



NHAI/WSA/Design Review/South/2022

Dated: 16.08.2022

Tender Id: 2022_NHAI_107305_1

Subject: Appointment of Architectural Consultant for Design, Design Review of Wayside Amenities on Different Sections of National Highway for South Region. – **Result of Technical Evaluation reg.**

Ref: Bids submitted on 06.04.2022 for the above mentioned work.

Sir,

This is with reference to the bids submitted on 06.04.2022 for the subject work. The Technical Evaluation result approved by the Competent Authority is as under:

S. No.	Name of the Bidder	TE 1, 2 & 3 (out of 60)	TE4 Presentation (out of 40)	Total Marks (out of 100)	Remarks
1.	M/s Amrta Turnkey Professional in JV with M/s M/s Sandeep Shirke Associates	-	-	-	Non-Responsive
2.	M/s C.P.Kukreja	59.5	39.5	99	Technically Qualified
3.	M/s Delhi Integrated Multi Modal Transit System Ltd. in JV with M/s La Vista Experience Outdoor Space	-	-	-	Non-Responsive
4.	M/s Mass N Void Design Consultants in JV with M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.	44.5	30.5	75	Technically Qualified
5.	M/s Mukesh & Associates	53.5	32	85.5	Technically Qualified

2. Detailed Technical Evaluation Sheet is attached herewith. Bidders may submit representations, if any, before 23.08.2022.

Yours faithfully,

(Asheesh Kumar Jain)
General Manager (Tech)

Appointment of Architectural Consultant for Design, Design Review of Wayside Amenities on Different Sections of National Highway for South Region								
							Annexure-I	
Final Comparative Technical Evaluation Score.								
S. No.	Name of Bidder	Experience of the Firm related to the assignment	Experience in development of innovative and sustainable architectural design, Understanding of Project requirements and technical	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	Approach & Methodology through presentation	Total	Rank of the Firm	whether the Technical Responsive Applicant/Bidder Eligible for opening of Financial proposal
		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed		
		Maximum marks	30	5	25	40		
1/5	M/s Amrta Turnkey Professiona in JV with M/s Sandeep Shikre Associates	NON- RESPONSIVE					#N/A	Non-Responsive
2/5	M/s C.P. Kukreja Architects	30.00	4.50	25.00	39.50	99	1	Responsive
3/5	M/s Delhi Integrated Multi Modal Transit System Ltd. in JV with M/s La Vista Experience Outdoor Space	NON- RESPONSIVE					#N/A	Non-Responsive
4/5	M/s Mass N Void Design Consultants in JV with M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.	25.00	3.50	16.00	30.50	75	3	Responsive
5/5	M/s Mukesh & Associates	27.50	2.50	23.50	32.00	85.5	2	Responsive

