

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

CONTRACT: ENM/L-08/NOVEC/2022 “One time Repair / Rectification of NOVEC based gas flooding system installed at DMRC Line-08 stations and Depot Building”

TENDER ID: 2022_DMRC_685865_1

1.0 INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 Open tender was invited for the above work in two packages namely Technical Package and Financial Package after obtaining approval of Competent Authority at NP # 51. Detailed Notice Inviting Tender including the minimum eligibility criteria was also uploaded on DMRC website (CP # 215-216).
- 1.2 The key information regarding sale and submission of tender is as under (CP # 259-260):

Cost of work in NIT	Rs. 34.71 Lakh
Tender Security	Rs. 69,420/-
Cost of Tender Document	Rs.5,900/- (inclusive of 18% GST)
Tender Document on sale	28.04.2022 to 30.05.2022 upto 14:00 hrs
Number of tenders received within stipulated time	Five (05) nos. bidders have submitted tenders (CP # 225): 1. M/s ADN Fire Safety Pvt. Ltd. (1/5) 2. M/s Fire Engineering Technology (2/5) 3. M/s Foamtech Antifire Pvt. Ltd. (3/5) 4. M/s Southern Electronics Bangalore Pvt. Ltd. (4/5) 5. M/s Vasu Infosec Pvt. Ltd. (5/5)
Mode of tender	Open tender under two packages
Time Period	01 Year from the stipulated date of commencement of work (i.e., Issuance of LOA).
Period of tender submission	20.05.2022 to 30.05.2022 (up to 14:00 Hrs.)
Date and time for opening of Technical Packages	31.05.2022 at 14:30 Hrs.
Late and delayed tenders	There was no late or delayed submission of tenders.
Validity of Tender	180 days from the last date of submission of tender i.e. up to 30.11.2022.

2.0 ESTIMATE AND FUNDS AVAILABILITY

Estimate for the subject work has been approved by the competent authority for amounting to Rs. 34,71,219.00 (inclusive of all taxes) against the budget head of Line-08 i.e., 5.00 - C- VIII (NP # 42).

3.0 TAXES AND DUTIES

- 3.1 As per Clause C 2.4 & 2.5 of ITT (CP # 54) and Clause-19 of SCC (CP # 107), the bidders were to quote the prices inclusive of all.
- 3.2.1 In terms of clause-20 of SCC, no price variation is admissible in this contract (CP # 108).
- 3.2.2 Evaluation of tenders has been made as per clause-E4 (Evaluation of Tenders) of ITT (CP # 29).

4.0 EVALUATION

- 4.1 In terms of Clause (E) of ITT of the tender document, technical packages uploaded by the bidders are to be opened and evaluated first and thereafter financial package of

