



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण
(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय)
National Highways Authority of India
(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways)
जी-5 एवं 6, सेक्टर-10, द्वारका, नई दिल्ली-110075
G-5 & 6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110075

दूरभाष / Phone : 91-11-25074100/25074200
फैक्स / Fax : 91-11-25093507 / 25093514

NHAI/11011/PC/BM/Naidupeta and Chillakuru/IE/2021

Date: 20.01.2023

To,

All Bidders (As per list enclosed)

Subject: Consultancy Services for Independent Engineer services for Supervision of (i) Construction of Six laning of Naidupeta Junction - Turpukanupur Section from Km 57+046 to Km 91+927 in the state of Andhra Pradesh on HAM under Bharatmala Pariyojana Phase-I. (ii) Construction of Four Laning of Chillakuru Cross Road to Turpu Kanupur (Part 1 of Package-II) Km 0+000 (131+500 of NH-16) to Km 23+770 on New NH-516W including six lane flyover and approaches on NH-16 (Length Km 1.050) and Six Laning of Turpu kanupuru to Port South Gate (Part 2 of Package-II) Km 23+770 to Km 35+015 on New NH-516W in the State of Andhra Pradesh on HAM Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana Phase I. **Technical Evaluation of Bids-Regarding**

Ref :- (i) Bids submitted on 09.08.2022 for the above mentioned work [Tender ID : 2021_NHAI_96771_1].

Dear Sir,

This is with reference to the Bids submitted on 09.08.2022 [Tender ID: 2021_NHAI_96771_1] for the subject proposal. The results with respect to Technical Evaluation as approved by the Competent Authority is as under:

A. First stage technical evaluation:-

- (i) It was observed that the bidder M/S BLOOM COMPANIES LLC IN ASSOCIATION WITH M/S ADVENT CONSULTING ENGINEERS does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement for firm experience regarding Project supervision/IC as well as preparation of Detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design as per clause 15(A), section-1 of RFP and **hence the bidder is considered as Non-Responsive.**
- (ii) It was observed that the bidder M/S CHAITANYA PROJECTS CONSULTANCY PRIVATE LIMITED IN ASSOCIATION WITH M/S SAADHYA INFRA SOLUTIONS LLP does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement for firm experience regarding preparation of Detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design as per clause 15(A), section-1 of RFP and **hence the bidder is considered as Non-Responsive.**
- (iii) It was observed that the bidder M/S SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PVT LTD. IN JV WITH FEEDBACK INFRA PVT LD. does not meet the minimum eligibility criteria for firm experience regarding project supervision as per clause 15(A) & (B), section-1 of RFP and **hence the bidder is considered as Non-Responsive.**
- (iv) It was observed that the remaining 5 bidders meet the minimum eligibility requirements defined in the RFP and hence, considered for second stage evaluation

B. Second Stage Technical Evaluation:

Agai

(l) It was noted that the proposed Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer (Mr. Pranav Kumar) and proposed Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer (Mr. Chaman Lal Gupta) by the bidder M/S L N MALVIYA INFRA PROJECTS PVT LTD IN ASSOCIATION WITH INTRATECH CIVIL SOLUTIONS & CONSULTANTS has furnished inflated/false information in the CV. Accordingly, as per NHAI Policy circular no. NHAI/Policy Guidelines/Consultancy/2020 No. 10.2.23 dated 20.07.2020 the CV's has been awarded zero '0' Marks. The details are as under:

(a) The Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer (Mr. Pranav Kumar) has claimed experience of Construction Supervision of "Six laning Yamuna Expressway Delhi Agra Section of NH-2 in the length of 165.00 Km in the State of Uttar Pradesh" as a Project Manager on behalf of M/s GKC Projects Limited. In this regard, it was noted that Yamuna Expressway is all together different from Delhi -Agra Section of NH-2, wherein in the certificate uploaded on the INFRACON portal the name of the work is mentioned as "Construction Supervision of Six laning Yamuna Expressway Delhi Agra Section of NH-2 in the length of 165.00 Km in the State of Uttar Pradesh".

