In order to ascertain the reasonableness of rates quoted by the lowest tenderers in Schedules B and C, clarification was sought from the lowest tenderers requesting them to submit due rate analyeis justifying the higher rates quoted by them in respect of items where rates offered are more than 50% higher than estimated rates (number of items tabulated above).The tenderes were also advised to communicate their consent to award the work deleting the scope of Schedule B and C from the tender in case their justification of higher rates was not considered satisfactory and acceptable (CP- 75/1to4 and 76/1to6). In response, the L1 tenderers have submitted a general justification (CP-77/1to2 and 78/1to2) stating that the rates were quoted during the peak time of Russia and Ukraine war when international sanctions on trade were enforced, resulting in uncertaint rise in market rates of all commodities. It has been also stated that high rated items are related to steel, aluminium, copper and petroleum products for which rates were on a rising trend at that time. The L1 tenderers have also conveyed their consent to award the tender by deleting the Schedules B and C from the scope of tender.

The Committee has gone through the details submitted by the tenderers and has found that even after considering the rate justifications submitted by the L1 tenderers and PVC updation, the offered rates for schedules B and C are substantially higher and untenable. Therefore, the Committee is of the view that these two schedules be taken out of the scope of the tender and a separate tender be processed for the electrical part of the work.

Considering all the points above, rates offered by L-1 tenderers, Miral Infrastructure for LOT III, and M/s Sai Projects Mumbai Pvt. Ltd. for LOT VI, are considered reasonable for Schedule A and Schedule D and proposed for acceptance duly deleting the scope of Schedules B and C from the tender.

vii) It is also noted that the Inter-se position of the tenderers does not change due to deletion of scope of Schedule B and Schedule C from the tender as can be seen from Annexure-F.

viii) The committee has studied the feasibility and reasonableness of the L1 offer in view of the facts brought out in the previous paragraphs. Thus, the committee observes that even though the present tender is BOQ based in which the tenderers have quoted rates that are 50 - 100%, over the estimated rates in some items, there is merit in assessing the overall reasonableness of the offer especially for the Schedule A and Schedule D which are considered reasonable on overall rate basis for both Lots.

3. Recommendation of Tender Evaluation Committee:

Tender evaluation Committee therefore, makes its recommendations as per the following:

(A) Considering the detailed deliberation on rates made in para 2.8 above, rates offered by L-1 tenderer: Miral Infrastructure for LOT III, and M/s Sai Projects Mumbai Pvt. Ltd. for LOT VI, are considered reasonable for Schedule A and Schedule D by the Committee. The Committee therefore proposes to award these tenders duly deleting scope/schedules B and C from the tender as under:

- Miral Infrastructure for LOT III at total cost of **₹ 1,09,33,79,944.37** + applicable GST.
- M/s Sai Projects Mumbai Pvt. Ltd., for LOT VI at total cost of **₹ 1,25,58,72,473.00** + applicable GST.

Schedule	LOT III		LOT VI	
	Estimated Cost	Offered Cost by Miral Infrastructure	Estimated Cost	Offered Cost by M/s Sai Projects Mumbai Pvt. Ltd.
Sch A-I	₹ 89,17,75,449.88	₹ 1,02,71,74,767.37	₹ 97,70,79,596.00	₹ 1,17,99,86,131.00
Sch A-II	₹ 16,72,000.00	₹ 16,72,000.00	₹ 6,00,400.00	₹ 6,98,000.00
Sch D-I	₹ 39,09,643.00	₹ 12,53,607.00	₹ 47,39,652.03	₹ 50,17,064.00
Sch D-II	₹ 5,27,93,143.00	₹ 6,32,79,570.00	₹ 6,48,34,441.18	₹ 7,01,71,278.00
TOTAL (Without GST)	**₹ 95,01,50,235.88**	**₹ 1,09,33,79,944.37**	**₹ 1,04,72,54,089.21**	**₹ 1,25,58,72,473.00**
% Above		**15.07%**		**19.92%**

(B) As brought out in detail in Para 2.8 on reasonableness of rates, it can be seen that the rates for both Lots (LOT-III and LOT-VI) are considered reasonable on overall tender prices and there is wide variation in item-wise quoted rates. Considering this, the TEC proposes that "All the rates of items mentioned in Annexure B and Annexure C shall not be referred as LARs in future tenders and estimates and specific mention of the same be made in LOA".

(C) It is also recommended that list of all items with offered rates exceeding 50% of the estimated rates (Annexure B and C) be given to field executives (Civil/S&T) for their respective schedules for close watch and that an internal control mechanism be set with instruction to the field executives as under:-
"Field executive in charge of the work for the respective schedule (Civil Engineers for Schedule A and S&T Engineers for Schedule D) shall ensure that these high rated items identified and circulated (Annexure B and C) shall be kept under close watch and any positive variation in these items be avoided to the extent possible and if essentially required to be done, the same shall be only with finance concurrence and approval of accepting authority i.e. Director/Projects".

(D) Considering a generally lukewarm response from tenderers for various Lots of the tender under discussion which is a composite tender (requiring specialized subcontractors for OHE, Electrical GS and S&T meeting prescribed qualification criteria) and considering substantially higher rates received for work schedules executed through subcontracting especially OHE and Electrical GS, it is recommended by Committee to execute all the sub-contracting schedules through separate tenders duly deciding their Lots/packaging. The balance 5 Lots which are not getting finalized may thus be re-tendered with only Civil works schedule. Final decision may however be taken by the competent authority in this regard.

Acceptance/rejection/modification of these TEC recommendations lie in the competence of DP/MRVC as per SOP Item No 2.01(a) of Works Tender.

5.8.2022	05/08/22	5.8.2022
Vilas Wadekar	Dinesh Vashistha	Smriti Verma
ED/Civil	CSTE	ED (Finance)

Director/Project

Recommendations of TEC in para 3 (pg 9&10 of 10) accepted.

08/8/22

ED/Civil

Signature Not Verified
Digitally signed by ANAND VASANT KULKARNI
Date: 2022.08.25 12:52:53 IST
Location: eProcure-EPROC