



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण
(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय)
National Highways Authority of India
(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways)
जी-5 एवं 6, सेक्टर-10, द्वारका, नई दिल्ली - 110 075
G-5 & 6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110075

दूरभाष / Phone : 91-11-25074100/25074200

Result

Ref:NHAI/13013/InvIT/2020-21/TransactionAdvisors/5

Date:30.07.2021

**To,
All Bidders,**

Subject: Request for Proposal for Empanelment of Transaction Advisory services for projects to be taken up for Assets Monetization through Infrastructure Investment Trust (INVIT) mode. -**Result-Reg.**

Please refer to bids invited on the subject Transaction Advisors services with NIT dated 02.07.2021 with tender id 2021_NHAI_81239_1.

2. Please detailed result attached at Annexure I with summary of results as follows:

S. No.	Name of the Consultancy Firm	Responsive/Non Responsive	Remarks
1	Ernst & Young LLP	Non-Responsive	Name in POA (Authorized or Granting Person) & DSC is different; therefore, it is not evaluated further (Clause 5.1 of RFP)
2	Grant Thornton Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	Responsive	
3	MITES Limited	Responsive	
4	FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED Association with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy LTD	Non-Responsive	1. Firm's experience is not matching with minimum eligibility criteria. 2.The proof of age and qualification of the key personnel is not furnished; Therefore, zero marks are assigned to such CV and such CV is not evaluated further. (Clause 3.2.4 of LOI of RFP)
5	aXYKno Capital Services Pvt. Ltd.	Non-Responsive	Name in POA (Authorized or Granting Person) & DSC is different; therefore, it is not

			evaluated further (Clause 5.1 of RFP)
6	Crisil Risk and Infrastructure Solutions Limited	Non-Responsive	Name in POA (Authorized or Granting Person) & DSC is different; therefore, it is not evaluated further (Clause 5.1 of RFP)
7	Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP	Responsive	

S. No.	Name of the Consultancy Firm	Technical Score	Rank	Eligible/Non Eligible	Remarks
	Max Marks	100			
1	Grant Thornton Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	-		Non-Eligible	The proof of age and qualification of the key personnel is not furnished, Therefore Zero marks are assigned to such CV and such CV is not evaluated further. (Clause 3.2.4 of LOI of RFP)
2	MITES Limited	95.00	1	Eligible	
3	Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP	-		Non-Eligible	The proof of age and qualification of the key personnel is not furnished, Therefore Zero marks are assigned to such CV and such CV is not evaluated further. (Clause 3.2.4 of LOI of RFP)

3. As per RFP clause 12.1 of Data Sheet, 7 days are hereby given to bidders to provide clarification, in case there is any objection with result.

Yours Sincerely,



R.K. Rathee
GM(T),NHAI HQ,
rkrathee@nhai.org,
Extn:1805

Annexure-1

Name of the Project		Annexure-I
Request for Proposal for Empanelment of Transaction Advisory services for projects to be taken up for Assets Monetization through Infrastructure Investment Trust (INVIT) mode		
List of the Applicants:-		
Applicant No:-	Name of the Applicant	Status of the Applicant Sole/JV/ Association
1/7	Ernst & Young LLP	Sole (LLP Firm)
2/7	Grant Thornton Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	Sole (Private Firm)
3/7	MITES Limited in association with CARE Advisory Research and Training Ltd.	Association
4/7	FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED association with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy LTD	Association
5/7	aXYKno Capital Services Pvt. Ltd.	Sole
6/7	Crisil Risk and Infrastructure Solutions Limited	Sole
7/7	Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP	Sole

Name of the Project						
Request for Proposal for Empanelment of Transaction Advisory services for projects to be taken up for Assets Monetization through Infrastructure Investment Trust (INVIT) mode						
Annexure-I						
Average annual turnover from consultancy services						
Required annual turnover		50.00				
S.No.	Name of Consultancy Firm/Entity (Sole Bidder/Bidder in JV)	Annual Average Turnover			Annual Average Turnover in Last 3 years 2017-18 to 2020-21	Eligible
		2019-20	2018-19	2017-18		
1/7	Ernst & Young LLP				0.00	-
2/7	Grant Thornton Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	468.99	397.70	272.17	379.62	Yes
3/7	RITES Limited in association with CARE Advisory Research and Training Ltd.	972.00	1066.12	1091.54	1043.22	Yes
4/7	FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED association with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy LTD	268.06	329.25	253.79	283.70	Yes
5/7	aXYKno Capital Services Pvt. Ltd.					-
6/7	Crisil Risk and Infrastructure Solutions Limited					-
7/7	Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP	2078.90	1709.30	1230.30	1672.83	Yes



