



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन एवं राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India)

क्षेत्रीय कार्यालय (उत्तराखण्ड) - मकान नं-58/37, बलबीर रोड, देहरादून- 248001

Regional Office (Uttarakhand) - House No.-58/37, Balbir Road, Dehradun- 248 001

Phone : 0135-2669752 & 62 E-mail : routtarakhand@nhai.org Website : www.nhai.gov.in

NHAI/PIU-RRK/NH-73/22008/IE/CGRG-GSY/2022/17773

02.09.2022

To,

All Bidders

Sub: Independent Engineer (IE) Services for Operation and Maintenance for the following projects

- 4 Laning of Roorkee-Chutmalpur-Gagalheri Section of NH-344 (Old NH-73) from Ch.0.00 to Ch.35.400 & Chutmalpur - Ganeshpur section of NH-307 (Old NH-72A) from Ch.0.00 to ch.17.900 in the State of Uttarakhand & Uttar Pradesh under NHDP Phase IV on Hybrid Annuity Mode
- 4 Laning of Gagalheri-Saharanpur-Yamunanagar (UP/Haryana border) section of NH-344 (Old NH-73) from Km.35.400 to Km.86.856 in the State of Uttar Pradesh under NHDP Phase IV on Hybrid Annuity Mode.-Result of Technical Evaluation-reg.

Based on representations received from bidders on Technical Evaluation result, the revised technical result of all the bidders who participated in subject project tender as per provisions of RFP is as under:

S. No.	Firm Name	Technical Score		Status	Rank
		Previous Marks	Revised Marks		
1/4	M/s. Artefact Projects Ltd. in Association with Global Infra Solution	Non-Responsive as per Clause 12(C) Note (v)*	89.22	Responsive	3
2/4	M/s. K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In association with Birja Construction LLP	Non-Responsive as per Clause 12(C) Note (v)*	95.10	Responsive	1
3/4	M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Highway Engineering Consultant	Non responsive as associate member i.e M/s HEC is Debarred by MoRTH vide letter no. CE-RO/LKO/In Principle approved NH/UP/2016-17543 (Pkg - X)/491 dated 17.06.2022.	Non Responsive as per RFP Clause 12 (C)*	Non-Responsive	-
4/4	M/s MSV International Inc. in association with Mahamarg Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	Non-Responsive as per Clause 12(B) & 12(C) Note (v)*	92.90	Responsive	2

*These Bidders have not submitted the Form 26 AS in order to certify their permanent key personnel as per requirement of RFP i.e. last one year from bid due date.

2. The detailed evaluation sheet is enclosed herewith for the bidders. Bidders are given opportunity to respond by 02.09.2022 upto 17:00 Hrs, in case of any objection.

Encl: As above

Katiyar

(P.K Katiyar)

Manager (T)-RO-UKD

Name of the Project													
Independent Engineer (IE) Services for operation and maintenance for the projects (i) 4 Lane divided carriageway of Roorkee-Chutmalpur-Gagalheri, NH-344 (Old NH-73) & Chutmalpur – Ganeshpur, NH-307 (Old NH-72A) in the State of Uttarakhand & Uttar Pradesh under NHDP Phase IV on HAM, (ii) 4 Lane divided carriageway of Gagalheri-Saharanpur-Yamunanagar (UP/Haryana border) section of NH-344 (Old NH-73) Uttar Pradesh & Haryana under NHDP Phase IV on HAM													
												Annexure-I	
Final Comparative Technical Evaluation Score.													
S. No	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Proposed work plan and Methodology		Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment#		Total		Rank of the Firm	whether the Technical Responsive Applicant/Bidder Eligible for opening of Financial proposal**
		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed		
	Maximum marks	35	35	5	5	20	20	40	40	100	100		
1/4	M/s. ARTEFACT PROJECTS LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH GLOBAL INFRA SOLUTION	34.50	27.50	5.00	5.00	20.00	20.00	38.20	36.72	97.70	89.22	3.00	Responsive
2/4	M/s. K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In association with Birja Construction LLP	35.00	34.25	5.00	5.00	20.00	19.00	37.32	36.85	97.32	95.10	1.00	Responsive
3/4	M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with	Non - Responsive as per RFP Clause 12 (C)										-	Non-Responsive
4/4	MSV International Inc. in association with Mahamarg Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	35.00	31.50	5.00	5.00	20.00	20.00	Not Claimed	36.40	60.00	92.90	2.00	Responsive

