

Minutes of Meeting

Date : 23.07.2021

Name of Work : Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra– Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19– Reg.

The Committee evaluated the technical bids of all the Bidders except M/s. MSV International INC in association with APSD Consultant Pvt. Ltd. as NHAI, HQ vide letter No.NHAI/Tech/UP(E)/VNS/NH56/Quality/2021/40, dated 10.06.2021 circulated that M/s. MSV International Inc, in association with Mspark Futuristics & Associates has declared as Non-Performer w.r.t. "Consultancy Services for Supervision of the Projects of (i) Four laning of Sultanpur to Varanasi (PKG-I) [from Sultanpur (Km.134.700) to Jaunpur (Km.209.230)] and (ii) Four laning of Sultanpur to Varanasi (PKG-II) [from Jaunpur (Km.209.230) to Varanasi (Km.272.590)]".

2. The letter also states that M/s. MSV International Inc, in association with Mspark Futuristics & Associates has declared "Non-Performer" for the period till the defects are not completely rectified. Both the entities are also prohibited to participate in the on going and future bids of NHAI till the time defects are rectified".
3. Vide RO, Nagpur letter No. NHAI/RO-NAG/IE-O&M-N-K/NH-53/2021/1074, dated 13.07.2021 intimated to the Bidder, M/s.MSV International INC in association with APSD Consultant Pvt. Ltd. that as there is no further communication, the Bid of M/s.MSV International INC in association with APSD Consultant Pvt. Ltd. for the subjected work has been considered as "non-responsive". In response to this, there is no further communication received from the above Bidder till date. It concludes that the Bidder agrees with the decision as "non-responsive".
4. The Comparison Statement and Bidder-wise evaluation is enclosed as Annexure-I. The abstract of technical evaluation of all the Bidders' except M/s. MSV International INC in association with APSD Consultant Pvt. Ltd. is as follows:

Sl. No.	Name of the Bidder	Marks obtained
(i)	M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited	84.00
(ii)	M/s. K & J Projects Private Limited	94.21
(iii)	M/s.L.N.Malviya Infra Projects Private Limited in association with Highway Engineering Consultant	97.14
(iv)	M/s. Upham International Corporation in JV with SA Infrastructure Pvt. Ltd. in association with ADNOPS Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.	95.53

5. As per RFP, the firm qualifies technically, if it scores 75 marks/points in technical evaluation.
6. The summary of Technical Capacity of the Firms is furnished below:

Sl. No.	Name of the Firm	Remaining capacity for new projects (nos.)		Whether eligible for opening of Financial Bid
		DPR	IE/AE/SC	
(i)	M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited	10.00	7.50	Yes

Shreyas
23/7/21
Sidh
23/7/21

23/07/2021

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-

19

Abstract of Marks obtained

Sl. No.	Name of the Agency / Firm	Total Marks obtained
1	M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd.	84.00
2	M/s. K & J Projects Private Limited	94.21
3	M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s. Highways Engineering Consultant	97.14
4	M/s. Upham International Corporation JV M/s. S A Infrastructure Consultant Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s. ADNOPS Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.	95.53
5	M/s. MSV International Inc. in Association with M/s. APSD Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	NON-RESPONSIVE - Vide letter no. 40 dated 10.06.2021, General Manager (Tech.) Uttar Pradesh (East) Division, NHAI, HQ has declared M/s. MSV International INC. as Non-Performer.


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
 GM(T), RO, Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
 PD, PIU-2, Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO, Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
 GM(T), RO, Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee

Evaluation of Maximum works to be permitted to one consultant.

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

Sl. No.	Name of the Firm	Remaining capacity for new projects (nos.)		Whether eligible for opening of Financial Bid
		DPR	IE/AE/SC	
1	M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd.	10.00	7.50	Yes
2	M/s. K & J Projects Private Limited	5.35	4.50	Yes
3	M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s. Highways Engineering Consultant	7.80	2.39	Yes
4	M/s. Upham International Corporation JV M/s. S A Infrastructure Consultant Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s. ADNOPS Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.	6.25	4.50	Yes
5	M/s. MSV International Inc. in Association with M/s. APSD Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	NON-RESPONSIVE - Vide letter no. 40 dated 10.06.2021, General Manager (Tech.) Uttar Pradesh (East) Division, NHAI, HQ has declared M/s. MSV International INC. as Non-Performer.		


23/7/24

(Prashant N. Pagrut)

GM(T), RO, Nagpur

Member Secretary of the Committee


23/7/24

(Abhijit P. Jichkar)

PD, PIU-2, Nagpur

Member of the Committee



(Shyam Sunder Kumar)

Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,

RO, Nagpur

Member of the Committee


23/7/24

(Satish J. Janwe)

GM(T), RO, Nagpur

Chairperson of the

Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur - Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra—Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

Firm	Percentage of Share	Average Turnover	No. of Key Personnel	Ongoing Projects	
				DPR	IE/AE/SC
M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd.	100	49.41	58	3.75	12

1	2	3			4			5			6			7	
Weighted average turnover on JV in last 3 FY (from consultancy)*	Weighted average no. of Key professionals on full time roles (min. from last one year) with JV**	Max. no. of projects to be allotted to one particular consultant including ongoing projects at a time in NHAI			Max. no. of projects in one Financial Year (cap of 25%)			Total ongoing / awarded Projects			Projects awarded in CFY out of Col. 5			Remaining Capacity for new projects (nos.) in CFY	
		Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC		
49.41	58	40	40	30	10	10	7.5	15.75	3.75	12	0	0	10	10	7.5

Assessment of the firms with JV

Prashant N. Pagrut
(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM(T), RO, Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Com

Abhijit P. Jichkar
(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
PD, PIU-2, Nagpur
Member of the Committee

(Signature)
(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager: Head F&A Unit,
RO, Nagpur
Member of the Committee

(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (I), RO, Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Evaluation of Maximum works to be permitted to one consultant.

