated 18.07.2022 the cited project, we M/s. Monarch Surveyors and Engineering Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. (Lead Partner) in joint Venture with M/s. K&J Projects Pvt. Ltd. (JV Partner) has submitted our bid on 01.08.2022 through online obviously, M/s. K&J Projects Pvt. Ltd. Wasn't been debarred by the Competent Authority for participating any tender of MORTH /GOI during submission In view of the foregoing and pursuance to the above mentioned order of Hon'ble High Court, We therefore earnestly request you to kindly review our technical Proposal and consider our bid for further evaluation for working with you on this prestigious assignment and oblige. Thanking you and assuring you of our highest consideration.	
M/s STUP Consultants Pvt. Ltd. In association with M/s Avaloz Consultant India Private Limited		
10	Technical Capacity (Appendix B-11) With reference to your above referred letter for the subject bid We, STUP Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s Avaloz Consultant India private Limited would like to submit to you our clarification / Justification towards the Technical Proposal submitted by us as enclosed herewith. 1. As you Know that 26AS is downloaded by the Key Personals and we do our best effort to get it arranged at the time of submission of bid, however, as per evaluation committee 22 is only considered out of 45. 2. We would request your good self to kindly relook our submitted Form T-11 (Technical Capacity), where we have submitted the wrong details of in-hand DPR unintentionally. We have considered more than 4 years old projects as in-hand DPR/AE/IE Projects, instead of those projects which either the bids for civil works have been received by the client or original	The bidder in his representation submitted the form 26AS of the key personnel and the same is found to be less than 40 no. It is also to mentioned that the bidder has now claimed they had earlier submitted wrong details of IN hand projects unintentionally and re submitted the corrected Form-T11. Clause 3.1.3 of LOI of RFP mentions that the bidder shall submit requisite details in the prescribed formats of technical proposal along with the RFP documents for evaluation of bids. The evaluation of the bids has been done as per the originally submitted bid

S. No	Representation	Reply of NHAI
	assignment period + one year is lapsed, whichever is earlier after the date of award of the DPR. As per Note-3 of Form T-11, the revised and correct Form-11 is enclosed with this letter for your kind consideration and acceptance please. In view of the above, presentably we have no in-hand DPR projects and only 3 nos. of IE/AE projects hence, we are still having the capacity for new work of DPRs from NHAI.	documents (including originally form T-11) as per provisions of the RFP and it has been observed that the firm fails in meeting the minimum eligibility criteria of Technical Capacity as per clause 3.1.3 of the RFP as such the bid remain as Technically Non-Responsive as declared earlier.
M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd.		
11	Experience of the Firm: DPR for 4/6 laning Elevated Road projects each equal to or more than 40% of indicative length of a package applied for (or Feasibility Study for 4/6 laning projects each equal to or more than 60% of indicative length of a package applied for) Firm has Experience of 03(Three) nos. of DPR Projects having length more than 100 Km (Ref. Page No. 5-1 to 5-79 of POE) (Project No. 1, 6 and 15) and 01 (one) no. of feasibility project having length more than 150 km. (Ref. Page No. 5-1 to 5-79 of POE) (Project No. 9) of our submitted proposal. Hence, firm score in this category will be revised to 10/10	The representation has been reviewed and there is no change in marks allotted earlier under this criteria.
12	Material testing, survey and investigation, equipment and software proposed to be used Experience in LiDAR or better technology for topographic survey (Infrastructure sector) 1 project -1 2 Projects -2 3 Project-3 4 Projects-4 5 Projects -5	In view of the representation submitted by the bidder, the bid has been re-evaluated and assigned 5 marks.
13	Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer - Mr. Sukesh Gupta Post Graduation in Highway Engg./Structures/Traffic and Transportation/Soil Mechanics and Foundation Engineering/Construction Management/Transportation Our proposed candidate i.e. Mr. Sukesh Gupta has completed Master of Technology (Transportation) (Refer Page No. 14-10 of the submitted Technical Proposal), hence he will get 05 in this category and his over score will be 100/100	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer has been re-evaluated and marks have been assigned for the Post graduation degree.