In view of above, the claimed experience appears to be false and accordingly as per NHAI Policy circular no. NHAI/Policy Guidelines/Consultancy/2020 No. 10.2.23 dated 20.07.2020 the CV has been awarded zero '0' Marks.

(b) Similarly, the Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer (Mr. Chaman Lal Gupta) has claimed the experience of working as Executive Engineer, PWD, Government of Himachal Pradesh for several projects [(i) Design and Construction Supervision of 4 lane State Highway 25 Mehatpur una Mubarikpur total length 42 km and rehabilitation of 2 major bridges in the State of HP, (ii) Design and Construction and Maintenance of 4 lane with Paved Shoulder from Govindsagar to Dabbar to wazir bowie total length 38 Km including 2 Bridges 400 m and 700 m in the State of Himachal Pradesh & (iii) Design and Construction of State Highway SH-23, 4 lane from Ranital to Palampur total length 32 Km including 4 Major Bridges length 200m , 300 m, 350 m, 400 m in the State of HP. However, it was noted that these State Highways are still 2 lane as seen through the Google Map.

In view of above, the claimed experience appears to be false and accordingly as per NHAI Policy circular no. NHAI/Policy Guidelines/Consultancy/2020 No. 10.2.23 dated 20.07.2020 the CV has been awarded zero '0' Marks.

C. Summary of the Technical Evaluation is as under:

(a) Technical Non-Responsive Bidders:

S. No.	Name of Firm	Result of Stage-I /II Evaluation	Remarks
1	M/S BLOOM COMPANIES LLC IN ASSOCIATION WITH M/S ADVENT CONSULTING ENGINEERS	Non-Responsive	The Bidder does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement for firm experience regarding Project supervision/IC as well as preparation of Detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design as per clause 15(A), section-1 of RFP
2	M/S CHAITANYA PROJECTS CONSULTANCY PRIVATE LIMITED IN ASSOCIATION WITH	Non-Responsive	The bidder does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement for firm experience regarding preparation of Detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design as per clause 15(A), section-1 of RFP

[Signature]

S. No.	Name of Firm	Result of Stage-I /II Evaluation	Remarks
	M/S SAADHYA INFRA SOLUTIONS LLP		
3	M/S SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PVT LTD. IN JV WITH FEEDBACK INFRA PVT LD	Non-Responsive	The bidder does not meet the minimum eligibility criteria for firm experience regarding project supervision as per clause 15(A) & (B), section-1 of RFP
4	M/S URS SCOTT WILSON INDIA PRIVATE LIMITED IN JOINT VENTURE WITH LION ENGINEERING CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD.	Non-Responsive	The CV of Sh. M. Ram Mohan Rao, Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer has scored less than 75% marks. As per clause 3.4 (x) of Section 2 - Letter of Invitation to Consultants, if Team leader cum Senior Highway Engineer scores less than 75% marks, the proposal shall be considered non-responsive.
5	M/S L N MALVIYA INFRA PROJECTS PVT LTD IN ASSOCIATION WITH INTRATECH CIVIL SOLUTIONS & CONSULTANTS	Non-Responsive	The CV of Sh. Pranav Kumar, Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer has scored zero '0' marks. As per clause 3.4 (x) of Section 2 - Letter of Invitation to Consultants, if Team leader cum Senior Highway Engineer scores less than 75% marks, the proposal shall be considered non-responsive.

(b) Technically Responsive Bidders:

S. No.	Name of Firm	Firm Score	Technology Score	CV Score	Final Technical Score
	Maximum Marks	40.00	20.00	40.00	100.00
1	M/S AARVEE ASSOCIATES ARCHITECTS ENGINEERS AND CONSULTANTS PVT LTD	38.00	14.00	32.52	84.52
2	*M/S TPF ENGINEERING PVT. LTD. IN JOINT VENTURE WITH K&J PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN ASSOCIATION WITH MAV ASSOCIATES LLP	38.00	20.00	30.80	88.80
3	M/S VOYANTS SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED IN JV WITH G-ENG ADVISORY SERVICE	36.00	20.00	34.30	90.30

(*Note:- This is subject to outcome of court case Writ petition no 7310 of 2022 dated 25.11.2022 in the High Court of Judicature at Bombay, Nagpur, Bench- Nagpur)

2. The detailed evaluation sheet for the responsive Bidders is enclosed herewith. Bidders are given opportunity to respond by **27.01.2023**, in case of any objection and to submit the requisite details/document within this period.



