



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण
(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय)
National Highways Authority of India
(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways)
जी-5 एवं 6, सेक्टर-10, द्वारका, नई दिल्ली-110075
G-5 & 6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110075

दूरभाष / Phone : 91-11-25074100/25074200
फैक्स / Fax : 91-11-25093507 / 25093514

NHAI/BM/Raipur-Vishakhapatnam/OD/IE/Pkg-I/2021

Dated: 06.08.2021

To

All Bidders (As per list enclosed)

Sub: Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design Chainage 124+611 Dhanara (Odisha/Chhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kaliagura in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I).- **Technical Evaluation of Bids - Reg.**

Ref: (i) Bids submitted on 17.05.2021 for the above mentioned work.

Dear Sir,

This is with reference to the bids submitted on 17.05.2021 for the subject proposal. The results with respect to Technical Evaluation as approved by the Competent Authority is as under:

A. First Stage Technical Evaluation (Experience of the applicants in completed projects in last seven years):-

2.1 It is noted that NHAI vide order No. NHAI/Tech/UP(E) /VNS/NH56/Quality/2021/40 dated 10.06.2021 has declared 'M/s MSV International Inc' as Non-Performer and prohibited the firm from participating in the on-going and future bids till the time the compliance is done by the firm. In view of the above order, the committee declared the bidder M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s Vaishnavi Infratech Services Private Limited as Non-Responsive.

2.2 The bidder M/s Highway Engineering Consultant, has failed to meet the minimum eligibility criteria "The firm should have minimum experience of Project Supervision/ Independent Engineer/ Consultant of 2/4/6- laning/ Bridge project of aggregate length equal to 373 km or more of similar category" as per the clause 15A of the Section 'Information to Consultants' of RFP. Hence, the bidder has been declared non-responsive and not considered for second stage evaluation of technical proposals.

2.3 M/s Yongma Engineering Co Ltd, the other partner of the JV Bidder M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s Yongma Engineering Co Ltd and in association with M/s Kaius Consulting Private Limited. has failed to meet the minimum eligibility requirement - "The firm should have minimum experience of preparation of

detailed Project Report/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report of 2/4/6-laning project of aggregate length equal to 249 km or more of similar category for which RFP is invited., in case of JV, the other JV partner should fulfil at least 40% (99.6 km) of eligibility criteria” as per clause 15 of ‘Information to Consultants’ section of the RFP. Hence, the bidder **has been considered non-responsive** and not considered for second stage evaluation of technical proposals.

In addition, the JV bidder M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s Yongma Engineering Co Ltd and in association with M/s Kaius Consulting Private Limited has also failed in Technical Capacity as their remaining technical capacity came out to be -7.52.

2.4 M/s ISAN Corporation, the other partner of the JV Bidder M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation has failed to meet the minimum eligibility requirement - “The firm should have minimum experience of preparation of detailed Project Report/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report of 2/4/6-laning project of aggregate length equal to 249 km or more of similar category for which RFP is invited., in case of JV, the other JV partner should fulfil at least 40% (99.6 km) of eligibility criteria” as per clause 15 of ‘Information to Consultants’ section of the RFP. Hence, the bidder **has been considered non-responsive** and not considered for second stage evaluation of technical proposals

B. Summary of the Second Stage Technical Evaluation as per RFP is as under:-

a) Technically Non-Responsive Bidders

S. No.	Name of Firm	Result of Stage-I Evaluation	Remarks
1	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd.	Non-Responsive	Bidder declared Non-Performing Entity by NHAI
2	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant	Non-Responsive	The bidder failed in minimum eligibility criteria
3	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd and in association with M/s Kaius Consulting Private Limited	Non-Responsive	JV partner failed in minimum eligibility criteria
4	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation	Non-Responsive	JV partner failed in minimum eligibility criteria

b) Technically Responsive Bidders

S. No.	Name of Firm	Firm Score	Technology Score	CV Score	Final Technical Score
	Maximum Marks	40.00	20.00	40.00	100.00
1	M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in association with M/s ROTRANS INFRA PROJECTS PRIVATE LIMITED	38.00	20.00	36.14	94.14
2	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd	39.50	20.00	37.57	97.07
3	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED	35.50	19.00	36.28	90.78
4	M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited and M/s Solverra Technologies Pvt Ltd	32.00	16.50	37.02	85.52

4. The detailed evaluation sheet for the responsive Bidders is enclosed herewith. Bidders are given opportunity to respond by 13.08.2021, in case of any objection and to submit the requisite details/documents within this period.

Yours sincerely,


(Ravinder)
General Manager (Tech)
Bharatmala

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design Chainage 124+611 Dhanara (Odisha/Chhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kaliagura in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)								
Minimum Eligibility Criteria for the Firm								
Applicant	Name of the firm	Sole/JV/ Association	Preparation of DPR (NH/SH/Equivalent)	Project Supervision/IC (NH/SH/Equivalent)		Annual Turnover	Technical Capacity	ELIGIBLE OR NOT ELIGIBLE
			The firm should have minimum experience of preparation of detailed Project Report/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report of 2/4/6-laning project of aggregate length equal to 249 km or more of similar category for which RFP is invited.	The firm should have minimum experience of Project Supervision/IndependentEngineer/Consultant of 2/4/6-laning/Bridge project of aggregate length equal to 373 km or more of similar category for which RFP is invited.	Firm/Lead Partner should also have experience of Project Supervision / IC of at least one project of Similar Category of 2/4/6 laning of length equal to 48 km	Annual turnover (average of last 5 years of the firm from consultancy business) OR in each of the preceding two years should be equal to or more than Rs. 52.69 crore		
1/8	M/s Highway Engineering Consultants	Sole	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Not Eligible
2/8	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited	Lead	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Not Eligible
		Other	No	Yes	--	Yes		
3/8	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.	Association	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Eligible
4/8	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd	Association	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Eligible
5/8	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	Association	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Eligible
6/8	M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited	Association	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Eligible
7/8	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation	Lead	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Not Eligible
		Other	No	Yes	--	Yes		
8/8	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s DN Consultant & Services Pvt. Ltd.	Association	Bidder declared Non-Performing Entity by NHAI vide order No. NHAI/Tech/UP(E) /VNS/NH56/Quality/2021/40 dated 10.06.2021					Not Eligible