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur - Kondhali (Km.9,200 to Km.50,000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra-Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

Firm	Percentage of Share	Average Turnover	No. of Key Personnel	Ongoing Projects	
				DPR	IE/AE/SC
M/s. K & J Project Pvt. Ltd.	100	50.75	47	0.9	2.8

1	2	3			4			5			6			7		
Weighted average turnover on JV in last 3 FY (from consultancy)*	Weighted average no. of Key professionals on full time roles (min. from last one year) with JV**	Max. no. of projects to be allotted to one particular consultant including ongoing projects at a time in NHAI			Max. no. of projects in one Financial Year (cap of 25%)			Total ongoing / awarded Projects			Projects awarded in CFY out of Col. 5			Remaining Capacity for new projects (nos.) in CFY		
		Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC
50.75	47	25	25	18	6.25	6.25	4.5	3.7	0.9	2.8	0.9	0.9	0	5.35	5.35	4.5

Assessment of the firms with JV

* (Turnover-1 x share-1 + Turnover-2 x share-2)

** (Key Professionals-1 x share-1 + Key Professionals-2 x share-2)

(Ongoing Projects-1 x share-1 + Ongoing Projects-2 x share-2)


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM(T), RO, Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
PD, PIU-2, Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO, Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM(T)-RO, Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Evaluation of Maximum works to be permitted to one consultant.

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur - Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra-Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

Firm	Percentage of Share	Average Turnover	No. of Key Personnel	Ongoing Projects	
				DPR	IE/AE/SC
M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	100	100.29	86	4.65	24.61

1	2	3			4			5			6			7		
Weighted average turnover on JV in last 3 FY (from consultancy)*	Weighted average no. of Key professionals on full time roles (min. from last one year) with JV**	Max. no. of projects to be allotted to one particular consultant including ongoing projects at a time in NHAI			Max. no. of projects in one Financial Year (cap of 25%)			Total ongoing / awarded Projects			Projects awarded in CFY out of Col. 5			Remaining Capacity for new projects (nos.) in CFY		
		Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC
100.29	86	40	40	30	10	10	7.5	29.26	4.65	24.61	7.31	2.2	5.11	7.8	7.8	2.39

Assessment of the firms with JV

* (Turnover-1 x share-1 + Turnover-2 x share-2)

** (Key Professionals-1 x share-1 + Key Professionals-2 x share-2)

(Ongoing Projects-1 x share-1 + Ongoing Projects-2 x share-2)


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM(T), RO, Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
PD, PIU-2, Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO, Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM(T), RO, Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Evaluation of Maximum works to be permitted to one consultant.

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur - Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra-Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

Firm	Percentage of Share	Average Turnover	No. of Key Personnel		Ongoing Projects	
					DPR	IE/AE/SC
M/s. Upham International Corporation In Association with M/s. ADNOPS Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.	80	12.8	23		2	3
M/s. S A Infrastructure Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	20	92.2	83		1	25

1	2		3			4			5			6			7		
	Weighted average turnover on JV in last 3 FY (from consultancy)*	Weighted average no. of Key professionals on full time rolles (min. from last one year) with JV**	Max. no. of projects to be allotted to one particular consultant including ongoing projects at a time in NHAI			Max. no. of projects in one Financial Year (cap of 25%)			Total ongoing / awarded Projects			Projects awarded in CFY out of Col. 5			Remaining Capacity for new projects (nos.) in CFY		
			Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC	Total	DPR	AE/IE/SC
28.68	35		25	25	18	6.25	6.25	4.5	9.2	1.8	7.4	0	0	0	6.25	6.25	4.5

Assessment of the firms with JV

* (Turnover-1 x share-1 + Turnover-2 x share-2)

** (Key Professionals-1 x share-1 + Key Professionals-2 x share-2)

(Ongoing Projects-1 x share-1 + Ongoing Projects-2 x share-2)


 (Prashant N. Pagrut)
 GM(T), RO, Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


 (Abhijit P. Jichkar)
 PD, PIU-2, Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


 (Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO, Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


 (Satish J. Janwe)
 GM(T), RO, Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee

SUMMARY

Name of the Agency : M/s. Upham International Corporation JV M/s. S A Infrastructure Consultant Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s. ADNOPS Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.

Sl. NO.	Description	Max. Marks as per RFP	Marks Obtained
1	Relevant Experience of firm for the Assignment	35	33.17
2	Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology	5	5.00
3	Experience in use of Technology for road inspection	20	20.00
4	Team Leader	19	18.05
5	Highway Maintenance-cum-Resident Engineer	12	10.92
6	Bridge / Structure Engineer	4	3.64
7	Road Safety Expert	5	4.75
	Total	100	95.53