Request for Proposal for Empanelment of Transaction Advisory services for projects to be taken up for Assets Monetization through Infrastructure Investment Trust (INVT) mode															
Test of Responsiveness															
S. No.	Name of the Firm	Sole/JV/ Association	Power of Attorney for signing the Application	Position	DSC holder	Receipt of online payment towards cost of RFP of Rs. 5,000/- (Rupees Five thousand only) in favour of National Highways Authority of India;	Forwarding Letter	If applicable, the Power of Attorney for Lead Member of JV;	Copy of Memorandum of Understanding between JV partners, if applicable;	Copy of Memorandum of Understanding with Associate, if applicable	Firms required experience	If proposal submitted before the deadline of submission	Bid security declaration in prescribed format	Firm having relevant turnover	Responsive (Yes/No)
1/7	Ernst & Young LLP	Sole (LLP Firm)	Peeyush Naidu Pg no 5	Partner	Satyam Shivam Shundaram		YES	NA	NA	NA		Yes			NO
2/7	Grant Thornton Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	Sole (Private Firm)	T. Ravinder Reddy Pg no 53	Vice President	T. Ravinder Reddy	Yes	Yes Pg no 5	NA	NA	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes Pg no 52	Yes Pg no 49	Yes
3/7	UTES Limited in association with CARE Advisory Research and Training Ltd.	Association	Anjeev Kumar Jain	GM	Anjeev Kumar Jain	Yes	Yes	NA	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4/7	FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED association with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy LTD	Association	Rishi Mendiratta	Assistant Vice President	Rishi Mendiratta	Yes	Yes	NA	NA	Yes	No	Yes	Yes Pg no 51	Yes Pg no 48	NO
5/7	aXYKno Capital Services Pvt. Ltd.	Sole	Mrs. Megha Thakur Pg no 1 POA	Assistant General Manager	Vishwanath Iyer			NA	NA	NA		Yes			NO
6/7	Crisil Risk and Infrastructure Solutions Limited	Sole	Mr. Akshay Purkayastha Pg no 2 POA	Director	Mr. Jagan Narayan Padamanabhan			NA	NA	NA		Yes			NO
7/7	Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP	Sole	Mr. Kushal Kumar Singh Pg no 2 POA	Partner	Mr. Kushal Kumar Singh	Yes		NA	NA	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Handwritten signatures and initials in blue ink, including a large signature on the left, a stylized 'R' in the center, and a signature on the right.

Request for Proposal for Empanelment of Transaction Advisory services for projects to be taken up for Assets Monetization through Infrastructure Investment Trust (INVIT) mode

MINIMUM ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA

S.No.	Name of the Applicants	Firm experience in last 7 years	Personnel		Annual Average Turnover	whether the Applicant is Technical "Eligible" or "Non-Eligible".
		The firm should have executed/ assisted at least two transaction/contracts each worth more than Rs. 500 Crores + in Infrastructure Sector	CV of Key Persons	Y/N	Annual average turnover for last 3 years of the firm should be equal to or more than Rs.50.00 Crores	
1/7	Ernst & Young LLP		TL- 75% score			
2/7	Grant Thornton Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	Yes	TL- 75% score	No	Yes	Non-Eligible
3/7	rites Limited in association with CARE Advisory Research and Training Ltd.	Yes	TL- 75% score	Yes	Yes	Eligible
4/7	FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED association with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy LTD	No	TL- 75% score	No	Yes	Non-Eligible
5/7	aXYKno Capital Services Pvt. Ltd.		TL- 75% score			
6/7	Crisil Risk and Infrastructure Solutions Limited		TL- 75% score			
7/7	Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP	Yes	TL- 75% score	No	Yes	Non-Eligible







