

Minutes of Meeting of Tender Evaluation Committee (Technical Evaluation) for the work of **"Elimination of Black Spot ID No. TN-02-191 & 408 for the year 2015-18 on Trichy - Madurai section of NH-45B in the State of Tamil Nadu"** (TENDER NO NHAI/17011/ 01/34/2021).

1. Regional Office, NHAI, Madurai invited bids vide Tender ID 2021_NHAI_84490_1 for the works of **"Elimination of Black Spot ID No. T TN-02-191 & 408 for the year 2015-18 on Trichy - Madurai section of NH-45 in the State of Tamil Nadu"** with an estimated cost of Rs. 1020.33 Lakh.
2. In this context, the following Tender Committee was constituted for evaluation of Bids;
 - i. Shri K Govindasamy, DGM(Tech), RO-Madurai - Convenor
 - ii. Shri G Athipathi, DGM(Tech) & PD-Trichy - Member
 - iii. Shri MS Chaithanya, Manager (Tech) RO Madurai - Member
 - iv. Shri S Syed Dawood Mian, Asst. Head, F&A Unit, RO-Madurai- Member
3. Last Date of submission of bids and Technical bid opening was scheduled on 08th and 09th September, 2021 respectively.
4. As per MoRTH Circular No. RW/NH-37010/4/2010-EAP (Printing) Vol.IV Dated 30.04.2020, evaluation of bids can be carried out with the available scanned copy of documents as per RFP requirement.
5. Accordingly, the Committee opened the e-bids submitted through online and decrypted. Total 5 Nos. of bids were received through online. The details of bids received and Financial Instruments submitted therewith were furnished to Accounts Division. Accounts Division confirmed the receipt of bid document cost except for Shri K Sugumar, Madurai (**BID ID: 320092**). As such, the Committee duly recommended to reject the bid in the pre-technical stage citing non-compliance of receipt of bid document fee.

S. S. —
x

G. Jm

Gm

6. The Committee has evaluated the remaining 4 Nos. of bids on 12.10.2021 based on available scanned copies and the detailed technical evaluation is furnished vide **Annexure-A**. Summary of the same is submitted hereunder:

S No	Name of Bidder	Bid ID	Recommendations
1	M/s KMC Associates, Theni	317014	Disqualified
2	M/s Dharma Infra Tech, Trichy	319123	Disqualified
3	M/s A Ramanathan & Co., Trichy	320084	Disqualified
4	M/s Sasi Constructions, Chennai	320186	Disqualified

Detailed Technical Evaluation is under Annexure-A

Based on the above and detailed technical evaluation annexed vide Annexure-A, Committee opines to disqualify all the 4 Nos. of Bids as they fail to furnish the requisite Machinery and Key Personnel/Documents complying with instructions set forth in RFP to qualify in Technical Evaluation. As such, the Committee hereby unanimously recommends to re-invite the bids [under 2nd call] with a reduced time period of 15 days duly considering the priority for elimination of the subject mentioned Blackspots.



(S Syed Dawood Mian)
Member

[On Leave]