Appointment of Architectural Consultant for Design, Design Review of Wayside Amenities on Different Sections of National Highway for South Region					
S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/5	4/5	5/5
	Description		M/s C.P. Kukreja Architects	M/s Mass N Void Design Consultants in JV with M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Mukesh & Associates
			Assesed	Assesed	Assesed
TE.1 Sub criteria for Experience of the firm related to the assignment					
(a)	Average Annual Turnover (last three years) from architectural consultancy services	7.5	7.5	2.5	5
	INR 5 – <10 Cr. : 2.5 Marks				
	INR 10 – 20 Cr. : 5 Marks				
	> INR 20 Cr. : 7.5 Marks				
(b)	No. of Architectural, Structural and Building Services Design Professionals on roll of firm/company. *The professionals who possess degree in architecture, civil/mechanical/electrical/environmental engineering, and interior design.	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
	10 – 30 No's : 2.5 Marks				
	31 – 50 No's : 5 Marks				
	> 50 No's : 7.5 Marks				
(c)	No. of successfully completed architectural design projects including mixed-use/ commercial/ retail/ hospitality/ institutional/ transit stations, healthcare design/ multi-modal logistics park of project area more than 1 ha. in past 7 years.	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
	Upto 3 Projects : 2.5 Marks				
	3 – 5 Projects : 5 Marks				
	> 5 Projects : 7.5 Marks				
(d)	Cumulative project cost of successfully completed architectural design projects including mixed-use/ commercial/ retail/ hospitality/ transit stations/ healthcare design/ multi-modal logistics park of project area more than 1 ha. in past 7 years.	7.5	7.5	7.5	7.5
	Upto INR 100 Cr : 2.5 Marks				
	INR 100 – 200 Cr. : 5 Marks				
	> INR 250 Cr. : 7.5 Marks				
Total		30	30	25	27.5
TE.2 Sub criteria for Experience in development of innovative and sustainable architectural design, Understanding of Project requirements and technical capabilities of the firm					
(a)	Technical Capabilities of the Firm	2.5			
	Presence of in-house professional expertise for architectural design, structural design, building services (Mechanical, Engineering, Plumbing MEP) and Interior design : 1.25 Marks (0.25 Mark per in-house specialization)		1.25	1.25	1.25
	Availability of licensed software's towards preparation and evaluation of design: Autodesk Revit, Autodesk AutoCAD, STAAD pro, IES/Trace (green building simulations), Adobe Illustrator: 1.25 Marks (0.25 mark per software)		0.75	1	1
(b)	Experience in development of sustainable, environmentally friendly architectural design.	2.5			
	Successfully completed architectural design projects with LEED/ GRIHA/ IGBC certification : 1.5 Marks (0.25 Marks per project)		1.5	0.75	0.25
	Professionals in firm with green building certification (LEED/GRIHA/IGBC), ECBC certification : 1 Marks (0.5 Marks per personnel)		1	0.5	0
Total		5	4.5	3.5	2.5
TE.3	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	25	25	16	23.5
TE.4	Approach & Methodology through presentation	40	39.5	30.5	32
Total		100	99	75	85.5

Summary Sheet of CV's								
S. No.	Details	Total Marks	2/5		4/5		5/5	
			M/s C.P. Kukreja Architects		M/s Mass N Void Design Consultants in JV with M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Mukesh & Associates	
			Name	Marks	Name	Marks	Name	Marks
1	Team Leader – Principal Architect	10	Dikshu C kukreja	10.00	Pranav Kumar	6.50	R Santosh Kumar	9.00
2	Landscape Architect	5	Jasleen Kaur Waraich	5.00	Soumik Mukherjee	3.5	Deepak Rao U	4.5
3	Structural Design Expert	5	Mohd. Fuzail Ahmed	5.00	Iqra Zafar	3	P Sivagami	5
4	Building Services Expert/MEP Expert	5	Raj Kumar Mathe	5.00	Sawarndeeep Saxena	3	C Ramesh	5
		25		25		16		23.5

Team Leader – Principal Architect

S. No.	Name of the Applicant	Max. Marks	M/s C.P. Kukreja Architects	M/s Mass N Void Design Consultants in JV with M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Mukesh & Associates
	Name of Key Personnel		Dikshu C kukreja	Pranav Kumar	R Santosh Kumar
	Date of Birth of KP's		08.06.1969	23.07.1970	17.08.1983
	Description		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	3	3	1.5	3
	Bachelor's in engineering/Architecture - 1.5 Marks				
	Post-Graduation in Architecture, Building Engineering Design - 3 Marks				
2	Adequacy for the Project	6	6	4	5
	Professional Experience in handing architectural design projects				
a)	Upto 10 Years - 0 Marks				
	10 – 15 Years - 2 Marks				
	> 15 Years - 3 Marks				
b)	Experience as Team Leader – Principal Architect in leading mixed-use/ commercial/ retail/ hospitality/ institutional/ transit stations/ healthcare design of project area more than 1 ha.				
	< 3 Projects - 0 Marks				
	3 – 5 Projects - 1 Marks				
	5 – 7 Projects - 2 Marks				
	Add 0.25 Marks for each subsequent project subject to maximum of 3 Marks				
3	Employment with the Firm	1	1	1	1
	< 2 Years - 0 Marks				
	2 years and more - 1 Marks				
	Total	10	10	6.5	9