Name of the Project																
Request for Proposal for Empanelment of Transaction Advisory services for projects to be taken up for Assets Monetization through Infrastructure Investment Trust (INVIT) mode																
FIRMS RELEVANT EXPERIENCE FOR THE ASSIGNMENT																
S.N o.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/7		2/7		3/7		4/7		5/7		6/7		7/7	
	Applicant Name Description		Ernst & Young LLP Claimed	Assesed	Grant Thornton Advisory Pvt. Ltd. Claimed	Assesed	RITES Limited in association with CARE Advisory Research Claimed	Assesed	FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED association with Chaitanva Proiects Claimed	Assesed	aXYKno Capital Services Pvt. Ltd. Claimed	Assesed	Crisil Risk and Infrastructure Solutions Limited Claimed	Assesed	Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP Claimed	Assesed
		45.00														
1	Turnover in the last 3 Financial Years (2018-19 – 2020-21)	10														
1.1	Rs. 50 - 100 Crore (Both inclusive)	3														
1.2	Rs. 100 - 150 Crore (150 crore inclusive)	5														
1.3	Rs. 150 Crore – 200 Crore(200 crore inclusive)	7														
1.4	More than Rs. 200 Crore	10					10	10								
2	If firm has executed/ assisted transactions/ contracts for Infrastructure Sector worth more than Rs. 500 Crores + (in the past 7 years) and the no. of such	35														
2.1	Two	20														
2.2	Three	25														
2.3	Four	30						30								
2.4	Five and More	35					35									
	Total	45.00					45.00	40.00								

Name of the Project: _____

Request for Proposal for Empanelment of Transaction Advisory services for projects to be taken up for Assets Monetization through Infrastructure Investment Trust (INVIIT) mode

Name of Applicant	RITES Limited in association with CARE Advisory Research and Training Ltd.	
Applicant status	Association	3/7
Minimum number of Transaction /Contract Projects in InfraStructure	2	
Aggregate number of Transaction /Contract Projects in InfraStructure	2	

1.a	Number of Transaction/Contract Projects in InfraStructure	
2	More than minimum number of Projects i.e	
3	More than number of Projects i.e	
4	More than number of Projects i.e	
5	More than number of Projects i.e	

S.No		Number of Transaction /Contract Projects in Infra-Structure												Eligible no. of Projects		Mark Obtained
	Client name	Project Done	Status in Part Project	% in IV	Transaction / Contract Value	L a Project is transactions/ contracts for Infrastructure Sector	Date of Completion	% of Completion	Eligible Value of Transaction / Contract Value	Remarks	Page no.	Whether the project experience is qualified.				
1	2 Jawaharlal Nehru Port Trust	3 Financial Consultancy	4 Sole	5 100	6 7915	7 Yes	8 06.05.2014	9 100.00	10 7915.00	11 12	13 9	14 Yes	15 16			
2	REMC	Financial Consultancy	Sole	100	750	Yes	01.03.2017	100.00	750.00		10	Yes				
3	REMC	Financial Consultancy	Sole	100	600	Yes	01.03.2020	100.00	600.00		12	Yes				
4	VPT	Financial Consultancy	Sole	100	0	Yes			0.00	Contract agreement instead of completion certificate	14	No				
5	Ministry of Rail	Legal Consultancy	Sole	100	0	Yes			0.00	Contract agreement instead of completion certificate	18	No				
6	Ministry of Rail	Financial Consultancy	Sole	100	0				0.00	Contract agreement instead of completion certificate	45	No				
7	DMRC	Financial Consultancy	Sole	100	0	Yes			0.00	Contract agreement instead of completion certificate	53	No	4			
8	REMC	Financial Consultancy	Sole	100	493	Yes	01.07.2019	100.00	493.00		56	No				
9	Ministry of Rail	Financial Consultancy	Sole	100	0	Yes			0.00	Contract agreement instead of completion certificate	65	No				
10	VPT	Financial Consultancy	Sole	100	0	Yes			0.00	Contract agreement instead of completion certificate	69	No				
11	APADC	Financial Consultancy	Sole	100	4209	Yes	27.11.2019	100.00	4209.00		83	Yes				
12	MDA	DPR WORK	Sole	100		No	01.10.2020	100.00	0.00	In completion certificate, Project/Transaction cost is met	86	No				
13	ADA	DPR WORK	SOLE	100		No	01.10.2020	100.00	0.00	In completion certificate, Project/Transaction cost is met	88	No				

