



**“TECHNICAL BID EVALUATION REPORT”
FOR
“REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR ENGAGEMENT OF
DEA EMPANLED TRANSACTION ADVISOR FOR
PROVIDING ADVISORY SERVICES FOR
DEVELOPMENT & OPERATIONALIZATION OF NW-
10, NW-28 & NW-85 IN MAHARASHTRA THROUGH
PPP”**

Inland Waterways Authority of India

(Ministry of Ports, Shipping & Waterways Govt. of India)

Head Office: A-13, Sector-1, Noida-201301 (U.P.)

Tel (0120)2474093, Fax (0120) 2522969

Web site: www.iwai.nic.in & <http://eprocure.gov.in/eprocure/app>

January-2023

Tender No. IWAI/HY/Maha-NWs/2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0	BIDDING PROCESS	3
2.0	RESPONSE TO "NIT"	3
3.0	BID EVALUATION	4
3.1	TECHNICAL EVALUATION	4
4.0	SUMMARY OF SUBMISSIONS:	8
5.0	EVALUATION RESULT	8
6.0	"TEC" RECOMMENDATIONS	8

TECHNICAL BID EVALUATION REPORT

Name of Work: "Request for Proposal (RFP) for selection of DEA empanelled transaction advisor for providing advisory services for development & operationalization of NW-10, NW-28 & NW-85 in Maharashtra through PPP".

1.0 BIDDING PROCESS

The timelines of bidding processes are as follows

Table – 1: Process of Bidding

Sl. No.	Description	Dates / Details
1.	Date of Tender Upload on Website	04.11.2022
2.	Date of Pre-Bid Meeting	21.11.2022
3.	Date of Bid Submission	24.12.2022 till 1800 hrs
4.	Date of Pre-Bid Minutes/Corrigendum issued	Corrigendum-I: Issued on 12.12.2022 for submission of bids from 12.12.2022 to 24.12.2022 at 15:30 hrs. Pre-bid Queries uploaded on 13.12.2022.
5.	Date of Opening of Technical Bids in presence of TEC	26.12.2022
6.	Members of Tender Evaluation Committee (TEC)	(i) Sh Praveen Nandwana, M(Fin) (ii) Shri Ashutosh Gautam, M(Tech) (iii) Sh. V C Dialani Director (MM)
7.	Date of Dispatch of Clarification Letters to the responsive Bidders	Clarification not sought by IWAI.
8.	Last date of submission of response to Clarifications by the Bidders	

2.0 RESPONSE TO "NIT"

The bidding was open only to 12 firms enlisted by DEA as per their notification no F.No 2/3/2021-PPP dated 01.07.2022. Out of the 12 firms only the following 4 firms evinced their interest in the bids

a) M/s CRISIL Limited

b) M/s KPMG

c) M/s PwC

d) M/s i-Deck

3.0 BID EVALUATION

After ascertaining payment of tender cost and EMD by the bidders, their technical bids were opened and evaluated as per the criteria laid down in the Tender document:

3.1 Technical Evaluation

The following evaluation criteria was suggested in lines with the recommendations as provided in DEA manual

Table 1: General Evaluation Criteria

Item Code	Parameter	Maximum Marks
1	Technical presentation	50
2	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	50
	Grand Total	100

Table 2: Technical presentation on the subject and Adequacy of the proposed Approach & Methodology in responding to Terms of Reference:- 50 Marks

S No	Description	Marks
1	Technical presentation	30
2	Work Plan	10
3	Quality of Approach and Methodology	10

Table 3: Qualification and Competence of the Key Professionals for the assignment shall be evaluated. The weight age for various key staffs are as under:

S. No.	Description	Marks
1.	PPP Expert cum Team Leader- 1 no	15

2.	Finance Expert	9
3.	Traffic Expert	6
4.	Infrastructure Expert	8
5.	Legal Expert	6

The criteria of marking of each key personal was further sub-divided as follows

Marking System as per RFP					
Expert		Educational qualification	Criteria	Scoring Pattern	Marks
PPP Expert Cum Team Leader		Graduation in engineering in any Discipline and MBA/Equivalent	Total Work Experience	12 years: 2 marks	2 marks
				More than 12 years - 15 years	3.5 marks
				More than 15 years	5 marks
			Experience in Transaction Advisory Projects in India related to IWT/Ports/Railway Sector	2 PPP Transactions	3 marks
				More than 2 projects	5 marks
			Experience in feasibility studies, financial analysis, financial modelling, business plan and Bid/ PPP advisory of transportation infrastructure project	1 project	3 marks
				2 projects or more projects	5 marks
Sub Total				15 marks	
Traffic Expert		Graduation in any discipline and post graduation or equivalent in any field	Total Work Experience	8 years	2 marks
				more than 8 years	3 marks