Landscape Architect					
S. No.	Name of the Applicant	Max. Marks	M/s C.P. Kukreja Architects	M/s Mass N Void Design Consultants in JV with M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Mukesh & Associates
	Name of Key Personnel		Jasleen Kaur Waraich	Soumik Mukherjee	Deepak Rao U
	Date of Birth of KP's		19.12.1966	02.02.1986	10.10.1980
	Description		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	1.5	1.5	1	1.5
	Bachelor's in Architecture - 1 Marks				
	Post-Graduation in Landscape Architecture - 1.5 Marks				
2	Adequacy for the Project	3	3	2	3
a)	Professional Experience in handling architectural design projects				
	Upto 5 Years -0 Marks				
	5 – 10 Years -1 Marks				
	> 10 Year - 1.5 Marks				
(b)	Experience in architectural design & planning of large scale passenger infrastructure projects (Airports in cities & area having million plus urban agglomeration, Intermodal stations / Terminals, Railway terminals in metros or major cities with intermodal integration, large bus terminals /Metro Stations)				
	<3 Projects - 0				
	3 Projects - 5 Projects- 0.5 marks				
	5- 7 Projects- 1 Mark				
3	Employment with the Firm	0.5	0.5	0.5	0
	< 2 Years -0 Marks				
	2 years and more - 0.5 Marks				
Total		5	5	3.5	4.5

Structural Design Expert					
S. No.	Name of the Applicant	Marks	M/s C.P. Kukreja Architects	M/s Mass N Void Design Consultants in JV with M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Mukesh & Associates
	Name of Key Personnel		Mohd. Fuzail Ahmed	Iqra Zafar	P Sivagami
	Date of Birth of KP's		25.11.1976	15.07.1991	10.05.1976
	Description		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5
	Bachelor's in Civil Engineering - 1 Marks				
	Post-Graduation in Engineering - 1.5 Marks				
2	Adequacy for the Project	3	3	1	3
	Professional Experience in handing structural design projects				
	Upto 5 Years -0 Marks				
a)	5 – 10 Years - 1 Marks				
	> 10 Years - 1.5 Marks				
b)	Experience as Structural Design Expert in leading mixed-use/ commercial/ retail/ hospitality/ institutional/ transit stations/ healthcare design of project area more than 1 ha.				
	< 3 Projects - 0 Marks				
	3 – 5 Projects - 0.5 Marks				
	5 – 7 Projects - 1 Marks				
	> 7 Projects - 1.5 Marks				
III	Employment with the Firm	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5
	< 2 Years -0 Marks				
	2 years and more - 0.5 Marks				
	Total	5	5	3	5

Building Services Expert/MEP Expert					
S. No.	Name of the Applicant	Marks	M/s C.P. Kukreja Architects	M/s Mass N Void Design Consultants in JV with M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Mukesh & Associates
	Name of Key Personnel		Raj Kumar Mathe	Sawarndeeep Saxena	C Ramesh
	Date of Birth of KP's		05.05.1975	07.12.1990	15.05.1969
	Description		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	1.5	1.5	1	1.5
	Bachelor's in Civil / Electrical Engineering - 1 Marks				
	Post-Graduation in Engineering - 1.5 Marks				
2	Adequacy for the Project	3	3	1.5	3
a)	Professional Experience in handing structural design projects				
	Upto 5 Years -0 Marks				
	5 – 10 Years - 1 Marks				
	> 10 Years - 1.5 Marks				
b)	Experience as Structural Design Expert in leading mixed-use/ commercial/ retail/ hospitality/ institutional/ transit stations/ healthcare design of project area more than 1 ha.				
	< 3 Projects - 0 Marks				
	3 – 5 Projects - 0.5 Marks				
	5 – 7 Projects - 1 Marks				
	> 7 Projects - 1.5 Marks				
III	Employment with the Firm	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5
	< 2 Years -0 Marks				
	2 years and more - 0.5 Marks				
Total		5	5	3	5