Total number of projects Experience		Eligible no. of Projects
		4.00
		Yes
		Eligible
		30

[illegible]

Total Length of Experience [DPR, Feasibility] (in km)	Aggregate number of Traffic Due Diligence related to the assignment of eligibility	No of Toll Plaza
	0.00	4.00
		Yes
		Eligible

S.No.	Average Turnover for last 3 years (in crores)
3	Average Turnover
	Turnovers Marks >200 10
	Turnovers Marks 150-200 7
	Turnovers Marks 100-150 5
	Turnovers Marks 50-100 3
	Turnovers Marks Below 50 3
	Marks obtained 10
	Marks Claimed



✓

2

Request for Proposal for Empanelment of Transaction Advisory services for projects to be taken up for Assets Monetization through Infrastructure Investment Trust (INVIT) mode

Name of Applicant	FEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED association with Charanya Projects Consultancy LTD.
-------------------	---

Applicant status	Association	4/7
Minimum number of Transaction /Contract Projects in Infra Structure		2

Aggregate number of Transaction / Contract Projects in Infrastructure	2
--	---

More than minimum number of Projects i.e.	2
More than number of Projects i.e.	3
More than number of Projects i.e.	4
More than number of Projects i.e.	5
14	

S No	Client name	Project Done	Status in Past Project
------	-------------	--------------	------------------------

1	2	3	4
PPCP		Transaction Advisory	Lead Member
UPIDA			

PI	UPRIDA	DFR works related to Technical Consultant	Lead Member
PI			
PI			

4	UPFIDA	Consultant	DPR works related to Technical Consultant	Lead Member
	UPFIDA			

5	UPR works related to Technical Consultant	Lead Member
	UPRIDA	DPR works related to

6	Technical Consultant	Lead Member
8	Transaction Advisory	Solo

[illegible]

Other Partner		
S.No	Client name	Project Done
1	2	3
		Status in Past Project
		4

[illegible][illegible]

3	S.No.	Terminals	Marks
	3.1	>200	10

1

Form Score for:	Multiple no. of Projects	Scores Awarded	Scores Claimed
Aggregate number of Transactions / Contact Projects in life-Cycle	1		
Lead Member Qualified the length	1		
Other member qualified the length	0		

100

Eligible Value of Transaction / Contract Value	Remarks	Page no.	Whether the project experience is qualified.	Eligible no. of Projects	Mark Obtained
1.					

	11	12	13	14	15	16
0	0.00	In certificate Transaction Value is not mentioned	27	h00		

0	0.00	not considered because dpr related work of technical consultant.	29	346
0	0.00	not considered because dpr related work of technical	32	256

0	0.00	not considered because of related work of technical consultant.	35	No
---	------	---	----	----

	0	1
not considered because dpr related work of technical consultant.	35	706
not considered because dpr		

0	0.00	related work of technical consultant.	42	No
0	5493.06		46	Yes

[illegible]

[Egide no. of Project]	
1.00	
No	

Sl. No.	Eligible Length of Project	Remarks	Page no.	Whether the project experience is qualified.	Marks Obtained
1	11	12	13	14	15

[illegible]

	Number of Transaction Contract
100	
No	
Notifiable	

Average Turnover	Marks obtained
1672.83	10

Mark Claimed

✓

Name of the Project

Request for Proposal for Empanelment of Transaction Advisory services for projects to be taken up for Assets Monetization through Infrastructure Investment Trust (INVIT) mode

Name & DoB. Of Key Personnel

	Applicant No.	1/7	2/7	3/7	4/7	5/7	6/7	7/7
S.No.	Key Position:	Ernst & Young LLP	Grant Thornton Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	BITES Limited in association with CARE Advisory Research and Training Ltd.	FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED association with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy LTD	aXYKno Capital Services Pvt. Ltd.	Crisil Risk and Infrastructure Solutions Limited	Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP
	Sole/JV/Association	Sole	Sole	Association	Association	Sole	Sole	Sole
1	Team Leader cum PPP expert	Shashi Shankar 01.09.1968	Padma Priya J. Not Mentioned	Alok Kumar 22.09.1969	Anil Gandhi 29.05.1971	Ravinder Kumar Awasthi 01.05.1977	Jagannarayan Padmanabhan 21.11.1975	Kushal Kumar Singh 8/21/1977
2	Transaction Expert	Waliul Islam 06.12.1980	Arun Kumar Selvarasu Not Mentioned	Sushmita Majumdar 17.02.1979	Sikha Gupta 05.08.1981	Sanjog Bawane 21.12.1974	Akshay Purkayastha 28.11.1981	Kapil Chaudhary 7/19/1983
3	Legal Expert	Vishnu P. Saudarsan 28.11.1976	Tarakesh Swain Not Mentioned	Mahesh Sreenivasan 27.02.1972	Reena Singh 01.07.1982	Manoj Kumar Mishra 11.08.1975	Arvind Kumar Verma 18.12.1968	Rohit Anand Das 4/26/1987

