

MINUTES OF MEETING

Sub: RFP for Consultancy Services for preparation of Feasibility Report for Construction of Ring Road for Siliguri city – *opening of financial bid - Reg.*

Venue: NHAI, RO-Kolkata

Date: 15 Nov 2021

As per decision taken by the Committee in its meeting dated 01 Nov 2021, RO-Kolkata vide letter no. NHAI/RO-Kol/001/2021/12/Siliguri Ring Road/1361 dated 08 Nov 2021 requested M/s MSV International Inc in Association with TTL Engineering Pvt. Ltd to verify the Technical Evaluation in case they have any objections.

In reply, M/s MSV International Inc vide their letter no. MSV/BD/2021/33513 dated 10 Nov 2021 has intimated that the total marks of M/s MSV has been given 95.34 marks of which 38 marks was towards firms relevant experience by deducting 2 marks in the criterion of Average Annual Turnover for last five years. In this regard, it is intimated that Average annual turnover of the firm for last five years is 79.65 cr. Therefore, overall revised technical marks shall be $95.34 + 2.00 = 97.34$ marks and therefore requested to enhance technical score by 2 marks prior to opening of financial bids.

Accordingly, the Committee has further evaluated the technical sheet of M/s MSV and it is found that the average annual turnover of the firm for last five years is 79.65 cr, therefore the final score of M/s MSV International Inc is 97.34 marks.

Further Committee has decided to proceed with further financial evaluation on 15 Nov 2021 with the following 15 nos agencies subject to approval of Competent Authority:

- (i) M/s Casta Engineers Pvt Ltd in JV with Hexa Co and in Association with Nokang Infra Pvt Ltd.
- (ii) M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.
- (iii) M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd.
- (iv) M/s Holtec Consulting Private Limited.
- (v) M/s Manglam Associates JV with Oms Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd.
- (vi) M/s Real Strength Infrastructure.
- (vii) M/s Redecon (India) Pvt Ltd in Association with SPARSH Engineering Co Pvt Ltd.
- (viii) M/s RITES Ltd.
- (ix) M/s Rodic Consultants Pvt Ltd in JV with Monarch Surveyors & Engineering Consultants Pvt Ltd.
- (x) M/s SOWiL Ltd in JV with M/s Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt Ltd in association with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt Ltd.
- (xi) M/s STUP Consultants Pvt. Ltd.
- (xii) M/s Thoughts Consultants Jaipur Pvt. Ltd.
- (xiii) M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd in JV with C E Testing Co Pvt Ltd.
- (xiv) M/s Voyants Solutions Pvt Ltd. in association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (I) Pvt. Ltd.
- (xv) M/s MSV International Inc in Association with TTL Engineering Pvt. Ltd

The meeting concluded with vote of thanks to Chair.

MINUTES OF MEETING

Sub: RFP for Consultancy Services for preparation of Feasibility Report for Construction of Ring Road for Siliguri city - *Evaluation of Technical Proposal - Reg.*

Venue: NHAI, RO-Kolkata

Date: 27 Sept 2021

As per decision taken in the meeting dated 24 Aug 2021, this office vide letter no. NHAI/RO-Kol/001/2021/12/Siliguri Ring Road/1001

dated 26 Aug 2021 has requested to all the participated bidders to verify the Technical Evaluation of all the Firms for giving opportunity to the participated bidders in case they have any objections. Further request was also made for extension of bid validity for 60 days.

The summary of technical evaluation sent for verification purpose to the bidder is as below:

1 No	Name of DPR Consultant	Firm's relevant experience in last 7 years	Survey & investigation, equipment and software proposed to be used	Qualification and Relevant experience of the proposed key personnel	Total
		40 Points	20 Points	40 Points	
1	M/s Casta Engineers Pvt Ltd In JV with Hexa Co and in Association with Nokang Infra Pvt Ltd	40	20	39	99
2	Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd	40	20	34.64	94.64
3	Consulting Engineers Group Ltd	40	20	39.2	99.2
4	Holtec Consulting Private Limited	40	20	35.7	95.7
5	STUP Consultants Pvt. Ltd	40	18.5	36.14	94.64
6	Redecon (India) Pvt Ltd in Association with SPARSH Engineering Co Pvt Ltd	38	20	37.7	95.7
7	rites LIMITED	40	20	39.26	99.26
8	Rodic Consultants Pvt Ltd in JV with Monarch Surveyors & Engineering Consultants Pvt Ltd	39	16	38.6	93.6
9	SOWiL Ltd in JV with M/s Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt Ltd in association with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt Ltd	38	20	36.54	94.54
10	Manglam Associates JV with Oms Infra Consultants Pvt Ltd	38	16	37.94	91.94
11	Real Strength Infrastructure	33	20	36.735	89.735
12	TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd in JV with C E Testing Co Pvt Ltd	40	20	34.96	94.96
13	Voyants Solutions Pvt Ltd. in association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (I) Pvt. Ltd.	40	18.5	37.74	96.24
14	M/s Kitco Ltd	37	3.75	32.58	73.33
15	Thoughts Consultants Jaipur Pvt. Ltd	37	20	39.5	96.5

It was observed that, M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultant Pvt Ltd was not having experience in preparing DPR for hilly roads for atleast 25 km and M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Pvt Ltd & M/s MSV International Inc was shown as Black listed in Infracon portal in their status. In the Minutes of the meeting 24 Aug 2021 the Committee decided to obtain a clarification from the aforementioned bidders also.