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design Chainage 124+611 Dhanara (Odisha/Chhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kalligura in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)																			
Technical Capacity																			
S. No.	Name of the Consultant firm/entity	Share	Sole/JV/ Association	Annual Average Turnover in the last 3 years (1)	Personnel with Form 26AS (2)	Max. NHAI Projects at a time (3)			Max. NHAI Projects in current fin. year (4)			Ongoing/awarded projects (5)			Projects awarded in CFY (6)			Remaining Capacity of IE/AE/CS (7)	Eligible
						Total	DPR	AE/IE /CS	Total	DPR	AE/IE /CS	Total	DPR	AE/IE /CS	Total	DPR	AE/IE /CS		
1/8	M/s Highway Engineering Consultants		Sole	65.75	66	40	40	30	10	10	8	8.40	5.05	3.35	1.25	0.00	1.25	6.75	Yes
2/8	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited	0.6	Lead Member	49.41	35	12	12	9	3	3	2	19.75	2.75	17.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	-8.00	No
		0.4	Other Member	86.20	8	0	0	0	0	0	0	3.30	0.00	3.30	0.00	0.00	0.00	-3.30	No
			JV	64.13	24.20	6	6	4	2	2	1	13.17	1.65	11.52	0.00	0.00	0.00	-7.52	No
3/8	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.		Association	92.19	72	40	40	30	10	10	8	29.00	3.00	26.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	4.00	Yes
4/8	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd		Association	330.31	86	40	40	30	10	10	8	14.00	6.00	8.00	3.00	0.00	3.00	5.00	Yes
5/8	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Pvt. Ltd.		Association	283.70	67	40	40	30	10	10	8	3.34	0	3.34	0.00	0	0	8.00	Yes
6/8	M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited		Association	119.22	43	25	25	18	6	6	4	5.27	0	5.27	0.00	0	0	4.00	Yes
7/8	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation	0.6	Lead Member	42.86	37	12	12	9	3	3	2	6.10	0	6.1	0.00	0	0	2.00	Yes
		0.4	Other Member	797.89	62	40	40	30	10	10	8	0.00	0	0	0.00	0	0	8.00	Yes
			JV	344.87	47.00	25	25	18	6	6	4	3.66	0.00	3.66	0.00	0.00	0.00	4.00	Yes
8/8	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s DN Consultant & Services Pvt. Ltd.		Association	0.00	89	6	6	4	2	2	1	17.00	5	12	0.00	0	0	-11.00	No

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design Chainage 124+611 Dhanara (Odisha/Chhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kaliagura in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)											
Applicant	Name of Firm	Relevant experience for the assignment		Experience in use of technology for road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Total		Responsive/Non-Responsive	Rank
		Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed		
			40.00		20.00		40.00		100		
1/8	M/s Highway Engineering Consultants	0.00	40.00	0.00	20.00	0.00	37.36	0.00	97.36	Non-Responsive	5.00
2/8	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited	0.00	40.00	0.00	20.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	60.00	Non-Responsive	5.00
3/8	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.	38.00	40.00	20.00	20.00	36.14	36.56	94.14	96.56	Responsive	2.00
4/8	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd	39.50	40.00	20.00	20.00	37.57	37.81	97.07	97.81	Responsive	1.00
5/8	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	35.50	40.00	19.00	20.00	36.28	37.36	90.78	97.36	Responsive	3.00
6/8	M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited	32.00	38.00	16.50	19.50	37.02	37.59	85.52	95.09	Responsive	4.00
7/8	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation	0.00	40.00	0.00	20.00	0.00	37.24	0.00	97.24	Non-Responsive	5.00
8/8	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s DN Consultant & Services Pvt. Ltd.	0.00	40.00	0.00	20.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	60.00	Non-Responsive	5.00

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design Chainage 124+611 Dhanara (Odisha)/C

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	1/8		2/8		3/8		4/8	
			M/s Highway Engineering Consultants		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited		M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.		M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd	
			Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed
1	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years) from consultancy business in each of the preceding two years	2	2			2	2	2	2	2
	< 2% of TPC (Less than Rs. 52.69 crore) – 0 marks									
	2-<3% of TPC (Rs. 52.69 to Rs. 79.03 crore)– 1.5 marks									
	3-<4% of TPC (Rs. 79.03 crore to Rs. 105.38)– 1.75 marks									
	>=4% of TPC (More than Rs. 105.38 crore)– 2 marks									
2	Number of Highway Professionals (as defined in RFP) with the firm in with more than one year with the firm.	10	10			10	10	10	10	10
	<10 personnel -0 marks									
	10 to 20 - 8 Marks									
	> 20 but <30 -9 marks									
	> 30 personnel - 10 marks									
3	Experience as Independent Engineer/Construction Supervision in number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning**of length (40% of Project Length =48 km) or more in last 7 Years.	12	12			12	12	12	12	12
	1 project - 9 marks Add 1 (one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (zero point two five) mark extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 3 (one point five) marks.									
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report preparation for Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length (40% of project length i.e. 48 km) or more in last 7 years.	6	6			6	6	6	5.5	6
	1 project – 4 marks Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 mark.									
5	In hand DPRs of NHAI's Highway/Bridge/Tunnel Projects (Presently Under Progress) <2 - 0 Marks 2-5 - 4 Marks >5 - 6 Marks	6	6			6	4	6	6	6
6	Experience in Construction Supervision/DPR/Design Review of major structures having length of more than 500 metre in last 7 years.	4	4			4	4	4	4	4
	1 project - 2.0 marks Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2.0 marks.									
	Total	40	0.00	40	0	40	38	40	39.5	40