(MS Chaithanya)
Member



(Shri G Athipathi)
Member



(K Govindasamy)
Convenor

ANNEXURE-A																								
S. No	Name of the Contractor Qualifying Criteria	Requirement as per Bid Document	M/s KMC Associates,Theni (317014)				M/s A Ramanathan & Co., Trichy (320084)				M/s Sasi Constructions, Salem (320186)				M/s Dharma Infra Tech, Pudukkottai (319123)									
1	Cost of tender document	Rs.50,000/-	Ref. No. 202824612 ICICI Bank IMPS Fund Transfer Rs. 50,000/- dated 07.09.2021 (Pg 3)				Ref No. SBINS21250816764 dated 07.09.2021 from SBI for an amount of 50,000/- Pg 2				Ref No. UBNJ21251472965 dated 05.09.2021 from Union Bank for an amount of 50,000/- (pg 1)				Ref No. IOBAN21247087600 dated 04.09.2021 from IOB (Furnished for Rs.50,000/-) Pg 2									
2	Bid Security	Nil, However, Bid Securing declaration shall be furnished.	Furnished (Pg 1)				Furnished Pg 3				Furnished Pg 107				Furnished Pg 03									
3	Average Annual Turn over for Last 3 years	Rs.305,098 Lakh	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakhs)	Year	Turnover (Lakh)	Multiplying factor	Amount (Rs. in Lakh)						
			2018-19	3365.44	1.33	4476.04	2018-19	2889.55	1.33	3976.11	2018-19	1698.66	1.33	2259.22	2018-19	1250.93	1.33	1663.74						
			2019-20	4233.38	1.21	5122.39	2019-20	3477.52	1.21	4207.80	2019-20	3609.76	1.21	3641.81	2019-20	1677.70	1.21	2030.02						
			2020-21	2324.13	1.10	2556.54	2020-21	4755.64	1.10	5232.30	2020-21	-	1.10	0.00	2020-21	3006.00	1.10	3300.00						
			Total			12154.97	Total			13415.22	Total			5901.00	Total			3593.76						
Average Turnover (pg 28)			4052.00			Average Turnover (pg 53)			4472.07			Average Turnover pg98			1967.01			Average Turnover (pg 01)			1331.00			
4	Similar nature of work completed during the last 7 years	One Similar completed Work costing not less than amount equal to 815.254 Lakhs Two Similar completed Works costing not less than amount equal to each of 510.185 Lakhs or Three Similar completed Works costing not less than amount equal to each of 408.132 Lakhs	Strengthening in Km 58/0-54/0 & 50/0-50/0 of NH-49 Extn. (New NH-85) -TN-2017-18 - 842, Work Value done : 1288.13 Lakh Completion certificate dated 21.09.2020 issued by Divisional Engineer(NH), Madurai. (pg 59)				Construction of Adml Bridge at Km 32/4 of NH-225 Extension (New NH-135) Across Marudhayar River completed for an amount of Rs.12.32 Crore Certificate issued by DE, NH, Trichy on 10.08.2021, Pg 83				There is no Highway work experience as per the works experience documents submitted by the Bidder which is not in conformity as per the RFP Clause 4.4 A (b) (iii)				Upgradation of PM roads under DE(H), NABARD & Rural road section, Work value done: 1114.24 Lakh, Completion certificate issued by DE(H), NABARD & Rural road section, Pudukkottai, Work Completed on 30.07.2021, [Pg No. 118]									
5	Registration	Organisation Registered with Central, State Government, P&T/CPWD, Railways / State PWD and other Govt. organisations	Registration No. 05/2015-2020 1st class Contractors code: 03-MU-A-0324-S, renewed vide letter No. 1110/2021-2022/DO-2/dated 14.05.2021 valid upto 31.03.2022. (pg 10)				1st class Registration No. 02/2008 renewed vide Letter No.353/2017/DO-2 dated 21.04.2017, Not renewed beyond 20.04.2018. (pg 21)				Lr. No. 2227/2021/DO2 dated 07.06.2021 Superintending Engineer, C&M, Salem, 1st Class Contractor Code No. 01-SL-A-0193-S for the period upto 31.03.2022 Pg 4				Proc. No. 825/2020/v2/ Dated 22.06.2021 Superintending Engineer, Highways NABARD and Village Pwds Circle, Trichy 21, 1st Class Registration No. 26/2007-08 valid upto 31.03.2022 Pg 39									
(i)	Place of Registration		Madurai				Trichy Pg 21				Chennai Pg 94				Trichy Pg 39									
(ii)	Principal Place of Business		Theni				Trichy Pg 21				Chennai Pg 94				Pudukkottai Pg 39									