Independent Engineer (IE) Services for operation and maintenance for the projects (i) 4 Lane divided carriageway of Roorkee-Chutmalpur-Gagalheri, NH-344 (Old NH-73) & Chutmalpur – Ganeshpur, NH-307 (Old NH-72A) in the State of Uttarakhand & Uttar Pradesh under NHDP Phase IV on HAM (ii) 4 Lane divided carriageway of Gagalheri-Saharannur-Yamunanagar

THE ASSIGNMENT

S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/4		2/4		4/4	
	Description		M/s. ARTEFACT PROJECTS LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH GLOBAL INFRA SOLUTION		M/s. K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In association with Birja Construction LLP		MSV International Inc. in association with Mahamarg Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	
			Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed
			27.50	34.50	34.25	35.00	31.50	35.00
1	Year of Establishment of the Firm (In case of JV year of establishment of Lead Member shall be considered)(Min 5 years)	2	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
	For 5 years - 1.5 marks	1.5	1.50	1.50	1.50	1.50	1.50	1.50
	More than 5 years – 2 Marks	2	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.50
2	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business	2	1.5	1.5	2	2	2	2
	For 5-10 Crores- 0.5 mark	0.5						
	For 10-20 Crores- 1 mark	1						
	20-50 Crores- 1.5 marks	1.5	1.5	1.5				
	For >50 Crores - 2 marks	2			2	2	2	2
3	Nos. of Key Professionals with the firm *	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	< 4 personnel - 0 marks	0						
	4 to 12 - Linearly varying from 0.25 to 2							
	> 12 personnel - 2 marks	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
4	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Authority Engineer/Supervision Consultant two construction projects of four/six laning ** of 30% of project length each or one projects of four/six laning ** of 50% project length in last 7 years.	6	6	6	6	6	6	6
	2 construction projects 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each -4marks Or 1 construction project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 2 (two) mark.	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
5	Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project t of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years	5	4	5	4.25	5	4	5
	2 project 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4 marks Or 1 project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks.	1	0	1	0.25	1	0	1
6	In hand DPRs of NHAI Projects (presently under progress)	10	5	10	10	10	7.5	10
	More than Project Length	5	5					
	More than 2 times of Project Length	7.5					7.5	
	More than 3 times of Project Length	10		10	10	10		10
7	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFOT/ OMT/ O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years	8	7	8	8	8	8	8
	1 project - 6 marks	6	6	6	6	6	6	6
	Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks	2	1	2	2	2	2	2
	Total	35.00	27.50	34.50	34.25	35.00	31.50	35.00
			1		2		4	

IH-307 (Old NH-72A) in the State of Uttarakhand & Uttar Pradesh under NHDP								
Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection								
S.N o.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/4		2/4		4/4	
	Description		M/s. ARTEFACT PROJECTS LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH GLOBAL INFRA SOLUTION		M/s. K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In association with Birja Construction LLP		MSV International Inc. in association with Mahamarg Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	
			Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed
1	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection	5	5	5	4	5	5	5
	Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Own Equipment							
	1-2 projects	1						
	3-5 projects	2						
	>5 projects	3	3	3	2	3	3	3
2	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Own Equipment							
	1-3 projects	1						
	> 3 projects	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
3	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit (MBIU) or better technology for bridges inspection	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Own Equipment							
	1-3 projects	1						
	>3 projects	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
4	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Own Equipment							
	1-3 projects	1						
	>3 projects	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
5	Experience in Automatic Traffic Counter cum Classifier	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
	Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis							
	Own Equipment	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	1-3 projects	0.5						
	>3 projects	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
	Total	20.00	20.00	20.00	19.00	20.00	20.00	20.00
			1		2		2	