227240/2022/O/o E&M

- technically compliant and acceptable bidders are to be opened on a later date. Accordingly, only the technical package has been opened for evaluation.
- 4.2 The technical package was opened online in the presence two members i.e. MGR/E&M/L- 8 and AM/E&M/L-HQ, while the nominated members as per "Bid Openers List" at CP # 222 were comprising of MGR/E&M/L- 8 and AM/E&M/L-5. It has been seen from NIC portal that five nos. agencies have participated in this tender at NIC portal (CP # 234). The bidders have uploaded their tender submissions on the e-tendering portal. The bidder have submitted tender cost and tender security up to the due date and time of tender submission (NP # 53).
 - 4.3 During initial evaluation of the technical package (CP # 235-253), post-bid clarifications duly signed by competent authority placed at NP # 63 & CP # (254-258) were asked from the participants and the same were uploaded on e-tendering portal i.e. "<https://eprocure.gov.in/eprocure/app>." on dated 13.07.2022 (CP # 261-271). The bidders were asked to upload their replies latest by 21.07.2022 upto 17:00 Hrs.
 - 4.4 M/s ADN Fire safety Pvt. Ltd. didn't submit reply to the post bid queries.
 - 4.5 Reply have been received from the remaining 4 nos. participants within the due date and time. The replies have been printed and placed at CP # (1854-2194) in hard file. Replies received from bidders have been compiled and placed at CP # (272-281) in the e-office file.
 - 4.6 It was observed that replies of the Post-bid clarifications uploaded by M/s Fire Engineering Technology (2/5), M/s Foamtech Antifire Pvt. Ltd. (3/5) and M/s Vasu Infosec Pvt. Ltd. (5/5) are responsive and compliant as per tender conditions.
 - 4.7 After incorporating the clarifications, the final evaluation of the technical packages was done and the evaluation sheets were placed at CP # (282-287).
 - 4.7.1 **After approval of the competent authority (NOTE # 79 of e-file); second round queries were sent to below three (03) nos. bidders for final technical evaluation through postal services:**
 - a) M/s ADN Fire safety Pvt. Ltd.
 - b) M/s Southern Electronics Bangalore Pvt. Ltd. &
 - c) M/s Foamtech Antifire Pvt. Ltd.
 - 4.8 Copy of receiving of Dispatch Letters received from the postal section of DMRC has been attached at CP # 308 (2220 in hard file).
 - 4.9 Copy of letters sent to the above firms have been placed at CP # (309-314) and in hard file, placed at CP # (2222-2231).
 - 4.10 In response to the above queries, the firms have submitted their response placed at CP # (2232-2380) in the hard file.
 - 4.11 Vide e-mail; dated M/s Southern Electronics Bangalore Pvt. Ltd. had requested to grant permission for submission of their response till 03.10.2022 in addition to the time granted to the firm in the letter (CP # 315-317). The mail copy in hard file is placed at CP # (2298-2300) of hard file.
 - 4.12 The competent authority has granted the permission to M/s Southern Electronics Bangalore Pvt. Ltd. (CP # 315). Accordingly, the firm has e-mailed 2 nos. documents in addition to their submission in hard copy. The mail copies have been placed at CP # (2376-2380) in the hard file.

227240/2022/O/o E&M

5.0 GENERAL EVALUATION

Evaluation of tender submission of the bidders has been discussed in following sub-headings.

5.1 POWER OF ATTORNEY

Out of five (05) bidders;

- a. M/s ADN Fire Safety Pvt. Ltd. has submitted POA in favour of their authorized signatory (CP # 657-658).
- b. M/s Fire Engineering Technology has submitted POA in favour of their authorized signatory (CP # 385 - 386)
- c. M/s Foamtech Antifire Pvt. Ltd. has submitted POA in favour of their authorized signatory (CP # 1114-1116)
- d. M/s Southern Electronics Bangalore Pvt. Ltd. has submitted POA in favour of their authorized signatory (CP # 1348A – 1349)
- e. M/s Vasu Infosec Pvt. Ltd. (CP # 1668 - 1669)

5.2 TENDER SECURITY

All the five (05) bidders have submitted valid tender security as tabulated below:

S.No.	Name of Bidder	CP No.
1.	M/s ADN Fire safety Pvt. Ltd.	<u>226</u> -227
2.	M/s Fire Engineering Technology	<u>228</u>
3.	M/s Foamtech Antifire Pvt. Ltd.	<u>229</u>
4.	M/s Vasu Infosec Pvt. Ltd.	<u>230</u> -231
5.	M/s Southern Electronics Bangalore Pvt. Ltd.	<u>232</u> -233

5.3 DEVIATIONS

Out of five (05) bidders:

- a. M/s ADN Fire Safety Pvt. Ltd. has quoted "No Deviation" (CP # 645).
- b. M/s Fire Engineering Technology has quoted "No Deviation" (CP # 482).
- c. M/s Foamtech Antifire Pvt. Ltd. has quoted "No Deviation" (CP # 1109).
- d. M/s Southern Electronics Bangalore Pvt. Ltd. quoted "Deviation" (CP # 1433). The bidders has quoted that:
 - (i) For BoQ item No. # 4 - Gas used is not only NOVEC but also FK-5-12-1.
 - (ii) For BoQ item No. # 8 - Tube used will be either Fire Trace or Equivalent UL Listed.

For the above deviations, clarification was sought from the bidder in the post bid query @ CP # 257; Para VI (a) & (b).