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET

Relevant Experience of Firm for the Assignment

Name of the Agency : M/s. Upham International Corporation JV M/s. S A Infrastructure Consultant Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s. ADNOPS Engineering Services Pvt.			Total Marks : 35	
Sl. No.	Description	Max Marks	Marks Obtained	
1	Year of Establishment of the Firm (In case of JV year of establishment of Lead Member shall be considered) (Min 5 years) • For 5 years - 1.5 marks • More than 5 years - 2 marks	2	2	
2	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business (Min 5 Crore) • For >50 Crores - 2 marks • For 20-50 Crores- 1.5 marks • For 10-20 Crores- 1 mark • For 5-10 Crores- 0.5 mark	2	1.5	
3	Numbers of key personnel with the firm more than one year with the firm. • < 4 personnel - 0 marks • 4 to 12 - Linearly varying from 0.25 to 2 • > 12 personnel - 2 marks	2	1.17	
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 2/4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years • 2 project 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4 marks Or • 1 project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks • Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks.	5	5	
5	In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects • For DPR project length > the length of project for which RFP invited -5 Marks • For DPR project length > two times the length of project for which RFP invited -7.5 Marks • For project length > three times the length of project for which RFP invited - 10 Marks	10	10	
6	Experience as Independent Engineer/Authority Engineer/ Supervision Consultant • two construction projects of four/six laning ** of 30% of project length each or one projects of four/six laning ** of 50% project length in last 7 years. 2 construction projects 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each -4marks Or 1 construction project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks •Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (zero point five) arks for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 2 (two) mark	6	6	
7	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFOT/OMT/O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years • 1 project - 6 marks • Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	8	7.5	
Total		35	33.17	


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET				
Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology				Total Marks : 5
Name of the Agency : M/s. Upham International Corporation JV M/s. S A Infrastructure Consultant Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s. ADNOPS Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.				
Sl. No.	Description	Max Marks	Marks Obtained	
1	Site Appreciation (i) Average 0.50 (ii) Good 0.75 (iii) Very Good 1.00	1	1	
2	Quality of Approach and Methodology (Review of scope of work and design review, construction supervision methodology, contract management approach, safety review/audit and O&M stage, initial view on project plan including key challenges envisaged and potential solutions to be judged).€ (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00	2	2	
3	Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00	2	2	
Total		5	5.00	


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET				
Experience in use of technology for road inspection				
Total Marks : 20				
Name of the Agency : M/s. Upham International Corporation JV M/s. S A Infrastructure Consultant Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s. ADNOPS Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.				
Sl. No.	Particulars	Max Marks	Marks Obtained	
1	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection Own equipment / MOU with Associate 1-2 projects 3-5 projects > 5 projects	6	6	
2	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement Own equipment/MOU with Associate 1-3 projects > 3 projects	3	3	
3	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit (MBIU) or better technology for bridges inspection Own equipment/MOU with Associate 1-3 projects > 3 projects	4	4	
4	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology Own equipment/MOU with Associate 1-3 projects > 3 projects	4	4	
5	Experience in ATCC Own equipment/MOU with Associate 1-3 projects > 3 projects	3	3	
		20	20.00	


Prashant N. Pagrut
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
 GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO-Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


Satish J. Janwe
 GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
 Chairman of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET				
Name of the Agency : M/s. Upham International Corporation JV M/s. S A Infrastructure Consultant Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s. ADNOPS Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.			Age : 58, 11.09.1962	
Name of the Team Leader : Alok Sukhdeoiji Mahajan			Max. Marks	Marks Obtained
S. N.	Description		25	25
1	General Qualification			
	- Graduate in Civil Engineering -21marks - Post-Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering/ any other specialized stream of civil engineering . - 04 marks.		25	25
2	Adequacy for the project		70	70
	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:			
	Total Highway Professional Experience			
i)	< 10 years -0 10 years -22 - Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30		30
	Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M of completed 4/6 lane highway sections			
ii)	< 3 years -0 Marks 3 years -30 Marks - Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks. - Experience in similar capacity* in Highway Development Projects taken up under PPP	35		35
iii)	1 projects - 4 marks - add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks	5		5
	Employment with the Firm			
3	< 1 year -0 1 year -3 - Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5		0
	Total	100		95
	Marks out of 19 (=A/100 x 19)			18.05


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
 GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO-Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
 GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET

Name of the Agency : M/s. Upham International Corporation JV M/s. S A Infrastructure Consultant Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s. ADNOPS Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.			
Name of the Highway Maintenance-cum-Resident Engineer : Anil Prabhudas Telang			
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Age : 59, 31.03.1962
1	General Qualification • Graduate in Civil Engineering- 21 marks • Post Graduation in Highway Engg.- 04 marks	25	Marks Obtained 21
2	Adequacy for the project	25	21
	Professional Experience	70	70
i)	Experience in Highway works (inspection/ design/construction/maintenance) • < 7 years -0 Marks • 7years -22 Marks • Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	30
ii)	Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature • < 3 years -0 • 3 years -12 • Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	15	15
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/ Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/ Expressways • 1 project -20 Marks • Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.	25	25
3	Employment with the Firm • < 1 year -0 Marks • 1 year -3 Marks • Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	0
Total		100	91
Marks out of 12 (=A/100 x 12)			10.92


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET

Name of the Agency : M/s. Upham International Corporation JV M/s. S A Infrastructure Consultant Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s. ADNOPS Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.			
Name of the Bridge/Structural Engineer : Ranjit Kumar			
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Age : 41, 15.08.1979 Marks Obtained
1	General Qualification I) Graduate in Civil Engineering II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	25	21
2	Adequacy for the project Professional Experience Total Professional Experience • < 7 years -0 Marks • 7years -22 Marks • Add two mark extra for each additional completed year subject to maximum 8(eight) marks.	70	
i)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation • < 3 years -0 Marks • 3 years -16 marks • Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	30	30
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation • < 3 years -0 Marks • 3 years -16 marks • Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	20	20
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation of 4/6 lane highway/expressway or similar project. • 1 Project -16 Marks • Add1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) mark	20	20
3	Employment with the Firm • < 1 year -0 marks • 1 year -3 Marks • Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	0
Total		100	91
Marks out of 4 (=A/100 x 4)			3.64