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for SuperChhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kaliagura in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	5/8		6/8		7/8		8/8	
			M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s DN Consultant & Services Pvt. Ltd.	
			Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed
1	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years) from consultancy business in each of the preceding two years	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	< 2% of TPC (Less than Rs. 52.69 crore) – 0 marks									
	2-<3% of TPC (Rs. 52.69 to Rs. 79.03 crore)– 1.5 marks									
	3-<4% of TPC (Rs. 79.03 crore to Rs. 105.38)– 1.75 marks									
	>=4% of TPC (More than Rs. 105.38 crore)– 2 marks									
2	Number of Highway Professionals (as defined in RFP) with the firm in with more than one year with the firm.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
	<10 personnel -0 marks									
	10 to 20 - 8 Marks									
	> 20 but <30 -9 marks									
	> 30 personnel - 10 marks									
3	Experience as Independent Engineer/Construction Supervision in number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning**of length (40% of Project Length =48 km) or more in last 7 Years.	12	9.5	12	12	12	12	12	Bidder declared Non-Performing Entity by NHAI	12
	1 project - 9 marks Add 1 (one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (zero point two five) mark extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 3 (one point five) marks.									
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report preparation for Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length (40% of project length i.e. 48 km) or more in last 7 years.	6	6	6	5	6	6	6	6	6
	1 project – 4 marks Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 mark.									
5	In hand DPRs of NHAI's Highway/Bridge/Tunnel Projects (Presently Under Progress) <2 - 0 Marks 2-5 - 4 Marks >5 - 6 Marks	6	4	6	0	4	6	6	6	6
6	Experience in Construction Supervision/DPR/Design Review of major structures having length of more than 500 metre in last 7 years.	4	4	4	3	4	4	4	4	4
	1 project - 2.0 marks Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2.0 marks.									
	Total	40	35.5	40	32	38	0	40	0	40

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design Chainage 124+6										
Evaluation sheet for assessment of experience in use of technology for road			1/8		2/8		3/8		4/8	
S.No.	Description	Maximum Point	M/s Highway Engineering Consultants		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited		M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.		M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd	
			Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed
1	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection		Firm failed in minimum eligibility		JV Partner failed in minimum eligibility					
1.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2		2		2	2	2	2	2
1.2	(a) Experience of 1 -2 projects - 1 (b) Experience of 3-5 projects - 2 (c) Experience of > 5 projects - 3	3		3		3	3	3	3	3
2	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement									
2.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2		2		2	2	2	2	2
2.2	(a) Experience of 1 -3 projects - 1 (b) Experience >3 projects - 2	2		2		2	2	2	2	2
3	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit or better technology for Bridges inspection									
3.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2		2		2	2	2	2	2
3.2	(a) Experience of 1 -3 projects - 1 (b) Experience >3 projects - 2	2		2		2	2	2	2	2
4	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology									
4.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2		2		2	2	2	2	2
4.2	(a) Experience of 1 -3 projects - 1 (b) Experience >3 projects - 2	2		2		2	2	2	2	2
5	Experience in Automatic Traffic Counter cum Classifier (ATCC)									
5.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2		2		2	2	2	2	2
5.2	(a) Experience of 1 -3 projects - 0.5 (b) Experience >3 projects - 1	1		1		1	1	1	1	1
Total		20	0	20	0	20	20	20	20	20

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Di11 Dhanara (Odisha/Chhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kaliagura in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)										
Evaluation sheet for assessment of experience in use of technology for road			5/8		6/8		7/8		8/8	
S.No.	Description	Maximum Point	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s DN Consultant & Services Pvt. Ltd.	
			Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed
1	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection						JV Partner failed in minimum eligibility		Bidder declared Non-Performing Entity by NHAI	
1.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2		2		2
1.2	(a) Experience of 1 -2 projects - 1 (b) Experience of 3-5 projects - 2 (c) Experience of > 5 projects - 3	3	3	3	1	3		3		3
2	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement									
2.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2		2		2
2.2	(a) Experience of 1 -3 projects - 1 (b) Experience >3 projects - 2	2	2	2	2	2		2		2
3	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit or better technology for Bridges inspection									
3.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2		2		2
3.2	(a) Experience of 1 -3 projects - 1 (b) Experience >3 projects - 2	2	2	2	1	2		2		2
4	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology									
4.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2		2		2
4.2	(a) Experience of 1 -3 projects - 1 (b) Experience >3 projects - 2	2	1	2	2	2		2		2
5	Experience in Automatic Traffic Counter cum Classifier (ATCC)									
5.1	Own Equipment/ Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	2	2	2	2	2		2		2
5.2	(a) Experience of 1 -3 projects - 0.5 (b) Experience >3 projects - 1	1	1	1	0.5	0.5		1		1
Total		20	19	20	16.5	19.5	0	20	0	20