In reply to the post bid query (i), the bidder has submitted clarification that the Gas FK-5-12-1 is matching with the specifications of the Clean Agent, CP # 2113 (Hard File). However, the firm has not submitted its consent regarding the acceptance of deviation by DMRC without any extra cost for the gas. Accordingly, the deviation is not accepted.

In reply to the post bid query (ii), the firm has submitted clarification that the tube used will be UL listed and equivalent to Fire Trace. Since, makes for Fire Trace tubes are already specified in the Employer's Requirement, Para-11.9, therefore, the deviation is not accepted.

In reply to 2nd post bid query VI (a) placed at CP # (322) of e-file and CP # (2382) in the hard file, the firm didn't submit clarification regarding the query. However, the deviation may be accepted subject to **"No extra cost for FK-5-12-1 shall be paid"**.

227240/2022/O/o E&M

In reply to query VI (b) placed at CP # (322) of e-file and CP # (2382) the deviation is accepted subject to supply of FTT of make; Fire Trace or Rotarex (or authorized of Rotarex).

e. M/s Vasu Infosec Pvt. Ltd. has quoted "No Deviation" (CP # 1630).

6.0 TECHNICAL PACKAGE EVALUATION:

6.1 M/s ADN Fire Safety Pvt. Ltd. (1/1)

Status of the tenderer with respect to 'minimum eligibility criteria' as per clause 1.2.2 of NIT is as under: -

A. Minimum Eligibility Criteria – Work Experience

The bidder has not filled and submitted Appendix – 7, Work-experience Performa. In the post bid query, placed at CP # 254, Para – V, the details were sought from the bidder, but the bidder did not reply to the post bid query (CP # 261- 262).

In reply to 2nd round post bid query the bidder has filled and submitted Appendix – 7, Work-experience Performa placed at CP # (318) of e-file and CP # (2381) of hard file wherein the bidder has quoted 3 ongoing works:

- a. Supply & Installation of Gas Flooding DLP system of Transformers for M/S L&T limited with Contract No. EJ331P01000381. As the work is executed for private client Neither in P.O. Copy, Nor in the provisional work completion certificate, the definition of similar nature of work has been compiled as per NIT clause 1.2.2. As per NIT clause 1.2.2. the similar nature of work has been mentioned as "Supply installation Testing Commissioning/Maintenance/Repair of Novec panel Flooding system ,but in the submitted PO and work completion, it is mentioned as Gas Flooding DLP system and does not fulfil the criteria of Similar Nature of Work as per Tender Document.
- b. Supply, Installation, Testing & Commissioning of Gas Panel Flooding system for M/S Tata Projects Limited with Contract No.- SBU-Urban Infra/New Parliament Building/670051/36743. As the work is executed for private client, Copy of provisional Work completion Certificate, Bill of Quantity, Details of payment received, Certified by C.A., T.D.S certificates for all payments received against the work-order under evaluation and copy of final/last bill paid by client not submitted as per NIT clause 1.2.2. (a).
- c. Supply, Installation, Testing & Commissioning of fire Suppression System for M/s BSES Rajdhani Power Ltd. With contract No NB/D05/2308039REV. & SER/DSA/23561560 REV. Neither in P.O. Copy, Nor in the provisional work completion certificate, has the definition of similar nature of work been compiled as per NIT clause 1.2.2. As per NIT clause 1.2.2. the similar nature of work has been mentioned as "Supply installation Testing Commissioning/Maintenance/Repair of NOVEC panel Flooding system, but in the submitted PO and work completion, it is mentioned as Supply, Installation, Testing & Commissioning of fire Suppression & Tubing system. As the work is executed for private client, Copy of provisional Work completion Certificate, Bill of Quantity, Details of payment received, Certified by C.A., T.D.S certificates for all payments received against the work-order under evaluation and copy of final/last bill paid by client not submitted as per NIT clause 1.2.2. (a).

B. Minimum Eligibility Criteria – Financial

The bidder has attached separate sheet for FOT Appendix - 8. In the post bid query, the bidder was asked to submit the details in the Performa as per Appendix-8 of tender document (CP # 254, Para – I). The bidder did not respond to the post bid queries.