(Asheesh Kumar Jain)
General Manager (T)-PC

Name of the Project		Annexure-I
Consultancy Services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of (i) Construction of Six laning from Naidupeta (Green Fields) to Turpu Kanupur Ch : KM 57+046 to Ch: KM 91+930 and greenfield area which falls in Nellore district, in the State of Andhra Pradesh on HAM Mode. (ii) Construction of Four Laning of Chillakuru Cross Road to Turpu Kanupur (Part 1 of Package-II) Km 0+000 (131+500 of NH-16) to Km 23+770 on New NH-516W including six lane flyover and approaches on NH-16 (Length Km 1.050) and Six Laning of Turpu kanupuru to Port South Gate (Part 2 of Package-II) Km 23+770 to Km 35+015 on New NH-516W in the State of Andhra Pradesh on HAM Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana Phase I.		
Length of the project (Km.)		70.946 Km
List of the Applicants:-		
Applicant No:-	Name of the Applicant	Status of the Applicant Sole/JV/ Association
1/8	M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates	JV/Association
2/8	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Private Limited in Association with M/s Saadhya Infra Solutions LLP	Association
3/8	M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	JV
4/8	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s Intratech Civil Solutions & Consultant	Association
5/8	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	Sole
6/8	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s Advent Consulting Engineers	Association
7/8	M/s SATRA Services and Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited	JV
8/8	M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	JV/Association

Consultancy Services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of (i) Construction of Six laning from Naidupeta (Green Fields) to Turpu Kanupur Ch : KM 57+046 to Ch: KM 91+930 and greenfield area which falls in Nellore district, in the State of Andhra Pradesh on HAM Mode. (ii) Construction of Four Laning of Chillakuru Cross Road to Turpu Kanupur (Part 1 of Package-II) Km 0+000 (131+500 of NH-16) to Km 23+770 on New NH-516W including six lane flyover and approaches on NH-16 (Length Km 1.050) and Six Laning of Turpu kanupuru to Port South Gate (Part 2 of Package-II) Km 23+770 to Km 35+015 on New NH-516W in the State of Andhra Pradesh on HAM Mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana Phase I.

MINIMUM ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA

Annexure-I

S.No.	Name of the Applicants	Technical Capacity	Preparation of DPR (NH/SH/Equivalent)	Project Supervision/IC (NH/SH/Equivalent)		Annual Turnover	whether the Applicant is Technical "Responsive" or "Non-Responsive".
			The firm should have minimum experience of preparation of detailed Project Report/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report of 2/4/6** laning project of aggregate length equal to 2 times or more of similar category for which RFP is invited.	The firm should have minimum experience of Project Supervision/IC of 2/4/6**-laning project of aggregate length equal to 3 times or more of similar category for which RFP is invited.	Firm should also have experience of Project Supervision/IC of at least one project of similar category of two/four/six** laning of length equal to 40% of project length.	Annual turnover (updated average of last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) of the firm from consultancy business should be equal to or more than 2% of Total Project Cost (TPC).	
1/8	M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates	Eligible	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
2/8	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Private Limited in Association with M/s Saadhya Infra Solutions LLP	Eligible	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Non-Responsive
3/8	M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	Eligible	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
4/8	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s Intratech Civil Solutions & Consultant	Eligible	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
5/8	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	Eligible	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
6/8	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s Advent Consulting Engineers	Eligible	No	No	Yes	Yes	Non-Responsive
7/8	M/s SATRA Services and Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited	Eligible	Yes	No	No	Yes	Non-Responsive
8/8	M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	Eligible	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive

Name of the Project

Consultancy Services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of (i) Construction of Six laning from Naidupeta (Green Fields) to Turpu Kanupur Ch : KM 57+046 to Ch: KM 91+930 and greenfield area which falls in Nellore district, in the State of Andhra Pradesh on HAM Mode. (ii) Construction of Four Laning of Chillakuru Cross Road to Turnu Kanumur (Part 1 of Package-II)