6	Power of Attorney to sign the bid document	Furnished / Not Furnished	Furnished (pg5)				Furnished Pg 5				Not Furnished - As per Sec III of RFP PoA is one of the Qualification Information to be submitted by the Bidder. As per Cl 4.4, (E) a (iii) non-submission of the same will make the bid "non-responsive"				Furnished Pg 23									
7	Bid Validity 120 days after the date of bid submission	Furnished / Not Furnished	Furnished without mentioned 120days (Pg 7)				Furnished Pg 14				Furnished Pg 104				Furnished pg 3									
8	Bid Capacity Available assessed bid (A x 11 2.5 – B) x C/4.6	Rs. 1020.33 Lakh	11478.57				12790.75				8173.57				8250.00									
9	Evidence of availability of lay equipments (either owned, leased or rented)	Requirement as per Bid Document (Age: Max 5 Years)	Nos.	Owned	Leased	Total Nos.	Remarks				Owned	Leased	Total Nos.	Remarks				Owned	Leased	Total Nos.	Remarks			
		Hot Mix plant (120 Ton per Hr)	1	1	0	1	Invoice has both GST and CST which is not valid/authentic. GST with 2007 year is invalid. Pg 84				1	0	0	Invoice Date is 23.12.2017 (post GST) whereas the Invoice Bill has CST and VAT - Invalid Invoice Pg 87				0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished Pg 47			
		Sensor paver finisher	1	1	0	1	Invoice has both GST and CST which is not valid/authentic. GST with 2009 year is invalid. Pg 85				1	0	1	Invoice furnished Pg 88				0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished Pg 50 (invoice copy is not legible)			
		Excavator	1	1	0	1	Invoice Furnished (Pg 86)				1	0	1	Invoice furnished Pg 89				0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished Pg 53			
		Bitumen Sprayer	1	1	0	1	Invoice Furnished Pg 87				1	0	1	Invoice Furnished (pg 90)				0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished Pg 54-56			
		Vibratory Roller	1	1	0	1	Invoice Furnished Pg 88				1	0	1	Invoice furnished Pg 91				0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished Pg 57-51			
		Pneumatic Tyred Roller	1	0	0	0	Invoice Furnished however, Cost of Pneumatic Tyre Roller @ Rs 5.5 Lakh is not authentic. Pg90				1	0	1	Invoice furnished Pg 93				0	1	1	Invoice furnished Pg 92-94 (invoice is not clear)			
		Front End Loader (1 cum bucket capacity)	1	1	0	1	Invoice Furnished Pg 91				1	0	1	Invoice Furnished (pg 94)				0	0	0	Invoice Furnished (pg 133)			
		Tipper (10 Ton Capacity)	5	5	0	5	RC Copsels Furnished Pg 96				4	0	4	Out of 5 RCs one Vehicle has expired Age limit				0	0	0	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished Pg 77-87			
		Concrete Batch Mix Plant at 20 Cum Per hour	1	0	1	1	Invoice Furnished Pg 97				1	0	0	Not Furnished				0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished Pg 58-60			
		Hydraulic Crane 15 T capacity	1	0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished however the same is not legible to view Pg 102				0	0	0	Invoice/RC not furnished. Lease agreement doesn't have any details w.r.t. Proposed machinery				0	1	1	Lease Agreement & Invoice Furnished Pg 91-93			
10	Project Manager cum Highway Engineer	Minimum Qualification Graduation in Civil Engineering + 3 Years Exp.	1	Shri VP Gogul Ram B.E (Civil), Year of Completion 2016 Particular Experience: 5 years			Degree Certificate furnished. Age proof is found missing (Pg 105-107)		Shri S Balamurugan B.E in Civil Engineering, Year of Completion: 1997 Particular Experience: 18 yrs		Age Proof Not furnished & CV is not as per RFP		Shri K Loganath B.E in Civil Engineering, Year of Completion: 2013 Particular Experience: 8 Yrs		Degree certificate furnished 1. Age Proof not furnished - not in compliance with the format furnished in RFP. Pg 37-38		Shri S Lakshminarayana Marayanan, B.E. in Civil Engineering, Year of Completion: 2014 Particular Experience: 5 yrs		Degree certificate and Age Proof Certificate furnished. Page No 150 not signed by the Bidder and Key Personnel. Date of the CV is not mentioned					

