

MINUTES OF MEETING

Sub: RFP for Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for Six- laning of Dhankuni-Kharagpur Section of NH-6 from Km. 17.600 to Km.129.00 in the state of West Bengal to be executed as BOT (Toll) project on DBFOT pattern under NHDP Phase V – **Final Evaluation of Technical Proposal - Reg.**

Venue: NHAI, RO-Kolkata

Date: 10 May 2022

As per observations of the Committee, out of 04 participated firms, only M/s MSV International Inc in Association with D N Consultant was fulfilling the requirement with respect to Technical capacity provision for maximum works to be permitted with one Consultant as per Clause 16(C). Other 03 (three) participated firms exceeded ceiling limits. In this context, Evaluation Committee in its meeting dated 22 Feb 2022 decided the following:-

- (a) Comments may be obtained from the firms whose Technical capacity provision for maximum works exceeds ceiling limits.
 - (b) upload the result of Technical Evaluation of above mentioned 04 (four) nos bidders on the NHAI website giving opportunity to the bidders to respond within 7 days in case they have any objections before opening of Financial Bids as per RFP provision.
 - (c) Intimation is to be given to the Concessionaires of the subject project for any conflict of interest.
2. Consequent upon transfer/ posting of Shri A Sarkar, DGM (F&A) vide Office Order no 11021/01/2020-Admn.(E-140371) dated 29 Apr 2022, the Committee constituted vide Office Order no NHAI/RO-KOL/002/2021/08/43/ 1362 dated 08 Nov 2021 has been re-constituted comprising of following members for evaluation of Technical & Financial e-bids at Regional Office-Kolkata for the subject tender works:-
- | | | |
|---|---|-------------|
| (a) Shri D K Choudhary, PD, PIU-Kolkata | - | Chairperson |
| (b) Shri S Shambhu, DGM (Tech), RO-Kolkata | - | Member |
| (c) Shri S Pal, PD, PIU-Krishnagar | - | Member |
| (d) Md Nawajesh Ali, Dy Manager (Tech), PIU-Kolkata | - | Member |
| (e) Shri L P Bhagat, AM & Head (F&A Unit), RO-Kolkata | - | Member |
3. According to the above decision, all the participated firms were asked to provide their comments in respect of Technical capacity & Technical result assessed by the Authority. Further, Concessionaire of the subject 6-laning project, M/s Ashoka Dhankuni Kharagpur Tollway Ltd was asked to provide comments whether they have any conflict of interest against the participated bidders.
4. In reply, M/s Ashoka Dhankuni Kharagpur Tollway Ltd vide letter dated 24 Feb 2022 intimated that, they does not have any conflict of interest against the participated bidders.
5. Based on replies received from the bidders, the Committee reassessed the technical capacity of the participated bidders as per clause 16 (C) of Information to Consultants and the same is tabulated as under:-

Sr No	Name of Firm	1	2	3			4			5			6			7			8
		Average Annual Turnover of Firm in last 3 FY (from consultancy works)	No of Key Professional on full time rolls (minimum from last one year) with the consultancy firm	Max no of projects to be allotted to one particular consultant including ongoing projects at a time in NHAI			Maximum o of projects in one Financial year (cap of 25%)			Total on-going/ awarded projects (nos)			Projects awarded in CFY (nos) out of Col (5)			Remaining capacity for new projects (nos) in CFY			Tech Capacity for max works to be permitted exceeded or not
				Total	DP R	IE/ AE / SC	Total	DP R	IE/ AE / SC	Total	DP R	IE/ AE / SC	Total	DP R	IE/ AE / SC	Total	DP R	IE/ AE / SC	
				3A	3B	3C	4A	4B	4C	5A	5B	5C	6A	6B	6C	7A	7B	7C	
1	M/s K & J Projects Pvt Ltd	49.15 Cr	41																Not Exceeded
		More than Rs 30 to Rs 60 Crores	>40	25	25	18	6	6	4	10	7	3	4	1	3	2	1	1	
2	M/s MSV International INC	109.19 Cr	83																Not Exceeded
		More than Rs 60 Crores	>60	40	40	30	10	10	8	11	2	9	0	0	0	10	10	8	
3	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd	100.89 Cr	63																Exceeded
		More than Rs 60 Crores	>60	40	40	30	10	10	8	69	20	49	15	8	7	0	0	0	
4	M/s Feedback Infra Pvt Ltd	266.81 Cr	64																Not Exceeded
		More than Rs 60 Crores	>60	40	40	30	10	10	8	25	10	15	4	0	4	6	6	4	

6. It is envisaged from the above Table that, out of 04 participated firm, Technical capacity of M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd is exceed the maximum limits. Other 03 (three) participated firms are fulfilling the requirement with respect to Technical capacity provision for maximum works to be permitted with one Consultant as per Clause 16(C). Therefore, the bid of M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd has been considered as “Technically Non-Responsive” as the firm didn’t qualify in Technical Capacity Criteria.

7. Based on the replies provided by the participated bidders, the Committee further reevaluated the Technical Proposals (except the bids of M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd) as per the criteria stipulated in the RFP. The details of marks claimed by the applicants and marks finally obtained after review by the Committee is enclosed herewith.

8. After reviewing the detailed submission of the four Bidders, the final Technical Score summary is as under:

Sl. No	Name of Firm	Relevant experience for the assignment		Quality of approach and methodology		Experience in use of technology and road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Total Marks		Rank
	Max Marks	35		5		20		40		100		
		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Final Claimed	Final Assessed	
1	M/s K & J Projects Pvt Ltd	35	35	5	5	20	20	37.16	36.992	97.16	96.992	1st
2	M/s MSV International INC	35	34.7	5	5	20	20	37.51	34	97.51	93.7	3rd
3	M/s Feedback Infra Pvt Ltd	34.5	34.5	5	5	19	19	36.84	36.798	95.34	95.298	2nd

9. As per Clause 5.3 (i) of RFP, the technical proposal should score atleast 75 points to be considered responsive. The Authority shall shortlist 5 (five) top firms on the basis of their technical score on the basis of their technical score not in the conflict of interest with the Concessionaire. In this instant case, the 03 (three) nos firms have scored more than 75 points.

10. As per reassessment of Technical capacity & Technical Scores, the committee unanimously decided to declare the following firms as Technically responsive and recommends for opening of the Financial Bids at the earliest date as per convenient to the Committee members, subject to approval of Competent Authority:-

- (i) M/s K and J Projects Pvt Ltd in Association with Voyants Solutions Pvt Ltd and M/s Indian Road Survey and Management Pvt Ltd
- (ii) M/s MSV International Inc in Association with D N Consultant
- (iii) M/s Feedback Infra Pvt Ltd in Association with Vaishnavi Infratech Services Pvt Ltd

11. The date of opening of Financial e-bids may be intimated to the above mentioned Technically responsive bidders for their information.

12. The meeting concluded with vote of thanks to Chair.