M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Upham International Corporation		

S. No	Representation	Reply of NHAI
14	Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer: Mr. Sanjay Shukhla Post-Graduation in Highway Engg./Structures/Traffic and Transportation/Soil Mechanics and Foundation Engineering/Construction Management/Transportation	The Post graduation degree from Open university. The representation has been reviewed and there is no change in marks allotted earlier in this criteria.
15	Senior Bridge Engineer : Mr. Desh Raj Vidyarthi Experience as Senior Bridge Engineer or Similar Capacity in Highway Design Consultancy Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/ Expressways) involving design of Major Bridges (min 2 nos. of length more than 200m)	In view of Representation the CV has re-evaluated and awarded 30 marks as against earlier allotted 27 marks in this criteria.
M/s RITES Limited in association with M/s JC Technocrats Pvt. Ltd.		
16	Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer: Mr. Naresh Kumar Sharma (C) (i) In Feasibility of 2/4/6 laning works or DPR/IC/Construction Supervision of major highway projects i.e. 2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/Expressways in Similar Capacity (Minimum Aggregate length of 80 km) Please refer Project No. 15 and 19 at page no 225 to 228 (Summary), 255 to 256 and 263 to 264 respectively of our Technical proposal which shows that Mr. Naresh Kumar Sharma (proposed as Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer) has experience of 424.4 Km as Resident cum highway Engineer and Senior Highway Engineer against requirement of 250 km for full 20.00 marks. In View of this, full 20.00 marks may please be awarded toward “Experience in similar capacity in feasibility of 2/4/6 laning works of DPR/IC/Construction Supervision of major highway projects i.e. 2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/Expressway in similar Capacity.	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer has been re-evaluated and there is no change in mark assigned earlier evaluation in this criteria.
17	Highway Cum Pavement Engineer : Mr. Harsh Kumar	
i)	Total Professional Experience <8 years -0 8-12 years - 11 12-15 years- 13 >15 years-15 Mr. Harsh Kumar (Proposed as Highway cum Pavement Engineer) has total Professional Experience of 16.9 years (29 th August 2005 to 26 th July 2022) at the time of bidding on 26 th July 2022 vis-à-vis the requirement of total Professional Experience of 15 Years for full 15 marks. Please refer page page no. 362 to 401 for further details.	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Highway Cum Pavement Engineer has been re-evaluated and there is no change in mark assigned earlier evaluation in this criteria.

S. No	Representation	Reply of NHAI
	In view of this, full 15.00 marks may please be awarded toward "Relevant Experience & Adequacy for the Project	
ii)	Experience in Highway Projects - Experience in Design/ Pavement Design of Highway Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/ Expressways) Mr. Harsh Kumar (proposed as Highway cum Pavement Engineer) has Experience in Design/ Pavement Design Engineer of Highway projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/ Expressway) of 12.8 years vis-à-vis the requirement of 10-15 years for 22 marks.	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Highway Cum Pavement Engineer has been re-evaluated and there is no change in mark assigned earlier evaluation in this criteria.
M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Private Limited in JV with M/s Altinok Consulting Engineering Inc. and in association with M/s Synergy Engineers Group Pvt. Ltd.		
18	Senior Bridge Engineer : Mr. Mohammed Younus Ahmed	
i)	Post Graduation in Structural Engineering / Bridge Engineering The Proposed candidate has M. Tech in Structural from The International Institute of Information Technology, Hyderabad in 2010, Therefore it is requested to kindly allot the marks under this category.	The representation has been revived and CV is assigned 5 marks as against 0 marks under this criteria.
ii)	Experience as Senior Bridge Engineer or Similar Capacity in Highway Design Consultancy Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH / SH / Expressways) involving design of Major Bridges (minimum 2 nos. of length more than 200m) < 2 Numbers - 0 2-4 Numbers - 24 5-6 Numbers - 27 >6 Numbers - 30 The Key personal has claimed 14 projects at Sr. No. 6 to 9, 15, 16, 17, 19, 23, 24, & 25. and claimed 30 out of 30 marks in the category.	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Senior Bridge Engineer has been re-evaluated and there is no change in mark assigned earlier evaluation in this criteria.