S. No	Name of the Contractor Qualifying Criteria	Requirement as per Bid Document		M/s KMC Associates,Theni (317014)		M/s A Ramanathan & Co., Trichy (320084)		M/s Sasi Constructions, Salem (320186)		M/s Dhama Infra Tech, Pudukkottai (319123)	
11	Site Engineer cum Surveyor Engineer	Minimum Qualification Diploma in Civil Engineering	1	Shri Dinesh Kumar S Diploma (Civil), Year of Completion: 2007 Particular Experience: 14 Years	Diploma Certificate furnished, Age proof is found missing (Pg 108-110)	Shri S Ganesan B.E in Civil Engineering, Year of Completion: 1988 Particular Experience: 20 Yrs	Age Proof Not furnished & CV is not as per RFP	Shri S D Balamurugan @ Shenbagam DCE in Civil Engineering, Year of Completion: 2006 Particular Experience: 12 Yrs	Degree certificate furnished 1. Age Proof not furnished - not in compliance with the format furnished in RFP. Pg 39-40	Shri P Manikandan, BE in Civil Engineering, Year of Completion : 2016 Particular Experience: 8 years	Degree certificate and Age Proof Certificate furnished. Page No 154 not signed by the Bidder and Key Personnel. Date of the CV is not mentioned
12	Material cum Quality Control Engineer	Minimum Qualification Diploma in Civil Engineering	1	Shri M Gopal, Diploma (Civil), Year of Completion: 2008 Particular Experience: 11 years	Diploma Certificate furnished, Age proof is found missing (Pg 111-113)	Shri P Senthilkumar DCE in Civil Engineering, Year of Completion: --- Particular Experience: 25 Yrs	Age Proof Not furnished & CV is not as per RFP	Shri K Raghukumar Diploma in Civil Engineering, Year of Completion: 2007 Particular Experience : 10 years.	Degree certificate furnished 1. Age Proof not furnished - not in compliance with the format furnished in RFP. Pg 41-42	Shri M Selvalthurai, BE in Civil Engineering, Year of Completion : 2016 Particular Experience: 5 years	Degree certificate and Age Proof Certificate furnished. Page No 158 not signed by the Bidder and Key Personnel. Date of the CV is not mentioned
13	Assistant Bridge Engineer	Minimum Qualification Diploma in Civil Engineering	1	Shri M Dinesh, Diploma (Civil), Year of Completion: 2014 Particular Experience: 6.5 Years	Diploma Certificate furnished, Age proof is found missing (Pg 114-116)	Shri M Sathiyaraj DCE in Civil Engineering, Year of Completion: 2009 Particular Experience : 11 years.	Age Proof Not furnished & CV is not as per RFP	Shri V Krishnamoorthi EE in Civil Engineering, Year of Completion: 2014 Particular Experience : 4 years.	Degree certificate furnished 1. Age Proof not furnished - not in compliance with the format furnished in RFP. Pg 43-44	Shri K Shalini, EE in Civil Engineering, Year of Completion : 2016 Particular Experience: 5 years	Degree certificate and Age Proof Certificate furnished. Page No 164 not signed by the Bidder and Key Personnel. Date of the CV is not mentioned
14	Information on litigation history in which the Bidder is involved	Furnished / Not Furnished		Nil Statement Furnished Pg 117		Nil Statement furnished Pg 12		Nil Statement furnished (pg 101)		Nil Statement Furnished Pg 10	
15	Affidavit on Stamp paper that information furnished in bid document in correct in all respects.	Furnished / Not Furnished		Furnished Pg 6		Furnished Pg 16		Furnished Pg 102		Furnished Pg 21	
16	Undertaking (Minimum cash upto 25%)	Furnished / Not Furnished		Furnished Pg 119		Furnished Pg 15 without date		Furnished Pg 103		Furnished without date Pg 11	
17	Undertaking (For Bid validity of 120 days)	Furnished / Not Furnished		Not Furnished (Undertaking furnished without 120 Days) Pg 120		Furnished Pg 14 without date		Furnished Pg 104		Furnished without date Pg 11	
18	Undertaking Refer Cl. 4.4 (B) (b) (i)	Furnished / Not Furnished		Furnished Pg 121		Furnished Pg 17		Furnished Pg 105		Furnished without date Pg 12	
19	Integrity Pact	Furnished / Not Furnished		Furnished		Furnished Pg 18		Furnished Pg 109		Furnished Pg 13	