As per clause 1.2.2/Notes of NIT, the bidder had to submit audited balance sheet of last 3 financial years. During the bid submission, the bidder submitted Balance Sheet for FY 2020-21 only. In the post bid query, the bidder was asked to submit audited balance

227240/2022/O/o E&M

sheets with UDIN reference numbers for FY 2018-19 and 2019-20 (CP # 254, Para – VI). The bidder did not respond to the post bid queries.

In reply to 2nd round post bid query (i) placed at CP # (319) of e-file and CP # (2385) of hard file, the firm has submitted detail in the Performa as per appendix 8 (CP # 2268), Data is UDIN verified.

In reply to 2nd round post bid query (vi) placed at CP # (319) of e-file and CP # (2385) of hard file the firm did not submit the audit balance sheet for FY: 2018-19

In view of the above submissions, the technical submission of **M/s ADN Fire Safety Pvt. Ltd.** is **non-responsive and generally non-compliant** to technical requirements of the tender conditions: -

6.2 M/s Fire Engineering Technology (2/5)

Status of the tenderer with respect to 'minimum eligibility criteria' as per clause 1.2.2 of NIT is as under: -

A. Minimum Eligibility Criteria – Work Experience

The bidder has filled and submitted Appendix – 7, Work-experience Performa wherein the bidder has quoted "SITC for Gas Flooding System for Electrical Panel" with P.O. number - PO / BSPTCL / PTE /FET /Fire /ICB 26-27 / (Amend-2) & PO/PTE/FET/BSPTCL/ICB 26-27/01/17-18. The work has been completed for Powertech Engineers with a completed portion of work for Rs. 1, 36, 20,740.00. In the post bid query, placed at CP # 255, Para – III, relevant details were sought from the bidder regarding Work experience. The bidder has submitted clarification placed at CP # 1952 & 1954 which is in line with the contract requirements.

B. Minimum Eligibility Criteria – Financial

During tender submission, the firm had not submitted Appendix – 8 of FOT in the prescribed performa. In the post bid query, the bidder was asked to submit the details in the Performa as per Appendix-8 of tender document (CP # 255, Para – I). The bidder acknowledged the query and submitted UDIN verified Appendix – 8, Financial data (CP # 1956) which is in line with the contract requirements.

In view of the above submissions, the technical submission of **M/s Fire Engineering Technology** is substantially **responsive and generally compliant** to technical requirements of the tender conditions.

6.3 M/s Foamtech Antifire Pvt. Ltd. (3/5)

Status of the tenderer with respect to 'minimum eligibility criteria' as per clause 1.2.2 of NIT is as under: -

A. Minimum Eligibility Criteria – Work Experience

The bidder has filled and submitted Appendix – 7, Work-experience Performa wherein the bidder has quoted "SITC of Fire Suppression System NOVEC 1230" with P.O. number - STP/17-18/089. The work has been completed for M/s SAFIRE TECHNOLOGIES PVT. LTD. In the post bid query, placed at CP # 256, Para – ii and IV, the bidder was intimated that the P.O. submitted by the bidder you against the Contract/LOA No. in Appendix – 7 of FOT for Work experience, pertains to the Supply of NOVEC cylinders of different capacities, Supply of Master Control Unit and Supply of Fire Detection Tube only. Being the supply item PO only, this was not fulfilling the criteria of similar work as specified in NIT Clause 1.2.2. and accordingly, relevant details were sought from the bidder regarding Work experience. The bidder has submitted work completion certificate (CP # 2024) which reveals that the work

227240/2022/O/o E&M

completed is for SITC of NOVEC based gas flooding system which is in line with the contract requirements.

B. Minimum Eligibility Criteria – Financial

The bidder has attached separate sheet for FOT Appendix - 8. In the post bid query, the bidder was asked to submit the details in the Performa as per Appendix-8 of tender document (CP # 256, Para –III). The bidder acknowledged the query and submitted Appendix – 8 of FOT (CP # 1988-1989) which is in line with the contract conditions.