THE ASSIGNMENT

S.N o.	Applicant No.		1/8		3/8		4/8		5/8		8/8	
	Description	Max Marks	M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates		M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd.		M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s Intratech Civil Solutions & Consultant		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra	
			Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed
			38.00	40.00	37.50	40.00	38.00	40.00	38.00	40.00	36.00	40.00
1	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	< 2% of TPC - 0 marks	0										
	2% of TPC - 1.5 marks	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5
	Add for additional turnover 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks for every 1% of TPC above 2% of TPC subject to maximum 0.5 marks.	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5
2	Nos. of Highway Professionals with the firm *	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
	<10 - 0 marks											
	10 to 20 - 8 marks											
	> 20 but <=30 - 9 marks											
	> 30 - 10 marks		10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
3	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Construction Supervision in Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length (40% of project length) or more in last 7 years.	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	11	12
	1 project - 9 marks	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9
	Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	2	3
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report preparation for Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length (40% of project length) or more in last 7 years.	6	6	6	5.5	6	6	6	6	6	5	6
	1 project - 4 marks	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	2	2	2	1.5	2	2	2	2	2	1	2
5	In hand DPRs of Highway/ Bridge/ Tunnel Projects (presently under progress)	6	4	6	4	6	4	6	4	6	4	6
	< 2 projects - 0 marks											
	2-5 projects - 4 marks		4		4		4		4		4	
	> 5 projects - 6 marks			6		6		6		6		6
6	Experience in Construction Supervision/ DPR/ Design Review of Major structures having length of more than 500 metre in last 7 years.	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	1 project - 2 marks	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Total	40.00	38.00	40.00	37.50	40.00	38.00	40.00	38.00	40.00	36.00	40.00
			1		3		4		5		7	

ing of Chillakuru Cross Road to Turpu Kanupur (Part 1 of Package-II) Km 0+000 (131+500 of NH-16) to F

Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection

S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/8		3/8		4/8		5/8		8/8	
			M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates		M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd.		M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s Intratech Civil Solutions & Consultant		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s Vayants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra Engineering	
			Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed
1	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	Own Equipment / Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	1-2 projects	1										
	3-5 projects	2										
	>5 projects	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
2	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Own Equipment / Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	1-3 projects	1										
	> 3 projects	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
3	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit (MBIU) or better technology for bridges inspection	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	2	4	4	4
	Own Equipment / Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2	2	2		2	2	2
	1-2 projects	1										
	>3 projects	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
4	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	2	4	4	4
	Own Equipment / Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2	2	2		2	2	2
	1-3 projects	1										
	>3 projects	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
5	Experience in Automatic Traffic Counter cum Classifier	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	1	3	3	3
	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2	2	2		2	2	2
	1-3 projects	0.5										
	>3 projects	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Total		20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	14.00	20.00	20.00	20.00
			1		3		4		5		7	

Summary Sheet of CV's														
S. No.	Details	Total Marks	1/8				5/8				8/8			
			M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates				M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited				M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd.			
			Name	Score	Assesed @40	Claimed @40	Name	Score	Assesed @40	Claimed @40	Name	Score	Assesed @40	Claimed @40
1	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	12	Mr. Subrata Mukhopadhyay	90	10.80	11.28	Mr. Birendra Kumar Singh	79	9.48	12	Mr. Milind Sri Rao	76	9.12	11.28
2	Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer (1)	4	Mr. Jaiprakash Asrani	91	3.64	3.64	Mr. Subrahmanyam Koganti	96	3.84	3.84	Mr. K. Jayapal	91	3.64	3.64
	Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer (2)	4	Rajeev Ranjan (Blacklist as on 31.03.2022)	0	0	3.8	Mr. Hemant Kumar Mishra	63	2.52	4	Mr. Prabhana nd Goit	88.5	3.54	3.64
3	Bridge / Structural Engineer(1)	4	Mr. Suresh.B.Goudar	91	3.64	3.64	Mr. C. Rajasekhar	91	3.64	3.84	Mr. Manohar Nizam	91	3.64	3.64
	Bridge / Structural Engineer(2)	4	Mr. Parvez Anwar	91	3.64	3.64	Mr. T Rajasekhara Rao	65	2.6	4	Mr. A. Venkata Sireesh Kuma	90	3.6	3.64
4	Senior Pavement Specialist	4	Mr. Manas Ranjan Sahu	86	3.44	3.44	Mr. Tarra Appala Naidu	70	2.8	4	Mr. Krishna Rao P	91	3.64	3.64
5	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	4	Mr. Suresh Kumar Bathina	91	3.64	3.64	Mr. Anand Kumar Sinha	91	3.64	3.84	Mr. P Arun Kumar	87	3.48	3.8
6	Road Safety Expert	4	Mr. Manish Agrawal	50	2	4	Mr. Biju Muthu	100	4	4	Mr. Krishna Murari	91	3.64	3.8
		40			30.80	37.08			32.52	39.52			34.30	37.08