Summary Sheet of CV's																														
S. No.	Details	Total Marks	1/7				2/7				3/7				4/7				5/7				6/7				7/7			
			Ernst & Young LLP				Grant Thornton Advisory Pvt. Ltd.				RITES Limited in association with CARE Advisory Research and Training Ltd.				FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED association with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy LTD				aXYKno Capital Services Pvt. Ltd.				Crisil Risk and Infrastructure Solutions Limited				Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP			
			Name	Claimed	Assessed Score	Assessed @ 50	Name	Claimed	Assessed Score	Assessed @ 50	Name	Claimed	Assessed Score	Assessed @ 50	Name	Claimed	Assessed Score	Assessed @ 50	Name	Claimed	Assessed Score	Assessed @ 50	Name	Claimed	Assessed Score	Assessed @ 50	Name	Claimed	Assessed Score	Assessed @ 50
1	Team Leader cum PPP expert	25					Padma Priya J.		0		Alok Kumar	25	25		Anil Gandhi		0										Kushal Kumar Singh	25	0	
2	Financing/Transaction Expert	15					Arun Kumar Selvarasu		0		Sushmita Majumdar	15	15		Sikha Gupta		0										Kapil Chaudhary	15	0	
2	Legal Expert	10					Tarakesh Swain		0		Mahesh Sreenivasan	10	10		Reena Singh		0										Rohit Anand Das	10	0	
		50				0.00			0.00		50.00		50.00				0.00			0.00							50.00		0.00	

Team Leader cum PPP expert			1/2		2/2		3/7		4/7		5/7		6/7		7/7	
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	Ernst & Young LLP		Grant Thornton Advisory Pvt. Ltd.		RITES Limited in association with CARE Advisory Research and Training Ltd.		FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED association with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy LTD		aXYKno Capital Services Pvt. Ltd.		Crisil Risk and Infrastructure Solutions Limited		Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP	
	Name of the Applicant		Shashi Shankar 01.09.1968		Padma Priya J. Not Mentioned		Alok Kumar 22.09.1969		Anil Gandhi 29.05.1971		Ravinder Kumar 01.05.1977		Jagannarayan 21.11.1975		Kushal Kumar Singh 8/21/1977	
	Name of Key Personnel		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed		Claimed	
	Date of Birth of KP's		Assesed		Assesed		Assesed		Assesed		Assesed		Assesed		Assesed	
	Description															
1	Educational Qualification	100%	0%		0%		20%		0%		0%		0%		100%	
	CA/MBA/Post graduate from an Institution recognized by AICTE/NAAC or affiliated to an Indian/ global University of repute or	20%					20%		20%		0%				20%	
	Essential Experience															
2		80%														
2	a) Total Professional Experience (Minimum 15 years)	16%														
i)	Less than 15 years	0%														
	15-20 years	8%														
	More than 20 years	16%					16%		16%						16	
ii)	b) Role specific Experience (Suitable experience on topics related to large infrastructure program financing including areas like framing PPP strategy, commercial development, attracting investment, structuring	64%														
	Experience in Infrastructure Sector	32%					32%		32%						32	
	Experience working with govt./	32%					32%		32%						32	
	Total	100%			0%		100%		100%						100	
	Weightage @ 25	25			0		25		25		0				25	
			1		2		3		2		1		2			