The Balance Sheet for FY 2019-20 submitted by the bidder along with Profit & Loss statements for all three financial years were not UDIN verified. In the post bid query, the bidder was asked to submit UDIN verified financial documents (CP # 256, Para – VI). The bidder acknowledged the query and submitted UDIN verified sheets (CP # 2000, 2002, 2003 and 2005) which are in line with the contract requirements. However, for FY: 2019-20 financial statements, the CA member details are not matching with the Hard copy submitted. In UDIN, it is **HITIN KISHNANI**, while in hard copy it is **Sh. Gauri Shanker Goyal**. In case the bidder is L-1 at the time of financial bid evaluation, clarification shall be sought from the bidder.

In reply to 2nd post bid query placed at CP # (320) of e-file and CP # (2384) of hard file firm has submitted at (CP # 2234) clarification regarding UDIN mismatch which may be **accepted**.

In view of the above submissions, the technical submission of **M/s Foamtech Antifire Pvt. Ltd.** is substantially responsive and generally compliant to technical requirements of the tender conditions.

6.4 M/s Southern Electronics Bangalore Pvt. Ltd. (4/5)

Status of the tenderer with respect to 'minimum eligibility criteria' as per clause 1.2.2 of NIT is as under: -

B. Minimum Eligibility Criteria – Work Experience

The bidder has filled and submitted Appendix – 7, Work-experience Performa wherein the bidder has quoted 3 ongoing works:

- a. Supply of Automatic Fire Detector & Extinguisher System for Bangalore Metro Project EP2CC with Contract No. – 4100325812. The work as specified above is for supply of Automatic Fire Detector & Extinguisher System (CP-1144-1158) for Bangalore Metro Project EP2CC and does not fulfil the criteria of Similar Nature of Work as per Tender Document.
- b. Annual Maintenance and Hydraulic Testing of WMS system (CO2 gas based flooding system) with Contract No. – DMRC / Tender / O&M / OEM-495 / 2019 /533 / 1535. The work as specified above is for CO2 gas based WMS system (CP-1142-1143) and does not fulfil the criteria of Similar Nature of Work as per Tender Document.
- c. Clean Agent based panel flooding system with Contract No. - ETA-POLYCAB / BMRCL / E&M /SC / PO /47. As the work is executed for private client, in the post bid query (CP # 257,Para- I), Copy of provisional Work completion Certificate, Bill of Quantity, Details of payment received, Certified by C.A., T.D.S certificates for all payments received against the work-order under evaluation and copy of final/last bill paid by client as per NIT clause 1.2.2.(a) was sought from the bidder.

The firm has submitted clarification at CP # 2113 but no Provisional Work Completion Certificate for the completed portion of work has been provided for the work with Contract No. - ETA-POLYCAB / BMRCL / E&M /SC / PO /47.

The firm has provided Installation Report at CP # (2104-2110) instead of Provisional Work Completion Certificate. The produced documents even do not specify the quantum of work completed and payment received for the completed portion of work.

227240/2022/O/o E&M

The firm has submitted a CA certified document for receipt of Rs. 5.00 Lakh by the firm from M/s ETA and Polycab against the work (CP # 2013), but this doesn't fulfil the requirement as per NIT clause 1.2.2.(a).

The firm has also submitted Performance certificate issued by AM/Tr-4/DMRC (**CP # 2030**) against Work-III, as submitted by the firm in Appendix-7, mentioning that the work also pertains to SITC of Clean agent based gas flooding system, but Provisional work completion certificate and amount of work completed not mentioned.

In reply to **2nd round** post bid query (i) placed at CP # (320) of e-file and CP # (2384) of hard file, the firm has E-mailed work completion certificate issued by the consortium of ETA and Polycab for contract No.-ETA-PLYCAB/BMRCL/EandM/SC/PO/47. The firm has also submitted offline documents placed at CP # (2301-2376).