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design Chainage 12																		
Summary of Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment																		
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	1/8				2/8				3/8				4/8			
			M/s Highway Engineering Consultants				M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited				M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.				M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd			
			Name		Marks		Name		Marks		Name		Marks		Name		Marks	
			Assessed	Claimed		Assessed	Claimed		Assessed	Claimed		#REF!	Assessed	Claimed				
1	Team Leader Cum Senior Bridge Engineer	12	Mahendra Kumar Jain		95.00 11.40	Firm failed in minimum eligibility	Bijaya Kumar Sahu		0.00 ---		Raman Manohar	89.00 10.68	91.00 10.92	Raju Mathur	96.00 11.52	97.00 11.64		
2	Resident cum Highway Engineer-I	3	Anil Kumar Singh		91.00 2.73		Sanjay Kumar		0.00 ---		Debaprosad Chakrabarty	91.00 2.73	91.00 2.73	Ambuj Ranjan	96.00 2.88	96.00 2.88		
3	Resident cum Highway Engineer-II	3	Bhoopendra Kumar Shrivastava		91.00 2.73		Raj Kumar Jain		0.00 ---		BASANT KUMAR SINGH	91.00 2.73	91.00 2.73	Rakesh Kumar	97.00 2.91	97.00 2.91		
4	Bridge/Structural Engineer	6	Rajesh Kumar		95.00 5.70		Genda Lal		0.00 ---		NVD Rao	91.00 5.46	91.00 5.46	sanjay kumar panigrahy	94.00 5.64	94.00 5.64		
5	Senior Pavement Specialist	6	Amit Saxena		91.00 5.46		Sanjay Kumar Gautam		0.00 ---		Rajeeb das	91.00 5.46	91.00 5.46	RAVINDRA SINGH	89.00 5.34	91.00 5.46		
6	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	6	Mohit Mohan Agrawal		95.00 5.70		Naresh Kumar		0.00 ---		G.V. Mohan Rao	88.00 5.28	91.00 5.46	MD. Kazmi Alam	91.00 5.46	91.00 5.46		
7	Road safety Expert	4	Sanjay Kumar Sharma		91.00 3.64		Prabhakar		0.00 ---		SHABANA THABASSUM	95.00 3.80	95.00 3.80	Swapan Baidya	95.50 3.82	95.50 3.82		
	Total	40		0.00	37.36			0.00	0.00			36.14	36.56			37.57	37.81	

!4+611 Dhanara (Odisha/Chhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kaliagura in the state of Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)																				
Summary of Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment																				
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	5/8				6/8				7/8				8/8					
			M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Pvt. Ltd.				M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited				M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation				M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s DN Consultant & Services Pvt. Ltd.					
			Name		Marks		Name		Marks		Name		Marks		Name		Marks			
			Assessed	Claimed		Assessed	Claimed		Assessed	Claimed		Assessed	Claimed		Assessed	Claimed		Assessed	Claimed	
1	Team Leader Cum Senior Bridge Engineer	12	Ajay Kumar Pandey	87.00	10.44	94.00	11.28	Rakesh Arora	92.00	11.04	95.00	11.40	Tatikonda Haribabu	94.00	11.28	SibaPrasad Patnaik	0.00	-		
2	Resident cum Highway Engineer-I	3	Rakesh Kumar	91.00	2.73	91.00	2.73	J. Amar Babu	93.50	2.81	94.50	2.84	Birendra Kumar Singh	95.00	2.85	RAMA SHANKAR JHA	0.00	-		
3	Resident cum Highway Engineer-II	3	srinivas J	91.00	2.73	91.00	2.73	H. S. Ravindranath	91.00	2.73	91.00	2.73	SVS Narayana	95.00	2.85	Deepak Kumar Pradhan	0.00	-		
4	Bridge/Structural Engineer	6	Ravi Sankar	95.00	5.70	95.00	5.70	Mekatoti Suresh Babu	95.00	5.70	95.00	5.70	Braj Bhushan Kumar	95.00	5.70	Alok Shekhar	0.00	-		
5	Senior Pavement Specialist	6	Ajay	87.00	5.22	91.00	5.46	Chaturbhuj Gupta	91.00	5.46	91.00	5.46	Manish Sahay	91.00	5.46	SANGRAM KESHARI RATH	0.00	-		
6	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	6	Suresh Kumar Bathina	91.00	5.46	91.00	5.46	V.Chandra Sekhar Rao	88.00	5.28	91.00	5.46	Anil Kumar Ghosh	91.00	5.46	Sachidanand Sharma	0.00	-		
7	Road safety Expert	4	Prasanth Kalathil	100.00	4.00	100.00	4.00	Pramod Kumar Jain	100.00	4.00	100.00	4.00	Anil Kumar	91.00	3.64	Suraj Kumar Pathak	0.00	-		
	Total	40		36.28		37.36			37.02		37.59			0.00	37.24		0.00		0.00	