In reply, all agencies have extended their bids validity except M/s KITCO Ltd., M/s Lion Engineering Consultants Pvt Ltd, M/s Upham International Corporation in JV with SA Infrastructure Consultant Pvt Ltd, & M/s MSV International Inc, in Association with TTL

Engineering Pvt. Ltd. The following three bidders have submitted observations on the Technical Evaluation.

- (i) M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.
- (ii) M/s TPF ENGINEERING Pvt. Ltd. in Joint Venture with C. E. TESTING Co. Pvt. Ltd.
- (iii) M/s Holtec Consulting Private Limited
- (iv) M/s Rodic Consultants Pvt Ltd in JV with Monarch Surveyors & Engineering Consultants Pvt Ltd
- (v) M/s STUP Consultants Pvt Ltd

Therefore the Committee has decided to further evaluate, after receiving the comments made by the above five bidders, the summary of Technical Evaluation is as below:

Sl No	Name of DPR Consultant	Firm's relevant experience in last 7 years		Survey & investigation, equipment and software proposed to be used		Qualification and Relevant experience of the proposed key personnel		Total	
		40 Points		20 Points		40 Points			
		Original	Revised	Original	Revised	Original	Revised	Original	Revised
1	M/s Casta Engineers Pvt Ltd in JV with Hexa Co and in Association with Nokang Infra Pvt Ltd.	40	40	20	20	39	39	99	99
2	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.	40	40	20	20	34.64	37.56	94.64	97.56
3	M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd	40	40	20	20	39.2	39.2	99.2	99.2
4	M/s Holtec Consulting Private Limited.	40	40	20	20	35.7	38.7	95.7	98.7
5	M/s STUP Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	40	40	18.5	18.5	36.14	39.14	94.64	97.64
6	M/s Redecon (India) Pvt Ltd in Association with SPARSH Engineering Co Pvt Ltd.	38	38	20	20	37.7	37.7	95.7	95.7
7	M/s RITES Ltd.	40	40	20	20	39.26	39.26	99.26	99.26
8	M/s Rodic Consultants Pvt Ltd in JV with Monarch Surveyors & Engineering Consultants Pvt Ltd.	39	40	16	17	38.6	38.6	93.6	95.6
9	M/s SOWiL Ltd in JV with M/s Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt Ltd in association with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt Ltd.	38	38	20	20	36.54	36.54	94.54	94.54
10	M/s Manglam Associates JV with Oms Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	38	38	16	16	37.94	37.94	91.94	91.94
11	M/s Real Strength Infrastructure.	33	33	20	20	36.735	36.735	89.735	89.74
12	M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd in JV with C E Testing Co Pvt Ltd.	40	40	20	20	34.96	37.36	94.96	97.36
13	M/s Voyants Solutions Pvt Ltd. in association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (I) Pvt. Ltd.	40	40	18.5	18.5	37.74	37.74	96.24	96.24
14	M/s Kitco Ltd	37	37	3.75	3.75	32.58	32.58	73.33	73.33
15	M/s Thoughts Consultants Jaipur Pvt. Ltd.	37	37	20	20	39.5	39.5	96.5	96.5

It is observed that, M/s Chaitanya has claimed total point of 97.56 (37.56 for qualification and competence of Key staffs for the assignment) however, as per evaluation done the Committee, total points obtained by M/s Chaitanya comes to 98.24 (38.24 for qualification and competence of Key staffs for the assignment). In this regard, Committee decided to give total marks of 97.56 to M/s Chaitanya as they claimed.

As per RFP Clause 5.2 The technical proposal should score at least 75 points out of 100 to be considered for financial evaluation. The CV of the proposed Team Leader should score at least 75 % marks otherwise the entire proposal shall be considered to have failed in the evaluation of Technical Proposals and shall not be considered for opening of Financial Proposals. But, M/s Kitco has failed to scored 75% and the agency did not submitted any reply against the evaluation sheet made by this office. Therefore Committee has declared as technically Non responsive.

Further Committee has decided to proceed with further financial evaluation with the following 14 nos agencies subject to approval of Competent Authority:

- (xvi) M/s Casta Engineers Pvt Ltd in JV with Hexa Co and in Association with Nokang Infra Pvt Ltd.
- (xvii) M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.
- (xviii) M/s Consulting Engineers Group Ltd.
- (xix) M/s Holtec Consulting Private Limited.
- (xx) M/s Manglam Associates JV with Oms Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd.
- (xxi) M/s Real Strength Infrastructure.
- (xxii) M/s Redecon (India) Pvt Ltd in Association with SPARSH Engineering Co Pvt Ltd.
- (xxiii) M/s RITES Ltd.
- (xxiv) M/s Rodic Consultants Pvt Ltd in JV with Monarch Surveyors & Engineering Consultants Pvt Ltd.
- (xxv) M/s SOWiL Ltd in JV with M/s Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt Ltd in association with M/s G-Eng Advisory Services Pvt Ltd.
- (xxvi) M/s STUP Consultants Pvt. Ltd.
- (xxvii) M/s Thoughts Consultants Jaipur Pvt. Ltd.
- (xxviii) M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd in JV with C E Testing Co Pvt Ltd.
- (xxix) M/s Voyants Solutions Pvt Ltd. in association with Aushta Consulting Engineers (I) Pvt. Ltd.

The meeting concluded with vote of thanks to Chair.