

NATIONAL HIGHWAYS LOGISTICS MANAGEMENT LIMITED
(formerly known as COCHIN PORT ROAD COMPANY LIMITED)

Regd. Office: NHAI HQ, G-5&6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110 075

Email id: spvsecretarial@nhai.org

CIN: U63000DL2004PLC124173

Phn: 011-25074100

NHML/Ropeways/FS/2022

Dated: 22.06.2022

Subject: Consultancy Services for carrying out feasibility study for development of ropeway projects' [Tender ID- 2022_NHAI_111162_1] - **Evaluation of Technical bid - reg.**

Ref: Bids submitted on 26.05.2022 for the above-mentioned work

Dear Sir,

This is with reference to the Bids submitted on 26.05.2022 for the subject proposal. The result with respect to technical evaluation as approved by the Competent Authority is as under:

First stage technical evaluation

2.1 The bids of the all the 04 (four) bidders were evaluated as per the criteria defined for minimum eligibility requirement in the RFP. The detailed of minimum eligibility evaluation are mentioned in the table below: -

S. No.	Name of the Applicants	Status of the Applicant Sole/JV/ Association	Experience in preparation of Detailed Project Report/Detailed Feasibility report (DPR)* for Passenger cable propelled transit system in the last 10 years. Ongoing projects (complete up to 90%)	Average annual turnover from consultancy services for last 5 financial years (Min. Rs. 50 Crore	Responsive or Non-Responsive
1/4	M/s BERNARD Gruppe ZT GmbH in JV with M/s Salzmann Ingenieure ZT GmbH (SALZMANN) and M/s BERNARD Consultants Private Limited (BERNARD)	JV	Yes	Yes	Responsive
2/4	M/s Tractebel Engineering Private Limited in JV with M/s Ropes GmbH & M/s WPK Austria GmbH	JV	Yes	Yes	Responsive
3/4	M/s K & J Projects Private Limited in JV with M/s Ronmas (India) Private Limited and M/s MDP Consulting	JV	Yes	Yes	Responsive
4/4	M/s Rites Limited in JV with M/s Egis Rail S.A. and M/s Spine Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	JV	Yes	Yes	Responsive



2.2 It is mentioned that all the four bidders in para 2.1 above are meeting the minimum eligibility criteria as per the information submitted by the bidders in their technical proposals.

Second stage technical evaluation

2.3 The bids of the 04 (four) bidders have been further evaluated by the Committee as per the criteria defined in the RFP which are as below:

2.3.1 As per the clause 3.2.4 (ii) of LOI of RFP following CVs of Key Personnel of the applicants who are getting below 75% Marks:

Name of Firm	Name of Key Staff	Score Assigned	Remarks
M/s BERNARD Gruppe ZT GmbH in JV with M/s Salzmann Ingenieure ZT GmbH (SALZMANN) and M/s BERNARD Consultants Private Limited (BERNARD)	(Mr. Stephan Salzmann) (Team Leader cum Ropeway Expert)	0.00	The Team Leader cum Ropeway Expert proposed (Mr. Stephan Salzmann) by M/s BERNARD Gruppe ZT GmbH in JV with M/s Salzmann Ingenieure ZT GmbH (SALZMANN) and M/s BERNARD Consultants Private Limited (BERNARD) is also the Team Leader cum Ropeway Expert in the work for carrying out " <i>feasibility study for development of Ropeway projects in the state of Uttarakhand</i> " awarded to the same bidder vide LOA dated 01.04.2022 and commencement date issued on 09.05.2022 with input of 8 months of TL cum Ropeway Expert. Accordingly, the CV of proposed Team Leader cum Ropeway Expert (Mr. Stephan Salzmann) is considered as failed.
M/s. Tractebel Engineering Private Limited in consortium with M/s. ROPES GmbH & M/s. WPK Austria GmbH	Mr. Herbert Haller (Fire Cum Safety Expert)	67.00	
	Mr. Kishore Gurumukhi (Real Estate cum Financial Expert)	63.00	
M/s K & J Projects Private Limited in JV with M/s Ronmas (India) Private Limited and M/s MDP Consulting	Mr. Yogendra Naij (Real Estate cum Financial Expert)	50.00	
M/s Rites Limited in JV with M/s Egis Rail S.A. and M/s Spine Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	Mr. Harinag Suravarapu (Environment cum Social Expert)	0.00	The Environment cum social Expert should be a graduate degree holder in Environment Engineering/Science or equivalent preferably with Post graduation in Environment Engineering/science or equivalent. The proposed key personnel is having a B Tech Degree in Civil Engineering and therefore, the CV is failed as per clause 3.2.4 (ii) of Letter of Invitation of the RFP.