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design Cha Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)															
			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.												
3.1	Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer		Names of Firms												
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	1/8		2/8		3/8		4/8						
	Name of the bidder----->>>>>>		M/s Highway Engineering Consultants		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited		M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.		M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd						
			Mahendra Kumar Jain		Bijaya Kumar Sahu		Raman Manohar		Raju Mathur						
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks						
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed					
1	General Qualification	25	Firm failed in minimum eligibility		JV Partner failed in minimum eligibility										
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21									21	21	21	21	
	II) Post-Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering	3									3	0	0	3	3
	III) Degree/Diploma/Certificate in Project Management	1									1	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70													
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Bridge projects < 12years - 0 marks; 12 years - 8 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 2 mks.	10									10	10	10	10	10
ii)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning***) and above) < 5 years - 0 marks; 5 years - 11 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks	15									15	15	15	14	15
iii)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Developemnt Projects (of Length 48 km or more) of similar configuration and above on PPP < 1 Project - 0 marks; 1 Project - 4 marks add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) mark	5									5	5	5	5	5
b)	Experience as eam Leader or similar capacity of Project preparation including design of major highway project (of length 48 km or more) of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning***) and above. <2 Projects-0 marks; 2 projects - 11 marks Add 2 marks for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) marks	15									15	13	15	15	15
c)	Experience in position of Team Leader/Project Manager or similar capacity in Construction Supervision/IC involving length 48km or more of similar configuration (2/4/6** laning) and above < 2 Projects -0 marks; 2 Projects -16 marks Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks.	20									20	20	20	18	18
d)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation and Maintenance of Major Highway (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above). 1 project - 4 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 (one) mark	5	5	5	5	5	5								
3	Employment with the Firm														
	< 1 Year - 0														
	1 Year - 3														
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks														
	Total:	100	-	95.00	-	-	89.00	91.00	96.00	97.00					

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six linage 124+611 Dhanara (Odisha/Chhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kaliagura in the state of

			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.							
3.1	Team Leader Cum Senior Highway Engineer		Names of Firms							
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	5/8		6/8		7/8		8/8	
	Name of the bidder----->>>>>>		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s DN Consultant & Services Pvt. Ltd.	
			Ajay Kumar Pandey		Rakesh Arora		Tatikonda Haribabu		SibaPrasad Patnaik	
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks	
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25								
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	21	21		
	II) Post-Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering	3	0	3	0	3	3	3		
	III) Degree/Diploma/Certificate in Project Management	1	0	0	1	1	0	0		
2	Adequacy for the Project	70								
	i) Total Professional Experience in handling Bridge projects									
	< 12years - 0 marks; 12 years - 8 marks									
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 2 mks.	10	10	10	10	10	10	10		
	ii) Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning***) and above)									
	< 5 years - 0 marks; 5 years - 11 marks									
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks	15	15	15	15	15	15	15		
	iii) Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Developemnt Projects (of Length 48 km or more) of similar configuration and above on PPP									
	< 1 Project - 0 marks; 1 Project - 4 marks									
	add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) mark	5	5	5	5	5	5	5		
	b) Experience as eam Leader or similar capacity of Project preparation including design of major highway project (of length 48 km or more) of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning***) and above.									
	<2 Projects-0 marks; 2 projects - 11 marks									
	Add 2 marks for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) marks	15	13	15	15	15	15	15		
	c) Experience in position of Team Leader/Project Manager or similar capacity in Construction Supervision/IC involving length 48km or more of similar configuration (2/4/6** laning) and above									
	< 2 Projects -0 marks; 2 Projects -16 marks									
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks.	20	18	20	20	20	20	20		
	d) Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation and Maintenance of Major Highway (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).									
	1 project - 4 marks									
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 (one) mark	5	5	5	5	5	5	5		
3	Employment with the Firm									
	< 1 Year - 0									
	1 Year - 3									
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	0	0	0	0	0	0		
	Total:	100	87.00	94.00	92.00	95.00	-	94.00	-	-

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design Cha Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)										
			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.							
3.1	Resident cum Highway Engineer		Names of Firms							
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	1/8		2/8		3/8		4/8	
	Name of the bidder----->>>>>>		M/s Highway Engineering Consultants		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited		M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.		M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd	
			Anil Kumar Singh		Sanjay Kumar		Debaprosad Chakrabarty		Ambuj Ranjan	
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks	
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	Firm failed in minimum eligibility		JV Partner failed in minimum eligibility					
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21								
	II) Post-Graduation in Transportation/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering/geotechnical engineering	4								
2	Adequacy for the Project	70								
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	20								
	< 10years - 0 marks;									
	10 years - 16 marks									
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks.									
ii)	Experience as Resident Engineer /Project Director/ Project Manager/ Superintending Engineer or equivalent/ Executive Engineer or equivalent on construction works/ Independent Engineer Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*** and above)	20								
	< 5 years - 0 marks									
	5 years - 16 marks									
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks									
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25								
	< 2 nos -0 marks									
	2 nos -19 marks									
	Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.									
iv)	Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/Construction Supervision/IC on PPP Mode (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5								
	2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks									
3	Employment with the Firm	5								
	< 1 Year - 0									
	1 Year - 3									
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks									
	Total:	100	-	91.00	-	-	91.00	91.00	96.00	96.00

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six linage 124+611 Dhanara (Odisha/Chhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kaliagura in the state of