Name of the Project											
Consultancy Services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of (i) Construction of Six laning from Naidupeta (Green Fields) to Turpu Kanupur Ch : KM 57+046 to Ch: KM 91+930 and greenfield area which falls in Nellore district, in the State of Andhra Pradesh on HAM Mode. (ii) Construction of Four Laning of Chillakuru Cross Road to Turpu Kanupur (Part 1 of Package-II) Km 0+000 (131+500 of NH-16) to Km 23+770 on New NH-516W including six lane flyover and approaches on NH-16 (Length Km 1.050) and Six Laning of Turnu											
										Annexure-1	
Final Comparative Technical Evaluation Score.											
S. No.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment#		Total		Rank of the Firm	whether the Technical Responsive Applicant/Bidder Eligible for opening of Financial proposal**
		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed		
	Maximum marks		40	40	20	20	40	40	100		
1/8	M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates	40.00	38.00	20.00	20.00	37.08	30.80	97.08	88.80	2	Responsive
2/8	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Private Limited in Association with M/s Saadhya Infra Solutions LLP	Non-Responsive The Bidder does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement for firm experience regarding preparation of Detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design as per clause 15(A), section-1 of RFP. Hence, bidder is considered as Non-Responsive.									
3/8	M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	Non-Responsive as per clause 3.4 (x)(e) Section-2 of RFP									
4/8	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s Intratech Civil Solutions & Consultant	Non-Responsive as per clause 3.4 (x)(e) Section-2 of RFP									
5/8	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited	40.00	38.00	20.00	14.00	39.52	32.52	99.52	84.52	3	Responsive
6/8	M/s Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s Advent Consulting Engineers	Non-Responsive The Bidder does not meet the minimum eligibility requirement for firm experience regarding construction supervision as well as preparation of Detailed Project Report/ Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design as per clause 15(A), section-1 of RFP. Hence, bidder is considered as Non-Responsive.									
7/8	M/s SATRA Services and Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited	Non-Responsive as per clause 15(A) & (B) Section-1 of RFP									
8/8	M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra	40.00	36.00	20.00	20.00	37.08	34.30	97.08	90.30	1	Responsive

Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer												
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/8		3/8		4/8		5/8		8/8	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates		M/s URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited In Joint Venture with M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Pvt. Ltd.		M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s Intratech Civil Solutions & Consultant		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	
	Name of Key Personnel		Mr. Subrata		Mr. M. Ram Mohan Rao		Mr. Pranav Kumar		Mr. Birendra Kumar Singh		Mr. Milind Sri Rao	
	Date of Birth of KP's		15.11.1959		15.10.1964		02.12.1973		02.08.1969		26.02.1968	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	24	24	21	24	0	24	24	25	21	24
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	0	21	21	21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering	3	3	3	0	3	0	3	3	3	0	3
iii)	Degree/Diploma/Certificate in Project Management	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70										
a)	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:											
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	10	10	10	10	10	0	10	10	10	10	10
	< 12 years -0											
i)	12 years -8		8	8	8	8	0	8	8	8	8	8
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 2 (three) marks.		2	2	2	2	0	2	2	2	2	2
	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development projects similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	15	15	15	15	15	0	15	15	15	15	15
ii)	< 5 years - 0											
	5 years - 11		11	11	11	11	0	11	11	11	11	11
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	0	4	4	4	4	4
iii)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) on PPP	5	5	5	4	5	0	5	5	5	5	5
	1 Project- 4 Marks		4	4	4	4	0	4	4	4	4	4
	add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks		1	1	0	1	0	1	1	1	1	1
b)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of project Preparation including design of major highway Project (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	15	11	15	0	15	0	15	0	15	0	15
	<2 Project -0 marks											
	2 Projects -11		11	11	0	11	0	11	0	11	0	11
	Add 2 mark for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks.		0	4	0	4	0	4	0	4	0	4
c)	Experience in position of Team Leader/Project Manager or similar capacity in Construction Supervision/IC involving length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6** laning) and above	20	20	20	18	20	0	20	20	20	20	20
	< 2 projects - 0											
	2 Projects - 16		16	16	16	16	0	16	16	16	16	16
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) marks		4	4	2	4	0	4	4	4	4	4
d)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation and Maintenance of Major Highway (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	5	5	5	0	5	0	5	0	5	5	5
	1 project - 4 marks		4	4	0	4	0	4	0	4	4	4
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 (one) marks		1	1	0	1	0	1	0	1	1	1
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	0	5	5	5	0	0
	< 1 year -0											
	1 year -3						0	3	3	3		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks						0	2	2	2		
	Total	100	90	94	68	94	0	99	79	100	76	94
	Weightage @ 12	12	10.8	11.28	8.16	11.28	0	11.88	9.48	12	9.12	11.28
			1		3		4		5		8	

Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer (1)								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/8		5/8		8/8	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	
	Name of Key Personnel		Mr. Jaiprakash Asrani		Mr. Subrahmanyam		Mr. K. Jayapal	
	Date of Birth of KP's		02.08.1966		24.06.1968		10.06.1958	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	21	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering/Geotechnical Engineering	4	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
	Professional Experience							
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects < 10 years -0	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	i) 10 years -16		16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience as Resident Engineer/Project Director/Project Manager/Superintending Engineer or equivalent/Executive Engineer or equivalent on construction works/Independent Engineer Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	ii) < 5 year - 0							
	5 years -16		16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25	25	25	25	25	25	25
	iii) < 2 nos -0							
	2 nos -19		19	19	19	19	19	19
	Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks.		6	6	6	6	6	6
	Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/Construction Supervision/IC on PPP Mode (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	iv) 2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks		5	5	5	5	5	5
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	5	5	0	0
	< 1 year -0							
	1 year -3				3	3		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks				2	2		
	Total	100	91	91	96	96	91	91
	Weightage @ 4	4	3.64	3.64	3.84	3.84	3.64	3.64
			1		5		8	

Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer (1)								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/8		5/8		8/8	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	
	Name of Key Personnel		0		Mr. Hemant Kumar Mishra		Mr. Prabhanand Goit	
	Date of Birth of KP's		00-01-1900		01.06.1963		03.04.1966	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	0	25	21	25	21	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21		21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering/Geotechnical Engineering	4		4	0	4	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
	Professional Experience							
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	20	0	20	20	20	20	20
	< 10 years -0							
i)	10 years -16			16	16	16	16	16
	Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.			4	4	4	4	4
	Experience as Resident Engineer/Project Director/Project Manager/Superintending Engineer or equivalent/Executive Engineer or equivalent on construction works/Independent Engineer Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*) and above)	20	0	20	17	20	20	20
ii)	< 5 year - 0							
	5 years -16			16	16	16	16	16
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.			4	1	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25	0	25	0	25	25	25
	< 2 nos -0							
iii)	2 nos -19			19		19	19	19
	Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks.			6	0	6	6	6
	Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/Construction Supervision/IC on PPP Mode (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5	0	5	0	5	2.5	5
iv)	2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks			5		5	2.5	5
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	5	5	0	0
	< 1 year -0							
3	1 year -3				3	3		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks				2	2		
	Total	100	0	95	63	100	88.5	91
	Weightage @ 4	4	0	3.8	2.52	4	3.54	3.64
			1		5		8	