- i) The firm has not mentioned the actual work completion amount in the submission (CP # 2380 of hard file).
- ii) The firm has also not submitted the details of payment received certified by C.A., T.D.S certificates for all payments received against the work order under evaluation and copy of final/last bill paid by client as per NIT clause 1.2.2.(a)
- iii) The firm has submitted CA certified receipt of payment of Rs 5,00,000.00 against the Contract No -ETA-PLYCAB/BMRCL/EandM/SC/PO/47 but as per NIT clause 1.2.2(A), Work-experience, the amount of one completed work for qualification is Rs 27.77 Lakh.(CP# 2372).

iv) In view of the above, the firm is not qualifying for further stage of Tender Evaluation.

C. Minimum Eligibility Criteria – Financial

As per FOT- Appendix – 8, the financial data shall be duly certified by CA/Company Auditor providing UDIN no. The UDIN for the attached sheet is providing information for FY 2020-21 only. In the post bid query the bidder was asked to provide UDIN with all the information for all three years (CP # 257, Para – II). In response submitted by the bidder at CP # 2100, the UDIN for the attached sheet is again providing information for FY 2020-21 only. Accordingly, the bidder response may be treated non-responsive.

Financial statements for FY 2018-19 and 2019-20 as submitted by the bidder were not UDIN verified. In the post bid query the bidder was asked to provide UDIN verified financial data sheets (CP # 257, Para – III). In response, the bidder again submitted the financial details which are not UDIN verified; CP # (2051-2052) for FY: 2019-20 and at CP # (2087-2088) for FY: 2018-19.

In reply to **2nd round** post bid query (iii) placed at CP # (321) of e-file and CP # (2383) of hard file, the firm submitted document as annexure 4 (CP # 2366). The submitted document doesn't reveal all requisite details.

In reply to **2nd round** post bid query (iv) placed at CP # (321) of e-file and CP # (2383) of hard file, Document submitted as annexure 5 (CP # 2321-2365) In the submitted details Financial statements for FY 2018-19 and 2019-20 are not still UDIN verified.

In reply to **2nd round** post bid query (v) placed at CP # (321-322) of e-file and CP # (2382-2383) of hard file, Document submitted as annexure 5 (CP # 2321-2365) the submitted details are same as previous. However, the firm has also e-mailed UDIN verified financial data for 2018-19, 2019-20 & 2020-21 wherein the details are correct. Accordingly, submission may be accepted.

In view of the above submissions, the technical submission of **M/s Southern Electronics Bangalore Pvt. Ltd.** is **non-responsive and generally non-compliant** to technical requirements of the tender conditions.

227240/2022/O/o E&M

6.5 M/s Vasu Infosec Pvt. Ltd. (5/5)

Status of the tenderer with respect to 'minimum eligibility criteria' as per clause 1.2.2 of NIT is as under: -

A. Minimum Eligibility Criteria – Work Experience

The bidder has filled and submitted Appendix – 7, Work-experience Performa wherein the bidder has quoted "Supply, Installation, Testing and Commissioning of Fire Suppression System (NOVES 1230 (Panel Flooding System))" with P.O. number - P.O. No. - CPC/21105-01/2017-18. The work has been completed for M/s HDFC Bank, Nelson Park. The completed portion of work is amounting to Rs. 39, 45,235.70 which is in line with the contract requirements.

B. Minimum Eligibility Criteria – Financial

The bidder has attached separate sheet for FOT Appendix - 8. In the post bid query, the bidder was asked to submit the details in the Performa as per Appendix-8 of tender document (CP # 258, Para –II). The bidder acknowledged the query and submitted Appendix – 8 of FOT (CP # 2118, Hard copy) which is in line with the contract conditions.

In view of the above submissions, the technical submission of M/s Vasu Infosec Pvt. Ltd. is substantially responsive and generally compliant to technical requirements of the tender conditions.

7.0 Summary

In view of above, the technical submission of the following bidder, as listed below is substantially responsive and generally compliant to technical requirements of the tender conditions: -

- (i) M/s Fire Engineering Technology
- (ii) M/s Foamtech Antifire Pvt. Ltd.
- (iii) M/s Vasu Infosec Pvt. Ltd.

Views of the Technical Evaluation Report are being put up for the consideration which may be Accepted/Modified/Amended by the Competent Authority i.e. GM/E&M (As per SOP Para W-6 (a) -iv).



Mng/E&M/L-8

JGM/E&M-1**GM/E&M**