(A) Technical Non-Responsive Bidders:

S. No	Name of the Firm	Package	Result of the Stage -II evaluation	Remarks
-------	------------------	---------	------------------------------------	---------

Ends

S. No	Name of the Firm	Package	Result of the Stage -II evaluation	Remarks
1	M/s BERNARD Gruppe ZT GmbH in JV with M/s Salzmann Ingenieure ZT GmbH (SALZMANN) and M/s BERNARD Consultants Private Limited (BERNARD)	1,2,3 (Team-1)	Disqualified	As per Para 2.3.1 above, the proposed Team Leader cum Ropeway Expert proposed (Mr. Stephan Salzmann) has been failed. Therefore, as per clause 3.2.4 (ii) of LOI, the entire proposal shall be considered to have failed in the evaluation of Technical Proposals and shall not be considered for opening of Financial Proposals. Further, the entire team (except one key personnel i.e Transport Planner Mr Dirk Kopperschlager) proposed by the bidder is same as one selected for work for carrying out "feasibility study for development of Ropeway projects in the state of Uttarakhand".

(A) Technical Responsive Bidders:

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Package	Team	Experience of the Firm related to the assignment	Adequacy of the proposed work plan and methodology in response to the TOR	Qualification and competence of the proposed key staff for the Assignment	Total
	Maximum marks			40	10	50	100
2/4	M/s Tractebel Engineering Private Limited in JV with M/s Ropes GmbH & M/s WPK Austria GmbH	1,2,3	Team-1	29.00	10.00	40.78	79.78
3/4	M/s K & J Projects Private Limited in JV with M/s Ronmas (India) Private Limited and M/s MDP Consulting	3	Team-1	35.00	10.00	42.62	87.62
4/4 (a)	M/s Rites Limited in JV with M/s Egis Rail S.A. and M/s Spine Pvt. Ltd.	1,2	Team-1	40.00	10.00	46.00	96.00
4/4 (b)	M/s Spine Pvt. Ltd.	3	Team-2	40.00	10.00	37.30	87.30

3. The detailed evaluation sheet for the responsive bidders is enclosed herewith. Bidders are given opportunity to respond by 27.06.2022 (18:00 hrs) in case of any objection and to submit the requisite details/ document within the period.


(Ravinder)
COO NHLML

Subject: Consultancy Services for carrying out feasibility study for development of ropeway projects' [Tender ID- 2022_NHAI_111162_1].

List of Bidders

Applicant No.	Name of Applicant	Status of applicant Sole/JV/ Association
1/4	M/s BERNARD Gruppe ZT GmbH in JV with M/s Salzmann Ingenieure ZT GmbH (SALZMANN) and M/s BERNARD Consultants Private Limited (BERNARD)	JV
2/4	M/s Tractebel Engineering Private Limited in JV with M/s Ropes GmbH & M/s WPK Austria GmbH	JV
3/4	M/s K & J Projects Private Limited in JV with M/s Ronmas (India) Private Limited and M/s MDP Consulting	JV
4/4	M/s Rites Limited in JV with M/s Egis Rail S.A. and M/s Spine Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	JV