			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.							
			Names of Firms							
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	5/8	6/8	7/8	8/8				
3.1	Resident cum Highway Engineer		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s DN Consultant & Services Pvt. Ltd.				
			Rakesh Kumar	J. Amar Babu	Birendra Kumar Singh	RAMA SHANKAR JHA				
			<u>Marks</u>	<u>Marks</u>	<u>Marks</u>	<u>Marks</u>				
			<u>Assessed</u>	<u>Claimed</u>	<u>Assessed</u>	<u>Claimed</u>	<u>Assessed</u>	<u>Claimed</u>	<u>Assessed</u>	<u>Claimed</u>
1	General Qualification	25					JV Partner failed in minimum eligibility	Bidder declared Non-Performing Entity by NHAI		
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21				
	II) Post-Graduation in Transportation/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering/geotechnical engineering	4	0	0	0	0				
2	Adequacy for the Project	70								
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects									
	< 10years - 0 marks;									
	10 years - 16 marks	20	20	20	20	20				
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks.									
ii)	Experience as Resident Engineer /Project Director/ Project Manager/ Superintending Engineer or equivalent/ Executive Engineer or equivalent on construction works/ Independent Engineer Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*** and above)	20	20	20	19	20				
	< 5 years - 0 marks									
	5 years - 16 marks									
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks									
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)									
	< 2 nos -0 marks	25	25	25	25	25				
	2 nos -19 marks									
	Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.									
iv)	Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/Construction Supervision/IC on PPP Mode (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5	5	5	5	5				
	2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks									
3	Employment with the Firm		0	0	3.5	3.5				
	< 1 Year - 0	5								
	1 Year - 3									
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks									
	Total:	100	91.00	91.00	93.50	94.50	-	95.00	-	-

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design Cha Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)											
			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.								
3.1	Resident cum Highway Engineer		Names of Firms								
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	1/8		2/8		3/8		4/8		
	Name of the bidder----->>>>>>		M/s Highway Engineering Consultants		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited		M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.		M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd		
			Bhoopendra Kumar Shrivastava		Raj Kumar Jain		BASANT KUMAR SINGH		Rakesh Kumar		
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks		
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	
1	General Qualification	25	Firm failed in minimum eligibility		JV Partner failed in minimum eligibility						
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21		21			21	21	21	21	
	II) Post-Graduation in Transportation/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering/geotechnical engineering	4		0			0	0	4	4	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70									
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	20		20			20	20	20	20	20
	< 10years - 0 marks;										
	10 years - 16 marks										
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks.										
ii)	Experience as Resident Engineer /Project Director/ Project Manager/ Superintending Engineer or equivalent/ Executive Engineer or equivalent on construction works/ Independent Engineer Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*** and above)	20		20			20	20	20	20	20
	< 5 years - 0 marks										
	5 years - 16 marks										
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks										
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25		25			25	25	22	22	
	< 2 nos -0 marks										
	2 nos -19 marks										
	Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.										
iv)	Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/Construction Supervision/IC on PPP Mode (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5		5			5	5	5	5	5
	2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks										
3	Employment with the Firm	5		0			0	0	5	5	
	< 1 Year - 0										
	1 Year - 3										
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks										
	Total:	100	-	91.00	-	-	91.00	91.00	97.00	97.00	

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six linage 124+611 Dhanara (Odisha/Chhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kaliagura in the state of										
			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.							
3.1	Resident cum Highway Engineer		Names of Firms							
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	5/8	6/8	7/8	8/8				
	Name of the bidder----->>>>>>>		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation	M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s DN Consultant & Services Pvt. Ltd.				
			srinivas J	H. S. Ravindranath	SVS Narayana	Deepak Kumar Pradhan				
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks	
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25								
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21		21		
	II) Post-Graduation in Transportation/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering/geotechnical engineering	4	0	0	0	0		4		
2	Adequacy for the Project	70								
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects < 10years - 0 marks; 10 years - 16 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks.	20	20	20	20	20		20		
ii)	Experience as Resident Engineer /Project Director/ Project Manager/ Superintending Engineer or equivalent/ Executive Engineer or equivalent on construction works/ Independent Engineer Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*** and above) < 5 years - 0 marks 5 years - 16 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks	20	20	20	20	20		20		
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) < 2 nos -0 marks 2 nos -19 marks Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.	25	25	25	25	25		25		
iv)	Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/Construction Supervision/IC on PPP Mode (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) 2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks	5	5	5	5	5		5		
3	Employment with the Firm									
	< 1 Year - 0									
	1 Year - 3	5	0	0	0	0		0		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks									
	Total:	100	91.00	91.00	91.00	91.00	-	95.00	-	-

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design to Construction Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)											
			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.								
3.2	Bridge/Structural Engineer		Names of Firms								
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	1/8		2/8		3/8		4/8		
	Name of the bidder----->>>>>>		M/s Highway Engineering Consultants		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited		M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.		M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd		
			Rajesh Kumar		Genda Lal		NVD Rao		sanjay kumar panigrahy		
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks		
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	
1	General Qualification	25	Firm failed in minimum eligibility		JV Partner failed in minimum eligibility						
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21		21			21		21		
	II) Post-Graduation in Structural Engineering	4		4			0		0		
2	Adequacy for the Project	70									
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/ Bridge projects	15		15			15	15	15	15	
	< 10years - 0 marks;										
	10 years - 11 marks										
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks.										
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Design/Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Flyover/Interchanges/any other such structures (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20		20			20	20	20	20	
	< 5 years -0 marks;										
	5 years -16 marks										
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.										
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Major Highway Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	20		20			20	20	20	20	
	< 2 Bridges -0 marks										
	02 Bridge -16 marks										
	Add 2 mark extra for each additional bridge subject to maximum 4 marks.										
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	10		10			10	10	10	10	
	< 2 nos. - 0 marks ;										
	2 nos -07 marks ;										
	3 or more -10 marks										
v)	Experience in similar capacity of modern bridge construction technology viz., Precast Segmental, Balanced Cantilever Construction, Extradosed Bridge, Full Span Launching, Incremental Launching	5		5			5	5	5	5	
	Experience in 1 project - 4 marks										
	More than one project - 5 marks										
3	Employment with the Firm	5		0				0	0	3	3
	< 1 Year - 0										
	1 Year - 3										
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks										
	Total:	100	-	95.00	-	-	91.00	91.00	94.00	94.00	