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET

Name of the Agency : M/s. Upham International Corporation JV M/s. S A Infrastructure Consultant Pvt. Ltd. In Association with M/s. ADNOPS Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.			
Name of the Road Safety Expert : Suraj Kumar Pathak			
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Age : 35; 24-09-1985 Marks Obtained
1	General Qualification - Graduate in Civil Engineering - 21 marks - Post-Graduation in Traffic/Transportation /Safety Engineering- 04 marks	25	25
2	Adequacy for the project	70	70
	Professional Experience		
i)	Total Professional Experience < 7years -0 Marks 7years -22 Marks - Add two marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	30
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Works of Major Highway Projects (4/6 laning Projects) < 3years -0 Marks 3years -17 Marks - Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3(three) marks.	20	20
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audit of 4/6 lane highway/Expressway projects. 1 no. -12 Marks - Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 3(three) marks.	15	15
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in preparation of Road Safety Management Plan for Inter Urban Highways. 1 project -3marks - More than one project - 5 marks	5	5
3	Employment with the Firm < 1 year – 0 Marks 1 year – 3 Marks - Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	0
	Total	100	95
	Marks out of 5 (=A/100 x 5)		4.75


 (Prashant N. Pagrut)
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


 (Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO-Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


 (Satish J. Janwe)
 GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

SUMMARY			
Name of the Agency : M/s. K & J Projects Private Limited			
Sl. NO.	Description	Max. Marks as per RFP	Marks Obtained
1	Relevant Experience of firm for the Assignment	35	35.00
2	Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology	5	5.00
3	Experience in use of Technology for road inspection	20	20.00
4	Team Leader	19	17.58
5	Highway Maintenance-cum-Resident Engineer	12	8.52
6	Bridge / Structure Engineer	4	3.56
7	Road Safety Expert	5	4.55
Total		100	94.21


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
 GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO-Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
 GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET			
Relevant Experience of Firm for the Assignment			Total Marks : 35
Name of the Agency : M/s. K & J Projects Private Limited			
Sl. No.	Description	Max Marks	Marks Obtained
1	Year of Establishment of the Firm (In case of JV year of establishment of Lead Member shall be considered) (Min 5 years) • For 5 years - 1.5 marks • More than 5 years - 2 marks	2	2
2	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business (Min 5 Crore) • For >50 Crores - 2 marks • For 20-50 Crores- 1.5 marks • For 10-20 Crores- 1 mark • For 5-10 Crores- 0.5 mark	2	2
3	Numbers of key personnel with the firm more than one year with the firm. • < 4 personnel - 0 marks • 4 to 12 - Linearly varying from 0.25 to 2 • > 12 personnel - 2 marks	2	2
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 2/4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 2/4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years • 2 project 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4 marks Or • 1 project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks • Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks.	5	5
5	In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects • For DPR project length > the length of project for which RFP invited -5 Marks • For DPR project length > two times the length of project for which RFP invited -7.5 Marks • For project length > three times the length of project for which RFP invited - 10 Marks	10	10
6	Experience as Independent Engineer/Authority Engineer/ Supervision Consultant • two construction projects of four/six laning ** of 30% of project length each or one projects of four/six laning ** of 50% project length in last 7 years. 2 construction projects 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each -4marks Or 1 construction project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks •Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5(zero point five) marks extra for Supervision consultancy subject to maximum 2 (two) mark	6	6
7	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFOT/OMT/O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years • 1 project - 6 marks • Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	8	8
Total		35	35


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
 GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
 GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-

19

EVALUATION SHEET				
Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology				Total Marks : 5
Name of the Agency : M/s. K & J Projects Private Limited				
Sl. No.	Description	Max Marks	Marks Obtained	
1	Site Appreciation (i) Average 0.50 (ii) Good 0.75 (iii) Very Good 1.00	1	1	
2	Quality of Approach and Methodology (Review of scope of work and design review, construction supervision methodology, contract management approach, safety review/audit and O&M stage, initial view on project plan including key challenges envisaged and potential solutions to be judged). € (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00	2	2	
3	Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00	2	2	
Total		5	5.00	


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
 GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO-Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
 GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET				Total Marks : 20	
Experience in use of technology for road inspection					
Name of the Agency : M/s. K & J Projects Private Limited				Max Marks	Marks Obtained
Sl. No.	Particulars	Own Equipment			
1	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection				
	Own equipment / MOU with Associate	3		6	6
	1-2 projects	1			
	3-5 projects	2			
2	> 5 projects	3			
	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement				
	Own equipment	1		3	3
	1-3 projects	1			
3	> 3 projects	2			
	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit (MBIU) or better technology for bridges inspection				
	Own equipment	2		4	4
	1-3 projects	1			
4	> 3 projects	2			
	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology				
	Own equipment	2		4	4
	1-3 projects	1			
5	> 3 projects	2			
	Experience in ATCC				
	Own equipment	1		3	3
	1-3 projects	1			
				20	20.00

(Signature)
23/7/24
Prashant N. Pagrut
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee

(Signature)
23/07/2021
(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee

(Signature)
23/07/2021
Satish J. Janwe
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairman of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET				
Name of the Agency : M/s. K & J Projects Private Limited		Name of the Team Leader : Rajesh A Hardas		Age : 60; 18-05-1961
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks Obtained	
1	General Qualification • Graduate in Civil Engineering -21marks • Post-Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering/ any other specialized stream of civil engineering . - 04 marks.	25	25	
2	Adequacy for the project Professional Experience in Highway Projects: Total Highway Professional Experience • < 10 years -0 • 10 years -22 • Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	70	67.5	
i)	Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M of completed 4/6 lane highway sections • < 3 years -0 Marks • 3 years -30 Marks • Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks. Experience in similar capacity* in Highway Development Projects taken up under PPP • 1 projects - 4 marks • add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks	30	30	
ii)	Employment with the Firm • < 1 year -0 • 1 year -3 • Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	35	32.5	
iii)		5	5	
3		5	0	
Total		100	92.5	
Marks out of 19 (=A/100 x 19)			17.58	


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET

Name of the Agency : M/s. K & J Projects Private Limited			
Name of the Highway Maintenance-cum-Resident Engineer : Ashok Dinkar Karajgaonkar			Age : 61, 06.10.1959
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks Obtained
1	General Qualification - Graduate in Civil Engineering- 21 marks - Post Graduation in Highway Engg. - 04 marks	25	21
2	Adequacy for the project	70	50
	Professional Experience		
i)	Experience in Highway works (inspection/ design/construction/maintenance) < 7 years -0 Marks 7years -22 Marks - Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	30
ii)	Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature < 3 years -0 3 years -12 - Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	15	0
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/ Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/ Expressways 1 project -20 Marks - Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.	25	20
3	Employment with the Firm < 1 year -0 Marks 1 year -3 Marks - Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	0
Total		100	71
Marks out of 12 (=A/100 x 12)			8.52


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
 GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO-Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
 GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee

**Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis
in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19**

EVALUATION SHEET				
Name of the Agency : M/s. K & J Projects Private Limited				
Name of the Bridge/Structural Engineer : Bijay Prakash				
S. N.	General Qualification	Description	Max. Marks	Age : 54, 10.08.1966 Marks Obtained
1	i) Graduate in Civil Engineering ii) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	- 21 marks - 04 marks.	25	21
2	Adequacy for the project		70	68
	Professional Experience			
i)	Total Professional Experience • < 7 years -0 Marks • 7years -22 Marks • Add two mark extra for each additional completed year subject to maximum 8(eight) marks.		30	30
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation • < 3 years -0 Marks • 3 years -16 Marks • Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		20	20
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation of 4/6 lane highway/expressway or similar project • 1 Project -16 Marks • Add1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) mark		20	18
3	Employment with the Firm • < 1 year -0 marks • 1 year -3 Marks • Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks		5	0
	Total		100	89
	Marks out of 4 (=A/100 x 4)			3.56


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

EVALUATION SHEET				
Name of the Agency : M/s. K & J Projects Private Limited				
Name of the Road Safety Expert : Pradeep Agrawal				
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Age : 62, 01.06.1959	Marks Obtained
1	General Qualification - Graduate in Civil Engineering - 21 marks - Post-Graduation in Traffic/Transportation /Safety Engineering- 04 marks	25		21
2	Adequacy for the project	70		70
	Professional Experience			
i)	Total Professional Experience < 7years -0 Marks 7years -22 Marks - Add two marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30		30
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Works of Major Highway Projects (4/6 laning Projects) < 3years -0 Marks 3years -17 Marks - Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3(three) marks.	20		20
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audit of 4/6 lane highway/Expressway projects. 1 no. -12 Marks - Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 3(three) marks.	15		15
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in preparation of Road Safety Management Plan for Inter Urban Highways. 1 project -3marks - More than one project - 5 marks	5		5
3	Employment with the Firm < 1 year – 0 Marks 1 year – 3 Marks - Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5		0
	Total	100		91
	Marks out of 5 (=A/100 x 5)			4.55

Shyam Sunder Kumar
(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

SUMMARY			
Name of the Agency : M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd.			
Sl. NO.	Description	Max. Marks as per RFP	Marks Obtained
1	Relevant Experience of firm for the Assignment	35	25.00
2	Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology	5	5.00
3	Experience in use of Technology for road inspection	20	19.00
4	Team Leader	19	16.82
5	Highway Maintenance-cum-Resident Engineer	12	10.92
6	Bridge / Structure Engineer	4	3.96
7	Road Safety Expert	5	3.30
	Total	100	84.00


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
 GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO-Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
 GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET			
Relevant Experience of Firm for the Assignment			Total Marks : 35
Name of the Agency : M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd.			
Sl. No.	Description	Max Marks	Marks Obtained
1	Year of Establishment of the Firm (In case of JV year of establishment of Lead Member shall be considered) (Min 5 years) • For 5 years - 1.5 marks • More than 5 years - 2 marks	2	2
2	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business (Min 5 Crore) • For >50 Crores - 2 marks • For 20-50 Crores- 1.5 marks • For 10-20 Crores- 1 mark • For 5-10 Crores- 0.5 mark	2	1.5
3	Numbers of key personnel with the firm more than one year with the firm. • < 4 personnel - 0 marks • 4 to 12 - Linearly varying from 0.25 to 2 • > 12 personnel - 2 marks	2	2
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 2/4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 2/4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years • 2 project 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4 marks Or • 1 project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks • Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks.	5	5
5	In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects • For DPR project length > the length of project for which RFP invited -5 Marks • For DPR project length > two times the length of project for which RFP invited -7.5 Marks • For project length > three times the length of project for which RFP invited - 10 Marks	10	10
6	Experience as Independent Engineer/Authority Engineer/ Supervision Consultant • two construction projects of four/six laning ** of 30% of project length each or one projects of four/six laning ** of 50% project length in last 7 years. 2 construction projects 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each -4marks Or 1 construction project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks •Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer/ supervision consultancy subject to maximum 2 (two) mark	6	4.5
7	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFOT/OMT/O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years • 1 project - 6 marks • Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	8	0
Total		35	25


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET

Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology

Total Marks : 5

Name of the Agency : M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd.