Bridge/Structural Engineer								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/8		5/8		8/8	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd	
	Name of Key Personnel		Mr. Suresh.B.Goudar		Mr. C. Rajasekhar		Mr. Manohar Nizam	
	Date of Birth of KP's		03.02.1973		22.03.1962		12.06.1976	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	21	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	< 10 years -0							
i)	10 years -11		11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional 2 year subject to maximum 4(four) marks.		4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in Design/Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Flyover/Interchanges/any other such structures (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
ii)	< 5 years -0							
	5 years - 16		16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Major Highway Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
iii)	< 2 Bridges -0							
	2 Bridge -16		16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add 2 mark extra for each additional bridge subject to maximum 4 (four) marks		4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
iv)	< 2 - 0							
	2 nos -07		7	7	7	7	7	7
	3 or more -10		3	3	3	3	3	3
	Experience in similar capacity of modern bridge construction technology viz., Precast Segmental, Balanced Cantilever Construction, Extradosed Bridge, Full Span Launching, Incremental Launching.	5	5	5	0	5	5	5
v)	Experience in 1 project - 4		4	4	0	4	4	4
	More than one project - 5 marks		1	1	0	1	1	1
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	5	5	0	0
	< 1 year -0							
3	1 year -3				3	3		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks				2	2		
	Total	100	91	91	91	96	91	91
	Weightage @ 4	4	3.64	3.64	3.64	3.84	3.64	3.64
			1		5		8	

Bridge/Structural Engineer								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/8		5/8		8/8	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	
	Name of Key Personnel		Mr. Parvez Anwar		Mr. T Rajasekhara Rao		Mr. A. Venkata Sireesh	
	Date of Birth of KP's		05.07.1972		07.08.1965		18.02.1978	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	25	25	21	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4	0	0	4	4	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	15	15	15	15	14	15
	< 10 years -0							
	10 years -11		11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional 2 year subject to maximum 4(four) marks.		4	4	4	4	3	4
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Design/Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Flyover/Interchanges/any other such structures (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	< 5 years -0							
	5 years - 16		16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	4	4
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Major Highway Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	20	20	20	0	20	20	20
	< 2 Bridges -0							
	2 Bridge -16		16	16	0	16	16	16
	Add 2 mark extra for each additional bridge subject to maximum 4 (four) marks		4	4	0	4	4	4
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	10	10	10	0	10	10	10
	< 2 - 0							
	2 nos -07		7	7	0	7	7	7
	3 or more -10		3	3	0	3	3	3
v)	Experience in similar capacity of modern bridge construction technology viz., Precast Segmental, Balanced Cantilever Construction, Extradosed Bridge, Full Span Launching, Incremental Launching.	5	5	5	0	5	5	5
	Experience in 1 project - 4		4	4	0	4	4	4
	More than one project - 5 marks		1	1	0	1	1	1
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	5	5	0	0
	< 1 year -0							
	1 year -3				3	3		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks				2	2		
	Total	100	91	91	65	100	90	91
	Weightage @ 4	4	3.64	3.64	2.6	4	3.6	3.64
			1		5		7	

Senior Pavement Specialists								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/8		5/8		8/8	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	
	Name of Key Personnel		Mr. Manas Ranjan Sahu		Mr. Tarra Appala Naidu		Mr. Krishna Rao P	
	Date of Birth of KP's		01.03.1980		04.06.1972		23.12.1967	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	25	25	21	21
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Pavement engineering or equivalent	4	0	0	4	4	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
a)	Professional Experience							
	Total Professional Experience of Pavement Design/Construction and Maintenance of Highways/Roads/Air Field Runway	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
i)	< 10 years -0							
	10 years -16		16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in Similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of 2/4/6-laning** of major Highway Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
ii)	< 5 year - 0							
	5 years -16		16	16	16	16	16	16
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity as Pavement/Geo-technical Engineer in construction/ construction supervision of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	0	20	20	20
iii)	< 2 nos - 0							
	2 nos - 16		16	16		16	16	16
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks.		4	4	0	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity on major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in innovative/non traditional technology and design	5	5	5	0	5	5	5
iv)	1 Project -4		4	4	0	4	4	4
	2 or more -5		1	1	0	1	1	1
	Experience in similar capacity on PPP Projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5	0	0	0	5	5	5
v)	2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks			0	0	5	5	5
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	5	5	0	0
	< 1 year -0							
3	1 year -3				3	3		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks				2	2		
	Total	100	86	86	70	100	91	91
	Weightage @ 4	4	3.44	3.44	2.8	4	3.64	3.64
			1		5		8	