19	Traffic Cum Safety Expert : Mr. Atul Kumar Garg	
i)	Experience in Highway Projects - Experience on Similar Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/ Expressways) < 5 years - 0 5-6 years - 19 6-10 years - 22 >10years - 25	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Traffic Cum Safety Expert has been re-evaluated and there is no change in mark assigned earlier evaluation in this criteria.

S. No	Representation	Reply of NHAI
	The proposed candidate has worked on 21 Nos. of 2/4/6 Lane highway projects with experience of 33 years at different stage of Highway projects which includes Feasibility Study, DPR, Development, Construction Supervision stage.	
ii)	Experience as Traffic and Safety Expert / Traffic Engineer or in Similar Capacity in Highway Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/Expressways) (Minimum aggregate length 80 km) < 80 Km - 0 80 Km - 150 Km - 24 >150 Km - 250 Km - 27 >250 Km - 30 The proposed candidate has experience in more than 299.36 Kms of 2/4/6 Lane Highway Projects as Traffic and Safety Expert / Traffic Engineer or in Similar Capacity. But during evaluation none of the experience has been counted. Therefore it is requested to kindly allot the marks under this criteria.	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Traffic Cum Safety Expert has been re-evaluated and there is no change in mark assigned earlier under this criteria.
M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s Intratech Civil Solutions & Consultant		
20	In the CV of the proposed Key Personnel i.e. Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer - Sh. Col. Sukhbir Singh Suhag (65% marks) which is less than the minimum requirement i.e. 75% marks, therefore, the proposal of bidder is Non-Responsive as per clause 3.2.4 (ii) of the RFP. Therefore, as per above mentioned facts, bidder is not qualifying for financial stage and considered Non-Responsive. Col Sukhbir Singh Suhag have been awarded 0.00 marks out of maximum 25.00 Marks under subcategory "Experience in Highway projects Experience in planning, projects preparation and design of Highway Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/Expressway)" In this connection it is submitted that Col Sukhbir Singh Suhag is having experience of more than 27 years in Highway Projects - Experience in planning, projects preparation and design of Highway Projects as an Executive Engineer and Superintending Engineer The Projects mention on Infracon CV can be considered under this under above subcategory Thus Based on experience of more than 27 Years of the candidate, he may kindly be considered for award of 25.00 out of maximum 25.00 marks in place of 0.00 marks under this sub category - Experience in planning, projects preparation and design of Highway Projects." We thereof request your good self that the marks awarded to Col Sukhbir Singh Suhag Teem Leader cum. Sr. Highway Engineer in the technical evaluation may kindly be reviewed with	The Highway projects only with respect to planning , project preparation and Design has been considered for evaluation under this criteria. In view of representation the CV has been re-evaluated and there is no change in marks allotted. Earlier As the CV of Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer score less than 75% marks the bid submitted by M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd in Association with M/s Intratech civil Solution & Consultant remains Technically Non-Responsive as declared earlier.

S. No	Representation	Reply of NHAI								
	respects to our submission made as aforesaid and accordingly award him 90.00 Marks out of Maximum 100 and thus his weighted marks will be 10.80 Weighted marks It is thereof request to kindly review your decision and declare our firm responsive on the basis of details submitted in our technically proposal along with our submission made above.									
M/s Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd.										
21	Firm's Relevant Experience in Last 7 Years: 1. Specific experience of the DPR consultancy related to the assignment for eligibility: 1.1 Aggregate Length of DPR / Feasibility study of 4/6 lane projects: 1.1.1 - More than the indicative length of the package applied for - 8 pts 1.1.2 - More than 2 times the indicative length of the package applied for - 9 pts 1.1.3 - More than 3 times the indicative length of the package applied for - 10 pts The bidder has claimed 09 projects at page no. 25-31,33-35, 36-40, 41-49, 50-54, 55-57,58-61, 66-73 & 74-79 of Technical Proposal as eligible projects and claimed 10 out of 10 marks in the category.	The projects which are not DPR/Feasibility projects and along with projects completion not mentioned by the client certificate has not been considered. The representation has been reviewed and there is no change in marks allotted earlier in this criteria.								