Sl. No.	Description	Max Marks	Marks Obtained
1	Site Appreciation (i) Average 0.50 (ii) Good 0.75 (iii) Very Good 1.00	1	1
2	Quality of Approach and Methodology (Review of scope of work and design review, construction supervision methodology, contract management approach, safety review/audit and O&M stage, initial view on project plan including key challenges envisaged and potential solutions to be judged). € (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00	2	2
3	Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00	2	2
	Total	5	5.00


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET					Total Marks : 20
Experience in use of technology for road inspection					
Name of the Agency : M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd.					
Sl. No.	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection	Own Equipment	Max Marks	Marks Obtained	
1	Particulars	3	6	6	
	Own equipment / MOU with Associate	1			
	1-2 projects	2			
	3-5 projects	3			
2	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement	3	3	3	
	Particulars	1			
	Own equipment/MOU with Associate	1			
	1-3 projects	2			
3	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit (MBIU) or better technology for bridges inspection	4	4	4	
	Particulars	2			
	Own equipment/MOU with Associate	1			
	1-3 projects	2			
4	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology	4	4	4	
	Particulars	2			
	Own equipment/MOU with Associate	1			
	1-3 projects	2			
5	Experience in ATCC	3	3	2	
	Particulars	1			
	Own equipment/MOU with Associate	1			
	1-3 projects	2			
			20	19.00	


Prashant N. Pagrut
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
 GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO-Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


Satish J. Janwe
 GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
 Chairman of the Committee

**Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000)
Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra-Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19**

EVALUATION SHEET				
Name of the Agency : M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd.		Name of the Team Leader : Raja Mukharjee		Age : 50; 02-06-1971
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks Obtained	
1	General Qualification	25	21	
	• Graduate in Civil Engineering -21marks • Post-Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering/ any other specialized stream of civil engineering . - 04 marks.	25	21	
2	Adequacy for the project	70	67.5	
	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:			
	Total Highway Professional Experience			
i)	• < 10 years -0 • 10 years -22 • Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	30	
ii)	Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M of completed 4/6 lane highway sections • < 3 years -0 Marks • 3 years -30 Marks • Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks. Experience in similar capacity* in Highway Development Projects taken up under PPP	35	32.5	
iii)	• 1 projects - 4 marks • add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks Employment with the Firm	5	5	
3	• < 1 year -0 • 1 year -3 • Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	0	
Total		100	88.5	
Marks out of 19 (=A/100 x 19)			16.82	


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET

Name of the Agency : M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd.

Name of the Highway Maintenance-cum-Resident Engineer : Sureah Kumar Samal			Age : 54; 22-06-1966
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks Obtained
1	General Qualification	25	21
	• Graduate in Civil Engineering- 21 marks		
	• Post Graduation in Highway Engg.- 04 marks	25	21
2	Adequacy for the project	70	70
	Professional Experience		
	Experience in Highway works (inspection/ design/construction/maintenance)		
i)	• < 7 years -0 Marks • 7 years -22 Marks • Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	30
	Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature		
ii)	• < 3 years -0 • 3 years -12 • Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	15	15
	Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/ Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/ Expressways		
iii)	• 1 project -20 Marks • Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.	25	25
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0
	• < 1 year -0 Marks • 1 year -3 Marks • Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks		
	Total	100	91
	Marks out of 12 (=A/100 x 12)		10.92


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET

Name of the Agency : M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd.

Name of the Bridge/Structural Engineer : Lakshmi Narayan G K

Age : 32; 04-12-1988

S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks Obtained
1 General Qualification			
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering - 21 marks	25	25
ii)	Post Graduation in Structural Engineering - 04 marks.	70	70
2 Adequacy for the project			
Professional Experience			
Total Professional Experience			
• < 7 years -0 Marks			
• 7years -22 Marks			
• Add two mark extra for each additional completed year subject to maximum 8(eight) marks.			
i)		30	30
Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation			
• < 3 years -0 Marks			
• 3 years -16 marks			
• Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.			
ii)		20	20
Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation of 4/6 lane highway/expressway or similar project.			
• 1 Project -16 Marks			
• Add1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) mark			
iii)		20	20
Employment with the Firm			
• < 1 year -0 marks			
• 1 year -3 Marks			
• Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks			
3		5	4
Total		100	99
Marks out of 4 (=A/100 x 4)			3.96