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design Cha Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)										
			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.							
3.4	Senior Pavement Specialist		Names of Firms							
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	1/8		2/8		3/8		4/8	
	Name of the bidder----->>>>>>		M/s Highway Engineering Consultants		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited		M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.		M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd	
			Amit Saxena		Sanjay Kumar Gautam		Rajeeb das		RAVINDRA SINGH	
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks	
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	Firm failed in minimum eligibility		JV Partner failed in minimum eligibility					
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21		21			21	21	21	
	II) Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Pavement engineering or equivalent	4		0			0	0	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70								
i)	Total Professional Experience of Pavement Design/Construction and Maintenance of Highways/Roads/Air Field Runway	20		20			20	20	20	20
	< 10 years -0 marks									
	10 years - 16 marks									
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks.									
ii)	Experience in Similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of 2/4/6- laning** of major Highway Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20		20			20	20	20	20
	< 5 years -0 marks									
	5 years -16 marks									
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.									
iii)	Experience in similar capacity as Pavement/Geotechnical Engineer in construction/ construction supervision of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20		20	20	18	20		
	< 2 nos -0 marks 2 nos -16 marks Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks									
iv)	Experience in similar capacity on major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in innovative/non traditional technology and design	5	5		5	5	5	5		
	1 Project -4 marks ; 2 or more projects -5 marks									
v)	Experience in similar capacity on PPP Projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) 2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks	5	5		5	5	5	5		
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0			0	0	0	0	
	< 1 Year - 0									
	1 Year - 3									
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks									
	Total:	100	-	91.00	-	-	91.00	91.00	89.00	91.00

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six linage 124+611 Dhanara (Odisha/Chhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kaliagura in the state of

			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.							
3.4 Senior Pavement Specialist			Names of Firms							
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	5/8		6/8		7/8		8/8	
	Name of the bidder----->>>>>>		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s DN Consultant & Services Pvt. Ltd.	
			Ajay		Chaturbhuj Gupta		Manish Sahay		SANGRAM KESHARI RATH	
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks	
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25								
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21		21		
	II) Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Pavement engineering or equivalent	4	0	0	0	0		0		
2	Adequacy for the Project	70								
i)	Total Professional Experience of Pavement Design/Construction and Maintenance of Highways/Roads/Air Field Runway									
	< 10 years -0 marks									
	10 years - 16 marks	20	20	20	20	20		20		
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks.									
ii)	Experience in Similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of 2/4/6- laning** of major Highway Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)									
	< 5 years -0 marks									
	5 years -16 marks	20	20	20	20	20		20		
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.									
iii)	Experience in similar capacity as Pavement/Geotechnical Engineer in construction/ construction supervision of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	16	20	20	20		20		
	< 2 nos -0 marks									
	2 nos -16 marks									
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks									
iv)	Experience in similar capacity on major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in innovative/non traditional technology and design	5	5	5	5	5		5		
	1 Project -4 marks ;									
	2 or more projects -5 marks									
v)	Experience in similar capacity on PPP Projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5	5	5	5	5		5		
	2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks									
3	Employment with the Firm									
	< 1 Year - 0	5	0	0	0	0		0		
	1 Year - 3									
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks									
	Total:	100	87.00	91.00	91.00	91.00		91.00		

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design Cha Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)										
			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.							
3.5	Senior Quality cum Material Engineer		Names of Firms							
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	1/8		2/8		3/8		4/8	
	Name of the bidder----->>>>>>		M/s Highway Engineering Consultants		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited		M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.		M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd	
			Mohit Mohan Agrawal		Naresh Kumar		G.V. Mohan Rao		MD. Kazmi Alam	
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks	
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25	Firm failed in minimum eligibility		JV Partner failed in minimum eligibility					
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21		21		21	21	21		
	II) Post Graduation in Geotechnical Engineering/Foundation Engineering/Soil Mechanics/Rock Mechanics	4		4		0	0	0	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70								
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15		15		15	15	15	15	
	< 10 years -0 marks									
	10 years - 11 marks									
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks.									
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of major Highway Projects ((similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above))	25		25		25	25	25	25	
	< 5 years -0 marks									
	5 years -19 marks									
	Add 2 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 6 (SIX) marks.									
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in handling Similar Highway projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25		25		22	25	25	25	
	< 2 nos -0 marks									
	2 nos -19 marks									
	Add 3 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.									
iv)	Experience in similar capacity on major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in innovative/non traditional technology	5		5		5	5	5	5	
	1 Project -4 marks ;									
	2 or more projects -5 marks									
3	Employment with the Firm	5		0			0	0	0	0
	< 1 Year - 0									
	1 Year - 3									
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks									
	Total:	100	-	95.00	-	-	88.00	91.00	91.00	91.00