22	1.2 - DPR for 4/6 laning projects each equal to or more than 40% of indicative length of a package applied for (or Feasibility Study for 4/6 laning projects each equal to or more than 60% of indicative length of a package applied for): 1.2.1 - 1 project - 8 pts 1.2.2 - 2 projects - 9 pts 1.2.3 - 3 or more projects - 10 pts The bidder has claimed 05 projects at page no. 25-31, 36-40, 41-49, 66-73 of Technical Proposal as eligible projects and claimed 10 out of 10 marks in the category.	The projects which are not DPR/Feasibility projects and along with projects completion not mentioned by the client certificate has not been considered. The representation has been reviewed and there is no change in marks allotted earlier in this criteria.								
23	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer: Mr. S. Kumar II(b) Experience in Highway Projects - Experience in Planning, project preparation and design of Highway Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH / SH / Expressways) <table><tr><td><12 Years</td><td>0 Points</td></tr><tr><td>12-15Years -</td><td>19 Points</td></tr><tr><td>15-18 Years</td><td>22 Points</td></tr><tr><td>>18 Years</td><td>25 Points</td></tr></table> Mr. S. Kumar has more than 20 years of Experience in Highway Projects - Experience in Planning, project preparation and design of Highway Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH / SH / Expressways) as	<12 Years	0 Points	12-15Years -	19 Points	15-18 Years	22 Points	>18 Years	25 Points	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer has been re-evaluated and there is no change in mark assigned earlier evaluation in this criterion.
<12 Years	0 Points									
12-15Years -	19 Points									
15-18 Years	22 Points									
>18 Years	25 Points									

S. No	Representation	Reply of NHAI								
	per INFRACON Project Nos. 17 to 23 & 25 to 52. So, you are requested to please add 3 points to the assessed score of 22.									
24	Highway cum Pavement Engineer - Mr Surendra Kumar									
i)	II(c) Experience in Similar Capacity: (i) In Design/Pavement design of Highway projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/ Expressways in Similar Capacity (Minimum Aggregate Length of 80 km) <table><tr><td><80 Km</td><td>0 Points</td></tr><tr><td>80Km-150Km</td><td>15 Points</td></tr><tr><td>>150 -250km</td><td>17 Points</td></tr><tr><td>> 250 Km</td><td>20 Points</td></tr></table> Mr. Surendra Kumar has more than 9 DPR projects which included Design/Pavement Design of 4-lane State Highways. Some of the important projects are INFRACON Project Nos. 21, 53, 55, 56, 58, 59, 60, 61 & 65. Aggregate length of these 9 projects is 392 km. So, you are requested to please add 3 points to the assessed score of 17.	<80 Km	0 Points	80Km-150Km	15 Points	>150 -250km	17 Points	> 250 Km	20 Points	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Highway cum Pavement Engineer has been re-evaluated and there is no change in mark assigned earlier evaluation in this criterion.
<80 Km	0 Points									
80Km-150Km	15 Points									
>150 -250km	17 Points									
> 250 Km	20 Points									
ii)	Experience in Similar Capacity: (ii) In Design/Pavement design of Highway Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/ Expressways in Similar Capacity - Number of Projects <table><tr><td>2 Projects</td><td>8 Points</td></tr><tr><td>2-5 Projects</td><td>9 Points</td></tr><tr><td>More than 5 Projects</td><td>10 Points</td></tr></table> Mr. Surendra Kumar has more than 9 DPR projects which included Design/Pavement Design of 4-lane State Highways. Some of the important projects are INFRACON Project Nos. 21, 53, 55, 56, 58, 59, 60, 61 & 65. So, you are requested to please add 2 points to the assessed score of 8.	2 Projects	8 Points	2-5 Projects	9 Points	More than 5 Projects	10 Points	In view of Representation submitted by the bidder the CV of Highway cum Pavement Engineer has been re-evaluated and there is no change in mark assigned earlier evaluation in this criterion		
2 Projects	8 Points									
2-5 Projects	9 Points									
More than 5 Projects	10 Points									