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO-Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra-Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET				
Name of the Agency : M/s. Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd.		Name of the Road Safety Expert : Vikram Ravindra Jadhav		Age : 30; 08-06-1991
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks Obtained	
1	General Qualification • Graduate in Civil Engineering - 21 marks • Post-Graduation in Traffic/Transportation /Safety Engineering- 04 marks	25	21	
2	Adequacy for the project	70	40	
	Professional Experience			
i)	Total Professional Experience • < 7years -0 Marks • 7years -22 Marks • Add two marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	0	
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Works of Major Highway Projects (4/6 laning Projects) • < 3years -0 Marks • 3years -17 Marks • Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3(three) marks.	20.	20	
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audit of 4/6 lane highway/Expressway projects. • 1 no. -12 Marks • Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 3(three) marks.	15	15	
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in preparation of Road Safety Management Plan for Inter Urban Highways. • 1 project -3marks • More than one project - 5 marks	5	5	
3	Employment with the Firm • < 1 year – 0 Marks • 1 year – 3 Marks • Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	5	
Total		100	66	
Marks out of 5 (=A/100 x 5)			3.30	

(Signature)
23/7/24

(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee

(Signature)
13/7/24

(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee

(Signature)
23/07/2024

(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee

(Signature)
23/07/2024

(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

SUMMARY			
Name of the Agency : M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s. Highways Engineering Consultant			
Sl. NO.	Description	Max. Marks as per RFP	Marks Obtained
1	Relevant Experience of firm for the Assignment	35	35.00
2	Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology	5	5.00
3	Experience in use of Technology for road inspection	20	20.00
4	Team Leader	19	17.58
5	Highway Maintenance-cum-Resident Engineer	12	10.92
6	Bridge / Structure Engineer	4	3.84
7	Road Safety Expert	5	4.80
	Total	100	97.14


(Prashant N. Pagnut)
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
 GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO-Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
 GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET				Total Marks : 35
Relevant Experience of Firm for the Assignment				
Name of the Agency : M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s. Highways Engineering Consultant				
Sl. No.	Description	Max Marks	Marks Obtained	
1	Year of Establishment of the Firm (In case of JV year of establishment of Lead Member shall be considered) (Min 5 years) • For 5 years - 1.5 marks • More than 5 years - 2 marks	2	2	
2	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business (Min 5 Crore) • For >50 Crores - 2 marks • For 20-50 Crores- 1.5 marks • For 10-20 Crores- 1 mark • For 5-10 Crores- 0.5 mark	2	2	
3	Numbers of key personnel with the firm more than one year with the firm. • < 4 personnel - 0 marks • 4 to 12 - Linearly varying from 0.25 to 2 • > 12 personnel - 2 marks	2	2	
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 2/4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 2/4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years • 2 project 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4 marks Or • 1 project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks • Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks.	5	5	
5	In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects • For DPR project length > the length of project for which RFP invited -5 Marks • For DPR project length > two times the length of project for which RFP invited -7.5 Marks • For project length > three times the length of project for which RFP invited - 10 Marks	10	10	
6	Experience as Independent Engineer/Authority Engineer/ Supervision Consultant • two construction projects of four/six laning ** of 30% of project length each or one projects of four/six laning ** of 50% project length in last 7 years. 2 construction projects 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each -4marks Or 1 construction project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks • Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 2 (two) mark	6	6	
7	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFOT/OMT/O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years • 1 project - 6 marks • Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	8	8	
Total		35	35	


(Prashant N. Pagrut)
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee


(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO-Nagpur
 Member of the Committee


(Satish J. Janwe)
 GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-

19

EVALUATION SHEET				
Adequacy of the Proposed Approach and Methodology			Total Marks : 5	
Name of the Agency : M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s. Highways Engineering Consultant			Marks Obtained	
Sl. No.	Description	Max Marks		
1	Site Appreciation (i) Average 0.50 (ii) Good 0.75 (iii) Very Good 1.00	1	1	
2	Quality of Approach and Methodology (Review of scope of work and design review, construction supervision methodology, contract management approach, safety review/audit and O&M stage, initial view on project plan including key challenges envisaged and potential solutions to be judged). € (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00	2	2	
3	Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00	2	2	
Total		5	5.00	

(Signature)
29/7/24

(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee

(Signature)
23/7/24

(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee

(Signature)
23/6/2024

(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee

(Signature)
23/6/2024

(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET					
Experience in use of technology for road inspection					
Name of the Agency : M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s. Highways Engineering Consultant					
Sl. No.	Particulars	Own Equipment	Max Marks	Marks Obtained	Total Marks : 20
1	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection	Own Equipment	6	6	
	Particulars	3			
	Own equipment / MOU with Associate	1			
	1-2 projects	2			
2	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement	Own Equipment	3	3	
	Particulars	1			
	Own equipment/MOU with Associate	1			
	1-3 projects	2			
3	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit (MBIU) or better technology for bridges inspection	Own Equipment	4	4	
	Particulars	2			
	Own equipment/MOU with Associate	1			
	1-3 projects	2			
4	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology	Own Equipment	4	4	
	Particulars	2			
	Own equipment/MOU with Associate	1			
	1-3 projects	2			
5	Experience in ATCC	Own Equipment	3	3	20.00
	Particulars	1			
	Own equipment/MOU with Associate	1			
	1-3 projects	2			

Prashant N. Pagrut
29/11/24

Prashant N. Pagrut
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee

Abhijit P. Jichkar
29/11/24

(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee

Shyam Sunder Kumar
28/01/2024

(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee

Satish J. Janwe
28/01/2024

Satish J. Janwe
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairman of the Committee

**Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000)
Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19**

EVALUATION SHEET

Name of the Agency : M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s. Highways Engineering Consultant			Age : 53, 04.08.1967
Name of the Team Leader : Vijay Khare			
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks Obtained
1	General Qualification	25	21
	• Graduate in Civil Engineering -21marks • Post-Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering/ any other specialized stream of civil engineering . - 04 marks.	25	21
2	Adequacy for the project	70	67.5
	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:		
	Total Highway Professional Experience		
i)	• < 10 years -0 • 10 years -22 • Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	30
ii)	• Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M of completed 4/6 lane highway sections • < 3 years -0 Marks • 3 years -30 Marks • Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.	35	32.5
iii)	• Experience in similar capacity* in Highway Development Projects taken up under PPP • 1 projects - 4 marks • add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks	5	5
3	• Employment with the Firm • < 1 year -0 • 1 year -3 • Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	4
Total		100	92.5
Marks out of 19 (=A/100 x 19)			17.58

Prashant N. Pagrut
23/7/21

(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee

Abhijit P. Jichkar
23/7/21

(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee

Shyam Sunder Kumar
23/07/2021

(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee

Satish J. Janwe
23/07/2021

(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET				
Name of the Agency : M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s. Highways Engineering Consultant		Age : 58, 20.07.1962		
Name of the Highway Maintenance-cum-Resident Engineer : L. H. Yogendrappa		Max. Marks	Marks Obtained	
S. N.	Description			
1	General Qualification			
	• Graduate in Civil Engineering- 21 marks	25	21	
	• Post Graduation in Highway Engg.- 04 marks	25	21	
2	Adequacy for the project	70	70	
	Professional Experience			
	Experience in Highway works (inspection/ design/construction/maintenance)			
i)	• < 7 years -0 Marks • 7years -22 Marks • Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	30	
ii)	Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature • < 3 years -0 • 3 years -12 • Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	15	15	
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/ Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/ Expressways • 1 project -20 Marks • Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.	25	25	
3	Employment with the Firm • < 1 year -0 Marks • 1 year -3 Marks • Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	0	
Total		100	91	
Marks out of 12 (=A/100 x 12)			10.92	



(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
 Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
 RO-Nagpur
 Member of the Committee



(Satish J. Janwe)
 GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
 Chairperson of the Committee



(Prashant N. Pagrut)
 GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
 Member Secretary of the Committee



(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
 GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
 Member of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET				
Name of the Agency : M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s. Highways Engineering Consultant				
Name of the Bridge/Structural Engineer : P. S. Ravikumar			Age : 54, 01.02.1967	
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks Obtained	
1	General Qualification I) Graduate in Civil Engineering II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	25	21	
2	Adequacy for the project Professional Experience Total Professional Experience • < 7 years -0 Marks • 7 years -22 Marks • Add two mark extra for each additional completed year subject to maximum 8(eight) marks.	70	30	
i)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation • < 3 years -0 Marks • 3 years -16 marks • Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	20	20	
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation of 4/6 lane highway/expressway or similar project. • 1 Project -16 Marks • Add1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) mark	20	5	
3	Employment with the Firm • < 1 year -0 marks • 1 year -3 Marks • Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	100	96	
Total Marks out of 4 (=A/100 x 4)			3.84	

Prashant N. Pagrut
23/7/21

(Prashant N. Pagrut)
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee

Abhijit P. Jichkar
23/7/21

(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee

Shyam Sunder Kumar
23/7/21

(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee

Satish J. Janwe
23/7/21

(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee

Independent Engineer services during Operation & Maintenance Period for 4-laned from Nagpur – Kondhali (Km.9.200 to Km.50.000) Section of NH-53 (Old NH-6) on BOT basis in the State of Maharashtra–Consultancy Package No.IE-O&M/NH-361/NAG-19

EVALUATION SHEET

Name of the Agency : M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s. Highways Engineering Consultant			Age : 45.02.06.1976
Name of the Road Safety Expert : Sanjay Sharma			Marks Obtained
S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	
1	General Qualification	25	21
	• Graduate in Civil Engineering - 21 marks		
	• Post-Graduation in Traffic/Transportation /Safety Engineering- 04 marks	25	21
2	Adequacy for the project	70	70
	Professional Experience		
	Total Professional Experience		
i)	• < 7years -0 Marks	30	30
	• 7years -22 Marks		
	• Add two marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.		
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Works of Major Highway Projects (4/6 laning Projects)	20	20
	• < 3years -0 Marks		
	• 3years -17 Marks		
	• Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3(three) marks.		
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audit of 4/6 lane highway/Expressway projects.	15	15
	• 1 no. -12 Marks		
	• Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 3(three) marks.		
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in preparation of Road Safety Management Plan for Inter Urban Highways.	5	5
	• 1 project -3marks		
	• More than one project - 5 marks		
	Employment with the Firm	5	5
	• < 1 year - 0 Marks		
	• 1 year - 0 Marks		
	• 1 year - 0 Marks		
	• Add 0.0 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks		
	Total	100	96
	Marks out of 5 (=A/100 x 5)		4.80

Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by SATISH JAGANNATH JANWE
Date: 2021.07.26 19:20:24 IST
Location: eProcurement System for Central PSUs

22/7/21

Prashant N. Pagrut
GM (Tech.), RO Nagpur
Member Secretary of the Committee

22/7/21

(Abhijit P. Jichkar)
GM (Tech.), PD PIU-2 Nagpur
Member of the Committee

22/10/2021

(Shyam Sunder Kumar)
Asst. Manager, Head F&A Unit,
RO-Nagpur
Member of the Committee

23/10/2021

(Satish J. Janwe)
GM (Tech), RO Nagpur
Chairperson of the Committee