Summary Sheet of CV's									Annexure-I					
S. No.	Details	Total Marks	1/4				2/4				4/4			
			M/s. ARTEFACT PROJECTS LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH GLOBAL INFRA SOLUTION				M/s. K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In association with Birja Construction LLP				MSV International Inc. in association with Mahamarg Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.			
			Name	Score	Assesed @75	Claimed @75	Name	Score	Weighted accessed	Weighted Claimed	Name	Score	Assesed @75	Claimed @75
1	Engineer In Charge/Team Leader	19	Pagadala Venkata Murali Krishna	90	17.10	18.05	Ashok kumar Mishra	94	17.86	18.05	D Venkateswara Rao	91	17.29	CV marks not claimed
2	Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer	12	Rajesh Srivastava	91	10.92	11.4	Dnyanoba Bilapate	91	10.92	10.92	Sanjay Kumar Kautilya	91	10.92	
3	Bridge/Structural Engineer	4	Amarendra Jaltare	100	4	4	Dharmendra	88	3.52	3.8	neeraj kumar mishra	91	3.64	
4	Road Safety Expert	5	Vinod Sharma	94	4.7	4.75	Mahesh Chandra Goyal	91	4.55	4.55	Ashok Kumar Srivastava	91	4.55	
		40			36.72	38.20			36.85	37.32			36.40	

Engineer In Charge/Team Leader								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/4		2/4		4/4	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s. ARTEFACT PROJECTS LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH GLOBAL INFRA SOLUTION		M/s. K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In association with Birja Construction LLP		MSV International Inc. in association with Mahamarg Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	
			Pagadala Venkata Murali		Ashok kumar Mishra		D Venkateswara Rao	
			10-05-1968		03-12-1958		07-11-1969	
			Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	25	25	25	21	CV marks not Claimed
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	
ii)	Post Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering	4	0	4	4	4	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
a)	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:							
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	30	30	30	30	30	30	
	< 10 years -0							
i)	10 years -22		22	22	22	22	22	
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.		8	8	8	8	8	
	Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M of completed 4/6 lane highway sections	35	35	35	35	35	35	
ii)	< 3 years - 0						0	
	3 years - 30		30	30	30	30	30	
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five)		5	5	5	5	5	
	Experience in similar capacity* in Highway Development Projects taken up under PPP	5	4	5	4	5	5	
iii)	1 Project- 4 Marks		4	4	4	4	4	
	add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks		0	1	0	1	1	
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	0	
	< 1 year -0		0	0	0	0	0	
3	1 year -3							
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks							
	Total	100	90	95	94	95	91	
	Weightage @ 40	19	17.1	18.05	17.86	18.05	17.29	
			1		2		5	

Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer							
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/4		2/4		4/4
	Name of the Applicant		M/s. ARTEFACT PROJECTS LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH GLOBAL INFRA SOLUTION		M/s. K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In association with Birja Construction LLP		MSV International Inc. in association with Mahamarg Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.
	Name of Key Personnel		Rajesh Srivastava		Dnyanoba Bilapate		Sanjay Kumar Kautilya
	Date of Birth of KP's		23/07/1971		25-06-1959		25-12-1963
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25	21	25	21	21	21
	i) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21
	ii) Post Graduation in Highway Engineering	4	0	4	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70					
	Professional Experience						
	Experience in highway works (inspection /design/ construction/ maintenance)	30	30	30	30	30	30
	< 7 years -0						
	i) 7 years -22		22	22	22	22	22
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.		8	8	8	8	8
	Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature	15	15	15	15	15	15
	< 3 year - 0						
	ii) 3 years -12		12	12	12	12	12
	Add one marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.		3	3	3	3	3
	Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/ Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/ Expressways	25	25	25	25	25	25
	iii) 1 project -20		20	20	20	20	20
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.		5	5	5	5	5
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	0
	< 1 year -0		0	0	0	0	0
	3 1 year -3						
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks						
	Total	100	91	95	91	91	91
	Weightage @ 40	12	10.92	11.4	10.92	10.92	10.92
			1		2		4