Financing/Transaction Expert																
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/2		2/2		2/2		4/7		5/7		6/7		7/7	
	Name of the Applicant				Grant Thornton Adviso		0		PRIVILEGED INFORMATION PRIVATE LIMITED association with		aXYKno Capital Services Pvt. Ltd.		ssil Risk and Infrastructure Solutions Limit		Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP	
	Name of Key Personnel		Waliul Islam		Arun Kumar Selvarasu		Sushmita Majumdar		Sikha Gupta		Sanjog Bawane		Akshay Purkayastha		Kapil Chaudhary	
	Date of Birth of KP's		06.12.1980		Not Mentioned		17.02.1979		05.08.1981		21.12.1974		28.11.1981		7/19/1983	
	Description		Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed
1	Educational Qualification	100%		0%			20%	0%				0%		0%	20%	0%
	CA/MBA/Post graduate from an Institution recognized by AICTE/NAAC or affiliated to an Indian/ global University of repute or equivalent	20%					20%	20%		0%						
2	Essential Experience	80%													80%	
2 a)	Total Professional Experience (Minimum 8 years)	16%														
i)	Less than 8 years	0%														
	8-10 years	8%														
	More than 10 years	16%					16%	16%								
	b) Role specific Experience (Suitable experience on topics related to large infrastructure program financing including areas like framing PPP strategy, commercial development, attracting investment, structuring contracts/concessions and regulations on infrastructure sectors)	64%														
ii)	Experience in Infrastructure Sector	32%					32%	32%								
	Experience in Financial Analysis/Project Appraisal/Fiancial Modelling	32%					32%	32%								
	Total	100%		0%		0%	100%	100%		0%					100%	0%
	Weightage @ 15	15		0		0	15	15		0					15	0
			1		2		2		2		1		2			

San

S

V

Q

San

Legal Expert																
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/7		2/7		3/7		4/7		5/7		6/7		7/7	
	Name of the Applicant		Ernst & Young LLP		Grant Thornton Advisory Pvt. Ltd.		RITES Limited in association with CARE Advisory Research and Training Ltd.		FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED association with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy LTD		aXYKno Capital Services Pvt. Ltd.		Crisil Risk and Infrastructure Solutions Limited		Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP	
	Name of Key Personnel		Vishnu P. Saudarsan		Tarakesh Swain		Mahesh Sreenivasan		Reena Singh		Manoj Kumar Mishra		Arvind Kumar Verma		Rohit Anand Das	
	Date of Birth of KP's		28.11.1976		Not Mentioned		27.02.1972		01.07.1982		11.08.1975		18.12.1968		4/26/1987	
	Description		Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed
1	Educational Qualification	100%	0%	0%	0%	0%	20%		0%	0%					20%	0%
	Law degree from an Institution recognized by AICTE/NAAC or affiliated to an Indian/ global University of repute or equivalent	20%					20%	20%		0%						
2	Essential Experience	80%													80%	
2 a)	Total Professional Experience (Minimum 10 years)	16%														
i)	Less than 10 years	0%														
	10-12 years	8%														
	More than 12 years	16%					16%	16%								
ii)	b) Role specific experience (Suitable experience in public/private companies/govt. agencies in India /globally on review and creation of bid documents and concession agreements, advising on negotiation of concession agreements and related documents)	64%														
	Experience in Infrastructure Sector	64%					64%	64%								
	Total	100%				0%	100%	100%		0%						
	Weightage @ 10	10				0	10	10		0						0%
			1		2		2		2							0







Name of the Project

Request for Proposal for Empanelment of Transaction Advisory services for projects to be taken up for Assets Monetization through Infrastructure Investment Trust (INVIT) mode

Annexure-I

Final Comparative Technical Evaluation Score.

S. No	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Approach & Methodology		Total		Rank of the Firm	whether the Technical Responsive Applicant/Bidder Eligible for opening of Financial
		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed		
	Maximum marks	45	45	50	50	5	5	95	95		
1/7	Ernst & Young LLP										Non-Responsive
2/7	Grant Thornton Advisory Pvt. Ltd.		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00		Non-Eligible
3/7	MITES Limited in association with CARE Advisory Research and Training Ltd.	45.00	40.00	50.00	50.00	5.00	5.00	100.00	95.00	1	Eligible
4/7	FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED association with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy LTD										Non-Responsive
5/7	aXYKno Capital Services Pvt. Ltd.										Non-Responsive
6/7	Crisil Risk and Infrastructure Solutions Limited										Non-Responsive
7/7	Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP				0.00						Non-Eligible

29.07