		Experience in traffic studies/Demand Assessment/Traffic Projections/Operating cost benchmarking for transportation & Logistic projects involving river and/or maritime transport including IWT/Ports/Railway Sector	1 Project	1 mark
			2 projects	2 marks
			3 or above projects	3 marks
			Sub Total	6 marks
Infrastructure Expert	Graduation in Engineering in any discipline and post-graduation or equivalent in any field	Total Work Experience	8 years	3 marks
			More than 8 years	4 marks
		Experience in traffic studies/Demand Assessment/ Traffic Projections/Operating Cost benchmarking for transportation & Logistic projects involving river and/or maritime transport including IWT/Ports/Railways sector	8 years	3 marks
			More than 8 years	4 marks
			Sub Total	8 marks
			Sub Total	8 marks
Finance Expert	MBA/PGDM or equivalent	Total Work experience	8 years	2.5 marks
			More than 8 years	4 marks
			Sub Total	6.5 marks

MAHARASHTRA THROUGH PPP

		Experience in Financial assessment, due diligence, financial modeling for the projects in the transportation sector preferably in IWT/Ports/Multimodal /Railways/Road Sector		
			1 project 2 or more projects	2 mark 5 marks
Sub Total				9 marks
Legal Expert	LLB/LLM	Total Work Experience	8 years More than 8 years	2.5 marks 3 marks
		Experience in reviewing of contract Documents/Concessi on Agreements in Infrastructure sector including experience in PPP projects	8 years More than 8 years	2.5 marks 3 marks
Sub Total				6 marks
Traffic Surveyor	Graduation in any discipline	Total Work Experience	5 years More than 5 years	2.5 marks 3 marks
		Experience in traffic studies/Demand Assessment/Traffic Projections/Operating cost benchmarking for transportation & logistic projects involving river and /or maritime transport including IWT/Ports/Railways	5 years More than 5 years	2.5 marks 3 marks
Sub Total				6 marks
Total Marks				50 marks

4.0 Summary of Submissions:

- 4.1 **M/s KPMG-** has submitted the CV of all required experts and all the experts have requisite qualifications and experience. The team is lead by Sh Guarav Vaish
- 4.2 **M/s PwC-** has submitted the CV of all required experts and all the experts have requisite qualifications and experience. The team is lead by Sh Jaffrey Thomas.
- 4.3 **M/s i-Deck-** has submitted the CV of all required experts and all the experts have requisite qualifications and experience. The team is lead by Sh Vijay Kumar C.
- 4.4 **M/s CRISIL -** has submitted the CV of all required experts and all the experts have requisite qualifications except that legal expert have less than 8 years of experience so no marks on account of experience has been allotted to her. The team is lead by Sh Jagannaryan Padmanabhan.

5.0 EVALUATION RESULT

The table given below depicting the results of "Technical Bid Evaluation" is enumerated hereunder:

Sl. No.	Bidder's Name	Scores obtained by Bidders (Out of 100 Marks)	Remark
1.	M/s CRISIL	47+15+25= 87	Technically qualified
2.	M/s I-Deck	50+17+28= 95	Technically qualified
3.	M/s PwC	50+17+25=92	Technically qualified
4.	M/s KPMG	50+17+26=93	Technically qualified
No. of Bids-4			

The detailed technical evaluation & marking is attached along with this report. As per T&C of the Tender only those bidders whose Technical Bids score 65 marks or more out of 100 shall qualify for further consideration and shall be ranked from highest to the lowest on the basis of their technical score (ST).

6.0 "TEC" RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the evaluation of original bids and the response all the firms are qualified for next stage i.e financial opening of bid.

(.....)


(V C Dialani)
Director(MM)

(.....)


(Ashutosh Gautam)
Member(Tech)

(.....)


Signature Not Verified

(Praveen Nandwana)
Digitally signed by Praveen Nandwana, DN: cn=RAJAT RAJAT, o=Inland Waterways Authority of India, email=praveen.nandwana@iwai.gov.in, c=IN
Date: 2023.01.30 15:44:43 IST
Location: eProcure-EPROC