CV marks
not
Claimed

Bridge/Structural Engineer								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/4		2/4		4/4	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s. ARTEFACT PROJECTS LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH GLOBAL INFRA SOLUTION		M/s. K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In association with Birja Construction LLP		MSV International Inc. in association with Mahamarg Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	
	Name of Key Personnel		Amarendra Jaltare		Dharmendra		neeraj kumar mishra	
	Date of Birth of KP's		03/11/1971		11-06-1967		01/07/1974	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	25	25	21	25	21	CV marks not claimed
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	
	II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4	4	4	0	4	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
	Professional Experience							
	Total Professional Experience	30	30	30	30	30	30	
	< 7 years -0							
i)	7 years -22	22	22	22	22	22	22	
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks	8	8	8	8	8	8	
	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation	20	20	20	19	20	20	
ii)	< 3years -0							
	3 years - 16	16	16	16	16	16	16	
	Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	4	4	4	3	4	4	
	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation of 4/6 lane highway/expressway or	20	20	20	18	20	20	
iii)	1 Project -16	16	16	16	16	16	16	
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional Project subject to maximum 4(Four) marks	4	4	4	2	4	4	
	Employment with the Firm	5	5	5	0	0	0	
	< 1 year -0				0	0	0	
3	1 year -3		3	3				
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks		2	2				
	Total	100	100	100	88	95	91	
	Weightage @ 40	4	4	4	3.52	3.8	3.64	
			1		2		4	

Road Safety Expert								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/4		2/4		4/4	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s. ARTEFACT PROJECTS LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH GLOBAL INFRA SOLUTION		M/s. K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In association with Birja Construction LLP		MSV International Inc. in association with Mahamarg Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	
	Name of Key Personnel		Vinod Sharma		Mahesh Chandra Goyal		Ashok Kumar Srivastava	
	Date of Birth of KP's		29/09/1960		12/12/1957		22/06/1957	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	25	25	21	21	21	CV marks not claimed
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	
	II) Post Graduation in Traffic/Transportation/Safety Engineering	4	4	4	0	0	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
i)	Professional Experience							
	Total Professional Experience	30	30	30	30	30	30	
	< 7 years -0							
	7years -22		22	22	22	22	22	
ii)	Add two mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.		8	8	8	8	8	
	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Works of Major Highway Projects (4/6 laning Projects)	20	19	20	20	20	20	
	< 3Years-0							
	3 years -17		17	17	17	17	17	
iii)	Add one marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.		2	3	3	3	3	
	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audit of 4/6 lane highway/Expressway projects.	15	15	15	15	15	15	
	1 nos -12		12	12	12	12	12	
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 3(three) marks.		3	3	3	3	3	
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in preparation of Road Safety Management Plan for Inter Urban Highways.	5	5	5	5	5	5	
	1 project- 3	3	3	3	3	3	3	
	More than one project - 5 marks	2	2	2	2	2	2	
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	0	
3	< 1 year - 0		0	0		0	0	
	1 year - 3							
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks							
	Total :	100	94	95	91	91	91	
	Weightage @ 40	5	4.7	4.75	4.55	4.55	4.55	
			1		2		4	

Name of the Project					
Name & DoB. Of Key Personnel					
S.No.	Applicant No.	#REF!	#REF!	#REF!	#REF!
	Key Position:	M/s. ARTEFACT PROJECTS LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH GLOBAL INFRA SOLUTION	M/s. K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In association with Birja Construction LLP	M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with Highway Engineering Consultant	MSV International Inc. in association with Mahamarg Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.
1	Team Leader- cum Highway Engineer	Pagadala Venkata Murali Krishna	Ashok kumar Mishra	TRILOKI NATH CHOUBEY	D Venkateswara Rao
		10-05-1968	03-12-1958	02-10-1963	07-11-1969
2	Highway maintenece cum Resident Engineer	Rajesh Srivastava	Dnyanoba Bilapate	Sanjay Kumar Pandey	Sanjay Kumar Kautilya
		23/07/1971	25-06-1959	20/01/1969	25-12-1963
3	Bridge/Structural Engineer	Amarendra Jaltare	Dharmendra	Genda Lal	neeraj kumar mishra
		03/11/1971	11-06-1967	20-09-1960	01/07/1974
4	Road Safety Expert	Vinod Sharma	Mahesh Chandra Goyal	V K Gupta	Ashok Kumar Srivastava
		29/09/1960	12/12/1957	24/05/1958	22/06/1957