Senior Quality cum Material Expert								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/8		5/8		8/8	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	
	Name of Key Personnel		Mr. Suresh Kumar Bathina		Mr. Anand Kumar Sinha		Mr. P Arun Kumar	
	Date of Birth of KP's		07.05.1982		23.12.1973		26.11.1979	
	Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	25	25
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Geotechnical Engineering/Foundation Engineering/Soil Mechanics/Rock Mechanics	4	0	0	0	0	4	4
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
	Professional Experience							
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	< 10 years -0							
i)	10 years -11		11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of major Highway Projects ((similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25	25	25	25	25	25	25
ii)	< 5 year - 0							
	5 years -19		19	19	19	19	19	19
	Add 2.0 (two) marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.		6	6	6	6	6	6
	Experience in similar capacity in handling Similar Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25	25	25	25	25	22	25
iii)	< 2 nos -0							
	2 nos -19		19	19	19	19	19	19
	Add 3.0 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.		6	6	6	6	3	6
iv)	Experience in similar capacity on major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in innovative/non traditional technology	5	5	5	0	5	0	5
	1 Project -4		4	4	0	4	0	4
	2 or more -5		1	1	0	1	0	1
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	5	5	0	0
	< 1 year - 0							
3	1 year - 3				3	3		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks				2	2		
	Total :	100	91	91	91	96	87	95
	Weightage @ 4	4	3.64	3.64	3.64	3.84	3.48	3.8
			1		5		8	

Road Safety Expert								
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/8		5/8		8/8	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd In Jv with M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s MAV Associates		M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Private Limited		M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited In Jv with M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited In Association with M/s Nu-Infra Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	
			Mr. Manish Agrawal		Mr. Biju Muthu		Mr. Krishna Murari	
			01.05.1974		10.04.1971		02.11.1958	
			Description		Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	21	25	25	25	21	25
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Traffic/Transportation/Safety Engineering or equivalent	4	0	4	4	4	0	4
2	Adequacy for the Project	70						
i)	Professional Experience							
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
	< 10 years -0							
	10 years -11		11	11	11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	4	4
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety works on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	15	0	15	15	15	15	15
	> 5 Years-0							
	5 years -11			11	11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.			4	4	4	4	4
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audits of 2/4/6-laning** Highway projects at different stages including at least one at design stage	20	0	20	20	20	20	20
	< 2 nos -0							
	2 nos -16			16	16	16	16	16
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional projects subject to maximum 4 marks.			4	4	4	4	4
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in identification and improvement of black spots on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	10	0	10	10	10	10	10
	<2 nos. - 0 marks							
	2 nos. - 7 marks			7	7	7	7	7
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional improvement of black spots subject to maximum 3 marks.			3	3	3	3	3
v)	Experience in similar capacity of preparing Road Safety Management Plans for Inter Urban Highway	5	4	5	5	5	5	5
	1 project- 4 marks		4	4	4	4	4	4
	2 or more project- 5 marks			1	1	1	1	1
vi)	Experience in similar capacity in field of Road Safety Management Plan	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	1 project- 4 marks		4	4	4	4	4	4
	2 or more project- 5 marks		1	1	1	1	1	1
3	Employment with the Firm	5	5	5	5	5	0	0
	< 1 year - 0							
	1 year - 3		3	3	3	3		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks		2	2	2	2		
Total :		100	50	100	100	100	91	95
Weightage @ 4		4	2	4	4	4	3.64	3.8
			1		5		8	