20	Recommendations of Committee	Qualified / Disqualified		1. Most of the Invoice copies are with old dates. (CST showing year of purchase in 2003 whereas Invoice Date is within 5 years which is not authentic & acceptable i.e. Hot Mix Plant & Sensor Paver Finisher). 2. Cost of Pneumatic Tyre Roller @ Rs. 5.6 Lakh is not authentic 3. Undertaking for 120 days of Bid Validity has not been furnished correctly. The bidder missed to update the days as "120: which is the requisite information in the undertaking. 4. Key Personnel CVs were furnished without Proof of Age which is a requisite information to qualify. The aforementioned deviations/observations may be considered as non-compliances as per Clause 16.2 and Appendix to ITB Clause 4.4. B) (b). Considering the above mentioned observations, committee hereby recommends to consider the bid as "Non-Responsive."		1. Hot Mix Plant - Invoice is in 2018 however, the same has CST details. Hence, it is not considered as a valid one. 2. Tipppers - One of the RC copies furnished by the bidder has expired age limit. 3. Bidder has not furnished copy of Concrete Batch Mix Plant 4. No RC/Invoice Copy has been furnished for Crane. Only Lease Agreement is furnished which is not sufficient for proof of machine. 5. Undertaking for 25% Caseh flow - has been furnished without date. 6. Undertaking for 120 days - has been furnished without date 7. All the CVs were furnished without Age proof & not as per RFP prescribed format. The aforementioned deviations/observations may be considered as non-compliances as per Clause 16.2 and Appendix to ITB Clause 4.4. B) (b). Considering the above mentioned observations, committee hereby recommends to consider the bid as "Non-Responsive."		1. Bidder has no similar work capacity as per RFP. The work experiences furnished by the bidder is not in 2/4/6 lane works of Highways which makes the bid non-responsive. 2. Power of Attorney - has not been furnished by the bidder - As per Sec III of RFP PoA is one of the Qualification Information to be submitted by the Bidder. As per Cl 4.4. (B) a (iii) non-submission of the same will make the bid "non-responsive". 3. All the CVs were furnished without Age proof & not as per RFP prescribed format. The aforementioned deviations/observations may be considered as non-compliances as per Clause 16.2 and Appendix to ITB Clause 4.4 A (b) (iii) & Clause 4.4. B) (b)(i). Considering the above mentioned deviations/non-compliances, the bid may be considered as "Non-Responsive".		1. Bidder has not furnished similar work costing more than the requisite amount during last 7 years, which is not in conformity as per the RFP Clause 4.4 A (b) (iii) [single/two/three works are not having the requisite cost capacity as desired in RFP] Only one work experience has Rs. 456 Lakh which will come under the category of 40% of similar work nature however remaining two works having 40% of work cost is not furnished. 2. Tipppers (5 Nos.) RC Copies not furnished. Copy of RCs are mandatory to ascertain the vehicle type, age limit, condition, owner name, etc. 3. Undertaking for 25% Cash has been furnished without Date 4. Undertaking for 120 days bid validity furnished without Date 5. Undertaking as per Clause 4.4. (B) (b) i has been furnished without Date 6. The CVs were furnished without proof of age which is one of the criteria mentioend in RFP. The aforementioned deviations/observations may be considered as non-compliances as per Clause 16.2 and Appendix to ITB Clause 4.4. B) (b). Considering the above mentioned observations, committee hereby recommends to consider the bid as "Non-Responsive."	
				(Disqualified)		(Disqualified)		(Disqualified)		(Disqualified)	

S. S. — —
(S Syed Dawood Mian)
Member

(on leave)
(MS Chaithanya)
Member

B. B. — —
(G Athipathi)
Member

G. — —
(Govindasamy K)
Convenor