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six linage 124+611 Dhanara (Odisha/Chhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kaliagura in the state of										
			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.							
3.5	Senior Quality cum Material Engineer		Names of Firms							
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	5/8		6/8		7/8		8/8	
	Name of the bidder----->>>>>>		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s DN Consultant & Services Pvt. Ltd.	
			Suresh Kumar Bathina		V.Chandra Sekhar Rao		Anil Kumar Ghosh		Sachidanand Sharma	
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks	
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25								
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21		21		
	II) Post Graduation in Geotechnical Engineering/Foundation Engineering/Soil Mechanics/Rock Mechanics	4	0	0	0	0		0		
2	Adequacy for the Project	70								
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects									
	< 10 years -0 marks									
	10 years - 11 marks	15	15	15	15	15		15		
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks.									
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of major Highway Projects ((similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above))									
	< 5 years -0 marks									
	5 years -19 marks	25	25	25	25	25		25		
	Add 2 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 6 (SIX) marks.									
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in handling Similar Highway projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)									
	< 2 nos -0 marks	25	25	25	22	25		25		
	2 nos -19 marks									
	Add 3 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.									
iv)	Experience in similar capacity on major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length (48km) or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in innovative/non traditional technology	5	5	5	5	5		5		
	1 Project -4 marks ;									
	2 or more projects -5 marks									
3	Employment with the Firm									
	< 1 Year - 0	5	0	0	0	0		0		
	1 Year - 3									
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks									
	Total:	100	91.00	91.00	88.00	91.00	-	91.00	-	-

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lane access control of Raipur-Visakhapatnam Economic Corridor under Bharatmala Pariyojana from Design to Construction Odisha on HAM Mode (Package-I)

			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.								
3.6	Road Safety Expert		Names of Firms								
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	1/8		2/8		3/8		4/8		
	Name of the bidder----->>>>>>		M/s Highway Engineering Consultants		M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in Joint venture with M/s YONGMA Engineering Co Ltd. and in association with M/s KAIUS Consulting Private Limited		M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with M/s ROTRANS Infra Projects Pvt Ltd.		M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd in association with M/s Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd		
			Sanjay Kumar Sharma		Prabhakar		SHABANA THABASSUM		Swapan Baidya		
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks		
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	
1	General Qualification	25	Firm failed in minimum eligibility		JV Partner failed in minimum eligibility						
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21		21			21	21	21		
	II)Post Graduation in Traffic/ Transportation/Safety Engineering or equivalent	4		0			4	4	0	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70									
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/ Bridge projects	15		15			15	15	15	15	15
	< 10years - 0 marks;										
	10 years - 11 marks										
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks.										
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety works on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	15		15			15	15	15	15	15
	< 5 years -0 marks;										
	5 years -11 marks										
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.										
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audits of 2/4/6-laning** Highway projects at different stages including at least one at design stage	20		20			20	20	20	20	20
	< 2 nos -0 marks										
	02 nos -16 marks										
	Add 2 mark extra for each additional bridge subject to maximum 4 marks.										
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in identification and improvement of black spots on major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	10		10			10	10	10	10	10
	< 2 nos. - 0 marks ;										
	2 nos -07 marks ;										
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional improvement of black spots subject to maximum 3 marks.										
v)	Experience in similar capacity of preparing Road Safety Management Plans for Inter Urban Highway	5		5			5	5	5	5	5
	Experience in 1 project - 4 marks										
	More than one project - 5 marks										
vi)	Experience in similar capacity in field of Road Safety Management Plan	5		5			5	5	5	5	5
	Experience in 1 project - 4 marks										
	More than one project - 5 marks										
3	Employment with the Firm	5		0				0	0	4.5	4.5
	< 1 Year - 0										
	1 Year - 3										
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks										
	Total:										
	100	-	91.00	-	-	95.00	95.00	95.50	95.50		

Consultancy services for Independent Engineer for Supervision of Development of six lainage 124+611 Dhanara (Odisha/Chhattisgarh Border) to Design Chainage 249+000 Kaliagura in the state of

			Evaluation Criteria for assessment of score of Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.							
3.6 Road Safety Expert			Names of Firms							
S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	5/8		6/8		7/8		8/8	
	Name of the bidder----->>>>>>		M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in association with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd in association with M/s Infrastructure Development Corporation (Karnataka) Limited		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Joint venture with M/s ISAN Corporation		M/s MSV International Inc in association with M/s DN Consultant & Services Pvt. Ltd.	
			Prasanth Kalathil		Pramod Kumar Jain		Anil Kumar		Suraj Kumar Pathak	
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks	
			Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed
1	General Qualification	25								
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21		21		
	II) Post Graduation in Traffic/ Transportation/Safety Engineering or equivalent	4	4	4	4	4		0		
2	Adequacy for the Project	70								
i)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/ Bridge projects									
	< 10years - 0 marks;									
	10 years - 11 marks	15	15	15	15	15		15		
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 mks.									
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety works on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).									
	< 5 years -0 marks;									
	5 years -11 marks	15	15	15	15	15		15		
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.									
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audits of 2/4/6-laning** Highway projects at different stages including at least one at design stage									
	< 2 nos -0 marks	20	20	20	20	20		20		
	02 nos -16 marks									
	Add 2 mark extra for each additional bridge subject to maximum 4 marks.									
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in identification and improvement of black spots on major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)									
	< 2 nos. - 0 marks ;									
	2 nos -07 marks ;	10	10	10	10	10		10		
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional improvement of black spots subject to maximum 3 marks.									
v)	Experience in similar capacity of preparing Road Safety Management Plans for Inter Urban Highway									
	Experience in 1 project - 4 marks	5	5	5	5	5		5		
	More than one project - 5 marks									
vi)	Experience in similar capacity in field of Road Safety Management Plan									
	Experience in 1 project - 4 marks	5	5	5	5	5		5		
	More than one project - 5 marks									
3	Employment with the Firm									
	< 1 Year - 0									
	1 Year - 3	5		5		5		0		
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks									
	Total:	100	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	-	91.00	-	-